## RESEARCH ON ICH'S CONTRIBUTION TO SDGS: EDUCATION AND COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT

00

**PROJECT REPORT** FY 2020 – FY 2021





ज्झ्नेक्ट्र् इ

> United Nations cational, Scientific and Cultural Organization



Cultura

International Research Centre for Intangible Cultural Heritage in the Asia-Pacific Region International Research Centre for Intangible Cultural Heritage in the Asia-Pacific Region (IRCI)

## RESEARCH ON ICH'S CONTRIBUTION TO SDGS: EDUCATION AND COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT

**PROJECT REPORT** FY 2020 – FY 2021

------





United Nations Intangib Icational, Scientific and Cultural Cultural Organization Heritage

International Research Centre for Intangible Cultural Heritage in the Asia-Pacific Region International Research Centre for Intangible Cultural Heritage in the Asia-Pacific Region (IRCI)

Edited by IWAMOTO Wataru, NOJIMA Yoko, SASAKI Kazue and DUDKO Anastasia

Published by International Research Centre for Intangible Cultural Heritage in the Asia-Pacific Region (IRCI)

2 Mozusekiun-cho, Sakai-ku, Sakai city, Osaka, 590-0802, Japan Tel: +81-72-275-8050 Fax: +81-72-275-8151 Website: https://www.irci.jp e-mail: irci@nich.go.jp

Printed by: Yubunsha

Date of Publication: March 2022

©International Research Centre for Intangible Cultural Heritage in the Asia-Pacific Region (IRCI) 2022 ISBN: 978-4-9909775-4-2

Cover photo (from top to bottom): Kethoprak performance, Indonesia ©DFLCL Dhamail performance, Bangladesh ©DAM Learning about falconry, Kyrgyzstan ©Taalim-Forum Colophon photo: two characters of Kethoprak performance, Indonesia ©DFLCL



The International Research Centre for Intangible Cultural Heritage in the Asia-Pacific Region (IRCI) was established in October 2011 as a Category 2 Centre under the auspices of UNESCO through its agreement with the Japanese government. The Centre, located in Sakai City, Osaka, was officially opened as one of the institutions of the National Institutes for Cultural Heritage (NICH) of Japan. Since its establishment, IRCI has undertaken various research projects focusing on safeguarding the intangible cultural heritage (ICH) in the Asia-Pacific region in cooperation with individual researchers and experts, research institutions, universities, museums, NGOs, government sections, and community members within and outside the region.

As everyone knows, Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs) were adopted by the United Nations General Assembly in 2015, but they do not have a specific goal on culture. However, the Declaration of 'the 2030 Agenda for Sustainable Development,' which contains the SDGs, insists on the importance of culture for sustainable development, and SDGs 4.7 and 11.4 also explicitly mention culture. You may notice that the United Nations has adopted resolutions on culture and sustainable development several times. UNESCO also implements various projects in this field, based on the collaboration between their Culture and Education Sectors.

This report presents the outcomes of the two-year project 'Research on ICH's Contribution to SDGs: Education and Community Development,' which was launched in FY 2020 to investigate the relationships among ICH, education, and community development, and discover the roles of ICH in achieving SDGs 4 (Quality Education) and 11 (Sustainable Cities and Communities). It contains a summary of the activities conducted over two years, three case study reports in FY 2021 by NGOs in Bangladesh, Indonesia, and Kyrgyzstan, and the results of the international symposia held in FY 2020 and 2021. The case study reports for FY 2020 by the above-mentioned NGOs are available on the IRCI website. The main parts of the project were commissioned by the SDGs Platform within the 'Platform for Future Co-creation of UNESCO Activities' framework of the Ministry of Education, Culture, Sports, Science and Technology (MEXT), Japan.

IRCI implemented the project in cooperation with three NGOs. Even though the unprecedented COVID-19 pandemic derailed the entire project, it was successfully completed with significant outcomes.

I am convinced that through perusal of this report the reader will grasp the relationship between ICH, education, and community development. In my view, the characteristics of ICH, such as an aspect of fun and, familiarity, grass-root nature, participatory aspects, and multi-stakeholder involvement, would be relevant for learner-centred education and autonomous community development.

IRCI would not have completed the project without the hard work of NGOs in three

countries: the Dhaka Ahsania Mission (DAM) in Bangladesh, the Dewi Fortuna Community Learning Center (DFCLC) in Indonesia, and the Taalim-Forum Public Foundation (TFPF) in Kyrgyzstan. I would like to take this opportunity to express my wholehearted appreciation of those who cooperated in the project despite the harsh COVID-19 environment. In Bangladesh, the DAM research team provided a detailed analysis of Dhamail practices based on various cases across rural and urban areas by working with government officials, Dhamail practitioners, script writers, and community members. In Indonesia, DFCLC compared the effects of Kethoprak in formal and nonformal education in cooperation with educators, students, parents, and community members, ICH practitioners, universities and government institutions, conducted research on the roles of Kyrgyz yurts and related knowledge and skills as well as the roles of local museums in safeguarding, utilising, and transmitting ICH.

I would like to extend my gratitude to the experts from the National Commission for Culture and the Arts (NCCA) in the Philippines, the Vietnam Museum of Ethnology (VME), and the Vietnam Institute of Educational Sciences (VNIES) for their continuous support and engagement in our project, even after the completion of the previous project. In Japan, I would like to thank the panellists of the symposia: Miyagi University of Education, Sendai City Akiu Lower Secondary School, Chubu University, Group for transmission of the torch to next generation as cultural heritage, Osaka Prefecture University, Shotoku Gakuen Junior & Senior High School, Hokkaido University, Chitose Primary School in Yamagata City, and Junior Chamber International Japan for their contributions, as well as the Asia-Pacific Cultural Centre for UNESCO (ACCU), the United Nations University Institute for the Advanced Study of Sustainability (UNU-IAS), the Global RCE Network, and the Goi Peace Foundation for their cooperation.

I would especially like to thank the resource persons for the project, President KATO Hisao and Professor LIOU Lin-Yu of the Nara University of Education, Professor SATO Masahiko of Tokyo City University, and Mr ISHIMURA Tomo of the Tokyo National Research Institute for Cultural Properties for providing advice and comments throughout the project, and Ms DUONG Bich Hanh of UNESCO Bangkok Office for sharing valuable thoughts on the entire project. Finally, I would like to express my gratitude to MEXT and the SDGs Platform for generously supporting this project.

I hope this report, together with the project report in FY 2020, will provide researchers, educators, and youth with a new perspective about ICH's potential to contribute to SDGs and encourage them to realise a sustainable and resilient society by safeguarding, utilising, and transmitting ICH. I also earnestly hope that the project can help accelerate the achievement of SDGs.

March 2022

IWAMOTO Wataru Director-General International Research Centre for Intangible Cultural Heritage in the Asia-Pacific Region (IRCI)

# Table of Contents

©DAM

Preface	
Table of contents         Acronyms and Abbreviations	
1. Summary of the Research on ICH's Contribution to SDGS: Education and Commu	-
Development	
1.1 Background and Purpose	
1.3 Major Activities in FY 2020	
1.4 Summary and Prospect	
	21
2. Summary of the 2-year Case Study	. 27
2.1 BangladeshEhsanur Rahman	29
2.2 Indonesia Kristian Apriyanta	34
2.3 Kyrgyzstan Almagul Osmonova and Jyldyz Doolbekova	39
2.4 Workshops	44
3. International Symposia	. 51
3.1 FY 2020 Symposium	. 53
3.1.1 Objective and Overview	55
3.1.2 International Symposium: Discussion Summary	55
3.1.3 Forum: Discussion Summary	60
3.1.4 Comments	63
Ishimura Tomo	
Liou Lin-Yu Sato Masahisa	
Iwamoto Wataru	-
3.1.5 Presentation Materials	70
ICH's Contribution to Sustainable Development Goals: Education and Community Development – A Research Study on Dhamail <i>ABM Shahab Uddin</i>	71
Character Cultivation and Culture Safeguarding on Students in Klaten Regency, Central Java, Indonesia as a Contribution for Quality of Education and Sustainable Development	
	81
Visionary Local Communities in Promoting ICH Education in Kyrgyzstan	

Almagul Osmonova and Jyldyz Doolbekova	1 87
Multi-disciplinary study on intangible cultural heritage's contribution to sustainable development: Focusing on education	ı 94
ICH Education in Vietnamese Schools towards SDGs – Practice and Expectations	100
The Activities of Japanese Youths and EducatorsIchinose Tomonori	110
Education and Urban Development	118
The Traditional Knowledge based ESD Projects on Bio-Cultural Diversity in the Ise-Mikawa Bay Watershed	126
Community Development Utilizing Historical Resources in Omihachiman City, Shiga Prefecture	135
3.1.6 Symposium Information General Information Programme List of Participants	142 145
3.2 FY 2021 Symposium	. 149
3.2.1 Objective and Overview	151
3.2.2 Expert Meeting	151
3.2.3 Public Symposium	161
3.2.4 Comments Ishimura Tomo Liou Lin-Yu Sato Masahisa Duong Bich Hanh	165 166 168
3.2.5 Presentation Materials	171
Potentials of Dhamail as ICH for Education and Community Development – Bangladesh Case StudyEhsanur Rahman Case Study of ICH's Contribution to the Art of Kethoprak	172
for Improving the Quality of Education and Community Empowerment 	178
Evolving Role of Community Museums in ICH Safeguarding: Case-Studies from Kyrgyzstan	184
Autonomous City Sakai and the World: Craftsman Culture that be Built in the History	190
Let us Know about Intangible Cultural Heritage in Akishima City Mine Haruyoshi, Ikeda Shomu, Sasaki Mai, Matsuo Ouka, Nagai Koki	201
Cases of Utilising Ainu Language into Education and in the Community as an Intangible Cultural Heritage	220
Chitose's Tradition and I – Let's Think about What We Can Do	

by Inheriting the Tradition of the Chitose District – Abe Daisuke	222
Efforts to Create Qualitative Values Nishimura Yoshinori	244
3.2.6 Symposium Information	249
General Information	249
Programme	250
List of Participants	
International Symposium Flyer	255
Appendix	. 257
Appendix 1. Case Study Report: Bangladesh	
Appendix 2. Case Study Report: Indonesia	
Appendix 3. Case Study Report: Kyrgyzstan	

# Acronyms and Abbreviations

©DAM

DAM	Dhaka Ahsania Mission		
DFCLC	Dewi Fortuna Community Learning Center		
ESD	Education for Sustainable Development		
FY	Fiscal Year		
ICH	Intangible Cultural Heritage		
ICOMOS	International Council on Monuments and Sites		
IPCC	Intergovernmental Panel on Climate Change		
IRCI	International Research Centre for Intangible Cultural Heritage in the Asia-Pacific Region		
NCCA	National Commission for Culture and the Arts		
NCCA RCE	National Commission for Culture and the Arts Regional Centre of Expertise on Education for Sustainable Development		
	Regional Centre of Expertise on Education for Sustainable		
RCE	Regional Centre of Expertise on Education for Sustainable Development		
RCE SDGs	Regional Centre of Expertise on Education for Sustainable Development Sustainable Development Goals		
RCE SDGs SLTs	Regional Centre of Expertise on Education for Sustainable Development Sustainable Development Goals School of Living Traditions		
RCE SDGs SLTs TFPF	Regional Centre of Expertise on Education for Sustainable Development Sustainable Development Goals School of Living Traditions Taalim-Forum Public Foundation		

# Summary of the Research on ICH's Contribution to SDGs: Education and Community Development



Section cover photo: Interviewing a museum worker at the ethnographic section of the museum, Kyrgyzstan ©Taalim-Forum

#### 1.1 Background and Purpose

On 25 September 2015, the 70th General Assembly of the United Nations adopted the 2030 Agenda, which included 17 Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs) and 169 associated targets. The 17 goals, which are not independent of each other but interrelated, constitute universal goals for the international community to build sustainable, resilient, and peaceful societies that ensure no one will be left behind. Since their adoption, the SDGs have become recognised worldwide, as can be seen in initiatives and efforts at the national, local, and individual levels, aiming to achieve SDGs by 2030.

In this context, the International Research Centre for Intangible Cultural Heritage in the Asia-Pacific Region (IRCI), as a Category 2 Centre of UNESCO for safeguarding intangible cultural heritage (ICH) in the region, has been focusing on the role of culture, specifically ICH in sustainable development. UNESCO emphasises that 'although culture does not have a dedicated SDG, it contributes to all 17 goals<sup>1</sup>.' The role of culture in SDGs is explicitly mentioned in targets 4.7 and 11.4. Accordingly, IRCI started to investigate the role of ICH in SDGs through implementing a series of projects since 2018. For the first two years, the project investigated ICH's contribution to SDG 4 (Quality Education), specifically focusing on the achievement of target 4.7, by conducting research in the Philippines and Viet Nam<sup>2</sup>. This project proved that ICH does contribute to SDG 4. Educational materials incorporating ICH<sup>3</sup>, which were developed in this project, helped learners understand ICH itself, and helped them acquire knowledge and skills related to ICH. Further, it is worth noting that the attempt of utilising ICH in education also affected educators, ICH bearers and government officials. Another significant finding was that understanding their own ICH enhanced learners' affection toward their own community. As the project indicated that ICH is deeply related to the community where the ICH is practiced and transmitted, the role of ICH in community development needs to be further investigated for achieving SDG 11.

Realising the importance of this linkage between ICH, education, and community development, IRCI started the current 'Research on ICH's Contribution to SDGs: Education and Community Development' project in 2020 to investigate how ICH could contribute to both SDGs 4 and 11, by analysing the relationships among ICH, education (SDG 4), and community development (SDG 11) in cooperation with NGOs in Bangladesh, Indonesia, and Kyrgyzstan. In this project, IRCI investigated how ICH education improves learners' capacity and skills, including their non-cognitive skills, and how learners who

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> UNESCO. 'Crosscutting Directions'. https://en.unesco.org/culture-development/transversalapproaches

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> IRCI. 2019. 'Multi-Disciplinary Study on ICH's Contribution to Sustainable Development – Focusing on Education (FY 2018 – FY 2019).' https://www.irci.jp/research/sdgs/

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> IRCl and NCCA. 2020. 'Multi-Disciplinary Study on Intangible Cultural Heritage's Contribution to Sustainable Development, Focusing on Education: A Guide for Facilitators and Local Coordinators for a School of Living Traditions on the *Buklog* Thanksgiving Ritual of the Subanen (English) (the second edition).' https://www.irci.jp/wp\_files/wp-content/uploads/2020/03/Revised-The-Philippines-1.pdf IRCI, VME, and VNIES. 2020. 'Guidelines for Intangible Cultural Heritage Education in Vietnamese Schools Towards Sustainable Development Goals (English).' https://www.irci.jp/wp\_files/wpcontent/uploads/2020/07/02266a89148ce6a6c3cee628367a4f76.pdf.

have received ICH education can contribute to their community and put their acquired knowledge and skills into practice for the community's development through case studies in Bangladesh, Indonesia, and Kyrgyzstan.

The project is expected to provide an opportunity for experts, researchers, educators, and youth in Japan and abroad to understand the potential contribution of ICH to education and community development, while helping ICH practitioners and their communities to recognize the importance and benefit of their ICH, thereby leading to the creation of sustainable communities. All these efforts would encourage profound research on safeguarding ICH and finally lead to effective safeguarding, utilising, and transmitting of ICH.

#### Reference to Culture in the 2030 Agenda for Sustainable Development\*

#### 1) Paragraph 36 in Declaration

We pledge to foster intercultural understanding, tolerance, mutual respect and an ethic of global citizenship and shared responsibility. We acknowledge the natural and cultural diversity of the world and recognize that all cultures and civilizations can contribute to, and are crucial enablers of, sustainable development.

2) Target 4.7 of SDG 4 (Ensure inclusive and equitable quality education and promote lifelong learning opportunities for all)

By 2030, ensure that all learners acquire the knowledge and skills needed to promote sustainable development, including, among others, through education for sustainable development and sustainable lifestyles, human rights, gender equality, promotion of a culture of peace and non-violence, global citizenship and appreciation of cultural diversity and of culture's contribution to sustainable development.

3) Target 11.4 of SDG 11 (Make cities and human settlement inclusive, safe, resilient and sustainable)



Strengthen efforts to protect and safeguard the world's cultural and natural heritage.

\*'Transforming our world: the 2030 Agenda for Sustainable Development, the Resolution', adopted by the General Assembly on 25 September 2015: https://sustainabledevelopment.un.org/ content/documents/21252030%20Agenda%20for%20Sustainable%20Development%20web.pdf

#### 1.2 Major Activities in FY 2020

The project in FY 2020 was divided into two phases. Phase 1 comprised a preliminary study before the project was officially contracted on 30 November 2020 by the SDGs Platform as a project under the framework of the 'Platform for Future Co-creation of UNESCO activities' commissioned by the Ministry of Education, Culture, Sports, Science and Technology (MEXT), Japan. Phase 2 comprised a full-fledged case study, including a field survey under contract with the SDGs Platform. The major activities in Phases 1 and 2 were scheduled as summarised in Table 1.

Date	Major activities
	Phase 1
July – September 2020	Selecting of project partners Planning of specific activities
September – November 2020	Preliminary study undertaken in Bangladesh, Indonesia, and Kyrgyzstan after making an agreement with three NGOs
30 November 2020	Submission deadline of the draft case study reports to IRCI
	Phase 2
30 November 2020	The project officially began after making an agreement with three NGOs after concluding the contract with the SDGs Platform
1 December – 14 January 2021	Case studies undertaken in Bangladesh, Indonesia, and Kyrgyzstan
15 January 2021	Submission deadline of the final case study reports to IRCI
28-29 January 2021	International symposium (online)

#### Table 1: Major activities in FY 2020

#### 1. Selecting project partners and planning specific activities

After exchanging several emails, three NGOs, namely the Dhaka Ahsania Mission (DAM) in Bangladesh, the Dewi Fortuna Community Learning Center (DFCLC) in Indonesia, and the Taalim-Forum Public Foundation (TFPF) in Kyrgyzstan were selected from South Asia, Southeast Asia, and Central Asia respectively as project partners by taking cultural diversity into consideration. These NGOs have actively dedicated themselves to safeguarding and transmitting ICH, while addressing various social issues that their communities have long been suffering from.

After reaching an agreement with each NGO, IRCI and the three NGOs planned detailed activities for FY 2020 through emails and took on the preliminary case study. The activities were planned with consideration the COVID-19 situation and safety measures in each country.

Accordingly, the research focus and specific activities in each country were decided as follows.

#### Bangladesh

<u>Target ICH</u>: Dhamail, a form of folk music and dance originating from in the Sylhet division of Bangladesh and practiced on the occasions of certain religious rites, religious festivals and birth and marriage ceremonies

<u>Target communities</u>: four unions (Badaghat, Polash, Joykolosh, Rafinagar) under four upazilas of Sunamgani district in the Sylhet division (Table 2)

	0		-		
Division	District	Upazila	Union	Category	Phase
Sylhet	Sunamganj	Bishwamvarpur	Palash	Urban	1
		Tahirpur	Badaghat	Rural	1
		Derai	Rafinagar	Rural	2
		South Sunamganj	Jaykolosh	Urban	2

#### Table 2: Target communities in Bangladesh

#### Research focus

- Comparison of Dhamail practices between rural and urban areas
- How Dhamail affects learners' learning and contributes to solving local issues such as poverty and dropouts and sustainable community development by incorporating it into non-formal education including the 'Let us Learn' programme of DAM.

#### Specific activities

Phase 1

- 1. Conduct preliminary case studies (mainly desk survey).
- 2. Produce a draft case study report.

Phase 2

- 1. Conduct further case studies (mainly desk survey) by expanding the target study in Phase 1.
- 2. Analyse the data obtained in the case study.
- 3. Produce the final case study report.
- 4. Present the results of the case study at the international symposium.

#### Indonesia

<u>Target ICH</u>: Kethoprak, a traditional theatre performance accompanied by traditional gamelan music, performed in the Javanese language and in traditional dress

#### Target communities: Klaten region, Central Java

#### Research focus

• Comparison of Kethoprak education in formal and non-formal schools

• How Kethoprak education affects learners' academic performance, their characteristics, and their attitudes towards their community and community development.

#### Specific activities

Phase 1

- 1. Conduct preliminary case studies (mainly desk survey).
- 2. Produce a draft case study report.

Phase 2

- 1. Conduct further case studies (mainly desk survey).
- 2. Analyse the data obtained in the case study.
- 3. Produce the final case study report.
- 4. Present the results of the case study at the international symposium

#### Kyrgyzstan

<u>Target ICH</u>: Kyrgyz and Kazakh yurt (hereafter Kyrgyz yurt), a traditional housing of nomadic people and related knowledge and skills

Kyrgyz yurt and related knowledge and skills were inscribed on UNESCO's Representative List of the Intangible Cultural Heritage of Humanity in 2014.

<u>Target communities</u>: four villages that practice yurt making and other elements that are deeply connected to the yurt

Province	District	Village	Population	Features
lssyk-Kul	Ton	Kyzyl-Tuu	470	167 yurt makers
Osh	Chon Alai	Sary Mogol	5,257	20% of women are involved in craftsmanship, including patterned weaving
Naryn	At-Bashy	Acha-Kaiyndy	5,106	Carpet making
lssyk-Kul	Ton	Bokonbaev	10,450	30 families keep and raise eagles, falcons, and aboriginal hunting dogs.

Table 3: Target communities in Kyrgyzstan

#### Research focus

- Relationships in yurt making, and other related elements
- How the Kyrgyz yurt and related knowledge and skills contribute to resolving issues faced by communities such as poverty and gender inequality.

#### Specific activities

Phase 1

- 1. Conduct preliminary case study (mainly desk survey).
- 2. Produce a draft case study report.

#### Phase 2

- 1. Conduct further case studies (mainly desk survey) by expanding the target study in Phase 1.
- 2. Analyse the case studies.
- 3. Produce the final case study report.
- 4. Present the results of the case study at the International Symposium.

#### Working schedule

The rough schedule of activities that was agreed upon by the three NGOs is shown in Table 4.

#### Table 4: Working schedule during FY 2020

Date	Major activities
	Phase 1
September – October	Finalise a detailed activity plan
2020	Conclude an agreement with each NGO
September – November 2020	Undertake preliminary studies in Bangladesh, Indonesia, and Kyrgyzstan
30 November 2020	Deadline to submit a draft case study report to IRCI
	Phase 2
December – January 2021	Undertake case studies in Bangladesh, Indonesia, and Kyrgyzstan
15 January 2021	Deadline to submit a final case study report to IRCI
28–29 January 2021	International symposium (online)

#### 2. Case Study

After concluding an agreement with each NGO (DAM in September, and DFCLC and TFPF in October), they undertook a preliminary case study as Phase 1.

The project officially started as phase 2 on 30 November 2020 after obtaining formal approval from the SDGs platform. The case studies conducted by the three NGOs are

summarised here. The case study report from each NGO is provided in Appendix of the project report for FY 2020, available on IRCI's website<sup>4</sup>.

#### Bangladesh

Major activities in Bangladesh are summarised in Table 5.

#### Table 5: Major activities in Bangladesh

Date	Activities
	Phase 1
15 September 2020 – 4 October 2020	Organised a research team
5–11 October 2020	Prepared a work plan Conducted desk surveys
12–27 October 2020	Developed research tools
27 October 2020	Organised a consultation meeting with the Ministry of Cultural Affairs
28 October 2020	Conducted hands-on orientation training on Dhamail for the research team
29 October 2020	Conducted the focus group discussions in Badaghat of Tahipu, and Palash of Bishwamvarpur
2–28 November 2020	Prepared the draft case study report
30 November 2020	Submitted the draft case study report
	Phase 2
1–13 December 2020	Conducted further desk survey by expanding the target communities
14–20 December 2020	Conducted a field survey, including the focus group discussions and interviews with key informants
21 December 2020 – 3 January 2021	Analysed the case studies
4 December 2020 – 15 January 2021	Created the final case study report.
28–29 January 2021	Participated in the international symposium (online)
25 January 2021	Submitted the final case study report

#### <u>Phase 1</u>

Upon starting the project, DAM organised a research team. First, the research team formulated a work plan, created questionnaires as research tools and conducted desk surveys. After a consultation meeting with the Ministry of Cultural Affairs and Shilpokala Academy (District Cultural Academy) of Bangladesh, DAM conducted a hands-on

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup> IRCI. 2020. 'Research on ICH Contribution to SDGs: Education and Community development. Project Report for FY 2020.' https://www.irci.jp/wp\_files/wp-

content/uploads/2021/02/019f9c70652e08635f0c8e5a87b928fb-1.pdf.

orientation training on Dhamail on 28 October 2020. The research team then conducted a field survey, including two focus group discussions targeting two upazilas: Tahipu and Bishwamvarpur to learn about the current situation of Dhamail, hear opinions of people living there as well as notify them about the project.

On 29 October 2020, a focus group discussion was conducted in Badaghat union where the 'Let Us Learn' project has been implemented, in Tahipur upazila, with 17 participants (11 men and 6 women. Participants included a union chairman (senior citizen), a rural doctor, a cultural performer group, a singer, an instrument player, a song/lyrics writer, a journalist, local government women members, and others from the local Muslim community. On the same day, in Bishwamvarpur upazila, a focus group discussion was conducted in Palash union (a Hindu community), where the 'Let Us Learn' project has been implemented, with the participation of 27 youngsters (21 girls and 6 boys).

DAM compiled a draft case study report based on the consultation meetings and focus group discussions. This report was shared with IRCI to guide further research activities.

#### <u>Phase 2</u>

In Phase 2, the research team carried out further studies by expanding the target upazilas to Derai and South Sunamganj and conducting large scale interviews with key informants by using questionnaires to obtain various opinions for a quantitative analysis.

Between 14 and 20 December 2020, a focus group discussion was conducted in Rafinagar union High School in Derai upazila, with nine teachers, seven of whom came from a neighboring area (nearby district of Sunamganj and Mymensing) and the two of whom came from Raginagar. Another FGD was held at Khagaura village in Rafinagar with 14 community senior citizens who were 60 – 80 years old. They included a teacher, a farmer, a priest, an artist, and students. Further, in South Sunamganj, a focus group discussion was held in Joykolosh union with 10 teachers from different schools and colleges.

The interviews with key informants were conducted with a total of 200 participants (50 people per upazila) between 14 and 20 December 2020 by using questionnaires. These were carried out for community senior members, leaders, performers, local government officials and cultural organisations, and youth who knew Dhamail.

During the field survey, Dhamail performances were organised in Palash village in Bishwamvarpur upazila, Khagauraa village in Rafinagar union, and Ujanigaon village in South Sunamganj upazila.

Finally, DAM created a case study report based on its desk and field surveys.

#### Indonesia

Major activities in Indonesia are summarised in Table 6.

In Indonesia, the case study was carried out without dividing the activities into two phases, as a formal school curriculum had to be taken into consideration.

Date	Activities
10 October 2020	Held a team meeting
30 October 2020	Finalised general guidelines
31 October 2020	Sent a letter that introduces the project to schools
7 November 2020	Presentation / outreach at SD Krista Gracia and SD N 2 Trunuh
10 November 2020	Initial data collection and a questionnaire survey at SD Krista Gracia
13 November 2020	Initial data collection and a questionnaire survey at SD N 2 Trunuh
18 November 2020	Interviews at SD Krista Gracia
20 November 2020	Interviews at SD N 2 Trunuh
25 November 2020	Second data collection at SD Krista Gracia and SD N 2 Trunuh
4 January 2021	SD Krista Gracia data analysis
18 January 2021	SD N 2 Trunuh data analysis
22–25 January 2021	Comparative data analysis
27 January 2021	Submitted the draft case study report
28–29 January 2021	Participated in the international symposium (online)
8 February 2021	Submitted the final case study report

#### Table 6: Major activities in Indonesia

After forming a research team, DFCLC obtained an agreement for their cooperation with the project from two primary schools, namely Krista Gracia that had incorporated Kethoprak into extracurricular activities and Negeri 2 Trunuh which did not have such classes.

DFCLC conducted surveys by using questionnaires that had been developed for the project and provided to stakeholders in each school. The questionnaires were distributed to five fifth grade teachers, a principal, 11 fifth grade teachers (six boys and five girls) between 11 and 12 years old, and their parents. Online interviews were also conducted to follow up on the answers to the questionnaires.

The data collected through the questionnaires and online interviews were analysed and compared for a case study report.

#### Kyrgyzstan

Major activities in Kyrgyzstan are summarised in Table 7.

 Table 7: Major activities in Kyrgyzstan

Date	Activities	
	Phase 1	
1–2 October 2020	Held meetings with the research team and discussed a work plan.	
5-15 October 2020	Conducted literature surveys.	
16–31 October 2020	Consulted and held discussions with experts, leaders of local organisations and communities.	
1–30 November 2020	Wrote a draft case study report	
30 November 2020	Submitted the draft case study report	
Phase 2		
1–20 December 2020	Conducted filed research in the four selected communities, including interviews	
15 December 2020 – 20 December 2020	Organised three online and one offline meeting with the group of ICH experts	
20 December 2020 – 15 January 2021	Created the final case study report.	
28–29 January 2021	Participated in the international symposium (online)	
15 January 2021	Submitted the final case study report	

#### <u>Phase 1</u>

TFPF mainly carried out preparatory activities: it organised a research team, consulted with stakeholders including experts, leaders of local organisations and communities, and conducted an archival survey. Based on what the research team carried out, a draft report was compiled. This report was shared with IRCI to guide further research activities.

#### <u>Phase 2</u>

TFPF started field research in the four selected villages, namely Kyzyl-Tuu, Sary Mogol, Acha-Kaiyndy, and Bokonbaev. The field research was conducted between 1 and 20 December 2020 in cooperation with local assistants and project coordinators working in these villages, due to the limited travel under the COVID-19 and difficulties in going to the mountainous areas during winter. During the field research, the team visited and interviewed 57 families of yurt-makers in Kyzyl-Tuu village, conducted interviews and focus group discussions mainly with women who engaged in patterned weaving in Sary Mogol village, and visited Acha-Kaiyndy, and Bokonbaev villages to grasp the whole picture of the community engagement in making felt carpets.

Three online and one offline meeting were organised with the group of experts in ICH including the directors of the State Historical Museum and the Museum of Nomadic Civilisation, the directors of public foundations, such as the Institute Sustainable

Development Strategy and Centre of Museum Initiatives, and a researcher and expert on cultural heritage from the University in Central Asia in Kyrgyzstan.

Finally, the TFPF research team completed the case study report.

#### 3. International Symposium

An international symposium was held online on 28–29 January 2021. The symposium consisted of four sessions: presentations on the case study (session 1), discussion and analysis (session 2), presentation on the follow-up of the previous project (FY2018–2019) (session 3), and a forum with the participation of Japanese educators and youth (session 4). Profound opinions and thoughts were exchanged among 26 experts from Bangladesh, Indonesia, Japan, Kyrgyzstan, the Philippines, Thailand, and Viet Nam and eight observers from across Japan.

In session 1, the three NGOs from Bangladesh, Indonesia and Kyrgyzstan made presentations, including on a summary of the case study; the ICH education that was studied in the project; an analysis on the relationships among ICH, SDGs 4 and 11; contributions of ICH to other SDGs; and future orientations of research on ICH and ICH safeguarding. In the discussions (session 2), participants exchanged their thoughts and suggestions on such topics as the influence of COVID-19 on the practice of ICH and the project; the relationships among ICH, education, and community development; future perspectives; and challenges in connection with the contributions of ICH to SDGs, and the effects of the previous project. During the discussions, it became clear that the COVID-19 pandemic had both positive and negative effects on the practice of ICH. The project clearly showed positive aspects of ICH's contribution to both SDGs 4 and 11 through analysing the relationships among ICH, education, and community development. It was also suggested that more attention needs to be placed on educational activities utilising ICH, increasing multi-stakeholder participation, involving the youth and policy linkage. In session 3, two former counterparts from the Philippines and Viet Nam who worked with IRC during FY 2018–2019, made presentations on the current situation of the previous project and future attempts and plans related to ICH and SDGs.

Session 4, programmed as the 'Forum with the Participation of Japanese Educators and Youth,' was intended to share widely the results of the case studies conducted by the three NGOs in Bangladesh, Indonesia and Kyrgyzstan and the attempts related to ICH, education and community development by Japanese educators and youth. In collaboration with the UNESCO Associated Schools Project Network (ASPUnivNet), United Nations University Global RCE Network (RCE), Asia-Pacific Cultural Centre for UNESCO (ACCU), and Goi Peace Foundation, Japanese educators and youth presented their activities related to ICH education and community development. Four presentations were made by Miyagi University of Education, Sendai City Akiu Lower Secondary School, Chubu University, and the Group for transmission of the torch (*taimatsu*) to next generation as cultural heritage.

The forum provided a valuable opportunity for all participants to share their knowledge and discuss the relationship among ICH, education, and community development from the viewpoints of the youth while learning about UNESCO activities in Japan and other countries in Asia.

Section 3.1 presents the details of the international symposium in FY 2020, including the discussions and presentation materials by participants.

#### 1.3 Major Activities in FY 2021

Based on the outcomes of the project in FY 2020, the three NGOs further investigated the relationships among ICH, education, and community development, and the roles of ICH in achieving SDGs 4 and 11 in each country's context.

Specific activities officially began after the project proposal was accepted on 12 July 2021 by the SDGs Platform as a project under the framework of the 'Platform for Future Co-creation of UNESCO activities' of the Ministry of Education, Culture, Sports, Science and Technology (MEXT), Japan. However, the planning of this year's activities started beforehand, in consultation with the three NGOs in order to start the research activities promptly. The major activities were scheduled as summarised in Table 8.

Date	Major activities
June – July 2021	Planning of specific activities
12 July 2021	Project accepted by the SDGs Platform
13 July – 5 September 2021	Preliminary study
6 September 2021	The project began after making an agreement with three NGOs after concluding the contract with the SDGs Platform
6 September – 30 November 2021	Case studies undertaken in Bangladesh, Indonesia, and Kyrgyzstan
4 November 2021	Workshop in Indonesia
9 November 2021	Workshop in Bangladesh
26 November 2021	Conference in Kyrgyzstan
30 November 2021	Submission deadline of the case study reports to IRCI
21–22 December 2021	International symposium (online)

#### Table 8: Major activities

#### **1.** Planning of specific activities

IRCI had online meetings separately with DAM on 16 June 2021, with DFCLC in the afternoon of 18 June, and with TFPF in the morning of 18 June, to discuss respective research focuses, activities, budget, and schedule. Activities were designed in careful consideration of the COVID-19 pandemic situation and associated government regulations. As a result of these online meetings and e-mail communications that followed, activities in each country were decided as summarized below.

#### Bangladesh

Target ICH: Dhamail

#### Target communities:

- 1) Traditional communities known for their practice of Dhamail: Sunamganj, Habiganj, Moulvibazar (mainly Srimangal) and the Sylhet districts
- 2) Neighbouring locations: Mymensingh, Kishoreganj, Netrakona and Brahmanbaria districts

Research focus: Comparison of Dhamail practices between rural and urban areas

#### Specific activities

- 1. Conduct further research focusing on the differences between Dhamail practices in urban areas and rural areas.
- 2. Develop Dahmail scripts relevant to the current situation in Bangladesh, and then give lessons in the suitable education programmes of DAM in rural and urban settings using these scripts.
- Organise a workshop to exchange opinions and thoughts, inviting several people from the four upazilas studied in FY 2020 and other stakeholders including IRCI. IRCI will participate in this workshop online.

If possible, introduce the recordings of Dhamail in rural and urban settings during the workshop.

- 4. Create a case study report.
- 5. Present the results of the case study at the international symposium.

#### Indonesia

Target ICH: Kethoprak

#### Target communities: Klaten region

<u>Major research focus</u>: Comparison of Kethoprak education in formal and non-formal schools

Specific activities

- 1. Develop lessons incorporating Kethoprak that are similar to the ones conducted in formal schools in FY 2020 and teach them in non-formal education institution for a case study.
- 2. Compare the results of the above study with those in FY 2020 and analyse differences and similarities between formal and non-formal education.
- 3. In the process of implementing the case study, analyse the following points to inform local governments.
  - Measures for the safeguarding, management, and utilisation of ICH for local communities that practice ICH, to encourage the community's involvement in such activities for sustainable community development.

- Practical ways of incorporating Kethoprak into both formal and non-formal education.
- 4. Organise a regional workshop to exchange opinions and thoughts by inviting experts, Kethoprak practitioners, educators and other stakeholders including IRCI. IRCI will participate in this workshop online. If possible, demonstrate the lessons that used Kethoprak.
- 5. Create a case study report.
- 6. Present the results of the case study at the international symposium.

#### Kyrgyzstan

Target ICH: Yurt and related knowledge and skills

Target communities: Naryn, Issyk-Kul, and Osh region

<u>Major research focus</u>: Roles of local museums in the target communities in safeguarding the ICH

Specific activities

- 1. Conduct further research on relationships between Kyrgyz yurt and related ICH elements surrounding the yurt as a shared community space, in three areas (Naryn, Issyk-Kul, and Osh regions) among the four areas studied in FY 2020.
- 2. Conduct research on the roles of local museums and communities (in above mentioned three areas) in safeguarding ICH and examine their contributions to SDGs including specific methodologies for utilising ICH.
- 3. Organise an international anthropological conference with the Anthropology Department of American University in Central Asia (AUCA) on safeguarding ICH in connection with education and community development, invite experts, bearers of traditional knowledge from the three study areas, and other stakeholders including IRCI. IRCI will participate in this workshop online.
- 4. Create a case study report.
- 5. Present the results of the case study at the international symposium.

#### Working schedule

The rough schedule of activities that was agreed upon by the three NGOs is shown in Table 9.

Before obtaining a formal approval from the SDGs Platform, each NGO conducted desk surveys, including research on literature and other materials related to the ICH in focus, while reviewing the activities of the previous year.

#### Table 9: Working schedule

Date	Major activities
July 2021	Finalise a detailed activity plan
	Conclude an agreement
July – November 2021	Conduct a case study * Start immediately after concluding the Exchange of Letters. * IRCI will participate in the workshops in each country online if possible (an interpreter is needed)
	Analyse the case studies
30 November 2021	Deadline to submit a case study report to IRCI * Kyrgyzstan will submit it by 7 December 2021.
December 2021	International symposium (online)
28 February 2021	Completion of the project
March 2022	The project report published on the IRCI website

#### 2. Case study

The project officially started on 6 September 2021. The case studies carried out by the three NGOs in Bangladesh, Indonesia, and Kyrgyzstan are summarised here, while detailed reports are found in this volume as an Appendix.

#### Bangladesh

Major activities in Bangladesh are summarised in Table 10.

#### Table 10: Major activities in Bangladesh

Date	Major activities
18–20 September 2021	Dhamail writing workshop at Shantiganj, Sunamganj
19–20 September 2021	Interviews with key informants in Dhirai, Santiganj, and Madhyanagar communities or upazilas of Sunamganj district
22 September– 2 October 2021	Interviews with key informants at Srimangal and Sylhet districts
23 September 2021	Visit to the Dhamail Academy
1 October 2021	The Annual Conference of Pratap Ranjan Smriti Parishad

After the desk survey, DAM organized a Dhamail writing workshop at Shantiganj upazila in the Sunamganj district on 18–20 September 2021 to create new Dhamail songs relevant to the current situation. It was attended by nine people, including a musician, a Baul singer and writer, composers, and Dhamail practitioners. They composed 19 songs covering nine issues, including environment and nature, discrimination, children's learning, artist's life, eve-teasing, drug abuse, patriotism, family planning, and sewerage.

Interviews with key informants were conducted with 16 people (4 women and 12 men, from 24 to 63 years old) from Dhirai, Santiganj, Madhyanagar communities or upazilas

of Sunamganj district on 19–20 September 2021 to collect their opinions. Participants included a Dhamail practitioner, an organizer, a music teacher, a Baul artist, a lyricist, a businessman, schoolteachers, students, and housewives. Additional interviews were conducted from 22 September to 2 October 2021 at Srimangal and Sylhet districts. Twelve participants who now live in Sylhet City but were originally from Moulvibazar and Sunamganj districts were also interviewed. They included writers, academicians, educators, researchers, Dhamail practitioners, writers, promoters, community groups and trainers.

The research team visited the Dhamail Academy at Rustampur village of Srimangal, Moulvibazar on 23 September 2021. The team had discussions with a head and a vice president of the academy and observed three Dhamail songs performed by trainees of the academy. The team also conducted a focus group discussion with 18 female trainees of the academy (3 to 12 grades) to elucidate their feelings and aspirations.

The research team observed two Dhamail performances in the Sunamganj district on 30 September 2021. One was a presentation by teenagers and young women in Satrumardan village. The second one was a simple presentation of six housewives in the Joykolosh village.

The research team was invited to the Annual Conference of Pratap Ranjan Smriti Parishad that was held on 1 October 2021 at Shantiganj Bazar, Pagla, and Shantiganj. Participants shared their ideas on various initiatives relating to Dhamail, for example about formation of Dhamail groups in villages.

#### Indonesia

Major activities are summarised in Table 11.

Date	Major activities
April – June 2021	Curriculum development Meetings with teachers, and team members
18 April 2021	Conducting the first extracurricular Kethoprak class in DFCLC
June – September 2021	Data collection (questionnaires and interviews with students and their parents)
3 September 2021	Interviewing principals, teachers, committees, and students
15 September – 18 October 2021	Data analysis Work on a case study report
23 October 2021	Workshop team meeting
27 October 2021	Rehearsal of the Kethoprak performance
28 October 2021	Kethoprak performance as an extracurricular class *Live streaming through YouTube

#### Table 11: Major activities in Indonesia

DFCLC started designing a curriculum for teaching Kethoprak at their organization in cooperation with teachers and committees in April 2021 and created guidelines. The

first extracurricular Kethoprak class was carried out with 12 students in DFCLC on 18 April 2021.

From June to September 2021, a questionnaire survey and interviews were conducted with teachers and committees of DFCLC, students who took the extracurricular Kethoprak classes in DFCLC and their parents. The results of the questionnaires and interviews were analysed and compared with the results of the FY 2020 case study.

On 28 October 2021, students who learned Kethoprak as extracurricular classes in DFCLC performed Kethoprak at the graduation ceremony in front of their parents and local government officials. The performance was streamed through YouTube.

#### Kyrgyzstan

Major activities are summarised in Table 12.

From August to 29 October 2021, TFPF visited two local museums, namely 'Salbuurun' in Bokonbaev village, Issyk-kul region and 'Fortress Koshoy-Korgon' in Kara suu village, Naryn region. In addition, TFPF virtually visited the 'Ethnographic Museum' in Sary-Mogol village, Osh region. During the visits, TFPF conducted eight interviews with initiators, founders, and workers of the above-mentioned museums, representatives of local authorities and teachers at local schools. Questionnaire surveys were conducted with 28 employees of regional and community museums.

Table 12: Major activities in Kyrgyzstan

Date	Major activities
31 August–29 October 2021	Interviews with key informants
31 August–29 October 2021	Visiting the three museums (interviews and questionnaires)
9–11 September 2021	The Forum of Museums titled 'Sustainable Museum as a Driver of Regional Development'
10 September 2021	Focus group discussions
11 September 2021	Questionnaires

The Forum of Museums titled 'Sustainable Museum as a Driver of Regional Development' took place at the Centre of Nomadic Civilization on 9–11 September 2021. During the forum, issues pertaining to the further operation of museums were addressed with the Minister of Culture.

Three focus group discussions were also conducted with 10–12 people from museum experts, and experts in the field of culture and cultural heritage on 10 September 2021.

#### 3. Workshop/Conference

As part of the case study, a workshop or a conference was organized in each country by collaborating NGOs, to share the result of their study and to obtain opinions and thoughts from stakeholders in each country. IRCI participated in this activity online to hear the voices of the local people. Under the condition that the travel to their countries was not possible due to the COVID-19 pandemic, workshops became important opportunities for IRCI to directly communicate with stakeholders, including ICH practitioners. A brief summary of the workshops is provided below, and specific information is provided in Section 2.4.

#### Bangladesh

A 'Stakeholders Workshop on Dhamail song of Sylhet region' was held online in cooperation with IRCI on 9 November 2021. Participants included experts on culture for sustainable development, ICH practitioners, researchers specialising in Dhamail, cultural activists, teachers, educators and development practitioners from the national level and the Sylhet region. About 25 people took part in the workshop.

The study presented in the workshop by DAM illustrated differences in rural and urban settings in the format of dance, usage of instruments, costumes, tunes, and clapping. While a wider use of Dhamail in various contexts was appreciated, participating experts also raised their concern and urged to preserve the richness of Dhamail practices.

#### Indonesia

A workshop titled 'The role of Kethoprak art in improving the quality of character education for students and supporting sustainable community development in Klaten' was held in cooperation with IRCI in Klaten on 4 November 2021. Participants included the principals of SD Krista Gracia Elementary School and SD Negeri 2 Trunuh Elementary School which were target schools for the FY 2020 research, Kethoprak practitioners, teachers in formal and non-formal schools, community members, a journalist, and local government officials. About 36 individuals took part in the workshop, and 11 of them joined the workshop online. The workshop was also streamed live via YouTube.

During the discussion, concerns were expressed about the loss of the noble values of local cultural arts such as traditional theatrical performance of Kethoprak due to the influences of globalisation. Educators expressed their hope to integrate Kethoprak into the school curriculum or as extra-curricular activities. Local government officials mentioned plans to strengthen ICH education in elementary and middle schools in Klaten while Kethoprak practitioners expressed their willingness to teach the values of Kethoprak art at schools.

#### Kyrgyzstan

An international conference, 'Safeguarding of the intangible cultural heritage through education' was held in cooperation with IRCI and the American University of Central Asia

(AUCA) in Bishkek on 26 November 2021. Participants included ICH researchers and experts from Kyrgyzstan and Kazakhstan, AUCA faculties and students, representatives of local and community museums, the UNESCO National Commission of Kyrgyzstan as well as practitioners of traditional cultures in Kyrgyzstan. About 50 experts took part in the conference, and half joined the conference remotely from Japan, Kazakhstan, and distant regions of Kyrgyzstan.

Participants emphasized the importance of collaboration between traditional knowledge holders and academics/researchers to strengthen the research on ICH especially on the safeguarding of the traditional knowledge and culture. Case studies on community museums were also presented.

#### 4. International symposium

The international symposium, which consisted of two parts, 1) an expert meeting with the stakeholders of this project, and 2) a public symposium with the stakeholders of this project, Japanese educators, students, and youth, was held online on 21–22 December 2021.

The expert meeting on 21 December 2021 was programmed for the three NGOs to share the results of their case studies, and to have intensive discussions among the experts. Participants had profound discussions on how ICH, education and community development related to each other and what kind of aspects of ICH affect achieving SDGs 4 and 11, based on the case studies conducted by the three NGOs. The discussion also extended to the challenges and future perspectives regarding positive aspects of ICH in achieving SDGs.

The public symposium on 22 December 2021 aimed at sharing the project outcomes with the wider public in Japan and abroad. It provided an opportunity for participants, including 44 audiences from across the world, mainly from the Asia-Pacific region, to enrich their knowledge and understanding of the contribution of ICH to SDGs and the linkage between ICH and SDGs through interactive discussions.

Section 3.2 presents the details of the discussions and the presentation materials by participants.

#### 1.4 Summary and Prospect

The two-year project, namely the case studies conducted in Bangladesh, Indonesia, and Kyrgyzstan, as well as the symposia that were programmed each year to discuss research outcomes, clearly showed that ICH, education, and community development have positive relationships, boosting each other up and contribute significantly to achieving both SDGs 4 and 11.

In Bangladesh, DAM studied Dhamail in the Sylhet region and how it affects learners' attitudes by incorporating it into non-formal education, considering that Dhamail can teach the history of a community, important social practices, religious beliefs, and

knowledge related to nature, and cultivate solidarity and mutual respect in a community. DAM's education programme utilizing Dhamail benefitted learners by helping their school learning, increasing their school attendance and friendship among them, and building unity and harmony. Dhamail also played a substantial role in enhancing the well-being of community members. Dhamail has been appreciated and practiced by both Hindus and Muslims and has been enjoyed by anyone regardless of age, gender, profession, ethnicity, and political beliefs. However, differences are recognised in its practice in the past and present, and between urban and rural areas. Although the transformation of Dhamail practice is a controversial issue, its lyrics that change depending on the situation convey important messages.

In Indonesia, DFCLC selected Kethoprak. DFCLC, as a non-formal learning centre, has provided programmes that teach knowledge and skills of various traditional culture for the youth; however, it recognises that young people are losing their interest in traditional culture including Kethoprak because of the effects of rapid globalisation and modernisation. DFCLC carried out Kethoprak education in both formal and non-formal schools. The study demonstrated quantitively that there were notable improvements in learners' motivation for learning, participation in school, academic performances, and their characters and behaviours after taking Kethoprak classes. In addition, Kethoprak education strengthened solidarity, cooperation, and caring for others in the community.

In Kyrgyzstan, TFPF selected the Kyrgyz yurt and related knowledge and skills, such as patterned weaving, felt carpet making and falconry, that have been transmitted from the cultural bearers to younger generations through a master-apprentice system. In examining how these ICH elements affect young people's behaviour towards their community and contribute to resolving issues faced by communities, special attention was paid to the role of community-based museums as a place of non-formal education. Community-based museums connect cultural masters, educators, young people, and community members by not just displaying artefacts but also providing interactive programmes utilising various ICH elements. The master-apprentice system has been effective in Kyrgyzstan to teach traditional knowledge and skills to young people. The improvement of women's leadership was observed in felt carpet making and patterned weaving, which created opportunities for them to earn cash income, and to be engaged in their own business. ICH also contributed to the community's economic growth by selling their products and attracting tourists.

The linkage between ICH and education was obvious in these studies. Education incorporating ICH in both formal and non-formal settings brought considerable effects on learners, teachers, parents, and even ICH practitioners. For learners, it increased motivation for learning and participation in school and improved academic performances on basic subjects in schools. It also positively influenced learners' attitudes and behaviours. Educators also benefited by utilising and teaching ICH in school. They developed new pedagogy by integrating ICH into basic subjects. ICH practitioners who were involved in the project became aware of the importance of their ICH and safeguarding it. They are also proud of themselves as an ICH holder and teacher.

With respect to the relationship between ICH and community development, ICH could serve as a sort of entertainment, and a source of income providing employment for

communities through holding shows and festivals, selling their products and promoting tourism. This not only brings economic benefits but also develops community members' pride and identity. Once they realise the attractiveness and benefit of ICH, their efforts for utilising, safeguarding, and transmitting ICH can be strengthened. Teaching, learning, and practicing ICH together at school or in a community reinforced a sense of solidarity, cooperation, mutual respect, social cohesion, identity, pride of being a member of their community, self-esteem, understanding the diverse gender roles, affection towards one's community, and appreciation of cultural diversity.

The contributions of ICH to SDGs could be summarised as follows:

#### Contributions to SDG 4

- ICH helps to acquire the knowledge and skills needed for sustainable development through learning messages and local wisdom that have been transmitted over generations.
- ICH improves the motivation of learning and participation in the school of students with the help of interest in ICH, and academic performance of basic subjects, which leads to ensuring the quality of education.
- ICH improves the attitudes and behaviours of students in communicating, socialising, expressing their opinions, provides the capacity of critical thinking, and increases their affection towards their community and pride of being its member.
- ICH fosters an appreciation of cultural diversity through learning the knowledge and skills of ICH together with other learners at schools or even comparing with other communities.

#### Contributions to SDG 11

- ICH makes communities aligned with sustainable development by generating income and employment, and by developing tourism.
- ICH makes communities resilient by providing entertainment, unifying a family and community, providing knowledge to cope with environment avoiding disasters, and helping alleviate pain, suffering, and the loss caused by disasters.
- ICH enhances efforts of safeguarding and transmitting ICH to young generations by raising awareness of the importance of ICH for both young people and ICH practitioners.
- ICH realises inclusive communities by involving various people in practicing ICH and related decision-making process, irrespective of gender, age, profession, religious and political faith, and ethnicity. Thus, multi-stakeholders' approach to the social problems can be acquired.



Figure 1: Relationship among ICH, education, and community

#### Contributions to other SDGs

Case studies and discussions in the project also suggested that ICH could contribute to not only SDGs 4 and 11 but also other goals. For instance:

SDG 1 (no poverty): ICH reduces poverty by providing income and jobs.

SDG 3 (good health and well-being): Practicing ICH ensures health and well-being through earning enough income and fulfilment.

SDG 5 (gender equality): ICH shows that women play a significant role and teaches gender equality.

SDG 8 (decent work and economic growth): Organising shows and festivals of ICH and selling ICH products provides work and leads to economic growth.

SDG 9 (industry, innovation and infrastructure): Establishing cultural institutions to promote ICH creates business and develop infrastructure.

SDG 10 (reduced inequalities): ICH provides opportunities for people regardless of age, gender, religious and political beliefs, professions, and ethnicity to enjoy.

SDG 13 (climate action): ICH provides ways to mitigate and avoid damages and reduce suffering from disasters, caused by climate change.

SDG 16 (peace, justice and strong institutions): ICH brings peace and justice through working and practicing together it in a family and community.

SDG 17 (partnerships for the goals): ICH Involves various stakeholders including community members, educators, researchers, NGOs, and policymakers in achieving sustainable development.

Figure 1 summarises the above-mentioned relationships among ICH, education, and community development and the ICH's contributions to SDGs.

The project also identified some important points that should be assured or carefully considered when employing ICH in the context of SDGs, and for safeguarding ICH in general.

#### Stakeholder involvement

It is a key to realise sustainable community development. Community members including women, young people and the underprivileged should be involved in the decision-making process of any activity related to their ICH. Government support is crucial to formulate policies and sustain initiatives and attempts by communities. Researchers and NGOs also play an important role to connect these stakeholders. It should be noted that the 2003 Convention highlights the role of communities in the safeguarding of ICH.

#### Adaptation of ICH

A controversial issue with respect to the transformation of ICH needs further discussion. Some stated that ICH should be kept in their original forms, while others argued that ICH needs to be modified or evolve by adapting to the rapidly changing environment that is not just natural but also social and economic. Others insisted that it is acceptable to make changes in ICH practice if it does not lose the essence or the most important components of ICH. However, everyone warned that any change should be made with the consent of the community of ICH practitioners. As demonstrated in the project, ICH links the youth and the elderly and connects the past and present. ICH has been recreated and adapted by the community in response to their environment, interaction with nature and history.

In conclusion, it is evident from the project results that ICH is a driver and enabler for achieving SDGs 4 and 11 as explained in Figure 1, which could be extended to other SDGs as well. ICH improves the quality of education; ICH education contributes to cultivating both cognitive and non-cognitive skills of young people, which enables better learning and growth. Those who acquired such abilities will be able to contribute to utilising, promoting, safeguarding, and transmitting ICH by becoming facilitators, practitioners, and researchers of ICH, teachers, policymakers, and leaders of their community. ICH enriches community members' lives by creating income and jobs and providing entertainment. It also provides a means to reduce anxiety and pain caused by illness and disasters. Recognising such benefits of ICH in the context of SDGs will eventually enhance the safeguarding and transmission of ICH.

The project was able to raise awareness of learners, educators, ICH practitioners, community members, and government officials about the importance of ICH and its effectiveness in the SDGs context. It also infiltrated the concept of SDGs into people involved in the project. Although SDGs do not set culture itself as a specific goal, any approach to SDGs that does not consider the role of culture may not be tenable, given that ICH is closely tied to the people and their environment and is the source of the community's sustainability and resilience. It is important to acknowledge the nature of ICH that is closely rooted in the local environment and transmitted over generations, and actively mobilising it as part of activities related to SDGs; however, it is also important to recognize that the viability of ICH has to be assured through various

safeguarding efforts for that ICH to be effectively utilised for the purpose of SDGs. In this respect, the current movement associated with SDGs that is both global and local is a great opportunity to promote the importance of safeguarding ICH.
## 2. Summary of the 2-year Case Study



Section cover photo: Dhamail performance, Bangladesh ©DAM

## Ehsanur Rahman Dhaka Ahsania Mission, Bangladesh

Intangible Cultural Heritage (ICH) is comprised of practices, representations, expressions, knowledge, and skills, including instruments, objects, artefacts, and cultural spaces, that communities, groups, and others, recognise as part of their cultural heritage (UNESCO, 2003). Bangladesh has a rich cultural heritage, especially intangible cultural heritage. It is the common heritage of humanity that deserves to be creatively passed down to future generations as a precious asset.

The International Research Centre for Intangible Cultural Heritage in the Asia-Pacific Region (IRCI), a UNESCO Category 2 Centre, and Dhaka Ahsania Mission (DAM), a NGO in consultative status with UN Economic and Social Council (ECOSOC) and UNESCO, jointly undertook a two-year research project through two consecutive studies (FY 2020 and FY 2021) on Dhamail songs and dances, which DAM has identified as a rich cultural heritage from Bangladesh's Sylhet region. This illustration gives a brief account of the two studies depicting the past, present, and possible future trends of Dhamail practices in the region and its spread to the neighbouring districts of the country as well as abroad.

Dhamail being a traditional folk dance-cum-song of Bangladesh's Sylhet region since the 14th century has been referred to in many literatures as a cultural heritage. Over the years, it has been performed by locals as a form of entertainment during social occasions, like weddings, birthdays, religious festivals, and others. Due to its growing popularity and performances in various contexts, diversity in Dhamail practices has been observed, illustrating differences in rural and urban settings in terms of dance format, instruments usage, costumes, tune, and clapping.

A two-year study gave an opportunity to focus deeply on Dhamail practices in various settings. The study objective in FY 2020 (17 September 2020 – 28 February 2021) was to understand its historic perspective, impact, and effectiveness at the community level, particularly its stimulus to education and social changes. The follow-up study in FY 2021 (12 September 2021 – 28 February 2022) aims to see Dhamail's spread and role in the realisation of Sustainable Development Goals (SDG) with specific reference to SDGs 4 (Education) and 11 (Community Development). Another element of this round of study was focused on safeguarding Dhamail as an ICH and its revitalization. The following are the five dimensions that have been addressed through these studies:

- (a) Research on ICH's contribution to SDGs: Education (SDG 4) and Community Development (SDG 11);
- (b) Research on Dhamail practices in rural and urban areas;
- (c) Development of contextually relevant Dhamail scripts for Education and Community Development (FY 2021);
- (d) Documentation of Dhamail practices and their changes over the years; and
- (e) Mapping institutional and informal settings for safeguarding Dhamail and its revitalization as ICH.

Since Dhamail is a traditional folk dance-cum-song of the Sylhet region, the selected study location largely covers the region's districts. In the first year, the study was confined to the four unions of four upazila under the Sunamganj district of Sylhet division. In the follow-up study in FY 2021 a wider geographical coverage was targeted, spreading to the division's Sunamganj, Habiganj, Moulvibazar (Srimangal) and Sylhet districts.

Methodological tools were developed for FY 2020 and FY 2021 studies in terms of qualitative data collection from the selected respondents. In the first year, a multi-stage random sampling method was followed to collect quantitative data at the community level. In both studies, structured and semi-structured questionnaires have been developed for fieldwork. A semi-structured questionnaire was developed for the focus group discussion (FGD) and consultations. The structured questionnaire was developed for the key informant's interview (KII). The following list enumerates the methodological process to give an idea about the diversity in the mode of information collection:

FY 2020

- Literature review;
- Visit to Dhamail training institutions;
- KII (5 participants from each union Palash, Badaghat, Rafinagar, and Joykolosh);
- FGD (17 participants: 11 male and 6 female at Taherpur upazila): A Let us Learn officials Technical Coordinator, Programme Officer, and upazila Coordinator;
- FGD (27 youth: 21 girls and 6 boys at Bishwamvarpur upazila): A Let us Learn project officials, Data Enumerators, and union Supervisor of this research study;
- FGD (9 teachers and 14 community members, aged between 60 to 80 years) at Derai upazila;
- FGD (10 teachers at South Sunamganj upazila);
- Observation of group performance; and
- Stakeholders' consultation.

## FY 2021

- Literature review;
- Visit to Dhamail training institutions;
- KII (12 experts and 16 Dhamail activists): academicians, Dhamail researchers, writers, groups, organizations, organizer, housewives, school teachers, lyricists, singers;
- FGD (18 participants): Dhamail trainees, performers;
- Writing workshop (9 persons): Dhamail practitioner, organizer, music teacher, Baul artist, lyricist, school teachers, students;
- Observation of group performances;
- Social media tracking Facebook, YouTube; and
- Stakeholders' consultation.

## Findings: Dhamail in practices

Findings from the studies have been shared through national level consultations at the end of each year. The first-year workshop's insights have been useful in formulating the second-year study and its deeper analysis. Experts' perceptions were gathered on the

current Dhamail practices and its future opportunities, particularly in reference to its contributions to SDGs.

In the second year, a stakeholder workshop, was held on 9 November 2021 in a virtual setting, where participants from various fields were invited and in which IRCI representatives also joined. There, ICH practitioners specializing on Dhamail, experts on sustainable development, researchers, cultural activists, teachers, educators, national level, and the Sylhet region level development practitioners exchanged their opinions and thoughts. In this section, the discussion's highlights and recommendations were mentioned.

Dhamail song and dance as ICH is concentrated in the Sylhet region and has a deep relationship with local knowledge as an integrated part of daily life and cultural values. It represents the Sylheti culture which is built on inclusiveness and social interaction. It thus contributes to developing interpersonal relationships and effective communication among people. It represents solidarity and shared values of the Haor (wetland) people, uniting people irrespective of caste, creed, religion, gender, or age. It also promotes sustainable social and economic development that empowers underprivileged communities, ensuring the active participation of people of all levels in the community, including women and children.

Because of cultural homogeneity in and around the region, Dhamail somehow has influence on the neighbouring districts of Bangladesh (e.g., Mymensingh, Kishoreganj, Netrakona, and Brahmanbaria). Its influence is also seen in some parts of India, like Assam, Tripura, and the Meghalaya states (e.g., the Cachar, Karimganj, and Hailakandi districts of Assam, parts of Tripura and Shillong under Meghalaya).

A common feature of Dhamail song-cum-dance is that it is performed by a group of approximately eight women. It is mostly a traditional entertainment that is performed as a group song. It is accompanied by such musical instruments as harmonium and modern mandira (an instrument consisting of a pair of metal bowls used for rhythm effect). A kartal, a primeval instrument, is also used in devotional folk songs. This wooden clapper has discs or plates that produce a clinking sound when clapped together. Nowadays, many other musical instruments are also played by men as the dance is performed.

Dhamail in its dance form mainly relates to love and contains a wish for the newly wedded couple to unite their souls. In rural wedding ceremonies (specially in Hindu family which is held nightlong), women perform Dhamail where older women take lead roles. Over years the use of Dhamail has widened and is now performed during various social events and festivals. For example, Dhamail is performed on birthdays, new house fest, Annaprasana (child feeding ceremony), Gayae-halud (turmeric ceremony), Jamai Baran (receiving bridegroom), Pujaparvan (religious rituals), irrigation fests, and rice grinding, among others. Dhamail has religious, educational, and cultural values. Culturally and religiously, it develops relations among families and communities. Dhamail is very effective to unite and foster bonding within the community.

## Findings: Views on Changes and Practices

Over the decades, with the widening of the usage of Dhamail practices in various rural and urban contexts in the region and around the world, particularly in countries where the migrant Sylheti families have moved (e.g., United Kingdom, United States), there were changes in the practices. During the FY 2021 study, DAM particularly looked into the issue and welcomed the ideas of diversity in composition, display, and grooming of the new generation. Here are a few snapshots of the changes observed during physical presentations, video documentaries, and social media displays of some social events.

- It was observed that there are differences between Dhamail practices in villages and cities. For example, in the case of dance, hand and foot work differ to some extent in rural and urban areas. Instruments in orchestra in urban settings also tend to vary.
- Differences were also observed between young and elderly performers in tune, dancing, and clapping pattern (faster and high sounding in youngsters' performance).
- Costume is also being changed. On many social and formal occasions, performers use styled costumes.
- Modern instruments like drum sets are getting used in some rural events as well.
- In the past, Dhamail was performed as a simple circle display. Now, its style is being changed radically due to the inclusion of modern instruments.

A few examples in weblinks:

A Dhamail documentary:

https://m.theindependentbd.com/arcprint/details/207572/2019-07-16

A new format of Dhamail dance in YouTube: https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=3CBNIF1s-1k

Dhamail in rural setting (A Television production): https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=Q6cjAEoVVks

Dhamail in urban setting (uploaded in YouTube): https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=6ablxV2XRul

## Future Trends and Opportunities

The field study shows that people's interest in Dhamail has been growing. It was traditionally learned from parents and other adults. Currently, there are opportunities to learn it in academic settings. Establishment of training academy in the local setting created an opportunity for rural girls to learn it. Various cultural organizations and music and dance education centres started offering Dhamail courses. Examples of this includes Udichi (a popular cultural group), Shrihatta Cultural Council, Navnagari Dhamail Sangha, Shilpakala Academy local centres, Lokdol Dhamail Sangha, Dhamail Academy, and International RadhaRamon Parishad.

Organizing writers' workshop during the study shows that Dhamail songs could be composed on any subject. Dhamail scriptwriters confirm that they composed lyrics on various social anomalies. People who have basic knowledge about melody and rhythm and are exposed to various social issues could compose them. Formal education or training was not considered an essential requirement by the participating Dhamail practitioners in the DAM organized workshop.

Nowadays, Dhamail songs include various current social issues and challenges, which adult women, men, and youth could employ for raising social awareness and for campaigns in order to implant in peoples' minds in the consultation, it was observed that educational, community development, health, safety, social, and political awareness issues could be amplified at the marginal level through Dhamail without compromising its quality. Thus, Dhamail teams could play an important role in initiating the process of revitalizing it as an effective communication tool and preserving the cultural heritage of the country.

The study reveals that the ways of using Dhamail in education are immense, with significant outcomes. For instance, it increases school attendance and friendship among students. The dancing component of Dhamail includes physical movements, therefore, it could eliminate inertia during the COVID-19 pandemic lockdown. Using Dhamail in the teaching-learning of children and adolescents in public and private schools would have long lasting results (learning through song is quicker and long-lasting). When presenting Dhamail, working as a group increased unity and harmony among the presenters. Group singing improved human relationships that contribute to the maintainance of peace and order in the society. It could also increase the community's resilience to disasters, calamities, and peoples' sufferings.

As a result of these immense benefits, during consultation workshop it has been suggested to include Dhamail in the institutional practices of various neighbourhoods and various school-college programmes. It has also been suggested that to include Dhamail in school programmes, pioneer students should be trained by community level teachers and practitioners.

From the perspective of safeguarding ICH, most people during the study claimed that Dhamail would not become extinct because of its potential and tendency to adapt to changing circumstances. However, experts have warned that any changes in Dhamail should be introduced while ensuring its quality and protecting its roots. For example, the rhythm and words must be coordinated in harmony with each other. The mainstream trend must continue to support the revitalization and ensure the safeguarding of Dhamail. These measures would defuse the apprehension that the rhythm and steps of the original song might be lost.

Moreover, there were suggestions about institutional support with regard to documentation, training, and promotional activities in educational and community development programmes. There is a need for a formation of Dhamail Cultural group at the community level, in the non-formal and formal schools, and higher educational institutions. In addition, it was recommended to encourage new lyricists, collection of songs, publishing books and distribution of those to people from all generations. During the KII, experts have recommended policy guidelines to preserve lyrics, notation, and dance forms as well as an authentic publication of the Dhamail history.

Kristian Apriyanta Dewi Fortuna Community Learning Center, Indonesia

#### Chapter I

#### INTRODUCTION

#### A. Background

There are many reasons for choosing the Art of Kethoprak<sup>1</sup> as the object of this case study research.

Kethoprak is a cultural heritage that has been inherited since the past civilisation. It is a communal social identity that is continuously passed down to the next generation and a real implementation of a functional unit of society, where all parts of the social system work together in producing a performing art. It is also a medium for character education. Kethoprak contains knowledge about values, norms and customs, behaviour and aesthetic, and artistic, creative, and appreciative traditional skills that are:

(1) Multilingual: Kethoprak is a combination of expressions of aesthetic, logical, and ethical language elements from various visual media, literature, music, and textual and acting that develop a sense of taste.

(2) Multidimensional: It consists of a variety of knowledge, analysis, evaluation, appreciation, and competency skills about past traditions, present artistic engineering technology, value of creativity, and inspiration for the future.

(3) Multicultural: It raises awareness towards respect and love for local cultural heritage and cultures around the world, encourages living in harmony within a pluralistic society, and supports civilized democracy and tolerance for differences of values.

(4) Multi-intelligence: It forms many kinds of intelligence namely personal psychology, including intra-interpersonal visual-spatial, verbal-linguistic, musical, mathematical-logic, and bodily-kinaesthetic intelligence.

However, Kethoprak in Klaten is currently facing the threat of extinction due to the negative effects of globalization, which makes younger generation lose interest in

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Traditional Drama performances started with Improvised Dance Drama Performances, which are used as rituals for farmers to worship the Goddess of Fertility during the planting and harvesting seasons of rice. Accompanied by the music of the *lesung* (traditional rice pounder made of wood) with the song 'Tembang Jawa', this drama is believed to be the beginning of Kethoprak which was born in Klaten in the 19th century (1887). With the characteristics of *kenthongan* as a guide and *gamelan* music as an accompaniment, the story's sources are myth and history, Javanese language, traditional clothing, makeup, and dance, with rules describing the values of Javanese life teachings, which have philosophical meanings and teachings for life. *Memayu Hayuning Bawana* is the concept of living in a harmonious relationship with nature, fellow human beings, and God.

traditional art as they consider it to be ancient. The younger generation's understanding of the benefits and values of this cultural heritage must be broadened to show the community that elements of past intangible cultural heritage in the art of Kethoprak benefits future life. Research was carried out to determine the contribution of ICH values through learning Kethoprak to SDGs 4 and 11. In collaboration with IRCI, case study I (FY 2020) was conducted, which focuses on the comparison between a formal elementary school that incorporated Kethoprak into lessons and one that did not (held from October 2020 to January 28, 2021). In case study II (FY 2021), Kethoprak teaching was implemented in a non-formal school (held from March to December 2021). These case studies are expected to provide a new spirit in the preservation and development of Kethoprak in order to strengthen the contribution of ICH elements in the field of education and culture.

## B. Purpose

The purpose of this research is to understand the role of Kethoprak in the improvement of the quality of education and sustainable community development in Klaten Regency, especially focusing on the contribution of ICH values of Kethoprak in the improvement of the quality of education (SDG 4), impact on sustainable community development (SDG 11), and other positive impacts.

## C. Research Object

The research targets of case study I are formal elementary schools, namely: (1) SD Krista Gracia, which utilised Kethoprak in lessons and (2) SD Negeri 2 Trunuh, which did not utilise it in lessons. The research target of case study II is a non-formal school, called Dewi Fortuna CLC, which integrated Kethoprak in the basic subject lessons and implemented it in extracurricular special subjects. The population of the study are as follows:

Object/ Respondent	case study I		case study II
	SD Krista Gracia	SD N 2 Trunuh	Dewi Fortuna CLC
	has lessons	no lessons	has lessons
Students			
Class	5 – 6	5-6	5 - 12
Age	11 – 12 years old	11 – 12 years old	13 – 50 years old
Male	6 people	5 people	17 people
Female	6 people	5 people	10 people
total	11 people	11 people	27 people
Headmaster	1 person	1 person	1 person
Cultural Arts Teacher	1 person	1 person	1 person
Java Language Teacher	1 person	1 person	1 person
History Social Teacher	1 person	1 person	1 person
Civics teacher	1 person	1 person	1 person
Parent	5 people	5 people	5 people
Public figure	1 person	1 person	3 people

## D. Method

The research method is based on case studies with a comparative model to examine cases in a systematic way as follows:

- 1. Observation, survey, collection of initial data from digital footprint;
- 2. Collecting quantitative and qualitative data evidence from primary and secondary data (questionnaires, interviews, documentation);
- 3. Analysis of collected data with the basic method *one sample t-test type*<sup>2</sup> (classification, calculation in case study I);
- 4. Implementation practice in non-formal education in case study II;
- 5. Analysis of comparative results (case study I with case study II); and
- 6. Conclusion based on the result of research findings.

## Chapter II

## RESULTS

## A. Contribution to improving the quality of education (SDG 4)

The contribution of Kethoprak in improving the quality of education (SDG 4) can be seen from the following.

## 1. School Capacity

Observation of school capacity is based on the results of questionnaires and interviews with one non-formal and two formal schools. It made clear that the three schools had different capacities as shown in the table below.

School capacity to	case study I		case study II
teach Kethoprak	Krista Gracia	N 2 Trunuh	DFCLC
School vision/mission	Has	Has	Has
Principal's motivation	Has	Has	Has
Infrastructure facilities	Has	No	Has
Funding	Has	No	No
Cooperation	Has	No	Has
management			
Curriculum	extracurricular	No	Core and
			extracurricular

Krista Gracia and Dewi Fortuna CLC have the capacity to carry out Kethoprak Art Learning and N 2 Trunuh does not.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> This analysis compares the differences and similarities of the data sample group with other data. This analysis aims to test hypotheses to produce a thorough and comprehensive case analysis of the 'what', 'how', and 'why' which could be the basis for further research.

#### 2. Improved Subject Values

Compared to the average scores in schools in Semester I (before participating in Kethoprak learning), Semester II's (after attending Kethoprak learning) average scores have increased in a few subjects in schools that held such lessons. They were found to have a positive impact on four subjects, namely: Cultural Arts, Javanese Language, Social Sciences, and Citizenship Education.



#### 3. Improved Character Education

The influence of ICH elements on Kethoprak character education can be seen from the students' attitudes in learning Kethoprak. For example, the religious attitude follows the *kondangan* ritual tradition, <sup>3</sup> where students foster harmony and tolerance, work together, respect differences of opinion, and provide prayer opportunities for those with different religions. They also show their independence when preparing tools; strengthen love for the homeland; increase respect for the service of heroes; and think about etiquette and courtesy towards their parents.

Questionnaires' and interviews' data consist of responses about character values. According to the National Education's goals, there are 18 attitude indicators. Respondents were: one principal, four subject teachers, one community leader, parents of 11 students from Negeri 2 Trunuh, 11 students from Krista Gracia, and 12 students from DF CLC.

No	Character Values	Krista Gracia	N 2 Trunuh	DF CLC
1.	Religious	11	11	11
2.	Honest	8	1	10
3.	Tolerance	11	9	12
4.	Discipline	8	3	10
5.	Cooperation	11	7	12
6.	Creative	8	1	7
7.	independent	7	3	8
8.	Democratic	9	5	7
9.	Curiosity	11	5	10
10.	Spirit of nationality	11	10	11
11.	Patriotism	11	11	12
12.	Appreciating Achievements	11	9	10
13.	Communicative	11	7	10
14.	Love peace	11	10	12
15.	Like to read	9	5	7
16.	Environmental care	11	11	12
17.	Social care	11	10	12
18.	Responsibility	11	11	12

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> The prayer tradition of offering and eating traditional food is a symbol of gratitude to the universe.

Schools that did not teach Kethoprak have a low number of positive character attitudes. It demonstrates that Kethoprak has a positive impact on students' character building.

## B. Contribution to Sustainable Community Development (SDG 11)

The art of Kethoprak has contributed to the protection and preservation of cultural heritage. This can be seen in indicators such as community involvement, partnership, and awareness in schools that organize Kethoprak learning activities, teaching knowledge about *gamelan* music, traditional songs, Javanese language, and script, providing resources about folklore and community history, lending free tools and facilities for rehearsals and performances, involving in organising committees, and providing assistance in funding. This stimulates the growth of feelings of solidarity, cooperation, and unity of social life in a community in order to safeguard Kethoprak together.

## C. Contribution to other SDGs

In case study II of the DFCLC as a non-formal education unit, it was found that there was an impact on other SDGs. This was due to the fact that non-formal education participants tended to be more mature, already working, or unemployed. This can be seen from the observation of interest and the acquisition of new knowledge about the following:

- 1. Gender equality (SDG 5): Increases the understanding of the importance of the role of women in traditional Javanese arts from stories about the Empress and Javanese heroines;
- 2. Growth of local community's economy (SDG 8): Community sells food products and rents services for supporting performances;
- 3. Creating opportunities for traditional performing arts creative industries (SDG 9) such as makeup artist, traditional clothing crafts, lighting designer, videographer, and other performance equipment;
- 4. Teaching caring for the environment (SDG 15) because Kethoprak stories always teach a harmonious living system and respect for nature through cultural symbols; and
- 5. Forming new art communities and forging more partnerships (SDG 17) to preserve Kethoprak.

## Chapter III

## CLOSING

The results of the case study research shows that Kethoprak has had a positive impact on the efforts to promote ICH elements to improve the quality of education (SDG 4) and sustainable development (SDG 11), as well as have an impact on SDGs 5, 8, 9, 15, and 17. This is welcomed by local governments, entrepreneurs, practicing artists, journalists, and community leaders in FGDs and received a positive response because Kethoprak has educational, participatory, and creative economic effects. Recommendations are classified into the following two policies.

## A. Klaten Regency Government Policy

- 1. The Department of Culture focuses on facilitating the preservation of Kethoprak art through the Student Kethoprak Festival;
- 2. Regional Development Planning Agency plans to form a study team to realise Klaten as a Kethoprak City; and
- 3. The Department of Education, through a circular letter, urged the integration of Kethoprak in the curriculum with general core curricular and extracurricular subjects.

## B. Practitioner Artists Society Policy

- 1. The Arts Council encourages the issuance of village regulations on the advancement of Kethoprak as an art that is preserved in the village;
- 2. The principal, together with practicing artists, will conduct teacher quality improvement lessons by organizing workshops on Javanese language and script and writing Kethoprak stories;
- 3. Creating business opportunities based on the use of Kethoprak to improve the community welfare economy.

DFCLC hopes to continue collaborating with IRCI with more research objects in advanced formal schools (for students aged 12 to 17 years) and with other CLC, establish communication and cooperation with more parties to promote the intangible cultural heritage, including Kethoprak, and make an effort so that Kethoprak is recognised as ICH by UNESCO.

## 2.3 Kyrgyzstan

Almagul Osmonova Jyldyz Doolbekova Taalim-Forum Public Foundation, Kyrgyzstan

In 2020-2021, the research group of the 'Taalim-Forum' public foundation (Kyrgyzstan) participated in the project entitled 'Research on ICH's Contribution to SDGs: Education and Community Development', which was supported by IRCI.

In the first stage, the study aimed to analyse the experience of 'visionary communities' in Kyrgyzstan with a focus on 'functional preservation' and the transmission of ICH as a 'living culture'. The selected 'visionary communities' were studied to identify the links between safeguarding ICH and achieving the SDG, including sustainable community development (SDG 11), achieving gender equality by empowering women and girls (SDG 5), and ensuring inclusive and equitable quality education and promotion of lifelong learning opportunities for all (SDG 4). The target element of the ICH in the study was the culture associated with the nomadic dwelling Kyrgyz-Kazakh yurt which was inscribed in the Representative List of the Intangible Cultural Heritage of Humanity. This includes the knowledge and skills in making yurts, the craft of making felt carpets, and pattern weaving.

Since, in parallel with ICH elements, the study explored the process of transferring ICH knowledge to new generations, the second phase of the research focused on studying the role of local community museums in the three regions where the first case study has been conducted.

The research methodology was based on a participatory approach in which local communities become active participants in the research process. The research activities included desk research, conducting FGD with ICH experts, and visits to selected local communities in the four regions. In-depth interviews were conducted with traditional knowledge holders, local activists and leaders, community museum founders and staff, local authorities, and school teachers. A questionnaire survey was conducted among employees of regional and community museums. The research group took part in the Forum of Museums' 'Sustainable Museum as a Driver for the Development of Regions', which was held at the Centre for Nomadic Civilization in the Issyk-Kul region. Participation there allowed the team to conduct FGD and questionnaire surveys. In partnership with the American University of Central Asia (AUCA), the International Conference was organised to discuss the safeguarding of intangible cultural heritage in Kyrgyzstan through formal and non-formal education and conducting research. There, the participants, including IRCI representatives, researchers, and ICH experts from Kyrgyzstan and Kazakhstan, AUCA students, representatives of local and public museums, the UNESCO National Commission in Kyrgyzstan, as well as practitioners of traditional culture, exchanged their views and thoughts.

## **Findings and analysis**

## FY 2020

Among the studied rural communities that are located in different regions of Kyrgyzstan, the Kyzyl-Tuu village has become widely known today, having received the informal name 'village of yurt-makers'. The community achieved this success with the support of the local NGO *Kiyiz Duino*, which has taken a leadership role in reviving and popularizing the art of yurt making, as well as felt production and traditional knowledge in general, through workshops, research, festivals, and demonstrations. As a result of the NGO's active work, more than 50 craftsmen cooperate with it today on an ongoing basis. The holding of regular festivals, which involve local residents, has attracted attention to ICH both at the national and international levels and spurred the development of tourism in the region.

The study showed that the community of the highland village of Sary Mogol in the Chon-Alai district of the Osh region carefully preserves, develops, and transfers the skill and knowledge of artistic pattern weaving. Rural craftswomen have united their efforts and created a community organization. They hold regular master classes and involve young women. Their collaboration with a public organization, the *Institute for Sustainable Development Strategy*, helped them build a strategy to revive the art of pattern weaving, ensure the sustainability of the results that are achieved through involvement in incomegenerating activities, and improve the quality of handicraft products.

Another case study showed that the art of making felt carpets is well preserved and

continues to develop in Naryn region, where the studied community of Acha Kaiyndy village in At Bashy district helped understand the ways of safeguarding an important ICH element, that is, the Kyrgyz traditional art of making felt carpets *Ala-Kiyiz* and *Shyrdak*, which is inscribed in the List of Intangible Cultural Heritage in Need of Urgent Safeguarding in 2012.

The studied unique experience of ICH conservation in the community of the Bokonbaev village in the Issyk-Kul region deserves attention and further dissemination. The living knowledge of our ancestors on traditional hunting has been preserved here thanks to the efforts of enthusiastic local leaders who created the *Salbuurun Federation*. It unites falconers throughout the country and their work is aimed at preserving and transferring traditional knowledge related to Kyrgyz hunting with falcons, golden eagles, and the local dog breed of *Taigan*. The transfer of knowledge to new generations goes through the traditional system: *Ustat – Shakirt* (Master – Apprentice). The Federation organises festivals and revives and popularises the art of traditional archery and the knowledge of upbringing birds of prey. The transfer of knowledge to new generations also takes place in the Youth Learning Centre, where classes are held in a traditional yurt, as well as outdoors.

The first phase of the study confirmed the hypothesis that ICH can be a source of strength and energy for the sustainable development of communities, as well as a way to solve local social and economic problems. The studied communities demonstrated that they still preserve traditional knowledge on ICH, experience it in daily life, and pass it on to the next generations. The ICH knowledge and skills contain valuable ecological knowledge with mechanisms for adapting and maintaining a balanced and sustainable way of life, which is relevant to achieving SDGs. The case studies vividly demonstrate how the development of the local economy integrates spiritual, cultural, and environmental components, including traditional ecological knowledge. Local initiatives in the studied communities contribute to the improvement of well-being and stimulate leadership among youth and women.

The study showed that communities carefully preserve the heritage of their ancestors and make efforts to revive and transfer traditional knowledge and spiritual culture. Master artisans are respected and have apprentices who are interested in learning. Local leaders recognize the importance of engaging youth to pass on knowledge. Tourism with elements of ethno-tourism and cultural and community tourism is developing, and in turn, stimulating the development of traditional types of handicrafts. The findings of the research demonstrate that traditional knowledge, skills, and experience help local communities survive today's rapidly changing world. ICH has become a source of cultural resilience, inspiration, consolidation, and collective responsibility. Local festivals are held regularly with the participation of craftsmen and holders of traditional knowledge such as the Felt Festival in Kyzyl-Tuu, Salbuurun Festivals in Bokonbaev, Shyrdak festivals in Acha-Kaindy, Lenin Peak in Sary Mogol. These festivals help promote handicrafts, stimulate the improvement of the quality of the products, empower local artisans and raise their status in communities. In all studied communities, the growth of female leadership is clearly visible. Women's groups have become more active through establishing public organizations, associations, cooperatives, and informal groups.

The study also identified barriers to successful ICH safeguarding. Among them are the spread of radical religious values that run counter to traditional cultural values of Kyrgyzstan and worshiping nature; weak government support; frequent political upheavals; low level of social security; high level of labour migration; degradation of pastures and deterioration of farmers' lives; and globalization that leads to the growth of mass pop culture and intensification of the process of erasing the cultural identity of people of Kyrgyzstan.

## FY 2021

In the studied communities, the opening and maintaining of the local community museums to safeguard traditional culture and ICH elements deserve a careful study. The focus of the research included the efforts of *Salbuurun Federation* in Bokonbaev Village, which established a local museum inside a traditional yurt. Another community museum was established in Sary Mogol village in an old traditional house. The third case for the study included the *Koshoi Korgon Fortress Museum* in the At Bashy district.

It was observed that the establishment of museums was based on donations of personal collections and items that contain cultural, memorial, decorative, or historical value. All three museums have been supported by local residents who donated artefacts and rare family possessions. All studied museums are located in attractive tourist places in Kyrgyzstan and present local culture to a wide audience.

Even though the *Salbuurun Museum* was opened inside the yurt, the *Koshoi-Korgon Fortress Museum* was specially built near the ancient historical and archaeological site, and the Ethnographic Museum in Sary-Mogol was based in the traditional house of a local family, in which the strong personal attitude of the founders of the museums to safeguard local heritage and revive and spread the knowledge of their ancestors have been clearly observed.

All museums pay attention to engaging local communities, working with local schools, teachers, and communicating with local authorities, businesses, and supportive people. They demonstrated their capacity to safeguard and promote local cultural values, become a cultural and educational centre, and contribute to the well-being of the local population. Safeguarding ICH through educational programmes involves local communities, women, and children. The methods to engage the youth include hands-on education, game-based approaches, conducting research projects, and other interactive activities.

The sharp decline in mobility caused by COVID-19 has led to a global crisis in the tourism industry, which also affected museums. Analysis showed that the number of foreign visitors was partially offset by the influx and interest of local communities in the museums' activities. In 2021, the predominance of local residents and domestic tourists relative to foreign tourists was observed.

The National Committee of Museums (ICOM Kyrgyzstan), the Consortium of Museums, and the Centre for Museum Initiatives Public Foundation are the organisations that support museum work and implement programs strengthening the capacity of museum

professionals in Kyrgyzstan. The collaboration of local community museums with these organisations is crucial to ensure their sustainability and strengthen their positions as cultural centres of local communities that contribute to ICH safeguarding. The studied museums provide their local communities with a place where they can meet, practice, learn, share, and promote ICH. They preserve the interest in cultural heritage sites and visually demonstrate intangible cultural values, reveal the spiritual meaning of cultural traditions, knowledge, and skills, and pass these to the younger generation. This work undoubtedly contributes to the implementation of the principles of the UNESCO Convention, promotes the diversity of cultural expressions, raises a sense of pride and involvement in its safeguarding and transmission to new generations.

The museums actively promote the presence of ICH in everyday life, attract visitors, and become popular socio-cultural centres that play an important role in safeguarding ICH, interpreting cultural heritage, and adapting it to modern social life. Thorough work with local communities contributes to raising a sense of pride and participation in ICH safeguarding, emotional attachment to places of residence, involvement in heritage management, obtaining new knowledge, and discussing risks, challenges, and opportunities.

Along with the positive aspects of the museums' activities, some shortcomings of the museums have been observed, including insufficient professional training of staff, which affects the carrying out of the documentation and inventory work, methods of updating and arranging expositions, and storage system. All newly established museums need to develop a reliable system of security and monitoring for the buildings and all the exhibits.

During the discussions and interviews with the participants of the Museum Forum and AUCA Conference, museum workers themselves have expressed the idea that it is necessary to rethink their work, taking into account the changed situation and the challenges in safeguarding ICH. It is important to understand and find ways to build museum collections containing ICH, organise exhibitions, and develop educational programs that are aimed at transferring knowledge and skills to young generations. Priority should be given to ways to co-create knowledge on ICH and their understanding by interpreting and communicating with the audience.

The case study research findings have been presented to international symposiums organized by IRCI with the focus on ICH's contribution to SDGs – Education and Community Development.

## 2.4 Workshops

In FY 2021 the three NGOs organised workshops/conferences to share their research with stakeholders, researchers, experts, educators, students, local government officials, ICH bearers, community members, and media related people in each country. It became a good opportunity to gather participators' opinions and thoughts concerning the safeguarding of ICH, education, and community development. The details of the workshops/conferences organised by the three NGOs are described here.

#### 1. Bangladesh

Title: Stakeholders Workshop on Dhamail song of Sylhet region

**Organiser:** Dhaka Ahsania Mission (DAM) in cooperation with International Research Centre for Intangible Cultural Heritage in the Asia-Pacific Region (IRCI)

Date: 9 November 2021, 10:00 – 13:00 (Bangladesh time)

#### Place: Online

A workshop 'Stakeholders Workshop on Dhamail song of Sylhet region' was held online by Dhaka Ahsania Mission (DAM) in cooperation with IRCI. The workshop was part of IRCI's project 'ICH's contributions to SDGs – Education and Community Development,' which investigates the relationship among ICH, SDG 4 (Quality education), and SDG 11 (Sustainable cities and communities) and the roles of ICH in education and community development. During the workshop, participants, including experts on culture for sustainable development, ICH practitioners, researchers specialising in Dhamail, cultural activists, teachers, educators and development practitioners from the national level and the Sylhet region, exchanged opinions and thoughts.

Dhamail, a traditional folk dance-cum-song of the Sylhet region in Bangladesh since the 14th century, has been recognized as an important cultural heritage. Over years, it has been performed by local people as a mode of entertainment in the marriage ceremonies, social occasions, various religious festivals, birthdays, and so on. Due to a growing popularity and performances in various contexts, a diversity has been reported in the practice of Dhamail. The study by DAM presented in the workshop illustrated the differences in rural and urban settings in the format of dance, use of instruments, dresses, tunes and clapping. While a wider use of Dhamail in various contexts was appreciated, participating experts also raised a concern and urged to preserve the richness of Dhamail practices. In this regard, the ICH safeguarding initiative by IRCI and DAM was welcomed by the participants, and promotional activities in educational and community development programmes.

#### Workshop information

#### Background

The interlinkages and integrated nature of the Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs) provided room to contribute culture, especially intangible cultural heritage (ICH) to the SDGs. Studies by the International Research Centre for Intangible Cultural Heritage in the Asia-Pacific Region (IRCI), a Category 2 institute of UNESCO, testifies on ICH's contribution to SDG 4, specifically target 4.7 (peace and cultural diversity) and SDG 11 (sustainable cities and communities).

Dhaka Ahsania Mission (DAM) with its diverse educational experiences and initiatives to contribute to SDGs joined with IRCI in a research project to analyse the relationship among ICH, education, and communities and clarify the roles of ICH for achieving SDG 4 and 11. The outcome of the project is expected to enhance the safeguarding of ICH effectively to achieve the relevant SDG targets. Through a field survey, given the diverse practices of Dhamail song in the Sylhet region and some other places, DAM conducted an in-depth analysis of the traditions and trends of Dhamail practices.

As part of the research, in 2020, DAM conducted a field study to gather information on practices of Dhamail song and dance as a folk media that is flourishing in the region for many decades. As follow-up, in 2021, DAM made another field study focusing on the diversity and differences of practices in various contexts including the differences in the practices between urban and rural areas.

#### Objectives

The proposed online stakeholder consultation workshop is aimed to exchange opinions and thoughts from relevant key informants and ICH experts at the national and local levels. During the workshop, the key findings from the 2021 field study will be shared to promote further reflections with a special focus on the safeguarding of ICH in general and Dhamail in particular. IRCI will participate in this online workshop to hear their opinions.

#### Programme

Time	Activities
10:00-10:10	Dr. M. Ehsanur Rahman, Executive Director, DAM / Introduction
10:10-10:15	Director General or his Representative / Message from Director General, IRCI
10:15-10:25	Representative from Bangladesh Shilpakala Academy / Opening remarks from Bangladesh government high officials
10:25-10:35	Ms. Kazue Sasaki Associate fellow, IRCI / IRCI's introduction and importance of ICH for Sustainable Development
10:35-11:00	Mr. Mohammad Mohsin and Mr. ABM Shahab Uddin (Research Coordinators) / Presentation of field study report on Dhamail diversity
11:00-12:00	Professionals and Key informants from Sylhet and Dhaka / Open Discussion: Dhamail practices – Traditions and Trends
12:00-12:30	IRCI experts and Bangladesh experts on ICH / Challenges and Recommendations on the safeguarding of ICH with special reference to Dhamail
12:30-13:00	Representative from Bangla Academy / Reflections and suggestions
13:00	Dr. S M Khalilur Rahman General Secretary, DAM / Concluding Remarks

#### 2. Indonesia

**Title:** The Role of Kethoprak in Improving the Quality of Character Education for Students and Supporting Sustainable Community Development in Klaten

**Organiser:** The Dewi Fortuna Community Learning Center (DFCLC), in cooperation with the International Research Centre for Intangible Cultural Heritage in the Asia-Pacific Region (IRCI)

Date: 4 November 2021, 09:00 – 16:00 (Indonesian time) Place: Online / DFCLC in Klaten

A workshop, entitled 'The role of Kethoprak art in improving the quality of character education for students and supporting sustainable community development in Klaten was held online in Klaten, Indonesia by Dewi Fortuna Community Learning Center (DFCLC), in cooperation with IRCI. This workshop was part of IRCI's project, 'ICH's contributions to SDGs – Education and Community Development', which investigates relationships among ICH, SDGs 4 (Quality Education), and 11 (Sustainable Cities and Communities) and the roles of ICH in education and community development. During the workshop, the participants, including the principals of the target schools for the research, Kethoprak practitioners, teachers in formal and non-formal schools, community members, a journalist, and local government officials have expressed their candid opinions and advice.

In the discussion, concerns are expressed about the loss of the noble values of local cultural arts, such as the traditional theatrical performance of Kethoprak, due to globalisation's influence. Participants hoped that this research by IRCI and DFCLC would move policymakers to pay attention to Kethoprak, strengthen the character education of younger generations, and support establishing Klaten as the City of Kethoprak Arts.

Educators, including school principals and teachers in both formal and non-formal education, have expressed their hope to integrate Kethoprak in the school curriculum or as extra-curricular activities, while emphasizing the importance of mastering local languages that are closely related to Kethoprak. They also agreed on the effectiveness of the adult learning approach using Kethoprak for community empowerment. Reflecting such voices, the Education Office mentioned its plans to strengthen ICH education in elementary and middle schools in Klanten. The Culture and Tourism Office would coordinate with the Klaten region to develop a government policy. Kethoprak practitioners have expressed their willingness to teach the value of Kethoprak art in schools. The Arts Council encouraged the communities to protect and promote local cultural arts, especially Kethoprak which is almost extinct, recognizing their educational, participatory, and creative economic effects.

#### Workshop information

#### Background

Since 2020, the Dewi Fortuna Community Learning Center (DFCLC), in collaboration with the International Research Centre for Intangible Cultural Heritage in the Asia-Pacific Region (IRCI) based in Osaka, Japan, has been conducting a case study that compares and analyses the role of intangible cultural heritage (ICH) in the formation of character values to determine if local wisdom on Kethoprak art contributes to education (SDG 4) and sustainable community development (SDG 11).

This case study uses a comparative method in the form of a comparison of the implementation of Kethoprak art education and its results in Elementary School Formal Education (SD) and Nonformal Education (Kejar Paket). The study analyses the results and impact on improving the quality of student education, school capacity, and role of community involvement. The analysis was conducted based on primary data obtained from questionnaires, respondent interviews, digital footprints, secondary data, and supporting documents from schools and communities involved. The results show that there are differences in the character education of students and the community's contribution on the efforts to preserve, protect, and promote the ICH between those who had Kethoprak learning experience and those who did not.

Kethoprak's contribution to SDG 4 at the elementary and non-formal education level (Kejar Paket) is seen from the increased motivation and participation of students. There was an improvement in mental capacity and character of students, which showed in their communicating, socializing, and expressing themselves and appreciation of the local wisdom. These connect to the development of the community itself. Students also showed tendency towards improving their academic scores on other subjects, such as Arts and Culture, Regional Languages, Social Sciences, History, and Citizenship Education.

The contribution of Kethoprak to SDG 11 is seen from the participation and involvement of the community in the preservation and development of traditional Kethoprak art, providing solutions to socio-cultural and environmental problems and through that supporting a communal work culture in society, which results in growth of solidarity, cooperation, and unity and fostering a sense of social concern. In a community, a sense of mutual cooperation and involvement is very important. It greatly affects ICH education in schools and the community itself, its development based on local potential, and achieving SDGs. ICH elements in Kethoprak contribute to community's social empowerment and provide resources, opportunities, knowledge, and creative skills that can influence the economy and lives of its people, leading to the achievement of the SDG.

First, information and data on the contribution of Kethoprak values to the quality of education and sustainable community development are needed. For that, we organised an FGD to review and exchange opinions on the matter by inviting experts, Kethoprak practitioners, educators, and stakeholders. IRCI participated online. We obtained opinions on research results to further refine the research that we will eventually publish in a book.

#### Objectives

- 1. Report on the Case Study and Research Results Analysis of the implementation of Kethoprak and comparison of the results of the impact of Kethoprak on formal and non-formal elementary School education.
- 2. Facilitate a discussion to obtain recommendations for follow-up plans or policies to continue

the efforts to use Kethoprak to improve the quality of education, encourage active participation of the younger generation in the Klaten community, and contribute to sustainable development and find solutions to socio-cultural problems.

3. Encourage the government, entrepreneurs, and society to join forces and formulate actions to organise a movement to socialise, protect, manage, and utilise ICH values through a legal policy.

#### Programme

Time	Activities
08:00-08:30	Test connection Zoom Meet IRCI Japan
	Opening Ceremony
08:30-09:00	Participant Registration
09:00 - 09:05	Opening: Listening to Indonesia raya song
09:05 - 09:30	DF CLC Chairman's Report
09:30 - 10:00	Case Study Report
10:00 - 10:30	Keynote speech Regent / Chairman Arts Council
10:30 - 11:00	Welcome speech from IRCI
	Feedback & Recommendations
11:00 - 11:30	Head of Education Department
11:30 - 12:00	Head of Klaten Tourism, Culture, Youth, Sports Department
12:00 - 12:15	Break
12:15 – 12:45	Klaten Regional Development Planning Agency
12:45 - 13:00	Principal of Krista Gracia Elementary School
13:00 - 13:15	Principal of SD N 2 Trunuh
13:15 - 13:30	Lecturer from Widya Dharma University, Klaten
13:30 - 13:45	Ketoprak Art Practitioner (Yati Pesek)
13:45 - 14:00	Entrepreneur Society (Edy Sulistyanto)
14:00 - 14:15	Journalist
14:15 – 14:45	Student
14:45 - 15:00	Art Studio / Non-Governmental Society
15:00 - 15:15	Break
15:15 – 15:30	Cultural Figure
15:30 - 15:45	Other participants
15:45 -16:00	Notes Formula
16:00	Closing

### 3. Kyrgyzstan

Title: Safeguarding of the Intangible Cultural Heritage through Education

**Organiser:** Taalim-Forum Public Foundation in cooperation with the International Research Centre for Intangible Cultural Heritage in the Asia-Pacific Region (IRCI)

Date: 26 November 2021, 9:00 - 13:00 (Bishkek time)

Place: Online / AUCA in Bishkek

An international conference, entitled 'Safeguarding of the intangible cultural heritage through education' was held online by the Taalim-Forum Public Foundation (TFPF) and the American University of Central Asia (AUCA) in Bishkek, in cooperation with IRCI. The conference was part of IRCI's project, 'ICH's contributions to SDGs: Education and Community Development', which investigates the relationship among ICH, SDG 4 (Quality Education), and SDG 11 (Sustainable Cities and Communities) and the roles of ICH in education and community development.

The participants, including ICH researchers and experts from Kyrgyzstan and Kazakhstan, AUCA faculties and students, representatives of local and community museums, UNESCO National Secretariat in Kyrgyzstan, as well as practitioners of traditional cultures in Kyrgyzstan, exchanged opinions and thoughts on the safeguarding of ICH in Kyrgyzstan including the yurt (traditional house) and related knowledge and skills through education. About 50 individuals took part in the conference, with half of them joining the conference remotely from Japan, Kazakhstan, and distant regions of Kyrgyzstan.

The presenters have noted the negative impact on ICH that safeguards the intersecting social, political, and environmental issues that were aggravated by the COVID-19 pandemic. They emphasized the importance of collaboration between the traditional knowledge holders and academics or researchers to strengthen research on ICH, and the ability of people and the community to actualize, safeguard, and transfer traditional knowledge and culture. Case studies on community museums demonstrated that local museums such as the yurt village could contribute to ICH safeguarding while being the drivers for community development.

#### Workshop information

#### Background

The international conference is dedicated to the discussion on preserving the intangible cultural heritage (ICH) in Kyrgyzstan through formal and non-formal education and research in this area. The conference is held within the framework of the project, 'Research on the ICH's Contribution to Sustainable Development: Education and Community Development', that is initiated and supported by the International Research Centre for Intangible Cultural Heritage in the Asia-Pacific Region (IRCI).

#### Programme

Time	Activity
08:50-09:00	Technical check
09:00-09:10	Opening of the conference
	Blessing from the founder of the living museum 'Salbuurun' Almazbek Akunov.
	Video greeting.
	Almagul Osmonova, Director of Taalim-Forum PF
	Nurgul Ukueva, Vice President for Academic Affairs, AUCA
09:10 - 09:25	Welcome words
	Iwamoto Wataru, Director-General, IRCI, Japan
	Soltongeldieva Sabira, UNESCO National Secretariat in Kyrgyzstan
09:25 – 10:45	Session 1. Living heritage that unites generations
	<u>Facilitator: Almagul Osmonova</u>
	Jyldyz Doolbekova, Reflection on the research on the safeguarding of ICH in
	Kyrgyzstan.
	Prof. Almaira Nauryzbaeva (Kazakhstan), Semiosphere of the Kazakh (kiiz uy)
	and Kyrgyz (boz uy) yurt in the aspect of traditional knowledge.
	Prof. Cholpon Turdalieva, Safeguarding of ICH by developing partnerships and
	supporting area research.
10.45 11.00	Dr. Ruslan Rakhimov, ICH research methodology.
10:45 - 11:00 11:00 - 12:00	Break, 15 min
11:00 - 12:00	Session 2. Contribution of ICH to sustainable development of regions Facilitator: Jyldyz Doolbekova
	Aida Alymova, Community museums as drivers of regional development.
	Aidai Asangulova, Actualization of the traditional heritage through the
	combination of tradition and innovation.
	Jyldyz Asanakunova, Safeguarding of traditional values for sustainable
	development of communities in the Issyk-Kul region.
12:00 - 12:30	Session 3. Discussion on targeted issues
	What is the role of leaders of public organizations / local communities,
	practitioners / custodians of traditional knowledge, researchers, and
	educational and cultural institutions in safeguarding of ICH?
	How does the safeguarding of ICH contribute to the achievement of
	sustainable development goals of the regions?
	What are the top priorities and main directions for safeguarding ICH in the
	country?
12:30 - 12:40	Summarising. Closing the conference

## 3. International Symposia



Section cover photo: Kethoprak performance, Indonesia ©DFCLC

# 3.1. FY 2020 Symposium



Section cover photo: Felt carpets, Kyrgyzstan ©Kiyiz Duino

#### 3.1.1 Objective and Overview

The international symposium on 'Research on ICH's Contribution to SDGs: Education and Community Development' was held online on 28–29 January 2021. It consisted of four sessions: Session 1 Presentations about the case study, Session 2 Discussion and analysis, Session 3 Presentation about the follow-up of the previous project (FY 2018–2019), and Session 4 Forum with participation of Japanese educators and youth. The symposium was completed successfully and facilitated the active exchange of profound opinions and thoughts in all sessions, with the involvement of 26 experts from Bangladesh, Indonesia, Japan, Kyrgyzstan, the Philippines, Thailand, and Viet Nam and eight observers from across Japan.

The objective of the international symposium was to share the results of case studies conducted by three NGOs to clarify the relationship among ICH, SDG 4, and SDG 11 and identify ICH's contributions to SDGs, especially SDGs 4 and 11. The international symposium deepened participants' knowledge about the relationship between ICH and SDGs and served as a forum for the discussion of future perspectives on ICH research, which will lead to effective ICH safeguarding.

With help from the UNESCO Associated Schools Project Network (ASPUnivNet), the United Nations University Global RCE Network (RCE), and Asia-Pacific Cultural Centre for UNESCO (ACCU), Japanese youth and educators from various universities and organisations were invited to the symposium. They shared cases related to Japan's ICH education with international researchers and resource persons and promoted UNESCO-related activities both domestically and internationally.

Furthermore, in cooperation with the Goi Peace Foundation, which has organised ESD youth conferences, the international symposium provided a valuable opportunity to consider the relationship among ICH, education, and community development from the viewpoints of youth.

The symposium also furnished a place to learn about the previous project's outcomes in order to testify to the project's sustainability.

The symposium also contributed to strengthening of the network of researchers in ICH-related fields in the Asia-Pacific region.

## 3.1.2 International Symposium: Discussion Summary

Symposium participants' comments, thoughts, and suggestions are summarised in this section. Major points discussed in the symposium are as follows.

## 1. Influences of COVID-19 on the practice of ICH and the project

The practice of ICH and the project activities in Bangladesh and Kyrgyzstan were not seriously affected by COVID-19 because most of the target communities are located in

rural areas where the COVID-19 situation was better than that in urban areas. The researchers were able to conduct field research and organise workshops in their target communities in cooperation with local researchers, local government officials, and community members. They also successfully conducted literature surveys, interviews, and data analysis.

In Indonesia, however, the project was significantly affected by COVID-19 countermeasures that limited movement and in-person meeting sizes (to a maximum of five people). Consequently, the project experienced difficulty holding workshops and teaching Kethoprak as an extracurricular activity. However, Kethoprak performance has remained as it was pre-COVID-19.

In the Philippines, communities and cultural masters have managed the situation using their own methods; they have practised and shared knowledge about their ICH using online tools and e-commerce, with the help of SLTs and NCCA.

Instead of raising provocative new research questions, the COVID-19 situation has worsened existing issues such as globalisation and internal and external threats to safeguarding ICH. However, Kyrgyzstan raised a new question related to SDG 11 with respect to community resilience, solidarity, and social responsibility amidst the pandemic.

Influences of COVID-19 on ICH could be summarised as follows.

## Negative aspects

- Movement was limited, and schools/educational institutions were closed.
- Many ICH-related festivals and events were cancelled.
- Not only ICH practitioners but also various industries supporting ICH, such as artisans and musical instrument manufacturers as well as theatres and other venues for ICH performance, have been suffering because ICH-related festivals and ceremonies were cancelled or postponed, and audiences' sizes are limited.
- In Kyrgyzstan, the following negative impacts have been observed:
  - Sales of ICH-related products, such as felt carpets, have dropped 50% due to the decreasing number of tourists visiting the communities.
  - Many culturally important people succumbed to COVID-19 infection.
- In Japan, the above-mentioned industries supporting ICH have lost government support due to the prioritisation of the COVID-19 response.

## Positive aspects

- Community members, ICH practitioners, and local NGOs have developed new skills and strategies to overcome their difficult situations, for example, using online tools such as social media, web meeting systems, and YouTube to perform, introduce, teach, and learn about ICH.
- ICH is essential to sustain a healthy society and quality of life, which constitute the crystallisation of human activity. It is different from tangible cultural heritage.

- The COVID-19 situation has provided an opportunity to implement ICH education using online tools that enhance communication within families, between learners and educators, and across borders.
- COVID-19 countermeasures that encourage people to stay at home and in their communities have brought families and community members together, ultimately strengthening solidarity.

## 2. Relationship among ICH, education, and community development

## Importance of ICH transmission through a multi-stakeholder approach

- Not only safeguarding of ICH but also research itself should be conducted by various stakeholders, including cultural bearers.
- ICH teaches us to value communities and tradition. However, on the basis of mutual respect, which ethical principles emphasise, we must respect our own ICH and that of others.

## Relationship between ICH and education

- Given that all SDGs are interrelated, ICH contributes to all SDG areas and has great integrated problem-solving potential. ICH can also contribute to the development of non-cognitive skills.
- ICH can improve education, including formal, non-formal, informal, and TVET.
- Everyone can enjoy and participate in ICH, regardless of religion, generation, or gender. ICH also provides solutions for social problems, such as child abuse and child marriage in Bangladesh, by modifying people's knowledge and behaviour in the community where the ICH is practised through the integration of ICH into education.
- 'Education about/through/in/for/as ICH' contributes to the project's continuity.
- Regarding the role of ICH in connection with education, 'education' has different meanings in the context of 'education about/in/through/for/as ICH'. Among them, 'education as ICH' is more reflective and places greater emphasis on emotional aspects.
- In terms of supporting ICH in a community, education about/through ICH is effective among teachers and local government officials who lack knowledge about ICH and an understanding of its importance.

## Relationship between ICH and community development

- ICH can contribute to community development in terms of the environment (use of natural resources, etc.), the economy (sales of traditional crafts and tourism, etc.), society (communal work and inter- and intra-generational communication, etc.), and resilience (mutual assistance, etc.).
- ICH, education, and community development are interconnected. ICH contributes to community development by improving the educational

environment and through the transmission of ICH to the public and the promotion of community harmony.

## **3.** Future perspectives and challenges regarding ICH's contributions to SDGs

## Educational activities

- Integration of various types of activities based on 'about/in/for/as' is important for implementing the next project.
- The compulsory practice of ICH in formal education is necessary to seamlessly connect with the voluntary practice of ICH in non-formal education.
- While ICH workshops and training have become popular, the traditional masterapprentice system is still in use in ICH education.
- Community-based museums play an important role in the transmission of ICH through teaching and learning about one's own ICH. Such institutions also nurture communities' sense of pride and cultural identity. Furthermore, they bring various stakeholders, including youth, together and build networks.

## Participation of multi-stakeholders

• Partnership between different fields, such as education and culture, is effective, and the participation of stakeholders at all levels will imbue the project with new perspectives.

## Involvement of youth

- Youth involvement is important because young people are the main actors in realising a sustainable society in the future.
- Considering the 'safeguarding ICH' aspect in the future project, youth involvement is among the challenges to be addressed, given the importance of youth voluntarily practising ICH, in addition to practice in educational institutions. However, amid globalisation and commercialisation, youth are not interested in ICH and tradition in their community because ICH brings few financial benefits.
- To encourage youth participation in ICH education, the methods and subjects need to be fun for them, and the design should be easy to understand.

## Policy linkage

• It is important to consider strategies for linkage with policy orientation and implementation to avoid positioning the project as an ivory tower.

## 4. Effects of the previous project

#### The Philippines

• The previous project is ongoing and has even expanded to other municipalities and SLTs. Community members, including cultural masters and local government

officials, have demonstrated their willingness to continue with the project. Moreover, stakeholders, including students and cultural masters, have expressed appreciation for the guidelines that have been developed, indicating that they help them teach and learn in an organised and systematic manner. Furthermore, users have gained a sense of pride and a strong cultural identity. The project and guidelines have also influenced local governments, which have established a task force to discuss ICH safeguarding measures. NCCA will continue to expand the project to the remaining SLTs and integrate it into formal education.

- Responsibility for all project-related decisions lies with the community members, and the ICH elements were selected to bring maximum benefits to the community.
- The guidelines delineate a teaching process that can be adjusted to suit individual communities; that is, communities can select any ICH element that is relevant to them, and each community can develop its own guidelines.
- Although the project began after Buklog applied to UNESCO's List of Intangible Cultural Heritage in Need of Urgent Safeguarding, the project has been involved in helpful Buklog safeguarding activities even after UNESCO inscribed the ritual in the list in 2019.

## <u>Viet Nam</u>

- The project has expanded through distribution of the guidelines to other schools and the Ministry of Education (MOE). The MOE will use the guidelines while planning for the upcoming year because it has recognised the effectiveness of ICH education and its role in achieving SDG 4.
- The MOE is also considering developing a similar project with the UNESCO Hanoi office.
- The guidelines are a good way to bring ICH education directly into schools via the new textbook system.
- Sustainability and socially impactful outcomes need to be considered separately.

## 5. Others

Regarding the integration of the ICH safeguarding issue into the research project, thoughts from the three NGOs are as follows:

- In the Bangladesh context, government support, including financial support, and the benefits community members derive from safeguarding their ICH need to be considered.
- In Kyrgyzstan, a holistic approach is needed to safeguard ICH, not only to revive the ICH itself but also to understand their meaning. Additionally, research on a community or place-based museum as a non-formal community learning centre is worth considering promoting the safeguarding of ICH.
- Safeguarding ICH is strongly linked with research and education, and integration of these three components with the involvement of various stakeholders is necessary.

According to the 2003 Convention, the authenticity of ICH elements is not as much of a concern as that of tangible cultural heritage due to the recognition of the continuous evolution of ICH. However, communities should have ownership of their ICH. Authenticity is also related to the governance or nature of a community.

## 3.1.3 Forum: Discussion Summary

Major points discussed in the forum are as follows.

## 1) Methodology of ICH education in school

- ICH education depends on districts and areas where the ICH is practiced. For example, students learn ICH after school in a community learning centre. Another example is ICH education is incorporated into the school curriculum as an 'integral study hour<sup>1</sup>.'
- Teaching ICH in a team school that is a system based on the specialties of each teacher is one of the alternative ways when considering the limited time of the school curriculum. And it is important to continue teaching even small portions of ICH from primary to high school to make students aware of their roots.
- There are approaches of 'a school to the community' and 'a school to students who can learn from the community' for teaching ICH. Students practice ICH and learn the background of ICH and research on ICH that can nurture non-cognitive skills such as affection towards their community.
- It is expected that the education that combines teaching traditional culture and introducing new methods such as career internship and entrepreneurship training enables students to build better capacity that makes a sustainable society. The students who have experienced such education may contribute to their community even though they leave the community.
- Traditional culture and ICH should be safeguarded by a collective community, rather than organizations or individuals. Individuals cannot safeguard their ICH after their death even though they are enthusiastic, and they have special knowledge and skills. Organisations and companies may not sustainably support and fund safeguarding efforts. Therefore, it is important to form a collective community that has new interests in safeguarding ICH.
- It is important to link the practical approach and learning approach while linking the approach of education about/in/for/as ICH in the ESD context.
- It is necessary to strengthen the spiral for learning in a community and school rather than placing too strong emphasis on formal education.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> An integral study hour is obligatory at primary and secondary schools in the Japanese education system and is often used for Education for Sustainable Development (ESD) for its transdisciplinary nature.

## 2) Challenges of ICH education

- It is difficult to teach and learn ICH in formal schools because they have to cover a lot of subjects under the current school curriculum in Japan as well as in other countries. But as tradition and ICH are the most familiar topics for students, educators need to be aware of the attraction of local ICH and naturally incorporate ICH into school curriculums or extracurricular activities. It is necessary to create policies to realise it.
- ICH education in either formal or non-formal settings needs to have local preservation society, including cultural practitioners and community members, understand ICH's educational effects because ICH, which through long-lasting tradition, often contains sensitive issues. As seen from the case study of RCE Chubu (Chubu University), it is critical to explain the benefits of the transmission of ICH. According to the case of Ohmihachiman city, to teach the torch making as an independent matter from the religious context, it takes some time to get permission from the Shinto shrine where it has been parctised for more than 1700 years.
- It is a challenge how to seamlessly connect ICH education in formal schools to that in non-formal schools. Formal education and non-formal education are not in conflict. It is critical to utilise both education systems for transmitting ICH and work with all stakeholders. It is necessary to consider what can be done in each formal and non-formal education in each country at the next step.
- ICH in the school curriculum cannot be necessarily taught in the perfect form as the traditional ICH. It may need to share that kind of understanding with local preservation societies. ICH education in the school curriculum can be considered as an introductory that teaches part of ICH. It is important to create a place to work with teachers, community members, and cultural holders.
- One of the challenges in ICH education at school and community development is how to deal with religious beliefs and rituals related to ICH when teaching ICH at school and supporting the local preservation society.
- It is indicated that the way of transmitting ICH in non-formal education that was conducted in a quite compulsory manner in a community is no longer applicable for modern society. One way is to teach ICH in formal education with some kinds of obligation. Another way is to devise methods to attract youth to voluntarily learn ICH, giving incentives such as earning money from practicing ICH, enhancing solidarity in the society, or achieving SDGs by practicing ICH.
- It is important to establish a place where various stakeholders can participate while linking education, research, and ICH safeguarding. From this point of view, it is expected to establish policy linkage and make suggestions for policy makers to achieve SDGs.

## 3) ICH contributions

• ICH including tradition and history not only teaches learners knowledge and skills of ICH but also nurtures appreciation of the community and pride towards it, which leads to a sustainable future. For example, torch in Ohmihachiman may

alleviate discrimination between men and women, between younger and elders, and between people in the community and ones out of the community by working with various stakeholders.

- The charming points of ICH are summarized below:
  - ICH is joyful and can be participated by everyone.
  - ICH can link different generations.
  - In this context of education, ICH can be a bridge between community and school or families. In various viewpoints of teaching education about/through/as ICH, ICH is recognized in the context of education.
  - It is not wise to distinguish between formal and non-formal settings and how to conceptualise in an integral manner formal and non-formal education.
- ICH may draw more attention under the situation of COVID-19. ICH will have a more profound meaning that 'learn to be' become very important compared to 'learn to do' or 'learn to live together'.

## 4) Meaning of transmitting ICH

- Education plays an important role to widen the opportunity for as many people as possible to nurture the successors of ICH.
- Considering the safeguarding of ICH, it is also important to think of transmitting ICH that evolves with the time instead of protecting tradition as shown by the expression 'safeguarding without freezing.' It needs mutual learning which teachers also learn from learners who will inherit ICH.
- The term 'safeguard' is used rather than the term 'protect' because ICH evolves as time changes. And authenticity is not taken so rigorously for ICH safeguarding. But the change should not happen through external pressure. In order to avoid such change, a community plays an important role.

#### 5) Relationship between ICH and community development

- It is indispensable to include an intangible as well as a tangible heritage for community development planning.
- The roles of the community and ties between community members and other stakeholders are important to promote and safeguard ICH.

## 6) Others

 UNESCO-associated schools (hereinafter UNESCO schools) are basically supported by National Commission for UNESCO in each country. In Japan, the Asia-Pacific Cultural Centre for UNESCO (ACCU), which is the Secretariat of the network of UNESCO schools, together with an international coordinator at the UNESCO headquarters and a national coordinator at the MEXT helps the UNESCO schools by organising events and forums in order to enhance both national and international exchanges. ASPUnivNet, which is a university network also supports the application and activities of UNESCO schools.
# 3.1.4 Comments

### Ishimura Tomo

Head, Audio-Visual Documentation Section Tokyo National Research Institute for Cultural Properties

The international symposium on 'Research on ICH's Contribution to SDGs: Education and Community Development' organised by IRCI was significant because the participants engaged in active discussions over a period of 2 days regarding how intangible cultural heritage may contribute to achieving SDGs 4 'Quality Education' and 11 'Sustainable Cities and Communities'.

# Session 1: Presentation of Case Studies

During Session 1, speakers presented case studies from Bangladesh, Indonesia, and Kyrgyzstan. In the presentation on Bangladesh, it was reported that Dhamail, a form of folk music, is practised across different religions and effectively enhances local communities' resilience to natural disasters such as floods. In the presentation on Indonesia, it was reported that Kethoprak, a traditional theatre performance, is passed down through formal education in elementary schools and via non-formal education within local communities. In the presentation on Kyrgyzstan, it was shown that the technique for making yurts, the traditional housing of nomadic people, is passed down within local communities in connection with other cultural elements such as weaving, felt making, and falconry.

# Session 2: Discussion and Analysis

During Session 2, the participants engaged in discussions based on the above-mentioned presentations. The three NGOs' case studies share some similarities. They all concluded that intangible cultural heritage is passed down via non-formal education within local communities, enhancing solidarity through knowledge transmission and producing a synergistic effect. However, the case studies also pointed to common issues regarding the transmission of intangible cultural heritage; for instance, globalisation and modernisation have diminished interest in tradition, especially among the younger generations.

# Session 3: Follow-up presentations of the previous project (FY 2018–2019)

Session 3 included follow-up presentations pertaining to the Philippines and Viet Nam, respectively, regarding the situation after implementation of the previous project. The report on the Philippines indicated that efforts are being made in different areas to encourage the transmission of intangible cultural heritage in the form of non-formal education within local communities via SLTs (School of Living Traditions). The report on Viet Nam showed that intangible cultural heritage is being handed down at schools in the form of formal education. In both countries, efforts reported in the previous project are continuing to produce results, although either formal or non-formal education has

been emphasised. In particular, Buklog<sup>2</sup> was added to the UNESCO Convention for the Safeguarding of the Intangible Cultural Heritage's List of Intangible Cultural Heritage in Need of Urgent Safeguarding in 2019, and it is expected that safeguarding endeavours involving SLTs and the inclusion of relevant elements on the list will create a positive synergistic effect.

# Session 4: Forum with participation of Japanese educators and youth

In Session 4, four groups from Japan reported their activities. These groups belonged to the following institutions: Miyagi University of Education, Akiu Lower Secondary School, Chubu University, and a Group for transmission of the torch (*taimatsu*) to next generation as cultural heritage. Miyagi University of Education and Akiu Lower Secondary School reported on their efforts to transmit intangible cultural heritage primarily through formal education, while Chubu University and the Group for transmission of the torch (*taimatsu*) to next generation as cultural heritage reported on their efforts to transmit intangible cultural heritage reported on their efforts to transmit of the torch (*taimatsu*) to next generation as cultural heritage reported on their efforts to transmit intangible cultural heritage reported on their efforts to transmit intangible cultural heritage reported on their efforts to transmit intangible cultural heritage primarily through non-formal education. After the presentations, all the participants engaged in discussions.

The following are the author's thoughts after participating in the discussions at the symposium.

One of the discussion topics was the relationship between formal and non-formal education and intangible cultural heritage. While many reports focused on non-formal education within local communities in relation to SDG 11, they also stated that it is often difficult to hand down intangible cultural heritage exclusively through non-formal education within local communities.

In pre-modern traditional societies, intangible cultural heritage was generally handed down via non-formal education within local communities, and it was common for people to spend their entire life in the local community in which they were born. Therefore, it can be said that learning about and transmitting intangible cultural heritage in the local community were almost 'obligatory' and even 'compulsory'.

However, in the current globalised and modernised society, people often have the freedom to leave their birthplace. At the same time, local communities' lifestyles have undergone rapid changes in the transition from traditional to modern. Under such circumstances, the conventional non-formal transmission of intangible cultural heritage within local communities seems inadequate. Modern society necessitates new strategies to sustain non-formal community-based education.

One of these strategies is encouraging people to participate voluntarily in the practice and transmission of intangible cultural heritage. Specifically, it entails convincing community members that there are benefits to be derived from practising intangible cultural heritage. For instance, in addition to communicating with them that intangible cultural heritage enhances community solidarity, a framework might be established for people to earn cash income by practising intangible cultural heritage. It may also be

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> Buklog is an elaborate thanksgiving ritual system practised among the Subanen, an indigenous people in the southern Philippines.

important to let these people know that engaging in activities related to one's cultural heritage plays a role in achieving SDGs, as accomplishing SDGs is of common benefit to humanity.

Another strategy is to incorporate the practice and transmission of intangible cultural heritage into formal education in schools. This may seem contrary to the aforementioned idea of encouraging people's voluntary participation since school education is, in a sense, 'obligatory' and 'compulsory'. However, some elements of intangible cultural heritage, including traditional arts and crafts, are difficult to acquire unless they are learnt early in life. Since non-formal education in local communities can no longer be expected to play an 'obligatory' or 'compulsory' role, the option of supplementing it with formal education should also be considered. Giving large numbers of people the opportunity to experience intangible cultural heritage through formal education is also significant. Moreover, integration into formal education is a means of expanding the base of intangible cultural heritage practitioners, which is necessary for its stable transmission to future generations.

To implement the two above-mentioned strategies, it is necessary for government officials, researchers, educators, etc., to cooperate with local community members and encourage them to work as stakeholders. However, the responsibility for the practice and transmission of intangible cultural heritage should not be thrust solely upon local communities since such an action leads to confining and 'freezing' traditional culture within these communities. Instead, it is necessary to situate the practice and tradition of intangible cultural heritage in the dynamic context of modern society and seek solutions to its problems.

In conclusion, I would like to share my overall impression of the project. When considering the relationship between intangible cultural heritage and SDGs, the former contributes to achieving SDGs 4 and 11, which, in turn, leads to the safeguarding of intangible cultural heritage. In other words, the two are interrelated, and it is important to pay attention to this relationship. However, the discussions revealed some confusion regarding this interrelation. For instance, regarding the relationship between intangible cultural heritage and SDG 4, it was determined that the incorporation of intangible cultural heritage into education improves the quality of education, and the transmission of intangible cultural heritage is promoted because of this step. Since this project is titled 'ICH's Contribution to SDGs', more emphasis tends to be placed on the former, but in reality, the latter is also important. It will be necessary to discuss these relationships in an organised fashion when going forward with this project in the future.

# Liou Lin-Yu

Professor, Department of Music Education Nara University of Education

It is well documented that intangible cultural heritage, such as folk music, festivals, tales, crafts, etc., is traditionally found within the cultural context of the community and is often related to the religious beliefs, events, and economic activities of said community.

However, intangible culture is under threat in both developed and developing countries as a result of changes in local communities. For instance, the growing trend of young people relocating to cities has led to a decline in (and sometimes the complete absence) of cultural successors in more rural communities. Furthermore, young people are often attracted to contemporary culture, causing them to drift away from traditional performing arts or handicraft originating from their communities. This catalyses the decline of traditional economic activities and cultural events because, unlike tangible culture, intangible culture can easily disappear in a single generation if there are no successors. Of course, this disappearance is somewhat mitigated by leaving records such as letters, pictures, and figures for future generations, but it is considerably more challenging to document singing, dancing, and other forms of movement. In this sense, intangible culture is not static; rather, it is a culture that must be passed down through human bodily movements. In other words, the transmission of intangible culture is based on people-to-people relationships.

One way to mitigate the effect of a lack of successors in local communities would be to provide meaningful education. This is an effective avenue because education allows us to understand the value of intangible culture and further raise awareness. Compulsory education manages this by establishing a conventional space for the handing down of information and knowledge when the community cannot do so itself. For school children, integrating intangible culture into the curriculum is effective because it maximises children's ability to absorb knowledge and incrementally gain skills.

Unfortunately, formal education is not always the best way for communities to pass on intangible culture, as circumstances differ according to each community's situation and the amount of support the government provides. For instance, in areas with a small school-age population, the number of students who can inherit and benefit from intangible culture is limited, which, in turn, limits the potential for spreading intangible culture.

Consequently, relevant education could include both formal and informal learning. Informal education allows adults to study intangible culture as a lifelong learning activity. Ideally, formal and informal education should be launched in parallel to teach intangible culture, but if this is not possible, informal education should be the focus.

On the first day of the symposium, we learned about projects involving intangible cultural heritage in Bangladesh, Indonesia, and Kyrgyzstan and recognised that there is a common point at issue: the lack of young successors. Nevertheless, on the second day of the symposium, we engaged with successful case studies involving formal and/or nonformal education delivered through projects conducted in Japan, Viet Nam, and the Philippines. Through these projects, we understood that the inheritance of intangible culture is usually a result of a small group of people realising the importance of preserving and developing it; with specialists' assistance, such groups gradually lay the foundation for related education in schools and local communities. Hence, this method has become the new traditional way of transmitting intangible culture.

Nevertheless, there are still numerous instances of unobserved and disappearing intangible cultural heritage around the world. For this reason, an additional mission of this project will be to raise awareness of the issue across communities.

# Sato Masahisa

Professor, Graduate School of Environmental and Information Studies Tokyo City University

Following the international symposium, I would like to raise a few points for consideration. These are as follows:

1. <u>The safeguarding of intangible cultural heritage (ICH) has the potential to contribute</u> to integrated problem solving.

Case studies have shown that the safeguarding of individual ICH contributes to the achievement of various Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs) and integrated problem solving (Table 1). These studies have commonly suggested that the safeguarding of ICH is effective not only at contributing to the achievement of quality education (SDG 4) but also at deepening cooperation and collaboration by taking account of 'people-to-people' relationships, for example, considering social justice, gender, and partnership (SDG 5; SDG 16; SDG 17). Additionally, many of these studies have raised points regarding the natural environment of a place and its human settlement (SDG 11; SDG 13) in terms of the regional human and natural geographic contexts that give meaning to the 'place'. Furthermore, a case study of Japan's Chubu region was presented, which covered a bioregion that transcends administrative divisions and connects 'people and nature', 'people and people', and 'places' through safeguarding activities. The emphasis on communal ICH safeguarding activities as contributing to the achievement of SDGs as a whole suggests the importance of considering these activities as an integrated problem-solving approach that contributes to the same.

# Table 1. Potential of the selected cases for integrated problem solving and achievingSDGs

- e.g., Bangladesh, 4, 5, 13, 16, etc.
- e.g., Indonesia, 5, 8, 9, 17, etc.
- e.g., Kyrgyzstan, 1, 4, 5, 11, etc.
- Sendai, 4, 11, with resilience, etc.
- Chubu, all SDGs (including 4, 11), mainstreaming cultural diversity for all SDGs
- Omihachiman, 4, 11, contributing to SDGs

# 2. <u>The safeguarding of ICH contributes to the acquisition of Social & Emotional</u> <u>Intelligence (SEI).</u>

It is evident that the safeguarding of ICH contributes to the acquisition of SEI, which is the current focus of international discussions about SDGs and Education for Sustainable Development (ESD). SEI is also termed 'non-cognitive skills', and the safeguarding of ICH contributes significantly to the enhancement of one's mindfulness, compassion, and

empathy. Furthermore, some case studies have reported that people have a strong sense of place ownership, which contributes to the acquisition of SEI, the basis for sustainable development in the future.

# 3. <u>The safeguarding of ICH contributes to improving the quality of education.</u>

A series of case study presentations has revealed that the safeguarding of ICH has contributed to improving the quality of various types of education (Table 2), namely formal education (FE), non-formal education (NFE), and informal education (IFE), through home learning and communication within the community, as well as technical and vocational education and training (TVET) to improve income and life skills.

# Table 2. Contribution of ICH safeguarding to improving the quality of education

- FE (formal education): rich in curriculum, integration of subjects, contextualisation, critical thinking, opportunities for change
- NFE (non-formal education): place-based learning, social learning
- IFE (informal education): intergenerational and intragenerational communication, visionary communities
- TVET (technical and vocational education and training): life skills training, income generation

# 4. The safeguarding of ICH contributes to community development.

It was revealed that the safeguarding of ICH contributes to local community development across environmental, economic, and social spheres (Table 3), as well as to the strengthening of social resilience. Moreover, it is noteworthy that daily coordination, collaboration, and mutual assistance through ICH safeguarding can address the Volatility, Uncertainty, Complexity, Ambiguity (VUCA) society.

# Table 3. Contribution of ICH safeguarding to improving community development

- Environment: wise use of natural resources, food culture, environmental conservation, bioregion-based knowledge accumulation
- Economy: income generation, cultural tourism
- Society: social bonding, intergenerational and intragenerational communication, visionary communities, institutional arrangement (e.g., schools and associations for the safeguarding of ICH), food culture, collective action, community coordination
- Social resilience: mutual assistance, daily communication, and partnership

# 5. Concluding remarks

Activities for the safeguarding of ICH have hitherto been carried out for the 'purpose' of safeguarding such heritage while respecting communities' autonomy. However, the findings of this project reveal that the safeguarding of ICH also has the potential to be a 'means' of contributing to (1) integrated problem solving, (2) the acquisition of SEI, (3) improved education quality, and (4) enhanced community development. The project has also revealed the potential of ICH safeguarding as a 'human right' that contributes to local residents' identity formation. ICH can be characterised by such terms as 'social inclusion', 'community-based', and 'respect for human rights', as shown in Table 4. This

creates a multiplicity of meanings of the safeguarding of ICH (safeguarding not only as an end in itself but also as a means to an end and as a right), and in the future, it will be important to handle this safeguarding in a multifaceted manner.

Additionally, regarding the research approach to safeguarding ICH, the focus will not only be on the positivism research approach, which has been dominant so far, but the interpretivism research approach, which emphasises the local contexts and qualitative aspects, and the critical theory and action research approach, which promotes participation and action, are also expected to be expanded and improved. It is important to discuss these approaches for the safeguarding of ICH from various perspectives in the future.

# Table 4. Characteristics of ICH (UNESCO, 2015)<sup>3</sup>

- Traditional, contemporary, and living: ICH not only represents traditions inherited from the past, but it is also recognised as constantly evolving living heritage. The focus, therefore, is on ensuring continuous recreation and transmission of cultural expressions, knowledge, and skills.
- Inclusive: ICH contributes to social cohesion, encouraging identity formation and a sense of responsibility that help individuals to feel part of one or more communities as well as society at large. A certain practice can belong to more than one culture. An expression of ICH in one culture may be similar to one practised by others, whether that is in the neighbouring village, a city on the opposite side of the world, or among peoples who have migrated and settled in a different region. Regardless of their origin, these have been passed from one generation to another, they have evolved in response to their environments, and they contribute to people's identity formation and sense of continuity.
- Representative: ICH depends on those people whose knowledge of traditions, skills, and customs is passed on to the rest of the community and from generation to generation or to other communities.
- **Community-based:** ICH can only become 'heritage' when it is recognised as such by the communities, groups, or individuals that create, maintain, and transmit it. No one can decide for a given community whether an expression or practice is their heritage.
- **Respectful of human rights:** Communities are encouraged to perform and safeguard their ICH insofar as the associated practices are compatible with international human rights. Activities and celebrations that endanger the life or health of some individuals or groups or are detrimental to mutual respect within a community or between groups are not supported by the ICH convention or any associated programme.

# Iwamoto Wataru

Director-General of IRCI

Upon the completion of the first year of the project 'Research on ICH's Contribution to SDGs: Education and Community Development', I would like to share my thoughts as Director-General of IRCI.

First, I am grateful to the researchers from Bangladesh, Indonesia, and Kyrgyzstan. Their work evidences the relationship between their intangible cultural heritage (ICH) and

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> Janet Pillai. 2015. 'Learning with Intangible Heritage for a Sustainable Future' UNESCO, pp.14-15. https://unesdoc.unesco.org/ark:/48223/pf0000232381

their respective communities, as well as their efforts regarding education. As I mentioned at the symposium, I encourage them to report their educational activities and the advantages of formal and/or non-formal educational settings for their ICH more clearly.

Second, the contribution of the Japanese case studies presented at the symposium is highly appreciated. The Japanese conception of ICH and its incorporation into education are very valuable. I am convinced that these inspire many countries.

Third, I thank the Japanese resource persons for their valuable comments, which were so instructive despite being diverse due to their varied specialties. Since their views are so meaningful, I did not attempt to synthesise them in this report. However, I hope that multi-disciplinary efforts will continue, so that we may derive an intensified message in the subsequent stages.

Finally, research on ICH and external factors such as SDGs sometimes lead to the demonstration of ICH, i.e., the components of ICH. In this context, I believe, based on studies conducted in three countries, that if ICH contributes to promoting the quality education and community development, it is because of its nature: 1) familiarity with people (e.g. it can be convened in a participatory manner involving the people of the related community, bridging generations), 2) roots in the community (links with the nature of the community and/or traditional knowledge), and 3) 'living' character (though traditional, it is a contemporary fact). These hypotheses will be further clarified.

# 3.1.5 Presentation Materials

This section provides the materials presented at the international symposium.

Three presentations by NGOs in Bangladesh, Indonesia, and Kyrgyzstan were given in Session 1. These presentations include the summary of case study, and the analysis of the relationship among ICH, SDGs 4 and 11, ICH's contributions to other SDGs, and the future orientation of research on ICH and its safeguarding.

Two presentations in Session 3 were given by the previous project counterparts in the Philippines and Viet Nam, who worked with IRCI during FY 2018 and 2019. Their presentations covered the current situation in each country after the completion of the previous project, and future plans related to the theme of ICH and SDGs.

Session 4 constituted the Forum, and four presentations were made by Japanese educators and youth from the following organisations or groups: Miyagi University of Education, Sendai City Akiu Lower Secondary School, Chubu University, and the Group for transmission of the torch (*taimatsu*) to the next generation as cultural heritage. Three presentations by Japanese educators were on the ICH education and related activities in Japan, whereas a presentation by a youth group representative shared his community development efforts involving distinguished local ICH.

### Session 1

ICH's Contribution to Sustainable Development Goals: Education and Community Development – A Research Study on Dhamail ABM Shahab Uddin, Co-researcher, DAM, Bangladesh





































-	ICH contributions to SDGs, except for SDG 4 and SDG 11.
	The ICH correlate and contribute to the following SDG targets directly or indirectly.
	Goal 3 Target 7
	Goal 5 Target 1
	Goal 5 Target 2
	Goal 5 Target 3
	Goal 10 Target 2
	Goal 13 Target 3
	Goal 16 Target 1
	Goal 16 Target 2
	Goal 16 Target 9

### Session 1

Character Cultivation and Culture Safeguarding on Students in Klaten Regency, Central Java, Indonesia as a Contribution for Quality of Education and Sustainable Development

Kristian Apriyanta, Representative, DFCLC, Indonesia





Kethoprak art is a traditional theater performance accompanied by traditional Gamelan music, in traditional language and dress, which is an oral expression, social practice, rituals and celebration events. In the story, it represents the concept of life of the Javanese "Memayu Hayuning Bawana" or maintaining a harmonious relationship between humans and Nature and God, teaching history, spiritual values, patriotism, social care, mutual cooperation, entertaining, can be done and accepted by anyone and this. very good for improving the quality of the character of our society

Kethoprak art is a work of local traditional art originating from Central Java, experiencing a decline in interest since the era of globalization began. The interests of local communities are dominant globalizing, leading to global cultural hegemony and threatening the capacity of the oldest generation to spread their knowledge to the youngest

# Why the Kethoprak Art

DFCLG has been actively involved in implementing learning and training formal and non-formal school children and holding the Student Kethoprak festival in Klaten for 10 years

There are positive opportunities in improving the welfare economy if we can properly manage the potential of this traditional local cultural art with all its aspects through creativity that is triggered by learning the traditional art skills of kethoprak.



10 October 2020 - 02 January 2021

hypothesis and belief that there is a close relationship between learning the traditional art of kethoprak and improving the quality of education and sustainable development for the young generation in Klaten

Study chase Contribution Of Intangible Cultural Heritage Students Of Traditional Kethopra Art To Improving The Quality Of Education And Sustainable Development In Klaten

The focus of research is to analyze the differences in the impact of schools that do and do not learn the Intangible Cultural Heritage of traditional art kethoprak on the Quality of Education and Sustainable Development in Klaten

School	Status	Population	Samples
SD Krista Gracia	Which follow	225	22
SD N 2 Trunuh	Who does not	120	12



- The capacity of the school in fostering students towards the preservation, protection and promotion of the Intangible Cultural Heritage of the traditional art of kethoprak
- 2. Observe the absorption of positive values in Ketoprak stories for students
- 3. Knowing the increase in student participation in school
- Knowing the effect of student development on other subjects related to improving academic quality
- Knowing the different interests of the younger generations towards learning Intangible Cultural Heritage
- Knowing whether there is a contribution of skills for students in the field of traditional arts and crafts.
- Knowing the contribution of schools in character development and sustainable community development in supporting a communal work culture in society.



N D;	Respons	ients	Variable	Details will be presented in the f Comparative Analysis Techniques, with in			CONTRACTOR OF THE OWNER OF	
1	Learner	5	Personal Experience		INDICATORS	SO KRISTA	SO 2 TRUNNIN	
2	2 Headmaster		Capacity Building for Schools,			GRACIA		
			Community Development Cooperation,		Assisting capacity building that fosters the younge generation to encourage the growth of character and local wildom in like community.	-	nat	
3	Teacher Arts	ofCultural	Process during Ketoprak Training					
4	lavanese Language Teacher		The development of Javanese Cultural Literature knowledge	2	extraourricular activities for community development and provide solutions to social	yes	not	
5			Development of academic	problems.				
	teacher Civics	(history) /	knowledge		Public concern for the protection and promotion of intengible Cultural heritage.	yes	not	
6	Parents of Students	Character development	4 2	increase student active participation in school	Yes	not		
7 Communities Involved				Community Involvement in Safeguarding cultural heritage, Development of cultural heritage in the school environment.	Creating awareness and participation in cultural presservation and character development and sustainable community development	yes	nat	
-	The Desament		1	Preserving and supporting a communal work culture in society.	AG2	not		
	1	School pr			Support skills education for unskilled people	Ves	oot	
Į.	2		Art Experience		especially traditional erts and crafts skills	46.5		
ž	3	Kethoprak Activity Schedule Student Report Card Sample Achievement of Sample Students Kethoprak Activity Documents Forms of Community Partnerships			Community Involvement in the implementation of the Ketoprak extracurricular activity at SD Krista Gracia		nat	
Secondery Date	4							
	5							
ě	6				and safeguarding cultural heritage and community development			













Future target of this activity will be Recommend point

- 1. Village Government Issues a Village Regulation on ICH through the Regent's Instructions 2. Extracurricular Compulsory Formal Education Institutions and Vocational Compulsory
- Non-Formal Education Institutions through Instruction of the Head of Office
- 3. Maximizing Community Involvement in the preservation, maintenance, management and use of ICH for sustainable development

please ask this respectful forum to provide input and suggestions for the achievement of our program goals to make it even better. Thank you

### Session 1

Visionary Local Communities in Promoting ICH Education in Kyrgyzstan Almagul Osmonova, General Director, TFPF, Kyrgyzstan Jyldyz Doolbekova, Researcher, TFPF, Kyrgyzstan









The term "visionary communities" refers to communities with the capacity to act as true leaders in safeguarding of the intangible cultural heritage.

- carefully preserve and enrich their original culture, knowledge and skills without losing the deeper cultural meanings and values; have a deeper understanding of
- . the importance and necessity of transferring this knowledge to younger generations; strive to improve the well-being of
- their communities;
- seek and secure support from public organizations and attract the attention of international donors.

# WHAT WE HAVE DONE



### Phase I

Consultations with experts & Discussions

# Phase II

Field research (4): interviews (about 70) & focus group discussions (4) in communities; Consultations with experts & Discussions (online & offline)

# KYRGYZ YURT MAKERS: Kyzyl-Tuu village



1,700 m above sea level
1,800 people
470 households
167 yurt makers
10% - older generation
60% - middle generation
30% - young generation

Kiyiz Duino (Felt Universe) Public Foundation







# ICH contributions to SDGs

Poverty alleviation (SDG 1)

Gender equality (SDG 5)

Quality Education (SDG 4)

Sustainable Cities and Communities (SDG 11)

# FINDINGS



- ICH becomes a source for cultural resilience, inspiration, consolidation, and collective responsibility.
- Masters apprentices system is kept alive.
- Development of tourism became an impetus for development of craftsmanship in the communities.
- Increased self-reliance and resilience, ability to find solutions to challenges and changing situation



# CHALLENGES



### Internal

(social, political & environmental);

### External

(religious fundamentalism, globalization, mass & pop-culture; increased pressure on the distinct cultural identity)

# FUTURE ORIENTATION OF RESEARCH ON ICH AND ICH SAFEGUARDING

- Research of the living museums: role of community-& provincial museums in safeguarding ICH
- Developing educational and methodological guidebooks and training teachers/facilitators on ICH to support informal education in the selected visionary communities;
- Mapping the visionary communities of Kyrgyzstan;
- Organize an international (or Central Asian regional) anthropological conference in partnership with Anthropology Department of American University in Central Asia (AUCA) with the focus on safeguarding the nomadic yurt as ICH with participation of bearers of traditional knowledge.

### Session 3

Multi-disciplinary Study on Intangible Cultural Heritage's Contribution to Sustainable Development: Focusing on Education

Renee Talavera, Head of Cultural Communities and Traditional Arts Section, NCCA



# Brief Project Background

- In 2018, the National Commission for Culture and the Arts of the Philippines in partnership with the International Research Centre for Intangible Cultural Heritage in the Asia-Pacific Region (IRCI) under the auspices of UNESCO, implemented the project entitled "Multidisciplinary study on intangible cultural heritage's contribution to sustainable development: Focusing on education".
- In the Philippines, this focused on the development and publication of learning guide for the Zamboanga del Sur School of Living Traditions (SLT) in the Subanen Community–a community-managed non-formal center of learning that is geared towards the safeguarding of traditional culture through transfer of indigenous knowledge from cultural masters to the younger generation. To date, there are 28 SLTs across the Philippines. The learning guide centered on the Buklog, the Thanksgiving Ritual System of the Subanen, which has been inscribed in the Urgent Safeguarding List of UNESCO.



# <section-header><text><text><image>

# The current situation of the FY 2018-2019 project

### • Further use of the learning guides

The learning guide for SLT Zamboanga del Sur has been used during the SLT sessions since its publication. Further, it has also been utilized by cultural masters in the Institute of Living Traditions (ILT), also a project of the NCCA where the intangible cultural heritage (ICH) elements are being taught to interested non-community members.



# The current situation of the FY 2018-2019 project

 Further changes in attitudes of cultural masters, educators, students and SLT coordinators in the SLTs that the project targeted

> attitudes toward teaching and learning

 Both the cultural masters and SLT students deemed the use of a learning guide more effective in the transmission of the ICH. They have been teaching and learning the ICH in a more organized manner.

### attitudes as Subanen community

 The Subanen communities were gratified that their ICH were documented in such a way that it will help the future generations to continuously learn their culture. They felt more proud of their identity as a community as they see the richness, depth, and significance of their intangible cultural heritage through the learning guide.

# The current situation of the FY 2018-2019 project

### Impacts of the project

After the printing of the learning guides, all the other SLT local coordinators were given copies which will serve as model for the learning materials they may create for their own SLTs. They have been inspired and motivated to develop their own SLT learning guides.



SLT Local Coordinators with the NCCA CCTAS Secretariat

# The current situation of the FY 2018-2019 project

### • Impacts of the project

The NCCA has then initiated the publication of learning guides for all other 27 Schools of Living Traditions (SLTs) across the Philippines. It will support the financial and technical aspects of the development and publication of learning guides spearheaded by the cultural masters and bearers, and the SLT local coordinators.



# The current situation of the FY 2018-2019 project

# • Impacts of the project

Z

Further, the NCCA shall also partner with the SLTs this year 2021 for the production and dissemination of elearning resources as support for SLT strengthening and ICH safeguarding, taking into account sustainable development through education.



# Future attempts and plans related to ICH and SDGs

The NCCA pool of facilitators who were trained on the implementation of the 2003 Convention drafted plans on safeguarding ICH in emergencies, taking sustainable development into consideration. These plans may then be enhanced and adopted by the NCCA and the participants' organizations as bases to formulate institutional policies and projects geared towards such purpose.



# Future attempts and plans related to ICH and SDGs

Further, the NCCA plans to collaborate with the Philippines' Department of Education-Indigenous Peoples Education Office to conduct localized trainings on ICH for teachers to capacitate them in integrating and teaching indigenous knowledge systems and practices in the formal education.








## Summary - What we do

- Studied new curriculum framework and reference documents (8–9/2018)
- Developed the ICH Guidelines for schools (10-12/2018);
- Organized Consultation
   Workshops (29 / 12/2018)











# What we do...

- 8/2020: Distributed the Guidelines and the DVDs to
  - >2 pilot schools
- >5 other schools that participated in the training workshops
- >3 schools that did not participate in the project
- 3-4/2020: Introduced the Guidelines to some faculties in the Hanoi University of Culture and the Hanoi National University of Education to let it become a practical reference for their students

# Impacts of the project's activities

#### >On 2 pilot schools

 All teachers are able to use the Guidelines to build lessons and actively integrate ICH into the lessons and extracurricular activities

 For students, integrating ICH and SDGs into lessons helps them clearly aware of their own rights and responsibilities in heritage conservation. They better remember the lessons, master the knowledge, and understand various ways of practice heritage conservation "Although I only assist the main teacher in organizing the ICH education through Experiential Activities, I can realize how useful and interesting these activities are for students, and for us teachers as well. Before, they play "tugging game" just merely as a game, but after the session, they understand the insightful meaning of the ICH "tugging ritual and game" – that's a big difference"

(Teaching assistant for Experiential Activities, Thuc Nghiem School, Ha Noi)

# Impacts...

## On 2 pilot schools...

"Previously, teachers found it difficult to bring intangible cultural heritages into such subjects as Biology and Physics. But now they are able to build appropriate integrated lessons, creating excitement for students."

(Ms. Le Thi Thu Huong, Rector of Thuc Nghiem School) "The document is very useful and the form of integrating cultural heritage with sustainable development at the right time of the education sector, Vietnam educational innovation educational innovation (Ms. Chu Thanh Hang, Teacher of Literature, Yen Hoa Secondary

"I wish that I knew this method (of using ICH in teaching) earlier. I surprise to see how students engaged and respond actively to the activities" (Teacher of Experiential Activities in Thuc Nghiem School, Ha Noi) It is great to listen to *Ca tru* directly in a lesson and know that the way we breathe in and out relating closely to the breathing technique when singing. I prefer this kind of interesting lesson."

(Tran Nhat Minh, 8th grate, Yen Hoa Secondary School)

Students are more confident and more interested in group work, self-study and presentation in class. They also proactively proposed to increase the time to present their research results, which in the past they were very shy and often avoided doing. (Ms. Vu Thi Phuong Thuy, Biology teacher, Ven Hoa Secondary School) "I really like this way of learning because it makes me feel comfortable. We can play when we learn the lesson. Now I know why this game is called "tug of war" (Tran Minh Quang, 6th grade, Thuc Nghiem School)

# Impacts...

## >On 2 pilot schools...

 Teachers have ideas to build interactive activities, and programs on the based of ICH and SDGs integration into lessons

School of Yen Hoa: Ms. Hang I built a field trip program at the community to preserve the Quan Ho cultural heritage in Bac Ninh and the family of a Ca trù artist in Hanoi. (Ms. Chu Thanh Hang, Teacher of Literature, Yen Hoo Secondary School) "Much inspired by the project's pilot activities in our school, in the coming sessions, I plan to guide our students to organize "an ICH festival", where they will explore and showcase different ICHs of our country... I believe it would be very a interesting event!" (Ms. Loan, Teacher of Thuc

Nghiem School)

"I integrated the lesson "The Altitude of Sound" with the intangible heritage of *Ca trù*, guiding students to try making some musical instruments." (*Ms. Pham Thu Huyen, Physics teacher, Thuc Nghiem* School)



# Impacts...

## >On communities

 Cultural bearers are eager and willing to contribute to education of ICH for students in schools

> "We are very proud to introduce to students of our nation's culture through traditional singing, dances, and folk games."

(Mr. Dang Chi Quyet, Cham people, Bau Truc village, town Phuoc Dan, Ninh Phuoc district, Ninh Thuan province) "Once a month, we are invited to schools to instruct the students to practice our ethnic dances and traditional games. We also teach our children at the in the village to do make handicraft whenever we have free time."

(Mrs. Ly Thi Seo, Hmong artisan, Dong Van District, Ha Giang Province)

# Expectations

#### SCHOOLS

- Continuous supports from education and ICH experts to school
- · Recommendation of reliable source of information for teachers and students
- More trainings for teachers; more schools can get involved
- Recognition of all level of educational authorities on teachers' efforts on building lessons integrated with ICH and SDGs
- Schools to pay more attention to ICH teaching-learning: More investment on teachers' fieldwork and teaching materials

## Impacts...

#### >On 2 institutions

Effectiveness of the study and Guidelines have been expanded to universities:

Use the Guidelines in teaching students of some universities on how to work and collaborate with the community to preserve and promote cultural heritage towards sustainable development in accordance with specific conditions of each locality

Experience sharing to other localities:

Share experiences about on the coordination between museum and school in cultural heritage education for teachers, museum staff, and cultural officers in some provinces (Ha Giang, Tuyen Quang, Hoa Binh, Ninh Thuan, An Giang) so that they diversify educational activities at schools and in museums

#### Schools-cultural bearers connection improved:

Strengthen the connection between schools and cultural bearers, helping the latter to be more aware of the cultural values they hold. As a result, they proactively propose and implement activities to promote cultural heritage values in their own communities.

## Impacts...

#### >On 2 institutions...

 Collaborating between the school and the museum to educate students about the intangible cultural heritage is a very new and very useful approach to the museum staff. sustainable development.



 Students colouring patterns according to traditional patterns of ethnic peoples at the VME



 Students from Ba Dinh
 Secondary School playing tug of war at the VME

# Impacts... On 2 institutions: • Experienced a positive and active model of partnership between education and culture agencies with regard to ICH education in schools • Great opportunity for teachers and researchers to be trained and work with cultural/museum officers and experts





Session 4: Forum The Activities of Japanese Youths and Educators Ichinose Tomonori, Miyagi University of Education







Tohoku District is Disaster Affected Area 2011 March11

- The scale of the earthquake was extremely large as the number of fatalities is 15,894 and the number of missing people is 2,562 (by Japanese Police office 2018).
- Loss of life : Total 522students and teachers(plus number of people whose safety is unknown: 236 students), the number of damaged school buildings is 754.
- Children evacuated from the disaster-stricken area (25,516), Fukushima radiation contamination area (almost 12,000).
- Orphan and children left after their parents' death (total 1,698),
- The Children of ethnic minorities/Children of special needs (almost 300)























## Session 4: Forum Education and Urban Development Chiba Shin, Principal of Sendai Akiu Lower Secondary School

The principal of Akiu Lower Secondary School gave presentation about his attempts and activities through the animation video. The following images were extracted from the video clip presented at the symposium.

































### Session 4: Forum

The Traditional Knowledge Based ESD Projects on Bio-Cultural Diversity in the Ise-Mikawa Bay Watershed

Furusawa Reita, Associate Professor, International ESD/SDGs Center Chubu University, and Coordinator of RCE Chubu













# **RCE Chubu Network**

#### **RCE Chubu Council (80 organizations)**

Universities

Antificiality University Auchificiality University Churus University Nagoya britishi Nagoya University Nagoya University Nagoya University Nagoya University Nagoya University Nago Provensity Nago University Nito Provensity We University

**High and Junior High Schools** Chubu University Davidni High Sch Heruhigaolis High School Heruhigaolis Junior High School

**Research Institutes** Research Institutes
Den-En-Avainable Content for Regional Colleboration, Aloni University
Motinal Institute for Fouldon science
Automation and the Content for Regional Colleboration, Aloni University
Automation Institute Colleboration Science
Automation

#### Key Institution (Secretariat)

Chubu University International ESD Center

#### **AdministrativeInstitutions**

Aichi Prefectural Government Orfu Prefectural Government Inte Prefecture Ine Prefecture Kanagai GV Negovo GV Hell Chaba Begrona Environment Office Chaba Begrona Environment Office Chaba Begrona (Tromoto Eluvera), Minaty Hiland, Intanticulare, Transport And Tourisen<sup>®</sup> "Chaba Regional Berness, Ministry OfLand, Intanticulare, Transport And Tourisen<sup>®</sup> "Chaba Regional Berness, Ministry OfLand, Intanticulare, Transport And Tourisen<sup>®</sup> "Chaba Regional Berness, Ministry OfLand, Intanticulare, Transport And Tourisen<sup>®</sup> "Chaba Regional Berness, Ministry OfLand, Intanticulare, Tourisen Chaba Regione Chamaga, Office Environment Berline Neglings Open vehicles of office Environment Berline

NGOs and NPOs

Rachgares-Elmas Shopping Sinet Physician Adoptities Cacure Enversemental Foundation (5M MPO Cetter Oth MPO Cetter Oth MPO Cetter Calanda, an aprila and Bicton Hoatmon Seager Center for Sestimation Hoatmon Seager Center for Sestimation Hoatmon Seager Center for Sestimation Hoatmon Registra (MERSO) Registra (MERS

**Private Companies** and Economic

Organizations Bentsu Dhubu Techno Chubu Assida Decki Chusadiren






















#### Session 4: Forum

Community Development Utilizing Historical Resources in Omihachiman City, Shiga Prefecture

Taguchi Shintaro, Group for transmission of the torch (*taimatsu*) to next generation as cultural heritage



About	田口 真太郎/Shintaro TAGUCHI
	滋賀県立大学大学院 環境化学研究科修了。2013年、近江八幅市地域おこし協力隊を経て、 よちづくり会社族よっせのマネージャーとして設立時より活動。大学や専門家と地域と連携 し、伝統文化のリサーチからセミナーやワークショップを通じた人材育成などコミュニケー ションプログラムの企画運営を行なっている。現在は、温賀県社会教育会員のほか、県立八 崎岡業高校の外部委員、ヴォーリズ学園の非常勤講師も務める。種味はトレランと茶道。
	Facebook @shintaro80000 Meil shintaro80000@gmail.com
	Brief history
	1987   Komit III Hittelio City, Batala Pretiodure, Jopani     2006 - 2010   Marversty of Silipa Pretiodure, School of Environmental Solimoce     2010 - 2012   Graduato School of Environmental Solimoce     2011 - 2013   Ontilactimisan City Deminuity Devidenment Longes attorn (sam)     2014 - 2020   Masse Corporation (Sm) Hachiman City Commanity Devidenment Congo w/)     2014 - 2020   Challactimisation of the terch to reak generation (sain)     2020 - 2021   Challactimian City Hei)





## 文化遺産としての松明を次世代へ贈る会 Group for transmission of the torch

to next generation as cultural heritage

•2014年から松明結の技術の保存伝承や後継者の育成、伝統文 化を通して地域活性化に取り組んでいます。

Since 2014, we have been working to preserve and pass on torchlight techniques, train successors and revitalise the local community through traditional culture.

 活動が評価され、2020年に滋賀県(文化・経済フォーラム滋 賀)から「文化で滋賀を元気に!賞」を受賞。

The economic and cultural organisations of Shiga Prefecture will award us with a prize in 2020 for our activities.











#### Masse Corporation (Omihachiman City Community Development Company) まちづくり会社 ㈱まっせ

"Massee" is a community development company. Based in Omihachiman City, it is a public-private community development organization that focuses on nature, history, and culture, and aims to create a sustainable future for the community.

近江八幡市を拠点に自然や歴史や文化に着目し、持続可能な地域社会の未来を目指し、多くの市民と共に語り合い実践する官民共同出資の まちづくりを行う組織です。



History

2010.3 | Merger of municipalities/旧近江八幡市と旧安土町の合併 2011.4 | Partnership agreement/産官学民連携協定締結 2012.9 | Study Committee/近江八幡まちづくり会社検討委員会 2013.6 | Establishment/株式会社まっせ 設立





#### Mission

Omihachiman, a city with all the charms of Shiga Prefecture, linking its beautiful nature and rich culture to the future.

滋賀の魅力が凝縮された近江八幡の

美しい自然と豊かな文化を未来へつなぐ



Conservation and use of Cultural landscapes ①文化的景観の活用

#ガイドツアー #体験WS



Conservation and use of historical resources ②歴史的資源の活用 #空き町家活用 #松明結



Training of human resources for community development ③まちづくり人材育成 #産官学民連携事業





## 3.1.6 Symposium Information

#### **General Information**

#### 1. Background and purpose of the project

The Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs), adopted in the 70th General Assembly of the United Nations on 25 September 2015, have gradually infiltrated in countries around the world. Since SDGs are the common goals shared by the international community to realise the sustainable world, the countries have sought ways to achieve the goals. UNESCO emphasizes potential contributions of culture, especially intangible cultural heritage (ICH) in SDG 2 (Zero Hunger), 4 (Quality education), 5 (Gender Equality), 11 (Sustainable Cities and Communities) and 17 (Partnerships for the Goals) and put great priority on the safeguarding of ICH in formal and non-formal education at the 12th session of the Intergovernmental Committee in 2017. With these situations, Intangible Cultural Heritage in the Asia-Pacific Region (IRCI) conducted the 2-year project that testifies ICH contribution to SDG 4, mainly the target 4.7<sup>4</sup>, starting from 2018.

The project was successfully completed in cooperation with the counterparts in the Philippines for non-formal education and in Viet Nam for formal education by developing the guidelines that unique ICH elements are incorporated into educational materials and using the materials in actual teaching and learning settings in both counties.

Through the 2-year project <sup>5</sup>, IRCI found out that ICH contributes to SDG 4. The educational materials using ICH could help learners understand the ICH itself and acquire its knowledge and skills. We further witnessed that affection towards learners' community and pride as members of their community were cultivated in the course of the project. In formal education, ICH helped students learn not only academic subjects but also non-cognitive skills. It is worth noted that the attempt using ICH into formal and non-formal education could affect not only learners but also educators including cultural bearers and government officials. The project clearly proved to achieve the target 4.7 and that ICH contributes SDG 4.

As UNESCO suggests that ICH's potential contribution to other SDGs as well as SDG 4, IRCI will focus on another SDG, namely SDG 11 in addition to SDG 4, because ICH is deeply related to the community where the ICH is practiced and transmitted. In order to study how children who receive the education related ICH contribute to their community and put their acquired knowledge and skills into practice for community development,

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup> SDG 4 target4.7: By 2030, ensure that all learners acquire the knowledge and skills needed to promote sustainable development, including, among others, through education for sustainable development and sustainable lifestyles, human rights, gender equality, promotion of a culture of peace and non-violence, global citizenship and appreciation of cultural diversity and of culture's contribution to sustainable development

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>5</sup> Project details: https://www.irci.jp/research/sdgs/

IRCI will launch a new 2-year project this year. The project aims to unveil relationships among ICH, SDG 4 and SDG 11 and clarify ICH roles on quality education and community development through a series of case studies. In cooperation with NGOs in Bangladesh, Indonesia, and Kyrgyzstan, IRCI will analyse good practices that combine ICH, education and/or community development to testify ICH's contribution to SDGs and utilise the outcomes for safeguarding ICH effectively.

# 2. Purpose of the international symposium

The purpose of the international symposium is to share the results of the case studies conducted by counterparts in order to clarify the relationship among ICH, SDG 4, and SDG 11 and to find ICH contributions to SDGs, especially SDG 4 and SDG 11. The international symposium will serve to deepen knowledge with respect to the relationship between ICH and SDGs of the participants and to discuss future perspectives on ICH research that lead to effective ICH safeguarding.

With help from the UNESCO Associated Schools Project Network (ASPUnivNet), United Nations University Global RCE Network (RCE) and Asia-Pacific Cultural Centre for UNESCO (ACCU), Japanese youth and educators will be invited from universities and organisations to the symposium. They will share cases of Japan's ICH education with international researchers and resource persons and promote UNESCO related activities domestically and internationally.

Furthermore, in cooperation with the Goi Peace Foundation, which has organised ESD youth conferences, the international symposium will give a valuable opportunity to consider the relationship among ICH, education, and community development from the viewpoints of youth

It also expects to enhance a network of researchers in the ICH related fields in the Asia-Pacific region.

## **3. Expected outcomes**

- 1. Relationships among ICH, SDG 4 (Quality Education), and SDG 11 (Sustainable Cities and Communities) are clarified.
- 2. ICH contributions to SDGs, especially SDG 4 and SDG 11 are identified.
- 3. Japanese youth and educators are expected to cultivate their knowledge and understanding of ICH safeguarding and SDGs, especially SDG 4 and SDG 11.
- 4. Participants are expected to build and enhance their research network.

## 4. Cooperating Institutions

- Dhaka Ahsania Mission (DAM), Bangladesh
- Dewi Fortuna Community Learning Center (DFCLC), Indonesia
- Taalim-Forum Public Foundation (TFPF), Kyrgyzstan

# 5. Participants

- Experts from DAM, DWCLC and TFPF
- Experts from Vietnam Academy of Social Sciences (VASS), Vietnam Museum of Ethnology (VME), Vietnam Institute of Educational Sciences (VNIES) and National Commission for Culture and the Arts (NCCA)
- Experts from UNESCO Bangkok Office
- Resource persons
- Japanese youth and educators
  - \* Online participants from ASPUnivNet, UNESCO School, RCE Network and 'ESD Japan Youth' of Goi Peace Foundation will be expected to join as observers (maximum 100 participants).

#### 6. Schedule plan

\*Japanese youth and educators will join the <u>session 4</u> on the second day.

#### The first day (28 January 2021)

- 1. Introduction
- 2. Session 1: Presentations about the case study by the counterparts
  - Share the case study by each counterpart (Bangladesh/Indonesia/Kyrgyzstan)
  - Comments from the Participants
- 3. Session 2: Discussion and analysis
  - The relationship among ICH, SDG 4 and SDG 11
  - ICH contributions to SDGs
  - Possible solutions for social issues
  - Future perspectives and challenges regarding the ICH contributions to SDGs

#### The second day (29 January 2021)

- 4. Session 3: Presentation about the follow-up of the previous project by the counterparts of FY 2018 FY 2019
- Share the current situation in each country (the Philippines/Viet Nam)
- Future attempts/plan
- Comments to the case study of 2020 and discussions
- 5. Session 4: Forum with participation of Japanese educators and youth (with simultaneous interpretation)
- Brief presentation about the case studies by counterparts in FY 2020 \*The short version of the presentation on the 1st day.
- Brief presentations about their activities by Japanese educators and youth
- Discussions
- 6. Closing

# 7. Organiser

International Research Centre for Intangible Cultural Heritage in the Asia-Pacific Region (IRCI)

Address: Sakai City Museum, 2 Mozusekiun-cho, Sakai-ku, Sakai City, Osaka, Japan Tel: +81-72-275-8050 / Fax: +81-72-275-8151

E-mail: irci@nich.go.jp

#### Programme

#### Day1 : Thursday 28 January

11:00 - 11:30 (Pening RemarksIntroductionOpening RemarksMr. Iwamoto Wataru, Director-General, IRCIMr. Kameoka Yu, Senior Deputy Secretary-General, Japanese National Commission for UNESCO Deputy Director-General for International AffairsMs. Duong Bich Hanh Programme Specialist for Culture, UNESCO Bangkok OfficeSESSION 1: Presentions about the case study11:30 - 11:50Mr. ABM Shahab Uddin Dhaka Ahsania Mission (DAM), Bangladesh11:50 - 12:10Ms. Almagul Osmonova Taalim-Forum Public Foundation (TFPF), Kyrgyzstan12:30 - 14:00Lunch BreakSESSION 2: Discussion analysis14:00 - 16:00Themes - (CH contributions to SDGs16:00 - 16:15Break16:15 - 17:30Themes - Future perspectives and challenges regarding the ICH contributions to SDGs17:30 - 18:00Wrap up for the Day 1			
Mr. Iwamoto Wataru, Director-General, IRCIMr. Kameoka Yu, Senior Deputy Secretary-General, Japanese National Commission for UNESCO Deputy Director-General for International AffairsMs. Duong Bich Hanh Programme Specialist for Culture, UNESCO Bangkok OfficeSESSION 1: Presentations about the case study11:30 - 11:50Mr. Katistian Apriyanta Dewi Fortuna Community Learning Center (DFCLC), Indonesia12:10 - 12:30Ms. Almagul Osmonova Taalim-Forum Public Foundation (TFPF), Kyrgyzstan12:30 - 14:00Lunch BreakSESSION 2: Discussation - ICH contributions to SDGs16:00 - 16:15Break16:15 - 17:30Nemes - Future perspectives and challenges regarding the ICH contributions to SDGs	11:00 - 11:30	Introduction	
Mr. Kameoka Yu, Senior Deputy Secretary-General, Japanese National Commission for UNESCO Deputy Director-General for International AffairsMs. Duong Bich Hanh Programme Specialist for Culture, UNESCO Bangkok OfficeSESSION 1: Presenttions about the case study11:30 - 11:50Mr. ABM Shahab Uddin Dhaka Ahsania Mission (DAM), Bangladesh11:50 - 12:10Mr. Kristian Apriyanta Dewi Fortuna Community Learning Center (DFCLC), Indonesia12:10 - 12:30Ms. Almagul Osmonova Taalim-Forum Public Foundation (TFPF), Kyrgyzstan12:30 - 14:00Lunch BreakSESSION 2: Discussion and analysis14:00 - 16:00Themes - ICH contributions to SDGs16:00 - 16:15Break16:15 - 17:30Themes - Future perspectives and challenges regarding the ICH contributions to SDGs		Opening Remarks	
Senior Deputy Secretary-General, Japanese National Commission for UNESCO Deputy Director-General for International AffairsMs. Duong Bich Hanh Programme Specialist for Culture, UNESCO Bangkok OfficeSESSION 1: Presertions about the case study11:30 - 11:50Mr. ABM Shahab Uddin Dhaka Ahsania Mission (DAM), Bangladesh11:50 - 12:10Mr. Kristian Apriyanta Dewi Fortuna Community Learning Center (DFCLC), Indonesia12:10 - 12:30Ms. Almagul Osmonova Taalim-Forum Public Foundation (TFPF), Kyrgyzstan12:30 - 14:00Themes - ICH contributions to SDGs16:00 - 16:15Break16:15 - 17:30Themes - Future perspectives and challenges regarding the ICH contributions to SDGs		Mr. Iwamoto Wataru, Director-General, IRCI	
Japanese National Commission for UNESCO Deputy Director-General for International AffairsMs. Duong Bich Hanh Programme Specialist for Culture, UNESCO Bangkok OfficeSESSION 1: Presentations about the case study11:30 - 11:50Mr. ABM Shahab Uddin Dhaka Ahsania Mission (DAM), Bangladesh11:50 - 12:10Mr. Kristian Apriyanta Dewi Fortuna Community Learning Center (DFCLC), Indonesia12:10 - 12:30Ms. Almagul Osmonova Taalim-Forum Public Foundation (TFPF), Kyrgyzstan12:30 - 14:00Lunch BreakSESSION 2: Discussion and analysis14:00 - 16:00Themes - ICH contributions to SDGs16:15 - 17:30Themes - Future perspectives and challenges regarding the ICH contributions to SDGs			
Director-General for International AffairsMs. Duong Bich Hanh Programme Specialist for Culture, UNESCO Bangkok OfficeSESSION 1: Presentations about the case study11:30 - 11:50Mr. ABM Shahab Uddin Dhaka Ahsania Mission (DAM), Bangladesh11:50 - 12:10Mr. Kristian Apriyanta Dewi Fortuna Community Learning Center (DFCLC), Indonesia12:10 - 12:30Ms. Almagul Osmonova Taalim-Forum Public Foundation (TFPF), Kyrgyzstan12:30 - 14:00Lunch BreakSESSION 2: Discustation and analysis14:00 - 16:00Themes - ICH contributions to SDGs16:15 - 17:30Themes - SDGs			
Programme Specialist for Culture, UNESCO Bangkok OfficeSESSION 1: Presentions about the case study11:30 - 11:50Mr. ABM Shahab Uddin Dhaka Ahsania Mission (DAM), Bangladesh11:50 - 12:10Mr. Kristian Apriyanta Dewi Fortuna Community Learning Center (DFCLC), Indonesia12:10 - 12:30Ms. Almagul Osmonova Taalim-Forum Public Foundation (TFPF), Kyrgyzstan12:30 - 14:00Lunch BreakSESSION 2: Discussion and analysis14:00 - 16:00Themes - ICH contributions to SDGs16:15 - 17:30Themes - Future perspectives and challenges regarding the ICH contributions to SDGs		,	
Programme Specialist for Culture, UNESCO Bangkok OfficeSESSION 1: Presentions about the case study11:30 - 11:50Mr. ABM Shahab Uddin Dhaka Ahsania Mission (DAM), Bangladesh11:50 - 12:10Mr. Kristian Apriyanta Dewi Fortuna Community Learning Center (DFCLC), Indonesia12:10 - 12:30Ms. Almagul Osmonova Taalim-Forum Public Foundation (TFPF), Kyrgyzstan12:30 - 14:00Lunch BreakSESSION 2: Discussion and analysis14:00 - 16:00Themes - ICH contributions to SDGs16:15 - 17:30Themes - Future perspectives and challenges regarding the ICH contributions to SDGs			
11:30 - 11:50Mr. ABM Shahab Uddin Dhaka Ahsania Mission (DAM), Bangladesh11:50 - 12:10Mr. Kristian Apriyanta Dewi Fortuna Community Learning Center (DFCLC), Indonesia12:10 - 12:30Ms. Almagul Osmonova Taalim-Forum Public Foundation (TFPF), Kyrgyzstan12:30 - 14:00Lunch BreakSESSION 2: Discussion and analysis14:00 - 16:00Themes - ICH contributions to SDGs16:15 - 17:30Themes - Future perspectives and challenges regarding the ICH contributions to SDGs			
Dhaka Ahsania Mission (DAM), Bangladesh11:50 - 12:10Mr. Kristian Apriyanta Dewi Fortuna Community Learning Center (DFCLC), Indonesia12:10 - 12:30Ms. Almagul Osmonova Taalim-Forum Public Foundation (TFPF), Kyrgyzstan12:30 - 14:00Lunch BreakSESSION 2: Discussion and analysis14:00 - 16:00Themes - ICH contributions to SDGs16:00 - 16:15Break16:15 - 17:30Themes - Future perspectives and challenges regarding the ICH contributions to SDGs	SESSION 1: Presentations about the case study		
11:50 - 12:10Mr. Kristian Apriyanta Dewi Fortuna Community Learning Center (DFCLC), Indonesia12:10 - 12:30Ms. Almagul Osmonova Taalim-Forum Public Foundation (TFPF), Kyrgyzstan12:30 - 14:00Lunch BreakSESSION 2: Discussion and analysis14:00 - 16:00Themes - ICH contributions to SDGs16:15 - 17:30Break16:15 - 17:30Themes - Future perspectives and challenges regarding the ICH contributions to SDGs	11:30 - 11:50	Mr. ABM Shahab Uddin	
Dewi Fortuna Community Learning Center (DFCLC), Indonesia12:10 - 12:30Ms. Almagul Osmonova Taalim-Forum Public Foundation (TFPF), Kyrgyzstan12:30 - 14:00Lunch BreakSESSION 2: Discussion and analysis14:00 - 16:00Themes - ICH contributions to SDGs16:15 - 17:30Themes - Future perspectives and challenges regarding the ICH contributions to SDGs		Dhaka Ahsania Mission (DAM), Bangladesh	
12:10 - 12:30Ms. Almagul Osmonova Taalim-Forum Public Foundation (TFPF), Kyrgyzstan12:30 - 14:00Lunch BreakSESSION 2: Discussion and analysis14:00 - 16:00Themes - ICH contributions to SDGs16:00 - 16:15Break16:15 - 17:30Themes - Future perspectives and challenges regarding the ICH contributions to SDGs	11:50 - 12:10	. ,	
Taalim-Forum Public Foundation (TFPF), Kyrgyzstan12:30 – 14:00Lunch BreakSESSION 2: Discussion and analysis14:00 – 16:00Themes - ICH contributions to SDGs16:00 – 16:15Break16:15 – 17:30Themes - Future perspectives and challenges regarding the ICH contributions to SDGs			
12:30 - 14:00Lunch BreakSESSION 2: Discuss-ond analysis14:00 - 16:00Themes - ICH contributions to SDGs16:00 - 16:15Break16:15 - 17:30Themes - Future perspectives and challenges regarding the ICH contributions to SDGs	12:10 - 12:30	0	
SESSION 2: Discussion and analysis   14:00 - 16:00 Themes - ICH contributions to SDGs   16:00 - 16:15 Break   16:15 - 17:30 Themes - Future perspectives and challenges regarding the ICH contributions to SDGs	42.20 44.00		
14:00 - 16:00Themes - ICH contributions to SDGs16:00 - 16:15Break16:15 - 17:30Themes - Future perspectives and challenges regarding the ICH contributions to SDGs			
- ICH contributions to SDGs   16:00 - 16:15 Break   16:15 - 17:30 Themes - Future perspectives and challenges regarding the ICH contributions to SDGs			
16:00 - 16:15Break16:15 - 17:30Themes - Future perspectives and challenges regarding the ICH contributions to SDGs	14:00 - 16:00		
16:15 – 17:30 Themes   - Future perspectives and challenges regarding the ICH contributions to SDGs			
- Future perspectives and challenges regarding the ICH contributions to SDGs	16:00 - 16:15	Break	
SDGs	16:15 - 17:30		
<b>17:30 – 18:00</b> Wrap up for the Day 1			
	17:30 - 18:00	Wrap up for the Day 1	

#### Day2 : Friday 29 January

11:00 - 11:15	Introduction for the day2	
SESSION 3: Presentation about the follow-up of the previous project (FY2018 – FY2019) by the counterparts		
11:15 - 11:35	1:15 – 11:35Ms. Renee TalaveraNational Commission for Culture and the Arts (NCCA),	

	the Philippines	
11:35 – 11:55	Ms. Pham Thi Thuy Chung Vietnam Academy of Social Sciences (VASS) Ms. Vu Hong Nhi Ms. Vu Phuong Nga Vietnam Museum of Ethnology (VME) Ms. Bui Thanh Xuan Vietnam Institute of Educational Sciences (VNIES)	
11:55 - 13:00	Lunch Break	
<b>SESSION 4: Forum with participation of Japanese educators and youth</b> Japanese youth and educators participate in the symposium Japanese-English simultaneous interpretation available		
13:00 - 13:15	Introduction	
	Opening Remarks	
	Mr. Iwamoto Wataru, Director-General, IRCI	
13:15 – 14:00	Brief presentation about the case studies (15 min x 3, including Q&A) * The short version of the presentation on the 1st day Mr. ABM Shahab Uddin (DAM), Bangladesh Mr. Kristian Apriyanta (DFCLC), Indonesia Ms. Almagul Osmonova (TFPF), Kyrgyzstan	
14:00 - 14:10	Break	
14:10 - 15:10	Brief presentations about the activities of Japanese youth and educators (15 min x 4, including Q&A) Introduced by Asia-Pacific Cultural Centre for UNESCO (ACCU), Global RCE Network, The Goi Peace Foundation ASPUnivNet Mr. Ichinose Tomonori Professor Miyagi University of Education UNESCO associated Schools (applying) Mr. Chiba Shin Principal Sendai City Akiu Lower Secondary School RCE Network Mr. Furusawa Reita Associate professor, International ESD/ SDGs Center, Chubu University The RCE Chubu Coordinator Group for transmission of the torch to next generation as cultural heritage Mr. Taguchi Shintaro	
15:10 - 15:30	Break	
15:30 - 16:30	Discussions Possible themes ( <i>The Themes may change</i> ): - ICH and education - ICH and community development - Concreate methods to achieve SDG 4 and SDG 11 by using ICH	

#### List of Participants

Bangladesh: Dhaka Ahsania Mis	ssion (DAM)			
Mr. Md. Shahidul Islam	Head of Education & TVET Sector			
Mr. ABM Shahab Uddin	Researcher			
Indonesia: Dewi Fortuna Community Learning Center (DFCLC)				
Mr. Kristian Apriyanta	Representative			
Kyrgyzstan: Taalim-Forum public foundation (TFPF)				
Ms. Almagul Osmonova	General Director			
Ms. Jyldyz Doolbekova	Researcher			
Ms. Anara Alymkulova	Director, Institute of Sustainable Development Strategy (ISDS)			
The Philippines: National Comm	nission for Culture and the Arts (NCCA)			
Ms. Renee Talavera	Head, Cultural Communities and Traditional Arts Section			
Viet Nam: Vietnam Academy of Social Sciences (VASS)				
Ms. Pham Thi Thuy Chung	Researcher, Institute for Religious Studies			
Viet Nam: Vietnam Museum of	Ethnology (VME)			
Ms. Vu Hong Nhi	Researcher/Deputy Head of Education Department			
Ms. Vu Phuong Nga	Researcher/Deputy Head of the Audio-visual Department			
Viet Nam: Vietnam Institute of Educational Sciences (VNIES)				
Ms. Bui Thanh Xuan	Deputy Director, Research Division for Continuing Education			
UNESCO Bangkok				
Ms Duong Bich Hanh	Programme Specialist for Culture			
Japan: Ministry of Education, Culture, Sports, Science and Technology				
Mr. Kameoka Yu	Senior Deputy Secretary-General, Japanese National Commission for UNESCO Deputy/Director-General for International Affairs			
Resource Persons				
Ms. Liou Lin-Yu	Professor, Department of Music Education, Nara University of Education			
Mr. Sato Masahisa	Professor, Graduate School of Environmental and Information Studies, Tokyo City University			
Mr. Ishimura Tomo	Head, Audio-Visual Documentation Section, Tokyo National Research Institute for Cultural Properties			

Japanese educators and youth	Japanese educators and youth (Session 4 only)		
Ms. Konishi Miki	Programme Coordinator, United Nations University Institute for the Advanced Study of Sustainability (UNU-IAS)		
Mr. Furusawa Reita	Associate professor, International ESD/ SDGs Center, Chubu University, The RCE Chubu Coordinator		
Mr. Suzuki Keisuke	ESD Youth Japan Secretariat, The Goi Peace Foundation		
Mr. Taguchi Shintaro	Group for transmission of the torch to next generation as cultural heritage		
Mr. Oyasu Kiichi	Director, Education Cooperation Department Asia-Pacific Cultural Centre for UNESCO		
Mr. Chiba Shin	Principal, Sendai City Akiu Lower Secondary School		
Mr. Ichinose Tomonori	Professor, Miyagi University of Education		
Secretariat			
International Research Centre for Intangible Cultural Heritage in the Asia-Pacific Region (IRCI)			
Mr. Iwamoto Wataru	Director-General		
Ms. Sasaki Kazue	Associate Fellow		
Ms. Umeda Yasuyo	Associate Fellow		

# 3.2. FY 2021 Symposium



Section cover photo: Okinohara rice planting dance performed in Chitose Primary School, Japan ©Chitose Primary School

#### 3.2.1 Objective and Overview

The 'Research on ICH's Contribution to SDGs: Education and Community Development' project was launched in FY 2020 to investigate ICH's contributions to SDGs, especially SDGs 4 and 11. Three case studies were examined in cooperation with three NGOs, namely DAM in Bangladesh, DFCLCL in Indonesia, and TFPF in Kyrgyzstan.

This international symposium was held on 21–22 December 2021 to examine the outcomes of the FY 2021 project and synthesise the lessons learned from 2 years of project activities. It aimed to share the results of the three NGOs' case studies and discuss how ICH, education, and community development are interrelated, as well as how ICH contributes to achieving SDGs 4 and 11. On the first day, an expert meeting titled 'ICH's Contributions to SDGs: Focusing on SDG 4 (Quality Education) and SDG 11 (Sustainable Cities and Communities)' was held, during which experts involved in the project engaged in intensive discussions to summarise the findings of 2 years of research.

On the second day, the public symposium 'ICH contributing to better education and sustainable communities' shared the project outcomes with the wider public and provided an opportunity for Japanese youth to learn about ICH safeguarding and SDGs, while interacting with international researchers and experts.

## 3.2.2 Expert Meeting

ICH's Contributions to SDGs: Focusing on SDG 4 (Quality Education) and SDG 11 (Sustainable Cities and Communities)

The expert meeting in FY 2021 was held on 21 December 2021 to analyse the relationship among ICH, education, and community development and clarify ICH's role in achieving SDGs 4 and 11. The meeting's attendees were 15 researchers, including experts from DAM in Bangladesh, DFCLC in Indonesia, and TFPF in Kyrgyzstan, experts from the Philippines and Viet Nam who collaborated on the previous IRCI project on SDGs, an expert from the UNESCO Bangkok office, and Japanese experts in education and cultural heritage.

#### 1. Presentations

Firstly, DAM, DFCLC, and TFPF reported the results of the case studies undertaken in FY 2021, each followed by a Q&A session.

#### Bangladesh

DAM presented the results of the analysis of Dhamail practices in urban and rural areas, specifically on how the Dhamail that is performed in urban areas differs from that in rural areas and the issues that exist regarding practising Dhamail in each area. The presentation also included the methodology, major activities, findings related to the role

of ICH in achieving SDGs, particularly SDGs 4 and 11, and potential next steps to continue this study (see Section 3.2.5 on presentation materials).

In the Q&A session that followed the presentation, participants directed their questions about the case study to Mr Rhaman of DAM. Major points discussed are as follows:

• How Dhamail supports community resilience to disasters, calamities, and human suffering

Dhamail scripts written in local languages can raise awareness and keep people informed in disaster situations. For instance, there was a case where the local people did not understand the implication of a cyclone warning given in the standard Bangla language.

• Whether DAM has received support from the national or local governments or local communities

DAM works with local communities, the government including the Ministry of Cultural Affairs, and national-level institutions such as the Shilpakala Academy through stakeholder consultations and cooperates with international organisations including UNESCO.

• Community members' feelings about changes to Dhamail scripts, i.e., whether the old Dhamail style should be preserved and whether youth Westernisation of Dhamail is acceptable

According to the presentation, the rhythm, and steps of Dhamail have been maintained in keeping with the original Dhamail practice; however, songs and scripts can be changed to convey important messages such as social issues. This may be deemed acceptable at the local level through consultations with local communities. However, there has yet been no conclusion about the changes to Dhamail and their impact on its transmission. It is important to decide which aspects of Dhamail are to be transmitted, as each group focuses on different aspects of Dhamail, such as solidarity, scripts or sounds.

The most important aspect is the purpose of practising and transmitting Dhamail. The original songs and messages have not been forgotten, but Dhamail can be modified depending on the purpose for or situation in which it is being performed. Hence, whether to modify Dhamail is the performer's choice.

• Whether consent is necessary when people want to use Dhamail, including its variations, especially as a promotional tool

Copyright is a basic issue. DAM, as a common practice, obtains permission when it takes pictures and specifies how and where the pictures will be used. When using others' products, such as YouTube, it is necessary to indicate sources. As for scripts, DAM cooperates with composers and writers and only uses their scripts for promotion with their consent. Given the popularity of digital materials, copyright for open-source materials needs to be considered.

• Whether COVID-19 aspects were included in the new scripts

Three scripts contain COVID-19-related topics, such as social distancing and economic recovery from pandemic-induced loss.

#### Indonesia

DFCLC presented quantitative data to compare Kethoprak education in non-formal versus formal schools and demonstrated that Kethoprak education has influenced students' academic performance, character, and attitudes towards their community. The presentation included the methodology DFCLC used, major activities, positive aspects of ICH in terms of achieving SDGs, and activities that DFCLC intends to carry out in the future (see Section 3.2.5 on presentation materials).

In the Q&A session, participants made noteworthy comments and engaged in discussion as follows:

• How DFCLC introduced Kethoprak in formal education, which usually has a less flexible curriculum than non-formal education, and what kinds of challenges and difficulties DFCLC faced as a community learning centre when introducing and teaching ICH

Kethoprak was taught in an extracurricular class at Krista Gracia primary school. Prerequisites for implementing Kethoprak education in schools are institutional capacity and understanding among principals, teachers, and students; governmental financial and technical support including related policy; and parents' understanding. Students' participation was among the challenges faced, since students' backgrounds are diverse, and it is difficult to keep them motivated to learn. Another challenge was securing adequate government funding.

• Whether non-formal education is superior to formal education for community development using ICH

In non-formal education, compared to formal education, learners are likely to be more motivated, and the majority have already had social experiences. Moreover, the curriculum in non-formal schools is flexible, unlike that in formal schools, which follow the national curriculum. Furthermore, non-formal schools are connected to communities, so they are expected to contribute significantly to community development using ICH.

• Young people's interest in traditional culture

Young people have become less interested in learning about traditional culture because of globalisation. They tend to consider local culture and arts as ancient, wasteful, slow, feudal, and uneconomical, and they place greater value on

information technology.

• Why Klaten was selected as the project's target area

Klaten is the place where DFCLC is located, and it is situated between the two large cities of Yogyakarta and Surakarta (Solo). Its cultural conditions are complex and heterogeneous, and it is currently experiencing a cultural transition problem due to globalisation.

#### Kyrgyzstan

TFPF presented on the roles of community museums in three regions studied in the project, focusing on the safeguarding of nomadic cultural heritage such as the Kyrgyz yurt and related knowledge and skills. The presentation introduced the features of three local museums and clarified the importance of local museums as educational and cultural places where community members including youth and women can gather to learn about ICH safeguarding and transmit their heritage (see Section 3.2.5 on presentation materials).

In the Q&A session, participants raised interesting questions as follows:

• On the evolving role of community museums

The museums studied in the case study have new characteristics such as openness and interactivity that are not seen in typical museums, which are often thought of as static places that simply store artefacts. Openness to transforming the ideas and work of museums by being part of environment and a community is a global trend. Fruitful pathways include exchanges of innovations with museums outside Kyrgyzstan and international experiences gained at museum worker forums. Moreover, a museum consortium leader in Kyrgyzstan uses modern technology to show videos to children and promote nomadic civilisation.

One of the important roles of local museums is to transmit traditional indigenous knowledge and heritage by teaching historical stories to students in local schools and encouraging people to visit the museum, as in the Sary-Mogol case.

• How local museums transmit ICH and train potential ICH bearers

Local museums, which, in Kyrgyzstan, are often founded by ICH bearers, can nurture potential ICH bearers not only by teaching skills such as weaving and felt making but also by sharing the stories behind them with youth. Exposure to these stories encourages youth to develop a sense of pride in their culture and recognise their identity through learning directly from ICH bearers, who, in turn, must be passionate and charismatic leaders capable of influencing young people's perceptions and attitudes, as well as social and economic life. Museum masterclasses also help to shape potential young ICH bearers.

Community museums play important roles in involving young people in and

encouraging them to safeguard their living heritage. Museums are an intergenerational platform for transmitting knowledge and heritage of which communities are proud. Challenges include technical knowledge about safeguarding ICH and financing community-level initiatives like museums and community learning centres. Regarding the latter, private enterprises and the government need to be involved in funding.

Mobilising the community is also important. There is a new project near the world heritage site in Bangladesh that encourages students and teachers to visit local museums as part of an annual study. However, after their visit, very few students and teachers recollect the important points or have strategies in mind for sharing that knowledge. Continuity in the engagement of the local community at this world heritage site, which includes intangible and tangible heritage, is important; however, it cannot be achieved without knowledge about safeguarding ICH bearers. Technical information to guide students is also important.

• Strategies for attracting visitors, including schools and other stakeholders, to the community museum

Community museums are more open and accessible to visitors. Specifically, community museums do not keep their artefacts in glass boxes, allowing visitors to touch, hold, and play with them.

Museum staff need to be creative about making exhibitions attractive and providing a variety of programmes. It is not mandatory for schools to have students visit community museums; rather, whether classes visit is left to individual teachers' discretion and initiative. Hence, it is very important for local museums to work closely with local schools and teachers. Such cooperation, which results in teachers engaging more in these kinds of activities, is beneficial for passing ICH to the young generation.

Another example of successfully attracting youth in Kyrgyzstan is an informal school that teaches archery and traditional hunting involving golden eagles, dogs, and horses through a master-apprentice system in which masters with varied traditional knowledge provide an abundance of examples. Such schools are successful because the masters' behaviour is in keeping with our culture, and learning is deeply embedded in an understanding of our culture, land, the philosophy of our ancestors, etc. Furthermore, youth find contests attractive; for example, an archery competition is engaging because it involves being nominated, wearing traditional clothes, competing, and ultimately winning. Small festivals also have the potential to consolidate and mobilise communities.

• Whether there is any conflict with community rights and benefits when museums sell tickets and souvenirs

It is important to consider strategies that will allow museums to function independently, without grants. Museums were initially hesitant to commercialise, but museum specialists have pointed out that charging admission fees and providing

paid services such as masterclasses are part of normal practice and a means of earning money towards the institution's sustainability.

The growing size of audiences that include ICH lovers and supporters who enjoy and understand ICH benefits local communities by creating opportunities for them to generate more income through participation in festivals and the sale of handicrafts and traditional musical instruments. Networking among such audiences, which include bearers of traditional knowledge, scientists, researchers, cultural practitioners, and youth, is also beneficial for communities as it is an opportunity to address various interconnected issues such as the loss of natural resources and environmental degradation.

#### 2. Follow-up reports by former project counterparts

Collaborators on the previous project, 'Multi-Disciplinary Study on Intangible Cultural Heritage's Contribution to Sustainable Development: Focusing on Education' (FY 2018-2019), namely the National Commission for Culture and the Arts (NCCA) in the Philippines and the Vietnam Institute of Educational Sciences (VNIES) and Vietnam Museum of Ethnology (VME) in Viet Nam, reported on the further development and elaboration of related activities after completion of the project.

## NCCA, the Philippines

In the Philippines, the project, which spanned the period 2018–2019, focused on the development and publication of guidelines for teaching Buklog, a thanksgiving ritual for the School of Living Traditions (SLT<sup>1</sup>) in Zamboanga del Sur in the Subanen community. The community manages the formal learning centre, which is geared towards safeguarding traditional culture by transmitting indigenous knowledge from cultural masters to the young generation. The cultural masters, local coordinators, and students of SLT in Zamboanga del Sur have used the guidelines and found them to be very effective and helpful in their teaching and learning. The guidelines have also been used by cultural masters involved in another NCCA project, that is, not only among SLTs but also by the Institute of Living Traditions. In this project, ICH elements are taught to all interested parties, as opposed to SLTs, which only teach ICH to community members.

After the project, attitudinal changes were observed in cultural masters, educators, students, and coordinators in SLTs. For instance, cultural masters' teaching has been more organised and structured, like in formal schools. This activates their sense of pride as educators. Furthermore, with use of the guidelines, youth have become more aware of their ICH; they appreciate its significance and tend to contemplate their identity and role in the community. Moreover, Subanen community members, including cultural masters, appreciate that their ICH has been documented in the form of guidelines that will help future generations continue learning about the culture and take more pride in their identity. These achievements can be credited to an understanding of the richness

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> The School of Living Traditions (SLT) was registered on UNESCO's Register of Good Safeguarding Practices in 2021.

and significance of their ICH, thanks to application of the guidelines.

One of the project's impacts is that the guidelines serve as a model for the learning materials that other SLTs are developing. Presently, NCCA is offering financial and technical support to 27 SLTs that are developing their own guidelines, an effort that is being spearheaded by cultural masters, bearers, and SLT coordinators themselves. Another project impact is that NCCA has completed the production and dissemination of 18 e-learning resources, including these guidelines, an achievement that has contributed significantly to strengthening SLTs and safeguarding ICH through sustainable development via education. NCCA hopes to continue localised training on ICH safeguarding for teachers, educators, and community members to enable the teaching and transmission of indigenous knowledge and practices in formal education.

In connection with ICH's contribution to SDGs, the previous project initially targeted the realisation of SDG 4.7 in a non-formal education programme. However, given that several education modules contained in the guidelines were implemented, replicated, and even innovated in other SLTs located in different parts of the country, it was reported that the guidelines actually contributed to achieving SDG 11, including targets 11.4,<sup>2</sup>, 11.5,<sup>3</sup> and 11.6.<sup>4</sup> Furthermore, the publication of the guidelines has contributed to strengthening efforts to protect the community's heritage by involving youth in learning the practices. The SLT programme was enhanced for this reason, and it has inspired communities' identity pride and helped community members realise the essence of their community membership.

## VNIES, Viet Nam

In 2020, VNIES delivered the guidelines developed during the previous project to 15 formal schools in Hanoi. Feedback from the pilot school attached to VNIES indicates that the guidelines are very useful and highly applicable because they were developed based on the new national curriculum.

Teachers not only taught ICH in subject classes but also learned effective teaching methodologies to enhance students' experience. The project also raised teachers' awareness about ICH as well as SDGs. Teachers have recognised that SDGs are closely linked to students' everyday life, such as traditional values, gender equality, peace throughout the community and country, community development, and cultural sensitivity. Moreover, teachers and school leaders have realised that ICH teaching requires a whole-school approach, which means that cooperation with ICH masters and school leaders is necessary to succeed. They have also acknowledged that given that ICH is closely linked to daily life themes, it can be incorporated into almost any subject and is not limited to civic education or literature classes. In ICH teaching, the content and

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> Strengthen efforts to protect and safeguard the world's cultural and natural heritage.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> By 2030, significantly reduce the number of deaths and the number of people affected and substantially decrease the direct economic losses relative to global gross domestic product caused by disasters, including water-related disasters, with a focus on protecting the poor and people in vulnerable situations.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup> By 2030, reduce the adverse per capita environmental impact of cities, including by paying special attention to air quality and municipal and other waste management.

approach should be attractive for students, similar to the lessons that were developed during the previous project, which incorporated 'tugging rituals and games' and 'Ca-tru singings', both of which are inscribed in UNESCO's Representative List of the Intangible Cultural Heritage of Humanity.

Teachers have recommended that stakeholders including researchers and policymakers devise more effective and interactive ways to teach ICH in elementary school to make ICH more accessible. For example, digitalising ICH gives students the freedom to learn anytime and anywhere, even during a pandemic. Under the circumstances, that is, given students' exposure to technology such as the internet, learning about ICH interactively is even more important for students than just listening.

School leaders and teachers at the pilot schools understand that ICH is effective and relevant for students to raise awareness towards community development, since almost all ICH has traditional value and is capable of fostering unity, solidarity, a sense of belonging, love for people and neighbourhoods, and teamwork and compassion. They also mentioned that the concept of community is closely related to Vietnamese culture. Researchers are now considering integrating ICH teaching and learning into non-formal education.

# VME, Viet Nam

VME currently displays exhibits about the culture of 54 Vietnamese ethnic groups as well as cultures in Southeast Asia and all around the world. Before participating in the project, VME paid no direct attention to SDGs. However, after participating in the project, SDGs have been considered in the planning of every educational activity at VME.

VME's SDG-related efforts include enhancing public understanding of the value of ICH and the roles cultural communities play, helping cultural communities practise and transmit their ICH, and spreading positive actions about and protecting and promoting ICH.

Through various activities and programmes that have utilised ICH since the project, VME reported the following findings:

- Community participation is necessary to have a relationship with cultural heritage.
- Educational activities have a positive impact on social life.
- It is important to respect the community's role and voice. In addition to their role as interpreters, communities should also become decision makers in terms of deciding how to explain, perform, and organise educational activities.
- Educational activities should benefit the museum, communities, and the public, especially young people.

#### 3. Discussions

The discussion and analysis session were facilitated by Mr Iwamoto. It focused mainly on the following points.

## 1) Aspects of ICH that contribute to SDGs 4 and 11

The case studies have demonstrated that ICH undoubtedly contributes to SDGs 4 and 11. For instance, utilising ICH in educational settings effectively enriches character education or the acquisition of non-cognitive skills, while also nurturing solidarity or a sense of attachment to the community. These are typically positive effects of ICH in education. Regarding the nature of ICH, what are the specific aspects of ICH that facilitate its contribution to SDGs 4 and 11?

- In the case of Dhamail in Bangladesh, interactions among participants and with community members while practising Dhamail are very important aspects for both SDGs 4 and 11. Regarding SDG 4, Dhamail's entertainment value (joyful learning) is a strong motivator for learners, and it contributes to reducing the number of dropouts. Regarding SDG 11, communication through Dhamail contributes to community development not only by sending messages but also by providing training.
- The traditional stories and rituals of Kethoprak in Indonesia contribute to SDGs 4 and 11. The national and local stories teach listeners about history and impart other important knowledge and skills that can be utilised throughout one's entire life.
- In the Kyrgyz case, improvisatory composition of poetry and songs that incorporate local beliefs encourages children to seek balance and harmony with the natural environment. These aspects of ICH connect children to the natural environment. The ethno-environmental aspects of ICH promote traditional knowledge and values and teach strategies for the sustainable use of natural resources, which, in turn, lead to a green or sustainable economy.

# 2) <u>Key factors for maintaining the relationship among ICH, education (SDG 4), and</u> <u>community development (SDG 11)</u>

According to the case studies the three NGOs conducted, ICH, education, and community development are interrelated. ICH helps improve education in both formal and non-formal settings, bringing benefits to learners, who acquire ICH knowledge and related skills through ICH education, which may shape them into future ICH practitioners. ICH education also fosters learners' pride in and affection towards their community and inspires them to work towards realising a sustainable community. What are the key factors to maintain such relationships?

- DAM (Bangladesh) and TFPF (Kyrgyzstan) both emphasised that intergenerational communication and interaction among participants are important to adapt to changes and support youth safeguarding of ICH.
- DFCLC (Indonesia) noted that factors such as a partnership with stakeholders and

government commitment through policies are important.

3) <u>Future developments regarding the activities the three NGOs intend to initiate after</u> <u>the end of the current project</u>

The current IRCI-led project ends in February 2022; however, three NGOs are expected to continue efforts to incorporate ICH into education and utilise ICH for community development with their own ways, as reported by the Philippines and Viet Nam. Are there any specific plans?

- In Bangladesh, DAM is planning a training course in 2022 for teachers in formal and non-formal education on how to teach Dhamail. DAM intends to make this initiative, which was developed in the IRCI project, part of its regular activities at the local level. At the national level, DAM will dialogue with the government to seek policy support for the next steps at the community and institutional levels.
- DFCLC in Indonesia will obtain more student data to determine whether this project can be more widely beneficial. Research on Kethoprak's contribution to other SDGs will continue. DFCLC will also strengthen its effort to make Klaten the city of Kethoprak, in the hope that the art of Kethoprak will be inscribed on the Representative List of the Intangible Cultural Heritage of Humanity.
- TFPF in Kyrgyzstan will try to integrate the already well-established network of organisations that have supported safeguarding ICH in order to provide professional support for the development of various ICH-related communitybased programmes. This networking will help organise festivals and other kinds of events, while seeking state-level support.

Before ending the discussion, experts who attended the meeting as resource persons, namely Mr Ishimura (head of the Audio-Visual Documentation Section at the Tokyo National Research Institute for Cultural Properties), Ms Liou (professor in the Department of Music Education, Nara University of Education), Mr Sato (professor at the Graduate School of Environmental and Information Studies, Tokyo City University), and Ms Duong (programme specialist for culture at the UNESCO Bangkok office), provided general comments reflecting their respective viewpoints. Their comments are transcribed in Section 3.2.4.

Concluding the discussion, Mr Iwamoto stated that SDG 4 covers inclusive education for all learners, that is, education that includes those who may not necessarily become ICH bearers in the future. It is very important to balance teaching ICH for the benefit of the general public with ICH education intended to shape successors. He commented on the major points raised at the discussion as follows:

- Many participants mentioned the importance of interaction among ICH holders and between ICH holders and their supporters. If learners can experience such interaction, they will not only learn about the spirit of ICH but also about the various people involved in its safeguarding, which will help them recognise the importance of cultural communities.
- Culture is innately intergenerational, as it has to be transmitted from person to person and from generation to generation. Sustainable development, which is

defined as development that contributes to the needs of the present generation without compromising the interest of future generations, is also intergenerational in nature. Hence, both present and future generations should be considered in the safeguarding of ICH.

Materials pertaining to the expert meeting can be found in Section 3.2.5, and other materials, such as general information and a list of participants, are presented at the end of this section.

# 3.2.3 Public Symposium

## ICH Contributing to Better Education and Sustainable Communities

The public symposium was held on 22 December 2021 to share the outcomes of this project with the wider public and facilitate the exchange of opinions and experiences among researchers, experts, educators, students, and youth in Japan and abroad through the presentation of cases in which ICH has been utilised in education and/or community development. The symposium was an opportunity for participants to understand the potential roles of ICH in relation to realising SDGs, especially SDGs 4 and 11. The content encouraged them to reference this experience to inform their future activities and research. In the interactive discussion session, participants exchanged thoughts, advice, and experiences mainly pertaining to the challenges and issues of incorporating ICH into education and community development.

In addition to the researchers and experts who attended the expert meeting on the previous day, Japanese panellists from Osaka Prefecture University, Shotoku Gakuen Junior & Senior High School, Hokkaido University, Yamagata City Chitose Primary School, and Junior Chamber International Japan (JCI), as well as project stakeholders and Japanese experts from the Asia-Pacific Cultural Centre for UNESCO (ACCU), the United Nations University Institute for the Advanced Study of Sustainability (UNU-IAS), the Global RCE Network, and the Goi Peace Foundation all participated in the public symposium. A total of 44 researchers and educators from Japan and abroad also took part in the public symposium as audience members.

Interactive discussions proceeded with the following points.

## 1) ICH's contribution to education (SDG 4)

According to Mr Ii (Osaka Prefecture University), ICH education imparts not only related knowledge and skills but also information about the background and history of ICH and the transmission process. Mr Ii and Mr Iwamoto argued that ICH education is expected to engender mutual respect and mutual learning when students from various backgrounds and cultures study ICH or culture together. Regardless of whether they are from big or small cities or developed or developing countries, students will be able to relate to ICH in their own community or culture. As in the Japanese cases Mr Yamana (Shotoku Gakuen Junior & Senior High School) and Mr Abe (Chitose Primary School)

presented, curricula that involve ICH are designed not to teach ICH as such but rather to identify issues in communities and resolve them independently through the study of ICH. Students' self-awareness is emphasised as an outcome of learner-centred education.

Many participants noted that indigenous/local languages need particular attention when we consider safeguarding and transmitting ICH because they are closely related to local culture and ICH. Ms Talavera (NCCA) mentioned that cultural masters in the Philippines use their local language to teach ICH. Mr Kitahara (Hokkaido University) suggested that although it might be difficult for all schools to regularly teach indigenous/local languages, formal schools, as the first step, could create an environment where learners can use such languages comfortably and confidently. Certain participants argued that public support is necessary to sustainably teach ICH including indigenous knowledge and languages in formal schools and to make such efforts widespread.

Participants raised several specific issues and challenges related to incorporating ICH into education. Mr Abe, for instance, stated that teachers need to do extra work to develop educational materials and find appropriate lecturers who can teach ICH at school. Another key issue is the understanding of the school to incorporate ICH into its curriculum. This situation recently improved with the inclusion of the phrase 'sustainable society' in the national 'course of studies' (educational guidelines) and the concept of SDGs have been widely diffused throughout Japan. Mr Kitahara also reported on the situation in Hokkaido, Japan, where ICH education is primarily delivered by individual teachers, although it is taught in extracurricular classes at some elementary schools. Unfortunately, teachers' efforts and initiatives do not continue when they move to other schools. Currently, there are too few teachers capable of teaching traditional culture and indigenous languages in formal schools without compromising other academic subjects.

Ms Liou (Nara University of Education) remarked that it is difficult for immigrants and ethnic minorities to maintain their mother language because, for pragmatic reasons, they need to use the official language of their place of residence. She added that evaluating students' performance will be challenging when introducing ICH into subject classes at elementary and junior high schools rather than as extracurricular activities because teachers usually do not have professional knowledge about ICH. Ms Xuan (VNIES) reported on the situation in Viet Nam, indicating that there is a gap between public and private international schools regarding teaching ICH. International schools consider ICH an important component of education for students who may study or work abroad in the future. In contrast, public schools tend to focus on basic subjects such as mathematics, literature, and English rather than ICH.

## 2) Cooperation between schools and communities

NGOs such as DAM, DFCLC, and TFPF play an important role in encouraging collaboration between schools and communities. DFCLC and TFPF have supported educational programmes in both formal and non-formal education by providing educational materials and introducing ICH practitioners to schools as teachers, as well as by organising festivals where students can showcase the knowledge, they have acquired through performance in front of audiences comprising their parents, fellow community members, and local government officials. For example, Chitose Primary School organised a school event to showcase students' performance of ICH to which parents and community members were invited. Moreover, according to TFPF, museums are places where visitors, including both community members and people outside the community, can learn about their ICH and culture through interactive activities with ICH practitioners.

Regarding the situation in Bangladesh, Mr Rhaman (DAM) reported that non-formal schools successfully collaborate with communities, while collaborations between formal schools and communities are not easily supported due to the government's rigid management of the school system, including the curriculum. It seems that in Bangladesh, it is difficult to introduce new initiatives, like this project, that utilise ICH in formal schools. Regarding Kyrgyzstan, Ms Osmonova and Ms Doolbekova (TFPF) remarked that the master-apprentice system plays an important role in connecting learners with their community in a non-formal education setting. In formal education, elective/optional courses connect schools and communities. For example, ethno-environmental education imparts traditional ecological knowledge to connect people with their local environment.

Mr Abe, Mr Yamane, and Mr Iwamoto stated that the school curriculum needs to be designed in line with the national 'course of studies'; however, 'the period for integrated studies' in the 'course of studies' allows teachers to take a multi-disciplinary approach to teach subjects in daily life, such as community-based activities, where teachers and students can communicate with community members. Mr Abe also mentioned that school events that allow students to share what they have learned at school with others are an opportunity for schools and community members to interact with each other.

## 3) ICH's contribution to communities (SDG 11)

Many participants stated that ICH provides entertainment, generates income and employment opportunities, and empowers minorities including women, children, ethnic groups and the disabled. Mr Ishimura (Tokyo National Research Institute for Cultural Properties) emphasised that ICH, including indigenous and local knowledge, plays a significant role during negative situations such as disasters. He and other participants, including students from the Shotoku Gakuen, acknowledged that ICH revitalises communities, connects people within and outside of communities, mitigates negative impacts caused by disasters, and helps communities recover in their aftermath. Mr Nishimura (Junior Chamber International Japan [JCI]) mentioned that JCI considers the utilisation of local cultural resources including ICH as a quality value creation initiative, as shown in the case of Yamaguchi JCI. As Mr Iwamoto said, ICH is also a vehicle for conveying specific messages of the community.

Participants emphasised that the active participation of communities and intergenerational cooperation are indispensable for the viable practise, safeguarding, and transmission of ICH. Mr Rhaman and Ms Talavera cautioned that a community's consent is crucial when seeking to perform or utilise their ICH because ICH often contains sensitive components or aspects such as religious or social secrecy, and any problems related to ICH should be resolved at the community level. Mr Rhaman added that

although it is necessary to obtain the community's consent to use their ICH, it would be acceptable to change some parts of ICH, for instance, costumes, musical instruments, or performance style, in order to adapt to the contemporary situation, with the condition that the essence of that ICH element will not be drastically transformed. In the Indonesian case of Kethoprak, teaching only some segments of ICH at school is unproblematic. Reflecting on Mr Rhaman's comment, many participants in the workshop in Bangladesh acknowledged that because ICH is living heritage, it is natural for it to be gradually transformed over time.

On active community participation, Mr Ishimura confirmed that the community plays a crucial role in practising and safeguarding ICH and that ICH itself contributes to community solidarity. Referring to a recent meeting on 'Culture, Heritage, & Climate Change' (co-sponsored by UNESCO, IPCC, and ICOMOS) held during 6–10 December 2021, he insisted that ICH, including indigenous and local knowledge, mitigates the negative impact of climate change such as natural disasters and provides solutions to climate change. Accordingly, ICH can contribute to SDG 13 (Climate Action) in addition to SDGs 4 and 11.

# 4) Impact of the COVID-19 pandemic on ICH

During the COVID-19 pandemic, many innovative methods have emerged and have been utilised as new means of teaching, learning, and introducing ICH. For example, since the onset of the pandemic, Shotoku Gakuen students have mainly conducted their activities using online tools such as the Internet, YouTube, and social media, which have given many people around the world the opportunity to experience local festivals. However, these new methods are not always welcomed because, as Ms Talavera pointed out, practising ICH often requires direct interactions with people on the spot.

# 5) Other topics

When asked about collaboration with Russian researchers, Mr Kitahara explained that research on Ainu culture and language is sometimes done in collaboration with researchers from Sakhalin in the Russian Far East where historical documents related to the Ainu have been accumulated and where the Ainu people once lived. The archives of museums and universities in St. Petersburg contain old Japanese documents from the Edo period. Hence, the joint research project and information exchanges are carried out with researchers at such organisations.

Mr Kitahara exemplified some important concepts such as connectivity and cultural pluralism. As in Japan, a country may have multiple different cultures. However, in Japan, some different cultures have long been connected in certain ways. Thus, when we learn about our own culture, we simultaneously, and often without realising it, learn about the cultures that connect Japan with East Asia or other regions, which eventually links us to the entire world.

## 6) Summary

Summarising the discussion, Mr Iwamoto remarked that ICH plays a significant role in linking oneself to nature and other people and in connecting people with their community. For example, ICH such as festivals bond people to their community, which is one of the key factors that enable people to recover from devastating disasters.

He listed key points mentioned by many participants, including the importance of community's role in transmitting ICH, intergenerational cooperation, and cooperation between schools and communities, the value of local and indigenous knowledge, and the emphasis on acquiring ICH-related techniques and skills in addition to ICH knowledge.

He also stated that the study of the relationship between ICH and SDGs reveals anew the characteristics of ICH in the context of SDGs. ICH is deeply rooted in the community, it is fun, and it is closely related to the individual. Furthermore, He added that ICH effectively connects the 17 interrelated SDGs. This project demonstrates that it is important to consider sustainable societal development through all 17 SDGs, not by merely addressing a single goal.

Materials presented at the public symposium can be found in Section 3.2.5, and other materials, such as general information and a list of participants, are presented at the end of this section.

## 3.2.4 Comments

#### Ishimura Tomo

Head, Audio-Visual Documentation Section Tokyo National Research Institute for Cultural Properties

First of all, I would like to express my gratitude to Bangladesh, Indonesia, and Kyrgyzstan for your effort to safeguard intangible cultural heritage, especially for your focus on the community participation in the safeguarding of ICH. An issue of community participation is very important. It has been discussed in the UNESCO committee and other related meetings for several times. I repeat again, I especially stress the importance of communities' spontaneous and self-motivated participation in practice and safeguarding of ICH. I would like to review your presentation, focusing on the community's spontaneous participation.

First, I would like to review the presentation made by Bangladesh. This is a very good example of the community's active participation in the practice and transmission of the ICH, Dhamail. But it was also pointed out that several changes occurred in Dhamail, influenced by introduction of modern instruments, foreign culture, and digital technology (e.g., YouTube). It may result in a loss or modification of traditional form of ICH. ICH is an always changing entity. We must be cautious about the irreversible changes caused by the decontextualisation or commercialisation. But I consider if it is not the case, we should let the community determine whether the ICH has changed or not, or

how it has changed. It may happen when a young practitioner of Dhamail utilises the digital technique, such as YouTube, to create new forms of Dhamail. This is a kind of evolution of ICH because the ICH is essentially an evolving entity.

As for the Indonesian case, it is also a good example of an endeavor to transmit ICH in both formal education and non-formal education. As the next step, it is necessary to nurture individuals and group who can spontaneously practice and continue Kethoprak.

In Japan, there are many local performing arts groups. As a safeguarding measure, the national government or a local government supports the activities of such performing arts group, for example, supporting it financially by paying part of public performance expenses, or providing funding for the purchase of new instruments or fixing old ones. Most of this kind of local performing arts groups are not professional, and most of the members are ordinary people. Thus, public support is essential. In my opinion, it is very crucial that we make this kind of group activity sustainable.

Lastly, the case study in Kyrgyzstan focused on community-based museums. I repeat that it is crucial to make this kind of museum a sustainable one. Museums are often established and run by a very enthusiastic individual spontaneously. There are also small museums and community-based museums in Japan. But there is one problem: when the individual in charge of the museum management passes away, there is no one to take over his/her work, and that leads to the closure of the museum. As a result, the collections will be dispersed or sold on the market - this is a very sad situation. That is why I stress the importance and necessity of creating a group of people that would take over this kind of community museum's activity. Some museums have been supported by government. But I believe that the government needs to support not only the maintenance of buildings etc, but also needs to help with capacity-building, to keep and sustain community museums. The government's efforts for capacity-building will develop the human resources to take over the museum's activity in a sustainable manner.

#### Liou Lin-Yu

Professor, Department of Music Education Nara University of Education

On the importance of learning, safeguarding, and developing ICH in various countries, our region has been recognised through projects of IRCI to date. The contents of the projects can be divided into two categories.

The first case is that the number of people who hand down ICH has decreased, and ICH needs to be protected before techniques or an art disappears or loses its traditional format. In that case, we have already learned that there is a method of handing ICH down through formal education or non-formal education. In addition, we already know that by inheriting the technology and arts, people receive jobs, a better life, and that leads to the creation of a good community and society.

The second case is to cultivate the wisdom, religions, spirit, identity, human nature, and empathy of the group that have been passed down from ancient times through ICH.

Firstly, I would like to talk about the results of the Bangladesh project. The Bangladesh research team investigated the current situation of Dhamail, which is being handed down in the Sylhet region. Especially, the research team examined differences in musical elements, such as dance styles, tunes, rhythms, and music instruments, between urban and rural areas. I think that the results of the examination will be useful for establishing the policy of transmitting Dhamail as a cultural heritage in the future. According to the report, the traditional Dhamail style remains in rural areas, while there are concerns that the style of Dhamail in urban areas will become more and more distant from the traditional one in terms of rhythm and the use of words and musical instruments. When passing on the traditional music to the next generation, to what extent changes can be tolerated is always a difficult question. If the basic music elements disappear from the traditional music, the music will belong to a totally different music genre because it will be difficult for us to recognise it as the same music.

On the other hand, it is also true that the traditional music entertainments often change gradually. What is important, is that traditional performing arts with a long history should be handed down properly in their basic form. The case in Bangladesh reported at this symposium is praiseworthy because the project carefully investigated and captured the basis of Dhamail and the state of its transformation.

It is certainly important to collect and preserve prototypes that have not yet been influenced by foreign music culture at first, and then it will be an important reference for creating new songs and steps based on them. It also turns out that Dhamail is very much involved in Bangladesh women's lifestyle. And once Dhamail is recognised as an ICH, it will be related to targets 4 and 11 of SDGs. Therefore, in the future, it would be great to know about the specific and created measures and terms of how to utilise these survey materials to develop or evolve the traditional and basic format of Dhamail, how to introduce Dhamail into the curriculum of formal and non-formal education, and how to use Dhamail to solve problems such as the early marriage of girls.

Next, regarding the Indonesian project, judging from the tradition and development of traditional performing arts in Indonesia such as Gamelan, I think that Indonesia has a wealth of experience in handing down ICH. It seems that the accomplishments of this year's project were also made by using that experience. It must be said that the reported results were also deeply related to SDGs targets 4 and 11.

The most interesting point is that the survey grades through learning Kethoprak. It is also quite impressive that learning Kethoprak was associated with a wide range of items, such as honesty, tolerance, discipline, cooperation, creativity, independence, and so on, as the indicators of human development. It seems that students have acquired various qualities through the learning of Kethoprak. However, it is possible that a collaborative artistic learning activity itself may produce such results. Actually, independent of music education, which I work on, students plan and perform western operas by themselves every year. And during the process, they show quite similar characteristics to those mentioned by the Indonesian report. So as a question, I would like to know why Kethoprak was taken up in this project, why it was not the *wayang wong*, and what special elements Kethoprak has in Indonesia's people or Java residents. According to this line of argument, there is a need to mention the history and social background of the

comprehensive art called Kethoprak in the report.

Regarding the Kyrgyzstan project, we learned about the issue of handing down the techniques of making Yurts, handcrafts, and beads at last year's conference, but this year we heard the report on the roles of the museum, including Yurts as an exhibition hall. Certainly, the museum is an important facility of social education, and lifelong learning, and an important place to preserve the wisdom and skills of our predecessors.

I understood that there are many museums in Kyrgyzstan, but it seems that there are many museums with overlapping exhibition contents. Visitors can learn something in a museum while they are visiting, but it may be difficult to learn continuously and systematically. I would like to know the details about why a large number of exhibition halls is needed, what museum people are happy to visit, what they are trying to learn, what kind of learning programs are continuously and regularly joined by local residents, and how museum transmits the ICH to the next generations.

#### Sato Masahisa

Professor, Graduate School of Environmental and Information Studies Tokyo City University

As we discussed before, our ICH activities have a big potential for contribution to education and SDGs because of the collective and responsible living practices, intergenerational transmission of knowledge and skills, adaptation, creativity and innovations, sustainable use of natural resources, and use of local social and economic structures. Culture can be a creative force in striving for sustainable development as we discussed in other UNESCO fields.

Mr Iwamoto pointed out that there are some similarities and links between ICH, education, and community development. Society is now facing the VUCA World, which stands for Volatility, Uncertainty, Complexity and Ambiguity. Thus, we have to think of human security - not only developing countries but also developed countries. Because the situation is getting more severe, we have to think about people-centered, comprehensive, context-specific and prevention-oriented solutions. In that sense, we need to consider ICH as one kind of social and emotional intelligence, since it not only takes part in developing the behavior of an individual but also forms social activities. In that sense, ICH can promote and help with social and emotional intelligence.

For the promotion of social and emotional intelligence, and to strengthen links between education, community development and ICH, I would like to propose a transformative approach. On the basis of discussions about the transformative approach, there are three views, which are: 'community of practice and learning,' 'communicative actions' and 'cooperative inquiry.' The presentations we saw during the symposium are very much linked to how we can set the community practice and learning, how we can promote such communicative actions and cooperative inquiry. Presentations showed us that people learn very much through ICH, and they also work for the society, so they contribute to sustainable societies. As Mr Rhaman from Dhaka Ahsania Mission mentioned, it is important to consider that education itself has to be re-changed. UNESCO published a document in 2021, just one month ago: 'Reimagining our futures together: a new social contract for education.' It says that we must urgently reinvent education to help address common challenges. To tackle common challenges and to get closer to the future of sustainable society, teaching needs to move from being considered an individual practice to becoming further professionalised as a collaborative endeavour. This is much more than individual technical training; we need to think about ways to raise people who can work together. This is one of the big challenges and at the same time, it has a very big potential, because it can become a bridge between education, ICH, and community development.

In the discussion about the community of learning, I would like to state that five elements are to be considered: belongingness, commonality, situatedness, infrastructure, and interdependence. These components can contribute to the development of learning communities, and ICH is a core for their actual implementation. We need to discuss further these five elements.

There are three steps to secure a community of practices. The first one is an engagement in a situated community: participatory infrastructure is needed to be set, e.g., a community museum; and there are many other places for the collaborative activities. Also, a community needs to have access to vehicles of change. One more thing is an elaboration of a common objective and vision for a sustainable future. ICH has a big potential for engagement in the situated community.

The second step is the exploration of innovative interdependence. Research cannot be done by not only a positivistic way. That is why we have to consider the action research that consists of observation, assessment, and reflection. In addition, we need to map existing capacities and assets, as well as needs and desires and identify them. And after that engage individuals in a process of investigation, learning, advocating, and teaching.

The third step is aligning common understandings and their coordination: planning community strategies for sustainable development and lifestyles, transitioning from abstract conceptualisation to concrete experience through utilising active experimentation as a form of testing and validation of pragmatic knowledge. Not only from the overall, the obstacle, the feature of the way of thinking, to the much more concrete way for the further actions. That's why I put the word 'reification' through action and reflections. We have to think of such processes and elements for the identification of the learning communities. It contributes to ICH and the promotion of education and community development.

# Duong Bich Hanh

Programme Specialist for Culture UNESCO Bangkok office

Thank you, Mr Iwamoto, and all of resource people who have provided their comments, especially Mr SATO for touching upon very new actions at the UNESCO level, particularly calling for a social contract for education which concerns a shared commitment for the

transformative education that we are also pursuing.

I would like to congratulate the teams for providing very insightful presentations on the very active work that they have done over the past years, despite the challenging COVID-19 situation. This is definitely not a research project in a traditional sense, it is really action research where you actually carried out and piloted interventions and based on that you drew conclusions. They are very useful. Since we are now continuously consolidating information about the impact of this approach as well as case studies, I would like to ask for permission to contact Mr Iwamoto and colleagues of IRCI later to see if we can highlight some of the interesting case studies in the coming guide that we are producing, because I think that we can make cross references through all the work that we are doing, so people can look out for your cases when they read our guide. We will be in touch with you and perhaps eventually around New Year will invite you to contribute these case studies to us.

The projects that have been implemented very clearly demonstrate the contribution to SDGs. I see the involvement of education here is at two levels. The first level is that you can really see that ICH in all of forms - whether it is our traditions, whether it is ritual, whether it is festivals and, most of you mentioned this, knowledge about nature - really contributes to not only SDGs in general but also SDG 4, which is about improvement of the quality of education. Another involvement of education is how you really see how different channels of education - whether it's formal, whether it's non-formal, whether it's a museum - become a really great way to transmit ideas to help safeguard the heritage, so we are more than ever ready to acknowledge the contribution of an educational system to safeguard our heritage. I am really glad to continue to be able to work with these projects in the future to help our objective to safeguard and transmit heritage.

There is a couple of things I have seen very clearly during the symposium. The first one is that I feel that everyone is so comfortable with each other. You really have formed a community, so to speak. You have followed each other's work for a few years, you know how you were doing a year ago and what you have achieved now. I really would like to congratulate IRCI for having this long vision for continuously bringing people together. We cannot do it alone, so having this community of practice is very important. In addition to the five countries who are working here, the five teams, we have other people who are also exploring, working on the same approach.

I want to make a proposal to IRCI to open a wider research forum where we can bring in not only the people working on the IRCI's research projects, but others as well. We can expand this network so that we can continue to learn from each other. Also, I want to point out the importance of networking on the ground that you have been building, e.g., all these different stakeholders. I would like to encourage you to continue to do so from now on too.

Another good impression I got from this is sustainability. Again, you are continuing to bring people together - so it is not like the project in the Philippines and the project in Viet Nam finished and you never hear from them again - because that is quite common for the different development projects. But here we continue to invest in them, and they
continue to stay on as part of this community. I also hope that colleagues from Bangladesh, Indonesia, and Kyrgyzstan already have a clear idea of how to carry on these ideas and actions of yours despite the fact that the project has now finished. An encouraging aspect that I learned from this project is the continuous intervention carried out by IRCI.

A question remains: how we escalate these innovative ideas, how do we need to spread this evidence, continue to show how ICH can contribute to sustainable development and education, etc. And of course, in addition to publishing all these wonderful results and projects, there is the research forum that hopefully one day we will put together with UNESCO and other category 2 centres in the region. There are certainly other ways we can develop if put our heads together. Together, we can very confidently show the impact that ICH can have on transformative education and how it can make a concrete contribution. I look forward to the written results, and I will get in touch with you in January to see how we will work with each other to disseminate these results together.

#### 3.2.5 Presentation Materials

The materials presented by DAM, DFCLC, and TFPF and used at the expert meeting 'ICH's Contributions to SDGs: Focusing on SDG 4 (Quality Education) and SDG 11 (Sustainable Cities and Communities)' are provided in this section.

The public symposium 'ICH Contributing to Better Education and Sustainable Communities' consisted of eight presentations. The three presentations by DAM, DFCLC, and TFPF, respectively, were short versions of those given at the expert meeting. In this section, the content of the other five presentations by Osaka Prefecture University, Shotoku Gakuen Junior & Senior High School, Hokkaido University, Yamagata City Chitose Primary School, and Junior Chamber International Japan (JCI), respectively, are provided.

Expert meeting

Public Symposium

Potentials of Dhamail as ICH for Education and Community Development – Bangladesh Case Study Ehsanur Rahman, Executive Director, DAM, Bangladesh

International Symposium for "Research on ICH's Contribution to SDGs: Education and Community Development"



#### The Study, Purpose & SOW

Research on ICH contribution to SDGs: Education (SDG 4) and Community Development (SDG 11) Research on Dhamail practices in Urban areas & Rural areas

Testing potentiality for use of Dhamail in education & community development campaign

> Documentation of Dhamail song-cum-dance practices and changes over the years

✓ Develop Dhamail scripts contextually relevant for Education and Community Development



#### Dhamail - The Target ICH for Study



Dhamail Song & Dance in a rural setting

- Dhamail A form of folk music in combination with dance
- Dhamail is organized generally in the marriage ceremonies, social occasions, different religious festivals, birthdays, etc.
- Mainly women and girls take part in the ritualistic Dhamaildance and song accompanied with dance & clapping
- Traditional musical instruments produce a clinking sound when the singers clapped together













#### **3 Key Findings**

- Dhamail has religious, educational and cultural values. Culturally and religiously it develops relations among the families and communities. Dhamail is very effective to get together and bring bondage with community feelings.
- Dhamail songs can be composed on any subject. Dhamail script writers confirm that they composed lyrics on various social practices & anomalies.
- 3. People's interest in Dhamail is growing. Setting of training academy could create opportunity for rural girls to learn Dhamail systematically.

#### ICH Contribution to SDG 4 & 11

Dhamail can contribute to SDG 4.7 that demands that all learners acquire the knowledge and skills needed to promote sustainable development and sustainable lifestyles, human rights, gender equality, promotion of a culture of peace and non-violence, and appreciation of cultural diversity.

- Dhamail songs can be used to address social problems such as early marriage of girls, deprivation of women, raising peoples voice on price hike, road safety, food safety etc.
- Dhamail can be of supporting community resilience on disasters and calamities and peoples' sufferings.

#### Scope of ICH Contribution to other SDGs

SDG 3	Through <u>health</u> awareness and child care issues			
SDG 5	Through increased gender sensitivity and women empowerment			
SDG 6	By promoting community roles on <u>conservation</u> of water sources and sanitation			
SDG 7	patterns and food safety			
SDG 12				
SDG 16				



Expert meeting

Public Symposium

Case Study of ICH's Contribution to the Art of Kethoprak for Improving the Quality of Education and Community Empowerment

Kristian Apriyanta, Representative, DFCLC, Indonesia

The Elements of local wisdom ICH teaches the formation of Javanese characters and attitudes "memayu hayuning bawana" (Harmonization and the balance of human relations with God, Humans and Nature) it is believed and illustrated in Kethoprak's art work with all its supporting elements.

But slowly the Kethoprak art is started to be abandoned by the younger generation, this also threatens the ICH Element inside

The results of the 1<sup>st</sup> case study of the FY 2020 in formal schools, stated that ICH in the Kethoprak Art, contributes to improve the SDGs 4 and SDGs 11

In Case Study II, we implemented it in Non-Formal Schools (DFCLC) which have different characteristics, to find out the results of the impact of ICH in the kethoprak art on the contribution of the SDGs

#### THE TARGET ICH ELEMENT

4

The Characteristics Differences between Formal and Non-formal Schools						
ni.	DHARACTER/TICS	FORMAL	HONFORMAL	SBNDIMBN		
1	School organizer	Government	Public	Minimum Infrastructure and facilities		
2	Learning system/curriculum	National Standard	Flexible, local	Implementing local potential-based policies		
3	Student age	Average	Variety	How to learn to be more mature, independent, democratic		
4	General attitude of students	food	Not Good	Negative association, lack of appreciation,		
5	General purpose of Students	Continuing study	Work	No skills, and a formal certificate		
6	Motivation to learn	Learning	Recognition	Low learning motivation, high work motivation		
7	Social problem	less	Complex	Lack of norms education, ethics, aconomics problem		

By Conducting Case Study II in Non-Formal Schools (DFCLC) it is hoped that the social problems experienced by students can be immediately overcome by the existence of Kethoprak art learning which includes ICH in supporting the resolution of social problems; better motivation to learn, provide skills for the arts skill, the society involvement in protecting the cultural heritage



#### THE FOCUS SOCIAL ISSUE

















#### WORKSHOP REGIONAL

We carried out this activity to report the results of the case study in the Klaten Region, to obtain recommendations from the participants who attended, the Regional Development Planning Office, the Education Office, the Culture Office, the Arts Council, Ketoprak art practitioners, Headmasters of Formal Schools, Heads of Non-formal Schools, Journalists, Heads of Villagers, Entrepreneurs and cultural arts activists in Klaten Regency

As a result, they support and committed to carry out, follow-up based on their authority in terms of regulations, government policies, to support for the declaration of Klaten to become the City of Kethoprak



#### SUGGESTION FOR THE FUTURE ACTIVITIES

For the purpose of development and batter learning in the future research, it can be dones

- 1. Increasing the number of rescarch objects to obtain the date
- Research on the contribution of the kethoprak art to other SDGs that is more detailed and in-depth

## THANK YOU

The noble value of local ICH in Kethoprak has an important role in global life. The integration of Education with Culture in Non-Formal Education is more effective As a result to support the sustainable community development based on the Philosophy of "Memayu Hayuning Bawana" that persists and can be utilized for its positive values for a

better life.

Expert meeting

Public Symposium

Evolving Role of Community Museums in ICH Safeguarding: Case-Studies from Kyrgyzstan

> Almagul Osmonova, General Director, TFPF, Kyrgyzstan Jyldyz Doolbekova, Researcher, TFPF, Kyrgyzstan



# THE RESEARCH QUESTIONS

- How can community museums help in preserving the living heritage? What are the strategies in this work?
- How to arrange spaces to represent of traditional knowledge, skills and customs in the museums?
- How to engage youth, and expand a circle of supporters?





## «SALBUURUN» LIVING MUSEUM



The museum exhibition is housed in a traditional yurt, 7.5 meters in diameter.

Number of exhibits – more than 500 items





## THE ETHNOGRAPHIC MUSEUM in the village of. Sary Mogol



The main exhibits are: household items (crockery, carpets, tools), horse equipment, photographs from different years, family relics, reconstructed national clothes of the Southern Kyrgyz and headdresses. The volume of the museum fund is 450 items.

### «KOSHOI KORGON» FORTRESS MUSEUM

The museum building and the fortress



## «KOSHOI KORGON» FORTRESS MUSEUM



The museum exhibition consists of two sections: archeological and ethnographic.

The picture gallery presents a part of the personal collection, which has been collected at different times.

In total, the museum holds about 1,000 items.

# CONCLUSIONS

- The community museums are important socio-cultural institutions in the process of safeguarding and transferring the heritage that contributes to the preservation of the cultural identity of the Kyrgyz people.
- They have a strong potential to engage local residents including youth and women, strengthen the cultural identity; consolidate communities, revive the sense of pride, foster respect for local traditions and heritage; promote educational initiatives to safeguard traditional ecological knowledge and skills; stimulate co-creation of knowledge and creativity together with bearers of traditional knowledge, youth leaders, and community activists for sustainable development of regions.

Public Symposium

Autonomous City Sakai and the World: Craftsman Culture that be Built in the History

li Naohiro, Professor, Osaka Prefecture University

Autonomous City Sakai and the World: Craftsman Culture that be Built in the History

> Humanities and Scial Sciences, Osaka Prefecture University II Naohiro

















(16—17 century Namban byōbu [folding screen] by KanoNaizen) In a collection of Kobe City Museum

# Sakai thrived as a city (Kyoto did not even come close!)

- Missionary Gaspar Vilela said,
- *"Sakai is immensely large and has many great merchants. Just like <u>Venice</u>, it is governed by an administrator."* 
  - $\rightarrow$  This passage makes it clear that Sakai was so well known to the European world as to appear on maps of the world at the time.
- <u>Luís Fróis</u> also reported,
- "Sakai is Japan's richest port city, and much of the gold and silver in the country gathers there."
- He called Sakai the "Venice of the East."























Public Symposium

Let us Know about Intangible Cultural Heritage in Akishima City Mine Haruyoshi, Ikeda Shomu, Sasaki Mai, Matsuo Ouka, Nagai Koki, Third-grade junior high school students Shotoku Gakuen Junior & Senior High School











# $\operatorname{Today's}_{\scriptscriptstyle{\boldsymbol{\varphi}\in \text{DO}\tilde{m}n}} \operatorname{Flow}$

OWhere is Akishima City?

OAbout intangible cultural properties

OHaijima Hiyoshi ShrineSakaki Festival

 $\odot Lion$  dance of the middle god

○Lastly











## ○Views for the future

- · To increase a frequency of posts on SNS
  - To show English subtitles
- To make shorts on YouTube




















# Sakaki Festival



A traditional festival that has continued since 1767.

Has a history of 250 years. It is held as the eve of the Haijima Hiyoshi Shrine annual festival, and it is known as a rare dawn festival in Japan because it cruises from midnight to dawn, and it is held all night for two days.























聖徳学園中学昭島	市応援隊
Shotoku _akisima	学園中学校
@shotku3206	
Thank you for spreading	g and following SNS!







# Public Symposium

# Cases of Utilising Ainu Language into Education and in the Community as an Intangible Cultural Heritage

Kitahara Mokottunas, Associate Professor, Hokkaido University

# Introduction

In this presentation I would like to talk about education that incorporates Ainu language, Ainu oral literature and Ainu place names as Intangible Cultural Heritage as well as other examples of utilization.

# 1. An overview of the Ainu language and its current status

Ainu language is a language used on the territories Ainu have lived in: on Hokkaido, southern Karafuto, the Chishima Islands, and the Tohoku region of Honshu. It is of a different lineage from Japanese.

Ainu toponyms and oral literature is designated as Hokkaido heritage.

In the latter half of the 19th century, as Japan and Russia expanded their territories, lands inhabited by the Ainu people were being absorbed by Japan and Russia, and a transition to the colonizers' languages was forced upon the Ainu people. As a result, among the languages designated as endangered by UNESCO, Ainu is listed as 'critically endangered.'

Restoring the Ainu language means guaranteeing the right to use the language of the Ainu. At the same time, it is important not only because non-Ainu residents learn about thus territory's history and culture, but also because it contributes to understanding and striving to realize multiculturalism and a society where different peoples coexist.

# 2. Examples of educational materials creation and use

In addition to individual efforts to restore and spread the Ainu language, there are efforts underway by research institutions such as universities and museums and by the Foundation for Ainu Culture.

Through cooperation from Ainu language instructors and researchers, the Foundation for Ainu Culture creates textbooks, supplementary teaching materials, and audio-visual materials.

Textbooks with which people can study in three levels of difficulty covering nine dialects have been created (2011—2014 academic years). In addition, supplementary teaching materials such as illustrated vocabulary cards have also been created.

For Ainu oral literature, DVDs with animation have been created. With them, it has become possible for learners with no background knowledge of premodern lifestyles and culture can come into contact with the world of oral literature.

Since the 2020 academic year, there have been introductions of the Ainu language

through video streaming, where contents such as knowledge of nature and culture as well as Ainu translations of children's stories are being streamed.

National Ainu Museum and Park Upopoy, which opened in July 2020, has three parts: a museum, a park, and a memorial facility. The museum and park area have programs for studying Ainu, Ainu language signage and exhibit descriptions. As an exhibition facility it provides a place for learning the Ainu language.

Here are some examples of utilization of Ainu language to the extent of my knowledge:

- Examples of constant utilization
  Two public elementary schools in Hokkaido
- Examples of sporadic utilization
  Elementary schools in the cities of Sapporo, Ebetsu, Chitose, and Kushiro
- School excursions visiting Upopoy Numerous schools visit Upopoy.

# 3. Place names and their usage

Ainu place names are distributed over Hokkaido, Karafuto, Chishima, and the Tohoku region of Honshu. In Hokkaido, more than 80% have been converted to Kanji or translated. Numerous books have been published and exhibitions taken place bringing together toponym research.

Since 2018, Donan Bus has used Ainu language announcements for its bus line that runs through the town of Biratori in the south of Hokkaido. Bus stop names are based on Ainu toponymius and all the announcements, i.g. about making a stop, are in Ainu language.

For community residents, particularly for junior high and high school students who use the bus to get to and from school, chances to come into contact with local Ainu place names increased and was created an environment where they can hear Ainu language every day.

# Conclusion

Among tasks that need solving is low awareness of importance of all activities connected to Ainu language, and, in addition to it, that those activities are limited in scope.

By making the educational materials more widely known, it would be possible to reduce schools' burden and conduct courses at the same time. By doing so, it would be possible to expand Ainu courses nationwide, without limiting it regionally to Hokkaido. I will add that possibility to train and assign teachers specialized in Ainu language-related subjects is also beneficial from a perspective of securing diversity within educational institutions.

# Public Symposium

Chitose's Tradition and I – Let's Think about What We Can Do by Inheriting the Tradition of the Chitose District –

Abe Daisuke, Yamagata City Chitose Primary School





### Rice

### Yamagata's rice is delicious.

Yamagata's environment is ideal for agricultural and livestock products. It has a climate with a large difference in temperature between the seasons and day and night, along with clear streams with plenty of fertile soil and mountain nutrients. Yamagata's rice was born and raised in such a privileged land and developed through repeated research. Local rice brands like Tsuyahime, Haenuki, Koshihikari, Hitomebore offer a solid lineup of quality that has been continuously awarded "Special A" in the overall evaluation of "appearance", "fragrance", "taste", "stickiness" and "hardness". Recently, the Yukiwakamaru brand rice was launched in 2018.





### おもてなし山形株式会社HPよ り

### Winter sports

From Zao, one of the largest ski resort in Japan, and Mt. Gassan, which opens only in Spring, Yamagata is a true ski kingdom located in snow country.

In addition to skiing and snowboarding, there are also spots where you can enjoy

nature in winter on snowmobiles or through snow shoe trekking.



4



### Ginzan Onsen

Ginzan Onsen is a traditional town where you can feel the nostalgia of the Taisho Roman era.

The multi-layered wooden inn buildings built in the Taisho to the early Showa eras lined up on both banks of the Ginzan river, a this tributary of the Mogami river. The townscape illuminated by gas lamps quite an impressive sight, and you can feel the richness of the seasons through expressions of fresh greenery, autumn leaves or snow scenes.

おもてなし山形株式会社HPよ









# What is a rice planting dance?

There are songs and dances performed from January to December that were held at the First Full Moon Festival (January 15).

There are words of praise and worship, and there are also interactions with the audience.

**Door-to-door entertainment..** Visit each household in the region **Preliminary celebration** ... Wishing for a good harvest in that year through a thankful dance at the beginning of the year

Significant impacts of famine that happened in the Tohoku region







Every community has unique characteristics; areas where traditions and customs are preserved until now... (omitted). Problems related to these characteristics are unique to the region and occur alongside the creation of

better towns and communities. It is expected that children will develop thoughts based on their ways of life in the community and act to find solutions for their community.

Furthermore, the answers and solutions to these issues are not well-defined, and they do not always fit within the framework of each existing subject. Thus, it is important to incorporate these issues into The Period for Integrated Studies and develop certain qualities and abilities through their solutions.

# **Relationship with ESD**

ESD perspectives (views and ideas) that are implemented on this subject

• **Diversity**... There are traditions inside the thoughts of people who want to pass on the "Okinohara Rice Planting Dance" in the Okinohara region, the origin and history of the "rice planting dance", the hopes of those involved in the dance, and various traditions in the world. Such traditions are supported by those who aspire to pass them on.

 Reciprocity... Traditions have been passed on through the connections of members of communities.

Finiteness... Tradition will be lost if there is no one to inherit it.

# ESD qualities and abilities that we want to develop through this study

# The ability to think critically (critical thinking)

... To learn about the traditional culture of the Chitose district "Okinohara Rice Planting Dance", understand the actual situation for someone to inherit and pass on the tradition, consider the significance of passing on the culture in the region, understand the difficulty of handing down traditional culture and how it is impossible to pass on a tradition if the successors do not feel that it belongs to hem.

## Systematic thinking

...To learn from those involved in the Okinohara Rice Planting Dance Preservation Society, curators, and university professors about how the adults in the Okinohara area convey the culture of "rice planting dance" to their children to pass on the culture...

# Long-term ability to think

... To think about what needs to be done to pass on the culture of "rice planting dance" in the Okinohara region by taking into account the thoughts of the successors and children.

# ESD values that we want to nurture through this learning

• To be aware of Inter-generational fairness among the adults who belong to the Okinohara Rice Planting Dance Preservation Society, the children who inherit the tradition, and the children who are not involved in it.

• Learn about the inheritance of traditional culture, which consists of adults who teach children the rice planting dance as members of the Okinohara Rice Planting Dance Preservation Society and the children who inherit it, understand the virtue of rice planting dance and foster an awareness of trying to spread and appreciate the culture as a member of the community.

# Practice Content Encounter with rice planting dance ▲ Issues of successor ▲ Change of times ▲ Fostering the affection towards the community ▲ Relationship with other people ▲ Relationship with culture









# What is the meaning of tradition and culture for children?





23

What's that? I do not understand it well















# Achievements and challenges in the activities

# Achievements















# Spread through posters





ちとせっこ

At first, I didn't know anything about the charms and history of the rice planting dance. However, after creating a poster that was based on what Mr. Endo, Ms. Morinaga, Mr. Kikuchi, and the sixth-grade students taught, and having many customers come to the rice planting dance performance, I think I could convey the charms and history of the rice planting dance.

# 3. Looking back on this practice

The teachers think about developing human resources (children) who will lead a sustainable society, and they were able to interact with the actual culture and develop pride and affection to the community by engaging with the locals, professors, curators, etc. who are passionate about passing on local cultures.



40.00

Through the activities in the planned learning unit, children were able to explore learning methods that are difficult to learn in single-unit learning modules.
## Challenges

- $\bigtriangleup$  The modern world is not prepared to inherit traditional performing arts
- ightarrowGo to lessons after school, many nuclear families, and the lack of
  - relationship between grandparents and grandchildren
- $\bigtriangleup$  Decrease in places for people to interact
- $\rightarrow$  Spread of Internet society, YouTube, video games and smartphone
- $\bigtriangleup$  Diluting local commitment
- → less children's association activities and neighborhood association events, deterioration of neighborhood association functions

From this...It is necessary to review how to relate to "traditional culture" and "traditional performing arts" suitable for modern society. There is no doubt that it is indispensable. It's easy to get rid of, but it's very hard to get it back. I think it is important for the children who will lead the society in the future to know the value and goodness as much as possible and to inspire them to leave it.

Public Symposium

Efforts to Create Qualitative Values Nishimura Yoshinori, Qualitative V

Nishimura Yoshinori, Qualitative Value Commission Chairman, Junior Chamber International Japan









# **History of Yamaguchi City**

Stepping back in time to the Middle Ages, the Ōuchi clan, who ruled over Nagato and Suo including the current Yamaguchi City, carefully protected local cultural figures, allowing Francis Xavier and Christian missionaries to stay. They had a deep understanding of culture and art, and a generous acceptance of diversity. This is the very essence of Ouchi culture, and it is defined as the root of current Yamaguchi culture.

**JCI** 







**Initiatives for Quality Value Society** 

JCI 0

With "quality value" as the key phrase, in the same manner as Yamaguchi JCI's case studies, Only One appeal rooted in each community's history and culture is discovered, it is then polished to develop an independent community.

This will lead to a sustainable society. We conduct our activities based on these ideas.

#### 3.2.6 Symposium Information

#### General Information

The Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs) are common goals shared by the international communities to achieve the sustainable world, and the countries have been seeking ways to achieve these goals. UNESCO, in this context, emphasises the potential contributions of culture, especially intangible cultural heritage (ICH) to SDGs.

The International Research Centre for Intangible Cultural Heritage in the Asia-Pacific Region (IRCI) has been implementing projects relating to SDGs since 2018, first two years on ICH's contribution to SDG 4 (Quality Education), specifically focusing on the achievement of the target 4.7, in the Philippines and Viet Nam, and from 2020 on the relationship between education (SDG 4) and community development (SDG 11), as the 2030 Agenda stresses 'the interlinkages and integrated nature of the Sustainable Development Goals.'<sup>5</sup> This project, 'Research on ICH's Contribution to SDGs: Education and Community Development,' aims to analyse the relationship among ICH, education and communities and the roles of ICH for achieving SDGs 4 and 11. It also discusses how young people who have experienced ICH education could contribute to the development of their communities, while actively engaging in safeguarding ICH.

#### 1. Purpose of the international symposium

The purpose of the International Symposium is to share the results of the case studies conducted by the 3 NGOs in Bangladesh, Indonesia, and Kyrgyzstan, and discuss the relationship among ICH, education and community development, and the roles of ICH for achieving SDGs 4 and 11. On the first day, intensive discussions were made to summarise the research in these two years. The public symposium on the second day aimed to share the result of this project to wider public, and to provide an opportunity for Japanese youth to learn ICH safeguarding and SDGs and interact with international researchers and experts.

#### 2. Expected outcomes

- 1. Relationships among ICH, education and community development are analysed and the ICH roles in achieving SDG 4 and SDG 11 are clarified.
- 2. Future perspectives and challenges regarding the ICH's contributions to SDGs discussed among stakeholders will facilitate further discussions on effective ICH safeguarding.
- 3. Experts, researchers, and Japanese youth, will deepen their knowledge of SDGs through learning various cases in the Asia-Pacific region.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>5</sup> United Nations. 2015. Transforming our world: the 2030 Agenda for Sustainable Development https://www.un.org/ga/search/view\_doc.asp?symbol=A/RES/70/1&Lang=E

#### 3. Participants (TBD)

- 1). Experts from Dhaka Ahsania Mission (DAM), Bangladesh; Dewi Fortuna Community Learning Center (DFCLC), Indonesia; and Taalim-Forum Public Foundation (TFPF), Kyrgyzstan
- 2). Experts from the Philippines and Viet Nam (counterparts in 2018-2019 project)
- 3). Experts from UNESCO Bangkok Office
- 4). Resource persons
- 5). Japanese youth, educators and experts introduced by ACCU, UNU-IAS, Goi Peace Foundation and Junior Chamber international Japan

\* Participants from ASPUnivNet, UNESCO School, RCE Network, ESD Youth Japan of Goi Peace Foundation, and Junior Chamber International Japan are expected to join online as observers (maximum 100 participants).

#### Programme

#### 1st day : Tuesday 21 December (Zoom meeting)

ICH's contributions to SDGs, focusing on SDG 4 (Quality Education) and SDG 11 (Sustainable Cities and Communities): Final discussions on project results and outputs

#### Programme Introduction 11:00 - 11:15 **Opening Remarks** Iwamoto Wataru **Director-General**, IRCI **Duong Bich Hanh** Programme Specialist for Culture, UNESCO Bangkok Office Case study report 11:15 - 12:05 Potentials of Dhamail as ICH for Education and Community Development -Bangladesh Case Study Ehsanur Rahman Executive Director. Dhaka Ahsania Mission (DAM), Bangladesh 12:05 - 12:55 Case study of ICH's contribution to the art of kethoprak for improving the quality of education and community empowerment Kristian Apriyanta Representative, Dewi Fortuna Community Learning Center (DFCLC), Indonesia 12:55 - 14:00 Lunch Break 14:00 - 14:50 **Evolving role of Community Museums in ICH safeguarding: case-studies** from Kyrgyzstan Almagul Osmonova General Director, Taalim-Forum Public Foundation (TFPF), Kyrgyzstan 14:50 - 15:00 Break

Discussion and analysis	
15:00 – 16:30	<ul> <li>Comments/reflections by participants from the Philippines and Vietnam</li> <li>How ICH contributes to SDGs</li> <li>Future perspectives and challenges regarding ICH's contributions to SDGs</li> <li>*For participants from the Philippines and Viet Nam, introduce any progress about the previous project (FY 2018 – 2019) and their cases related to the topic.</li> </ul>
16:30 - 17:00	Wrap up for the 1st day

#### 2nd day : Wednesday 22 December (Zoom Webinar)

# Public Symposium - ICH contributing to better education and sustainable communities

\*A simultaneous English-Japanese interpretation is available

Time	Programme	
Introduction		
11:00 - 11:30	Opening remarks	
	Iwamoto Wataru Director-General, IRCI	
	MEXT	
SESSION 1: ICH' region	s contributions to education and community development in the Asia-Pacific	
11:30 - 11:50	<b>Bangladesh ICH Study on Dhamail 2021</b> Ehsanur Rahman Executive Director, Dhaka Ahsania Mission (DAM), Bangladesh	
11:50 - 12:10	Case study of ICH's contribution to the art of kethoprak for improving the quality of education and community empowerment Kristian Apriyanta Representative, Dewi Fortuna Community Learning Center (DFCLC), Indonesia	
12:10 - 12:30	Evolving role of Community Museums in ICH safeguarding: case-studies from Kyrgyzstan Almagul Osmonova General Director, Taalim-Forum Public Foundation (TFPF), Kyrgyzstan	
12:30 - 13:30	Lunch Break	
SESSION 2: Effo	rts in Japan to utilise ICH for education and community development	
In cooperation with: Asia-Pacific Cultural Centre for UNESCO (ACCU); United Nations University Institute for the Advanced Study of Sustainability (UNU-IAS); Global RCE Network; The Goi Peace Foundation; ESD Consortium Kinki Region; Junior Chamber International Japan (JCI)		
13:30 - 13:45	Autonomous City Sakai and the world - Craftsman culture that be built in the history - li Naohiro Professor, Humanities and Social Sciences, Osaka Prefecture University ASPUnivNet	

13:45 - 14:00	Let us know about Intangible Cultural Heritage in Akishima City Mine Haruyoshi; Ikeda Shomu; Sasaki Mai; Matsuo Ouka; Nagai Koki The third-grade student, Shotoku Gakuen Junior & Senior High School UNESCO associated schools
14:00 - 14:15	Cases of utilising Ainu language into education and in the community as an intangible cultural heritage Kitahara Mokottunas Associate Professor Division of Humanities, Department of Ainu and Indigenous Studies, Laboratory of Ainu and Indigenous Studies, Hokkaido University RCE Hokkaido Central
14:15 - 14:30	Chitose's tradition and I $\sim$ Let's think about what we can do by inheriting
	the tradition of the Chitose district $\sim$
	Abe Daisuke Teacher, Yamagata City Chitose Primary school ESD Consortium Kinki Region
14:30 - 14:45	<i>Efforts to create qualitative values</i> Nishimura Yoshinori Qualitative Value Commission Chairman Junior Chamber International Japan
14:45 - 15:00	Break
Interactive Disc	ussion
15:00 - 16:30	Challenges and issues in incorporating ICH into education and community development
16:30	Closing

#### List of Participants

Speakers: project partners				
Bangladesh: Dhaka Ahsania Mission (DAM)				
Ehsanur Rahman	Executive Director			
Md. Matiar Rahman	Program Officer			
Indonesia: Dewi Fortuna Community Learning Center (DFCLC)				
Kristian Apriyanta	Representative			
Kyrgyzstan: Taalim-Forum public foundation (TFPF)				
Almagul Osmonova	General Director			
Jyldyz Doolbekova	Researcher			
Meerim Bayimbetova	Researcher			

Anara Alymkulova	Director, Institute of Sustainable Development Strategy (ISDS)
Speakers: Japa	nese educators and youth (Public symposium only)
li Naohiro	Professor, Humanities and Social Sciences, Osaka Prefecture University
Kitahara Mokottunas	Associate Professor, Division of Humanities, Department of Ainu and Indigenous Studies, Laboratory of Ainu and Indigenous Studies, Hokkaido University
Abe Daisuke	Teacher, Yamagata City Chitose Primary school
Nishimura Yoshinori	Qualitative Value Commission Chairman, Junior Chamber International Japan
Yamana Kazuki	Director, Global Education Department, Shotoku Gakuen Junior & Senior High School
Mine Haruyoshi	Third-grade student, Shotoku Gakuen Junior & Senior High School
Ikeda Shomu	Third-grade student, Shotoku Gakuen Junior & Senior High School
Sasaki Mai	Third-grade student, Shotoku Gakuen Junior & Senior High School
Matsuo Ouka	Third-grade student, Shotoku Gakuen Junior & Senior High School
Nagai Koki	Third-grade student, Shotoku Gakuen Junior & Senior High School
	Experts
Renee Talavera	Head, Cultural Communities and Traditional Arts Section, National Commission for Culture and the Arts (NCCA)
Vu Hong Nhi	Researcher/Deputy Head of Education Department, Vietnam Museum of Ethnology (VME)
Bui Thanh Xuan	Deputy Director, Research Division for Continuing Education, Vietnam Institute of Educational Sciences (VNIES)
Bui Thanh Xuan Duong Bich Hanh	Deputy Director, Research Division for Continuing Education,
	Deputy Director, Research Division for Continuing Education, Vietnam Institute of Educational Sciences (VNIES)
	Deputy Director, Research Division for Continuing Education, Vietnam Institute of Educational Sciences (VNIES) Programme Specialist for Culture, UNESCO Bangkok
Duong Bich Hanh	Deputy Director, Research Division for Continuing Education, Vietnam Institute of Educational Sciences (VNIES) Programme Specialist for Culture, UNESCO Bangkok Resource Persons Professor, Graduate School of Environmental and Information
Duong Bich Hanh Sato Masahisa	Deputy Director, Research Division for Continuing Education, Vietnam Institute of Educational Sciences (VNIES) Programme Specialist for Culture, UNESCO Bangkok Resource Persons Professor, Graduate School of Environmental and Information Studies, Tokyo City University Professor, Department of Music Education, Nara University of
Duong Bich Hanh Sato Masahisa Liou Lin-Yu Ishimura Tomo	Deputy Director, Research Division for Continuing Education, Vietnam Institute of Educational Sciences (VNIES) Programme Specialist for Culture, UNESCO Bangkok Resource Persons Professor, Graduate School of Environmental and Information Studies, Tokyo City University Professor, Department of Music Education, Nara University of Education Head, Audio-Visual Documentation Section, Tokyo National Research Institute for Cultural Properties Danese experts (Public symposium only)
Duong Bich Hanh Sato Masahisa Liou Lin-Yu Ishimura Tomo	Deputy Director, Research Division for Continuing Education, Vietnam Institute of Educational Sciences (VNIES) Programme Specialist for Culture, UNESCO Bangkok Resource Persons Professor, Graduate School of Environmental and Information Studies, Tokyo City University Professor, Department of Music Education, Nara University of Education Head, Audio-Visual Documentation Section, Tokyo National Research Institute for Cultural Properties
Duong Bich Hanh Sato Masahisa Liou Lin-Yu Ishimura Tomo	Deputy Director, Research Division for Continuing Education, Vietnam Institute of Educational Sciences (VNIES) Programme Specialist for Culture, UNESCO Bangkok Resource Persons Professor, Graduate School of Environmental and Information Studies, Tokyo City University Professor, Department of Music Education, Nara University of Education Head, Audio-Visual Documentation Section, Tokyo National Research Institute for Cultural Properties Danese experts (Public symposium only) Director, Education Cooperation Department, Asia-Pacific

Konishi Miki	Programme Coordinator, United Nations University Institute for the Advanced Study of Sustainability (UNU-IAS)	
	Observer (Public symposium only)	
Kawamura Hiromi	Deputy Secretary-General of the Japanese National Commission for UNESCO, Director for International Strategy Planning, Ministry of Education, Culture, Sports, Science and Technology (MEXT)	
	Secretariat	
International Research Centre for Intangible Cultural Heritage in the Asia-Pacific Region (IRCI)		
Iwamoto Wataru	Director-General	
Nojima Yoko	Head of the Research Section	
Sasaki Kazue	Associate Fellow	
Ikeda Akiko	Associate Fellow	
Umeda Yasuyo	Associate Fellow	

#### International Symposium Flyer



## Appendix

Appendix includes three case study reports that were submitted by three NGOs (DAM in Bangladesh, DFCLC in Indonesia, and TFPF in Kyrgyzstan) in FY 2021.



Cover photo: Kethoprak performance, Indonesia ©DFCLC

# Appendix 1. Case Study Report: Bangladesh



Section cover photo: Dhamail in rural setting, Bangladesh ©DAM

# 2021 Study Report on Dhamail

Research on ICH's Contribution to Sustainable Development: Education and Community Development

# A CASE STUDY

Dhaka Ahsania Mission Bangladesh

In cooperation with

International Research Centre for Intangible Cultural Heritage in the Asia-Pacific Region (IRCI)

#### Research on ICH's Contribution to Sustainable Development: Education and Community Development

#### Study Report on Dhamail Bangladesh Case Study 2021 by Dhaka Ahsania Mission (DAM) In cooperation with International Research Centre for Intangible Cultural Heritage in the Asia-Pacific Region (IRCI)

Study Team: Dr. M. Ehsanur Rahman Mohammad Mohsin ABM Shahabuddin

**Contact Information:** 

Dhaka Ahsania Mission (DAM) Road # 12, House # 19, Dhanmondi R/A, Dhaka-1209, Bangladesh

International Research Centre for Intangible Cultural Heritage in the Asia-Pacific Region (IRCI) Address: Sakai City Museum 2 cho, Mozusekiun-cho Sakai-ku, Sakai City, Osaka 590-0802 Japan

#### Foreword

Dhaka Ahsania Mission, with Consultative Status with UNESCO, identified Dhamail song combined with dance as a cultural heritage of the Sylhet region for further study in collaboration with International Research Centre for Intangible Cultural Heritage in the Asia-Pacific Region (IRCI) Japan, a UNESCO Category 2 Centre.

This case study report on Dhamail tried to gather in-depth knowledge of Dhamail and analyse the relationship among ICH, education, and community development, and ICH's contribution to SDGs 4 and 11. The researchers tried their utmost to collect qualitative information and evidence. They collected information using the KII method from academicians, practitioners, organisers, local researchers, teachers and writers, a Dhamail academy founder, and Dhamail song collectors.

The study shows that Dhamail as an intangible cultural heritage (ICH) has the potential to increase social interactions, promoting interpersonal relationships and effective communication among people. It also can be a strong tool to promote further solidarity and shared values, uniting people irrespective of caste, creed, religion, gender, or age. This empowers underprivileged communities, including women and children, ensuring their active participation at all levels of community dialogue.

We believe that this case study report on Dhamail can serve as a good source of knowledge and practice for achieving the SDG 4.7 and 11.4 targets. It will serve as a resource for ICH to gain further insight into using Dhamail to promote joyful education and cultural development, all directions for safeguarding ICH. The UNESCO Convention of ICH 2013 made adequate provision for safeguarding ICH and promoting its usage in education, community awareness-raising, and capacity-building, as well as participation of communities, groups, and individuals in development. This study was undertaken to ensure consideration of these perspectives.

We would like to thank the Research Team, IRCI, and relevant DAM colleagues for their active engagement and support in making the study complete.

Dr. M. Ehsanur Rahman

Executive Director Dhaka Ahsania Mission 15 December 2021

### ACKNOWLEDGMENT

The famed Dhamail song coupled with its marvellous typical dance is not just a ritualistic performance. Given its rich heritage and history, Dhaka Ahsania Mission undertook this research study to gain a deeper understanding of the rooted feelings and conception of it as an ICH. The integrated nature of Sustainable Development Goals (SDG) demands the active engagement of people from all walks of life, particularly the local communities, in the development process. We strongly feel that ICH has the potentiality of providing long-lasting support to sustainable development.

The research team and all connected with the process of undertaking this study worked hard in documenting Dhamail practices, illustrating its past and present, and visualizing its possible future. We are happy to acknowledge the contributions of all these wonderful people. Through this note we would like to share the credit of this research with all of them.

We are particularly grateful to the local youth in the Sylhet region, as well as the Dhamail groups, especially the girls, experts, trainers, journalists, cultural activists, performers, and writers in both rural and urban settings for their relentless support and cooperation during the study. We are equally indebted to the local community, who provided information and shared their views on Dhamail. We would like to extend our special thanks to the International Research Centre for Intangible Cultural Heritage in the Asia-Pacific Region (IRCI) for engaging DAM in this ICH research and their insightful support.

The Study Team

### **Table of Contents**

	Foreword	3
	Acknowledgement	4
	Table of Contents	5
Chapter I	The Target ICH Elements	6
Chapter II	The Target Communities	9
Chapter III	The Research Methodology and Its Implementation	11
Chapter IV	The Focused Social Issues	14
Chapter-V	What Activities were Conducted	15
Chapter VI	The Findings and Analysis	19
Chapter VII	Suggestions & Future Activities	24
	Annexes	26

## Chapter I

#### **Target ICH Elements**

The target element of this research is Dhamail. Dhamail is a form of folk music in combination with dance mainly practiced in the Sylhet region of Bangladesh. It is an item of traditional cultural heritage since the 14<sup>th</sup> century, mostly performed as group songs for entertainment during social festivals. Over the years it has spread to some other parts of the country, particularly the Mymensingh, Kishoreganj, Netrakona, and Brahmanbaria Districts of Bangladesh and abroad.

Mainly performed by women and girls, Dhamail performance, a ritualistic dance and song accompanied by clapping, over time has become a tradition during wedding ceremonies, birthday celebrations, new house festivals, Annaprasana (the child feeding ceremony), Gayae-Halud (the turmeric ceremony), Jamai Baran (Receiving Bridegroom), and others. Traditional musical instruments such as the harmonium, dholak, and kartal produce a clinking sound when the singers clap together. All these together have made Dhamail, on which this study focuses, an Intangible Cultural Heritage (ICH) of Bangladesh.

The interlinkages and integrated nature of the Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs) provide room for including the contributions of culture, especially ICH, in the SDGs. Studies by the International Research Centre for Intangible Cultural Heritage in the Asia-Pacific Region (IRCI), a Category 2 Centre of UNESCO, testifies to ICH's contribution to SDG 4, specifically Target 4.7 (peace and cultural diversity), and SDG 11 (sustainable cities and communities).

Dhaka Ahsania Mission (DAM) with its diverse educational experiences and work that contribute to SDGs undertook a research project together with IRCI to analyse the relationships among ICH, education, and community development and to clarify the roles of ICH in achieving SDGs 4 and 11. The outcome of the project is expected to effectively enhance the safeguarding of ICH as a measure towards achieving the relevant SDG targets. Through a field survey, which covered the diverse practices of Dhamail songs in the Sylhet region and some other places, DAM opted to conduct deeper research on tradition and trends of Dhamail practices.

As part of the research, in 2020 DAM made a field study to gather information on practices of Dhamail song and dance, which has been a folk medium in the region for many decades. As a follow-up, in 2021 DAM conducted this field study, focusing on the diversity in practices and differences of the practices in various contexts including the differences between urban and rural areas.

This study has the ultimate purpose of researching the contribution of ICH to SDGs, specifically focusing on Education (SDG 4) and Community Development (SDG 11). Thus, DAM undertook research on Dhamail practices in urban areas and rural areas, as well as developing a few Dhamail scripts contextually relevant for education and community development. This process could contribute to some extent to the documentation of Dhamail practices and changes in various contexts and institutional and informal settings towards 'safeguarding' Dhamail and facilitating its revitalisation as an ICH.

#### Selected Quotes and Anecdotes on Dhamail and its Process

"Dhamail song is a form of folk music and dance which was originated in the greater Sylhet region. It is a ritualistic performance which combines songs and dances and is performed on auspicious occasions. Traditionally women move in a circle, clapping their hands to the beat of the music, to render Dhamail songs which mostly relate the love story of Krishna and Radha, while male members sing and play musical instruments" [Bangladesh Shilpakala Academy]

The songs were popularized by Sree Radharaman Dutta, who was born in 1833 in Keshabpur Village in Jagannathpur Upazila of Sunamganj District. He wrote and composed over 2,000 songs.

Dhamail Gan (Song) is mainly a women's ritual dance and song. Hindu girls of the Sylhet and Mymensingh Districts perform Dhamail or Dhamali dance and songs with pomp and grandeur on the occasions of certain religious rites, different religious festivals and birth and marriage ceremonies. Twenty to twenty-five women stand in a circle in the yard and perform this rite. In Dhamail the musical measure is maintained by the clapping of the hands; hence, no musical instruments are needed. There is a specialty in the step and pace of the dance – women clap their hands successively, bending down and lifting their heads to the front. In Sylhet, handclapping is called *thapri* in the local vernacular. They dance moving forward and backward alternatively and, in a circle, keeping pace with the hand clapping.

The toes of back foot touch the ground while heels remain high; thus, they have to change right and left legs. Dhamali is erotic music relating to Radha and Krishna and written by Mr. Radha Raman. Some have said that Radha Raman did not write any Dhamail songs; he recited in his voice and his disciples wrote them down. In addition, rural women used to sing Dhamail song with a combination of a special form.

Social Dhamail songs narrating events of north Bengal, relating conversations between brides and bridegrooms, and containing proverbs are still prevalent. Dhamail is a folk song of the ancient tradition. Scholars believe that the fourteenth-century poet Chandi Das wrote Srikrishvakirton (Songs in glorification of Krishna) after being inspired by Dhamail and Jhumur songs. The word *dhamali* can be seen in Srikrishnakirton in the sense of jokes. The seventeenth-century poet Daulat Kazi uses *dhamari* in the same sense, *'Khelai bondhur sone premer dhamari'*. These quotations indicate the antiquity and popularity of *dhamali gan* (song) and dance. [Wakil Ahmad].

Music has the power to resonate the ethos of people, the joys, the pleasures of a group in an ecstatic outburst of melody and beats. [Banglapedia].

In yesteryear's glory days, one could hear womenfolk of the household sing songs while performing certain religious rites, on occasions like wedding ceremonies, days that mark the weaning of a child, or any other event — even moments of grief and tribulations. But mostly, songs of womenfolk are primarily celebratory, where the entire neighbourhood raised their voices in joy.

"The singing troupes are, more often than not, amateurs. In wealthy households, professional musicians, or *geedal* as they are known, often took up the responsibility of performing the songs. Mostly, however, it was average women that were, and still are, involved in this artistic venture. Their lessons in music were only handed down from one generation to the next. The use of instruments was minimal, if not non-existent, with claps providing the only form of percussion. Especially in Dhamail songs of the Sylhet region, this unique feature is the hallmark of the songs.

Dhamail songs usually start with one woman standing in the courtyard, clapping. She is the leader, singing the lines of a Dhamail song – usually an ode to the divine affair between Radha and Krishna. As a few lines are sung, one or two women join her in the chorus, and the cheering

continues with the hands. And as the song goes on, more women join in. As the clapping reaches a crescendo, so does the circular movement. The voices are raised, and the sound of the beat reaches a deafening peak. And then the beat regresses to normal. Most often, the Dhamail ends on the highest note, where the singing and dancing reaches a peak.

All the womenfolk sing in unison. Some are incapable of holding their breath for a long time, and thus, it is important that all participants sing and maintain the beat. Dhamail songs do not roll from one note to another in a pleasant manner. It is the total performance; the dance and the song combined make it appealing. There is a specialty in the step and pace of the dance — women clap their hands successively by bending down and lifting their heads to the front. Footwork is equally important in Dhamail dances. The toes of back foot touch the ground while heels remain high; thus, they have to change right and left legs.

In terms of lyrics, Dhamail is primarily wedding songs where the protagonist are Radha and Krishna; it is believed that the inner significance of this dance form is that the newlyweds must immerse in a love like that of Radha-Krishna." [Mannan Mashhur Zarif; The Daily Star; 14 April 2020]

Dhamail is practiced in the greater Sylhet and greater Mymensingh Districts of Bangladesh. Needless to say that Sylheti culture, especially Dhamail, somehow influences some parts of Assam, Tripura, and Meghalaya States of India, such as Cachar, Karimganj, and Hailakandi Districts of Assam, parts of Tripura and parts of Shillong under Meghalaya States of India. [Barak Upatyaka Banga Sahitya O Sanskriti Sanmilan (BUBSSS) of Assam]

## Chapter II

#### **Target Communities**

Dhamail is a traditional folk dance-cum-song of the Sylhet region. We can broadly divide the geographic coverage into two sites: (a) the location of origin: Sunamganj, Habiganj, Moulvibazar (mainly Srimangal), and Sylhet Districts, and (b) the neighbouring locations: Mymensingh, Kishoreganj, Netrakona, and Brahmanbaria Districts. This gives a picture of how Dhamail originated in the north-eastern part of Bangladesh and spread to the central-eastern districts on the border with India. Consequently, in some parts of these border districts in India, the practice of Dhamail originated and is largely practiced. Please see the location maps of the study districts on the next page.

The research team has conducted fieldwork in different places with a number of communities and their members from different groups, including women, girls, and men from the communities. The purpose is to learn about Dhamail in greater depth and consult with academicians, researchers, educators, Dhamail singers, writers, trainers, and founders of Dhamail institutes. This enabled the team to gather diverse opinions and information on Dhamail in terms of its starts, origin background, and changes in lyrics (a few colloquial words), tune, form, and style contextualized to place and dialect. Further details are mentioned in Chapter V where field activities are summarised.



Girl trainees in front of a Dhamail Academy in Srimangal



Map of Sylhet Division where Dhamail originated

Map of Bangladesh A: Origin location B: Neighbouring location



## **Chapter III**

#### **Research Methodology and its Implementation**

The central question<sup>1</sup> of the research guided our consideration of our methodology to answer it. With this approach in mind, the research design was decided by the origin of Dhamail locations, differences between the rural and urban practices of Dhamail, and its relationships with community development.

The research methodology was also influenced by the ideas of the gradual influence of modernity as progressive cultural groups sought to shape it into a more acceptable form and of the refusal to accept any change in the traditional form of Dhamail. Qualitative information collection methodologies were used in the research, whereby illustrative data were collected from the key informants through Key Informant Interviews (KIIs) in addition to Focus Group Discussions (FGDs) and consultations. The field study was conducted in September and October 2021, followed by a national consultation in November 2021 to elicit the reflections of the stakeholders on the field findings. The methodologies that were followed to achieve the research objectives are listed below:

- Literature review
- Key Informant Interview (KII)
- Focus Group Discussion (FGD)
- Writing workshop
- Observation of Dhamail group performance
- Stakeholders' consultation
- Social media tracking Facebook, YouTube
- Visit to Dhamail training institutions

**Literature Review:** Review of relevant documents such as project documents, national information on websites, documents in the targeted locations, study reports, and other relevant reports.

**Key Informant Interview (KII):** KIIs were conducted to collect the individual views of senior people, leaders, performers, cultural organisations, and youth who know about Dhamail. Information was collected from 12 experts and 16 Dhamail activists.

**Focus Group Discussion (FGD)**: Focus Group Discussions with a total of 18 participants were conducted in which academicians, housewives, practitioners, Dhamail writers, founders of groups and Dhamail Institutions, and Dhamail trainers participated

**Writing workshop:** Our Workshop on Writing Dhamail songs was a lively event in which nine persons including a Dhamail practitioner, an organiser, a music teacher, a Baul artist, a lyricist, a businessman, school teachers, students, and housewives joined, composing and tuning songs. Collectively they composed 19 songs covering 9 issues.

**Observation of group performance:** Observations of Dhamail group performances were another method to differentiate changes in Dhamail in different contexts. This observation method was particularly intended to examine the differences in rural and urban practices, which is one of the main objectives of the research.

**Stakeholder Consultations:** Stakeholder consultations involving the direct sharing of the research findings for the validation and recommendations of the study were a highly effective part of this research. Recommendations from participants in the workshop have been added in the recommendation chapter. Dhamail-related practitioners and lyricists, a founder, organisers, and

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Whether Dhamail is a diversified ICH of Bangladesh that needs safeguarding and has valuable content to impact education and community development.

representatives, academicians, local researchers, Dhamail song collectors, activists, teachers, students, trainers, performers, a representative from the government, and representatives from IRCI were present. Most importantly, the Director General of IRCI graced the workshop with his presence and introductory notes. In total 26 people participated in the online consultation workshop. A list of participants is given in the Annex.

**Social Media Tracking:** Social media tracking was needed to enrich our understanding of the implications of and capture the variations in performances. Observation of the Dhamail performance by watching online videos from Facebook and YouTube also took place during the fieldwork.

Methodological tools have been developed for the collection of qualitative data from the selection of key respondents from different districts to identify areas of diversity. A structured checklist was developed for the KII. After analysing the data collected from the respondents, this report was prepared to unify the responses according to the prescribed IRCI format.

Here are snapshots of an interview and the Dhamail writers' workshop during the field work.



Interviewing the founder of a Dhamail academy



Dhamail writers' workshop



## CHAPTER IV

#### **Focused Social Issues**

The study aimed to underscore the relationships among ICH, education, and community development within the broad framework of SDGs in general and SDGs 4 and 11, in particular. During the fieldwork and stakeholders' consultation the potentialities for ICH contributions to SDGs were discussed. The experts and practitioners deepened their thoughts on the relationships among ICH, SDG 4, and SDG 11 and possible insights into facilitating the goals by promoting Dhamail practices.

Dhamail songs include references to various current social issues and challenges which women, men, teenagers, and youth can pick up on for social awareness and which can be used in campaigns to implant them in their minds. It was observed during the consultation that without compromising Dhamail quality, educational and community development and health, safety, social, and political awareness can be amplified at the marginal level through this media. Dhamail teams thus can play an important role here in initiating the process of revitalising Dhamail as an effective cultural heritage of the country.

The study reveals that the opportunity of using Dhamail in education is immense and the outcomes are significant, as by increasing school attendance and friendship among students. The dancing part of Dhamail can eliminate inertia through physical movement. Using Dhamail in the teaching-learning of children and adolescents in public-private schools would have long-lasting results, as learning through songs is faster and longer-lasting. Working in groups in presenting Dhamail increases unity and harmony among the presenters, including children and adolescents. Group singing improves human relationships, contributing to maintaining peace and order in society.

With all these immense benefits, it has been suggested that Dhamail be included in the institutional practices of various neighbourhoods and in various school-college programmes, as this can play a role in building social harmony. In order to include Dhamail in schools, initiatives can be taken to train pioneer students. For this, community-level teachers and practitioners have to be engaged to make the practices sustainable.



Learning Dhamail in a group

## **CHAPTER V**

#### What activities (field research/desk surveys) were conducted?

The journey of preparing this case study report was short in duration but quite insightful and productive. The sequential roadmap/steps below give a glimpse of that journey of collective actions of the study team, experts, practitioners, and communities.

- 1. Creating a preparatory work plan and scheduling a dated action plan;
- 2. Liaising with local support persons and communities;
- 3. Organising the Dhamail Song Development Workshop;
- 4. Visiting Dhamail-related institutions (at different times and dates);
- 5. Collecting opinions of Dhamail practitioners and Key Informant individuals (in different places, on different dates);
- 6. Attendance at the Dhamail Conference;
- 7. Preparation of the draft report;
- 8. Organising the Stakeholder Consultation at the national level for sharing the Draft Report; and
- 9. Preparation of the Case Study Report

**Preparatory work** included the study team formation, basic information collection on Dhamail and review of the previous studies, scheduling a detailed work plan, a cost plan, communication with field-level support persons, planning a writer's workshop, designing FGD and KII checklists, and scheduling field travel.

**Communicating with local people was the next step**, in which the names and addresses of local Dhamail activists, Baul artists, and local experts were collected. This has been a continuous activity throughout the study period.

The **Dhamail writing workshop** was organised from 18 to 20 September 2021 in Sunamganj District. In total, 9 participants from different levels took part. They were mainly musicians, *baul* singers and writers, composers, and practitioners.

During the period 19–20 September 2021 **KII**s were organised with 16 people in total (4 women, 12 men) aged 24-63. These people were from Dhirai, Santiganj, Madhyanagar communities or Upazilas of Sunamganj District. The interviewed persons include a Dhamail practitioner, an organiser, a music teacher, a Baul artist, a lyricist, a businessman, school teachers, students, and housewives.

On 23 September 2021, the research team visited the Dhamail Academy. It is situated in Rustampur Village of Srimangal, Moulvibazar. Besides discussion with the head and the vice president of the academy about Dhamail practices, the trainees of the academy performed three Dhamail songs. The team then held a discussion with 18 trainees of the academy about their feelings and aspirations. The trainee girls were of mixed age and mixed grades (grade 3 to 12).

From 22 September to 2 October 2021, the team carried out selected Key Informant Interviews in Srimangal and Sylhet Districts. These people were in Sylhet City based but hail from Sylhet, Moulvibazar, and Sunamganj Districts. During this period 12 eminent persons were interviewed, including writers, academicians, teachers, educationists, professors, researchers, Dhamail practitioners, promoters, community groups, and trainers.

**The Dhamail Song Development Workshop** was organised at Shantiganj, Sunamganj. With participants at the FIVDB Training Center adjacent to the market on 18 September, all preparatory work including communication (stationery collection, banner making, venue and meal arrangements, etc.) was done

before the start of the workshop. The song development workshop was conducted from 16 to 20 September 2021. In total 9 participants from different levels took part. Among them were a Baul artist, a lyricist, Dhamail organizers, and trainers. The workshop programme included the purpose description, a review of the prehistory of Dhamail, recent adaptations of the Dhamail form, problem identification and prioritization, preparing guidelines for song writing, song development, reviews and feedback, and refinement. The participants developed 19 songs on 9 topics. The issues include environment and nature, human-to-human discrimination, children's learning, artist's life, eve teasing, drug abuse, patriotism, family planning, and sewerage.

**Participation in the Annual Conference of Pratap Ranjan Smriti Parishad** held on 1 October 2021 at Shantiganj Bazar, Pagla, Shantiganj. The research team member Mohammad Mohsin and the local associate Biman Talukder were invited to the mentioned conference for selected sessions. The conference participants shared ideas on various initiatives relating to Dhamail, for example, the formation of Dhamail groups in villages. As a result of this initiative, people become more enthusiastic about Dhamail.

On the evening of 20 September, the team met Advocate Devdas Chowdhury, who is the CEO of the International Radharman Parishad, in Sunamganj. He briefly described the efforts of the organisation, which was founded for the promotion and expansion of Dhamail all over the world. Every year on behalf of this organisation a three-day Dhamail festival is organised. These initiatives have undoubtedly played crucial roles in the promotion of Dhamail.

**Observation of Dhamail performance at the field level:** The team witnessed the presentation of two parties in Upazila Shantiganj, Sunamganj at Pagla in Satrum Sardan village; the presenters were teenagers and young women. The other was a simple presentation of 6 housewives of Joykalas Village.

In the first group, two people performed songs from outside the circle and the rest of the members took turns dancing in the circle. There were various additions to the dance – tilting the head to the right, clapping one foot to the right and then one foot to the left, etc. Occasionally, the cycle shrank and grew. In this context, the organiser said, the participants were young, so they could keep the breaths together, and the two artists sang from outside without dancing. Regarding the addition of dance steps, he clarified that since they took part in different competitions, people could not be attracted without some variations.

In the second performance, six songs by Radharman and Pratap Ranjan were performed by six elder women from Joykalas Village. They put on ordinary casual *Saris* (Long cloth of women). Clapping with the help of a drummer in a loud voice, they performed songs and dances. One starts the circle while the others took part in the song. However, they were limited to 4/5 (perhaps due to age) but none of them were fatigued.

On the next pages, a few snapshots, and references of Dhamail performances are given as examples.



Dhamail display in rural setting



Rural Dhamail by elder women performers

A new format of Dhamail dance on YouTube https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=3CBNIF1s-1k



Dhamail display in Bangladesh Shilpakala Academy, Dhaka



https://m.theindependentbd.com/arcprint/details/207572/2019-07-16

Dhamail video clips can be seen in the following two links

Dhamail in q rural setting (television production) https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=Q6cjAEoVVks

Dhamail in an urban setting (uploaded to YouTube) https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=6ablxV2XRul
# **CHAPTER VI**

# **Findings and Analysis**

The study findings relating to Dhamail practices are as follows: Dhamail is mostly a traditional form of entertainment performed as group songs, which has been practiced as part of the culture of the Sylhet region for centuries. At most rural wedding ceremonies, especially in Hindu families, which are held throughout the night, women perform Dhamail and often elder women take the lead roles. It is also performed in many other social events and festivals. Because of the deep-rooted nature of the Dhamail song and ritualistic dance, it has spread to many other neighbouring regions. Various social issues and popular stories have survived through this cultural practice.

The key findings on changes in the practices of Dhamail provide quite rich insights. The main features of change are as follows:

- (a) There are differences between village and city Dhamail practices. For example, in the dancing, the hand work and feet work differ a little bit in the times of display, and different orchestras are used in urban areas.
- (b) Differences between tunes, dancing, and clapping among the young and the elderly have also been observed.
- (c) Details of the use of performing dress are also changing.
- (d) Instruments like drum sets are now used in some rural events as well.
- (e) Earlier there was a simple circle display; now the style has changed with the inclusion of modern instruments and performance by the younger generations.
- (f) Dhamail has religious, educational, and cultural values. Culturally and religiously, it has served to develop relations among families and communities. Dhamail brings community members together and strengthens the bonds between them.
- (g) Dhamail songs can be written on any subject. Dhamail scriptwriters confirm that they have composed lyrics on various social issues.
- (h) People who have basic knowledge of the melody and rhythm and who have been exposed to various social issues compose Dhamail songs. Formal education or training is not considered an essential requirement.

In the study, the team tried to give a synopsis of different views and opinions of the key informants and other respondents about the differences in Dhamail practice in the rural and urban settings, as well as developing educational Dhamail by contemporary Dhamail lyric writers. The team also tried to identify the scope of application and opportunities of using Dhamail to contribute to SDGs 4 and 11, focusing on community development. Finally, the team tried to find ways of safeguarding Dhamail as an ICH.

It has been observed that there is significant growth of Dhamail and its rapid spread has been noted in urban settings. Many educationists, local researchers, practitioners, groups, and Dhamail lyric writers and organisers have been coming forward to promote Dhamail. Institutions have been founded by individuals, though many of those are in a very initial stage, s So it is hopeful that within a short time Dhamail will be well accepted in urban areas by a greater number of young people, which would be a very positive sign. Major reasons behind this increase in popularity of Dhamail may be threefold: Information about Dhamail is more widespread due to an increased interest of the youngsters in these types of song, opportunities are available at the local level to learn Dhamail, and wider practices have developed of Dhamail song for entertainment in the regions where people from the Sylhet region have increasingly migrated.

Nowadays, Dhamail has been performed at major national and international events. Dhamail remains community-friendly and easy to organise and perform. The value of Dhamail is also recognised in developing interpersonal relationship among families and communities, both culturally and religiously.

Dhamail has been found to be effective in strengthening the community's bonds and creating a peaceful and harmonious environment where all groups of people, especially women, can participate actively, reduce grief and sorrows, foster love, and affection, and promote human rights.

The informants as well as the respondents from different social strata raised concerns about noteworthy changes in the urban Dhamail practice and performance. They strongly believe that Dhamail may undergo some changes in style, but in no way should its original lyrics be changed. One opinion has come from the practitioners that they do not have a problem with the history and tradition of Dhamail but they write, practice, and maintain the existence of Dhamail by demonstrating and organising shows.

During the field work with a group of practitioners and experts from the Sylhet region, DAM took the initiative of composing some new Dhamail songs covering various social issues. The scripts of these new Dhamail songs (all in Bangla) are included in the annex.

Some of the selected newly composed songs have been tried out through groups singing at the rural level, and trials in urban settings in non-formal education centres of DAM in Dhaka and in the formal education institution of DAM (Ahsania Mission College) with adolescent girls are still in progress. Due to exam schedules and interruptions because of COVID-19, the trials could not be completed during the study period. DAM will continue this process when the schools open in early 2022. To measure any changes in the attitudes or behaviour of children, more time would be required. DAM will continue following up the implications of Dhamail practices in the learning process and in the community-based campaign works.

As the contents of Dhamail songs address some common social issues, there are no significant differences in the Dhamail lyrics practiced in rural and urban areas.

There are many differences between past and present Dhamail presentations. Adi (old) Dhamail was more about performing songs. No percussion instruments were required. At present, the effect of percussion is to break real feelings, as performances with drums in the village are easy now. There is also a difference in dance patterns and variations in dancing and clapping between the young and the elderly performers.

In terms of differences, there are variations in the style of presentation of Dhamail. In the cities, due to the lack of adequate space and time, the wider use of musical instruments has become inevitable. Nowadays shortened performances are also observed. Many people have commented on the use of musical instruments; in addition to drums, claps, and harmonium in rural setting. However, a faster rhythm can be noticed in the city. Different forms of dance were also reported - Dhamail group dance versus single Dhamail, etc. Differences in language and pronunciation were also seen in different Upazila of the same district, as is often the case in cities with changes in lyrics. However, these changes have not greatly affected the quality of entertainment and information.

Dhamail differs not only in the past but also in the present. In the past there was a vigorous effort of safeguarding it, but now the tradition is being ruined by the expansion of foreign culture. Dhamail was formerly organised for marriages in the city, but this practice is less seen currently due to the influence of western culture. Apart from that, however, there are differences in dance and melody.

Differences in the use of songs, musical instruments, and dances in the city reveal that the only musical instrument in the village is the Dhole (drum), but in the city, modern instruments such as pads, drums, keyboards, flute, guitar, and piano are used. The performance is made interesting through musical instruments. There are many changes in the dance and dress in the city. The splendour of the city form is a little greater than the rural. There are also other differences between the two, as the atmosphere of that village is no longer available, the form has been transformed under the influence of modernity. Thus, in the urban form, the words, dance, and melody have changed.

Dhamail has a simple singing style of dance, but modernity in the city is associated with fascinating spectacle. It is held in a different Chapter (as prescribed in the song) in the village. Despite some changes, the rural trend is predominant. The children learn music from a teacher in the city, whereas the girls in the village learn by watching and listening; consequently, the melodic structure does not remain the same. Some experts have opined that current urban Dhamail is not the original Dhamail. Even in the village, Adi (old) Dhamail is now hard to find. When performers brought Dhamail from the village to the city, they adapted it to modern musical instruments. Here is an illustration of segment-wise changes/differences between rural and urban settings:

**Place**: In the urban areas of the Sylhet region Dhamail performances took place in school or cultural functions along with other modern dances. To satisfy the audience in such a function, Dhamail is performed on the stage. On the other hand, rural women and girls perform it in the courtyards of their houses. No stage is needed, only plain ground, which costs nothing and feels easy.

**Dress:** Dhamail originally had no dress code. Women and girls performed Dhamail in whatever dress they had on and without any make up; no extra outfit or attire was needed. On the other hand, urban Dhamail performance needs to be well-outfitted with make-up to beautify the girls and make the dance recreational. Different colourful uniforms or dresses are arranged for the group.

**Instrument:** In the urban areas all modern instruments like guitar, drum pad, Harmonium, and Dhol are used to make the dance fast, but in the rural areas, only clapping with the hand and the Dhol is used; if the Dhol is unavailable, clapping with the hand is enough. In some cases, the *Mondira* is used.

**Lyrics:** In terms of lyrics, small changes have been made in the urban settings. In the rural settings, some colloquial words are also added, and sometimes if women forget any line of the lyrics, they extemporise and continue the song.

**Style:** In the urban areas the dance style has changed a little bit, but in the rural areas the style remains almost the same. Ancient or traditional Dhamail has four specific rules in the dance regarding the

- Use of clapping between 1 to 7.
- Use of body movement
- Use of speed
- Use of the legs
- Use of the head

**Use of body and movement:** Body movements in the rural areas are unchanged, but in the urban areas the traditional forms are sometimes not followed, so in the urban areas the body movements differ from the rural.

**Melody:** In the rural areas the song is sung by performers while the dance is performed by every member of the group, but in the urban areas, the song is sung on an audio recorder; performers do not sing while dancing.

**Use of steps:** In the rural performance the use of steps starts slowly, then quickens to medium speed, then faster, and finally again becomes slow. In the urban settings this rule does not apply.

Regarding the risk of these qualitative changes in the Dhamail, most experts said that Dhamail will not become extinct with these changes and the quality will not be affected significantly, but people have to be aware of the consequences of any changes. At the same time, mainstreaming efforts must continue. The rhythm and words must be harmoniously coordinated.

In this study, the team observed that there are many significant little-publicised efforts to keep Dhamail in focus, and many scholars and experts have come forward to promote Dhamail. They are also very much concerned about the existence, promotion, and safeguarding of Dhamail, a very versatile, attractive, and entertaining song and dance form. For example, by founding Dhamail academies, the girls of surrounding villages can easily learn Dhamail, which would have created an opportunity to learn Dhamail in the future and participate in various events and would also give them the opportunity to teach their siblings and other academy learners. There is also an economic value if it becomes popular and has a significant demand.

To make arrangements for the collection and preservation of Dhamail from its marginal position, we suggest that: (a) Non-governmental organisations also encourage various international organisations to come forward. (b) Encourage new lyricists and collect songs. (c) Publish books and distribute them all over the country. (d) Carry out publicity by students from the villages. (e) Promote Dhamail through regular performances on various occasions. (f) Urge the District Shilpakala Academy to venture into expanding Dhamail.

To keep and preserve it as a heritage, a conclusive suggestion was that it must be cared for at its source. To this end, necessary institutions (such as universities) should be set up in Sylhet, especially in the Haor region. The government should set up an archive to save Dhamail so that even after 50–100 years, anyone can see it in its original form.

From the analysis, different views emerged under the following three categories:

The first category is radical: Under no circumstances should even a word or fraction of melody be changed of traditional or ancient Dhamail, which does not need to be beautified further.

The second category holds that under the demands of time, place, and environment, a little change may occur in terms of instruments, dress, and lyrics, which are mediocre. Beautification is needed for popularisation, as Dhamail needs to be popularised.

The third category is the liberal view. This group opined that the very nature of culture is to change with the times and modernisation. To popularise any cultural segment or heritage, beautification and intermixture is the demand of the times, and it changes automatically, which cannot be prevented, but at the same time they agree that the heritage should be preserved somewhere, then let it be freely modernised by people to secure its internationalisation under the demands of globalisation. The world is now treated as a global village, so change is everywhere that nobody can prevent.

Dhamail songs should be collected, preserved, and presented, and the real history of the form should be investigated. Tunes and dance songs can be published in the form of books and notation can be made by experts. Dhamail is a rich dance-song form. Incorporating Dhamail in the co-curriculum of the school-college and the education of young children plus teenagers is needed to ensure that they care about their tradition. Those who compose Dhamail should focus on its original form. Some experts have suggested that in order to preserve the uniqueness of Dhamail, it is necessary to build a widespread institution to determine its standards.

Every respondent of this research reflected their sincere expectations of the survival and safeguarding of the song and dance form and of its optimal use to achieve the SDG targets 4.7 and 11.4. In this respect they said the government as well as non-government organisations, particularly cultural forums, groups, and researchers should take prompt initiatives and leadership in safeguarding it.

#### How to safeguard Dhamail:

An expert informant opined that he was quite convinced that folk songs as a traditional subject naturally would change with the times. The same is happening in the case of Dhamail. As it cannot be prevented, to keep and preserve it as a heritage, it must be cared for at its source. For these necessary institutions such as universities should be set up in Sylhet especially in the Haor region.

An archive should be established to save Dhamail without delay. Dhamail songs should be collected, preserved, and presented and its real history investigated. Tunes, dances, and songs should be published in book form. Notation of original Dhamail can be developed by experts. As Dhamail is a rich dance song, as many academies have already been established to defend it, the Dhamail Academy has to do that the same.

Dhamail should be incorporated in the core curriculum and co-curriculum to inculcate young children and teenagers of school-college age in its tradition. Above all, weekly classes can be dedicated to Dhamail practice in the schools, which will promote joyful learning.

A few experts opined that there is so much variety and beauty in the melody of Dhamail that it does not need any change. Regarding musical Instruments, many famous artists have used modern instruments in their songs but would not exclude their own musical instruments. Thus, in modernisation the practitioners have to think whether they will preserve the tradition or 'modernise' it completely.

In conclusion, it can be said that a kind of demand has been created in the meantime due to dedicated activists who have been promoting Dhamail in the urban areas despite the many criticisms in terms of changing the characteristics and original form of Dhamail. They argue in reply that if Dhamail is not popularised in the wider community, particularly the modern generation, its existence will be threatened, and it might be completely lost. Others say folk culture never dies; it will continue to exist regardless.

However, there is a scope to protect, preserve, and safeguard Dhamail, as was discussed in consultations with all levels of community people. Dhamail could be introduced in educational institutions as well as cultural organisations being developed at the local and district levels. Organising training workshops and introducing Dhamail into the education system may safeguard Dhamail's nature as a very diverse and recreational form of cultural heritage. Local researchers, academicians, and practitioners opined that any cultural heritage needs to be safeguarded, for which there is a need for an archive where the original form, a list of the writers and tunes, a collection of all lyrics, printed literature on the history of the heritage, and its expansion, dimensions, connotation, boundaries, and geo-physical existence should be composed by Dhamail experts for preservation in the archive.

In this regard government patronage will be strongly needed, they added. The Ministry of Cultural Affairs of the Bangladesh Government can take these initiatives. Some researchers and writers opined that specialized institutions should be established in the Sylhet region, where formal research on Dhamail will be carried out and regular training will be provided lasting years, as well as establishing an archive where writers, academicians, and practitioners can work together.

# **CHAPTER VII**

## **Suggestions and Future activities**

In this last chapter of the case study report, the future trends and possible options for Dhamail as an ICH are indicated based on the findings and analysis. As an inter-generational cultural practice of the heritage, Dhamail was traditionally learned by the new generation from their parents and other adults. Currently, there are opportunities to learn it in academic settings, though it remains informal. With the growing popular interest in Dhamail, the setting of local training academies could create an opportunity for rural girls to learn Dhamail. Various cultural organisations and music and dance education centres offer courses in Dhamail. Examples are: Udichi (a popular cultural group), Shrihatta Cultural Council, Navnagari Dhamail Sangha, Shilpakala Academy local centres, Lokdol Dhamail Sangha, Dhamail Academy, and International RadhaRamon Parishad. These initiatives need to be patronised, and a framework for technical and financial support would ensure proper standardisation in the learning process. Policy guidelines to preserve lyrics, notation, and dance forms, and collect documentation and publications have been recommended as a priority.

The present trends in the city are the increased use of modern instruments such as pads, drums, keyboards, flute, guitar, and piano along with faster rhythms and higher sounds. Commercial performances are becoming more common at social events, celebrations, and festivals. In some cases the performances are being diluted by foreign cultural elements. In the inter-generational transition process, some of these intrusions cannot be avoided. However, in safeguarding this rich cultural heritage, archiving of the past generations' practices as reference would be strategically important. This would enable the new generation to look back to the origin and richness of the ICH. Encouraging new lyricists, collecting songs, publishing books, and distributing these materials across communities are a few practical ideas in this regard.

It seems evident that Dhamail will not become extinct due to its increased popularity across the region in both rural and urban settings. Acknowledging the current trend of changes, the note of caution by the experts of recognising to any changes ensuring the quality of this ICH is recommended. A few suggestions are: the rhythm and words must be coordinated in harmony, while keeping the spirit of melody; the rhythm and steps of the original song must not be lost.

Learning through rhythmic song is quick and long-lasting. This should be capitalised upon as a learning strategy in educational institutions, particularly when the education sector is looking for ways and means to recover from losses in education due to COVID-19. The blended approach would boost the mental spirit of students and teachers while they learn and enjoy themselves.

As a tool for community contribution, the use of Dhamail performance has proved effective in promoting educational messages, school enrolment campaigns, and mass awareness of vaccination, malaria, and pandemics. Dhamail can be used to address social problems such as the early marriage of girls, deprivation of women, and raising people's voices about price hikes, road safety, and food safety. It has also been suggested that Dhamail can support community resilience against disasters and calamities and help relieve peoples' sufferings. For this purpose, Dhamail cultural groups need to be formed at the community level, in non-formal and formal schools, and at higher educational institutions.

#### The potentiality of Dhamail as ICH to contribute to SDGs 4.7 and 11.4

From the primary analysis of the qualitative information received from the key informants (academicians, researchers, practitioners, Dhamail writers, founders of groups and Dhamail institutions, and Dhamail trainers), it was found that Dhamail could play an active role in achieving social harmony (SDG 4.7) and building sustainable communities (SDG 11.4) by promoting social inclusion. To introduce these practices in the schools and non-formal education systems, directives from the government as well as education experts would be needed. In addition, motivated and cultural-minded teachers can

be recruited at the institutional levels – schools, colleges, and universities. The engagement of community teachers may also be an option.

SDG 4.7 demands that all learners acquire the knowledge and skills needed to promote sustainable development and sustainable lifestyles, human rights, gender equality, promotion of a culture of peace and non-violence, and appreciation of cultural diversity. During the writers' workshop a couple of Dhamail songs were written addressing these issues. Institutional measures to ground those at the community level through youngsters' groups will contribute to building sustainable cities as envisaged in SDG 11.4.

Dhamail may be included in the co-curricular activity lists of education institutions. A few ideas are as follows: (a) in social studies or life skills education of higher-grade classes; (b) awareness education on social issues like the consequences of child marriage and legal provisions; (c) campaigns on the importance of education, especially for girls, the consequences of dowry, and the importance of regular attendance in schools; and (d) the sensitisation of students during assembly.

All these can be done through the formation of cultural groups in the schools and at the college or university level. This will also help to protect, preserve, and safeguard Dhamail as an ICH. Training on Dhamail would be an integral part of developing skills of the youth and cultural forum members to protect, preserve, and safeguard ICH that will continue from generation to generation.

As an anecdote, we note that in 2017, the Bengal Foundation (a corporate house) organised a training workshop in the Srimangal area and trained a group of youth in Dhamail. Soon after that, many Dhamail groups were formed in and around the area, signalling that patronage can inspire performers and encourage people to grow with Dhamail. A few institutions have also been established, one of which the research team has visited to observe Dhamail performances.

-The End-

# ANNEXES

# Annex I

# Participant List of the Stakeholders' Workshop

#	Name	Address	Email
1.	Iwamoto Wataru	Director General IRCI	irci@nich.go.jp
2.	Ms. Nojima	IRCI	nojima-y35@nich.go.jp>
3.	Kazue Sasaki	Associate Fellow, IRCI	sasaki-k5u@nich.go.jp
4.	D. Saimon Jakaria, DD	Bangla Academy	dr.zakariasaymon@gmail.com
5.	Ad. Debdash Chowdhury	CEO, Int. Radha Raman Parishad	chowdhurydebdas2@gmail.com
6.	Dr. Abul Fate Fattah	Ex. Principal Madan Mohon College, Sylhet, researcher and writer	affattah@gmail.com
7.	Enayet Hasan Manik	President, Udicchi, Sylhet	ehmanik53@gmail.com
8.	Dr. Mustak Ahmed Din	Controller of Examination, Leading University, Sylhet, Researcher and Writer	mosnobi@gmail.com
9.	Drupad Chowdhury Nupur	ED, Rural Advancement Society	ras.orged@gmail.com
10.	Mr. Ahamad Monjurul Haque Chy	Cultural Officer, Shilpokola Academy, Sunamganj	paveldrama33@gmail.com
11.	Abha Rani Sarker	Teacher & Dhamail Lyricist, Derai, Sunamganj	abhasarker73@gmail.com
12.	Ms. Anita Deb Shyam	School teacher & dance teacher	anitadebshyam13@gmail.com
13.	Mr. Deponkor Mohanta	PTI Moulovibazar	deponkor.sylpti@gmail.com
14.	Mr. Shamol Ch. Deb	Cultural activist	shamoldeb1977@gmail.com
15.	Mr. Animesh Bijoy Chowdhury	Singer & writer	animeshbchy@gmail.com
16.	Baul Basiruddin Sarker	Folk singer	bashiruddinsarkar@gmail.com
17.	Mr. Biman Talukder	Cultural activist	methosurweb@gmail.com
18.	Mr. Joyonta Kumar Sarker	Derai, Sunamganj	
19.	Dr. S M Khalilur Rahman	General Secretary, DAM	mkhalilur@hotmail.com
20.	M. Ehsanur Rahman	Executive Director, DAM	ehsan1155@gmail.com
21.	Mr. Mohammad Mohsin	Field Coordinator (Research)	mohsin.m71@gmail.com
22.	ABM Shahab Uddin	Research Coordinator	damjoyful.pm@gmail.com
23.	Kh. Md. Abdun Nayeem	Principal Officer (IT)	rnayeem79@gmail.com
24.	Md. Matiar Rahman	Program Office-MIS	Mdmatiar77@gmail.com
25.	Ms. Kaspia Sultana	Interpreter	kaspia07@gmail.com
26.	Ms. Tashin Ishayat	Interpreter	tashinishayat@gmail.com

# Annex II

# **Newly composed Dhamail songs**

# Total 18 songs

Educational (2) Human dignity (5) Population (1) Environment (2) Drug abuse (2) Eve teasing (1) Corona virus (1) Public toilets (1) Safeguarding of Dhamail (2) Entertaining Dhamail (1)

# Appendix 2. Case Study Report: Indonesia



Section cover photo: Kethoprak performance, Indonesia ©DFCLC

**Case Study Report** 

# THE ROLE OF KETHOPRAK IN IMPROVING THE QUALITY OF EDUCATION AND SUSTAINABLE COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT

# Dewi Fortuna Community Learning Centre Indonesia

in cooperation with International Research Centre for Intangible Cultural Heritage (IRCI)

#### Abstract

Case Study I (FY 2020) investigated the roles and contributions of the art of Kethoprak in improving the quality of education and sustainability of communities in formal education, after which Case Study II (FY 2021) was conducted in non-formal schools to compare its result with that of Case Study I. Case Study II analysed the capacity of the Dewi Fortuna Community Learning Centre in implementing a practice that integrates Kethoprak with basic subjects and extra-curricular activities. Learning Kethoprak improved the quality of education (SDG 4) and students' academic performance in other subjects, such as arts and culture, local languages, social sciences, and history and civic education. Improvements were also noticed in students' character, communication skills, socialisation skills, self-expression, motivation level, participation level, etc. This encouraged support for a communal work culture to inculcate solidarity, cooperation, and unity in the society.

Sustainable community development (SDG 11) can also be observed in community participation in efforts to preserve, protect, and promote intangible cultural heritage—the art of Kethoprak. It provides opportunities, knowledge, and skills to overcome socio-cultural and environmental issues and develop local potential to increase the community's creative economy to participate in and impact SDGs 5, 8, 9, 15, and 17.

# A BRIEF REPORT ON THE ROLE OF KETHOPRAK IN IMPROVING THE QUALITY OF EDUCATION AND SUSTAINABLE COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT International Symposium of IRCI in December 2021

## I. THE TARGET ICH ELEMENT

The philosophy of *meyu hayuningbawana* is a part of local Javanese wisdom and provides religious and social guidance apart from providing insights about basic human traits such as honesty, tolerance, discipline, cooperation, creativity, independence, democracy, patriotism, respect, importance of communication, care for the environment, social care, and responsibility. Traditional beliefs are preserved and passed across generations through local traditional cultural ceremonies and art forms such as Kethoprak, Wayang Kulit, various dance forms, and Javanese literature.

Global industrialisation has a positive as well as a negative side. On the one hand, use of modern technology has simplified human life, but on the other hand, it has distanced the young generation from their traditional and moral values. Although the full range of benefits of globalisation is yet to be recognised, but it has clearly rendered the youth culturally homeless—especially in the socio-cultural, educational, and economic senses. The transition from the local to the global era has led to a certain degradation of the human character because the youth is less interested in learning about their culture and traditions. Local culture andarts are considered ancient, slow, feudal, and uneconomical—contrary to the global spirit being fast, competitive, and economical; this results in changes in the culture of communal cooperation (*gotong royong*), leading to individual competition. Thus, positive synergy becomes negative competition, tolerance becomes intolerance, willingness to participate in social care reduces, harmony turns into exploitation, and the spirit of patriotism wanes. All this leads to a growing threat of social inequality and economic and moral poverty in life.

A major cause for this is the lack of solidarity and lack of inculcation of ICH values for character building in the youth and society to face the transition from the local era to the global era. This condition must be addressed immediately in line with the International Research Centre for Intangible Cultural Heritage in the Asia-Pacific region (IRCI)'s objectives by strengthening traditional local cultural values as elements of ICH, to return to traditional cultural values to develop a sustainable society through education. ICH elements in the teachings of local wisdom contribute towards strengthening the character of youth. A local traditional art form with numerous ICH elements is Kethoprak.

IRCI collaborated with Dewi Fortuna Community Learning Centre (henceforth, DFCLC) Indonesia to conduct a case study titled, 'The contribution of ICH values which is contained in the Kethoprak art in order to improve the quality of education and sustainable community development'. It analysed the contribution of local wisdom as an element of ICH presented via Kethoprak for the improvement of the Quality of Education (SDG 4) and Sustainable Community Development (SDG 11) and other SDGs, and to receive recommendations for follow-up plans from policymakers in the Klaten Regency by conducting relevant activities.

- 1. Case Study I (FY 2020): Comparative research of formal elementary schools that conduct Kethoprak activities and those that do not, to ascertain schools' capacities to foster students to preserve, protect, and promote ICH, along with schools' contributions to the development of character education and community involvement in the development of Kethoprak and to provide solutions for educational, socio-cultural, and environmental problems.<sup>1</sup>
- 2. Case Study II (FY 2021)<sup>2</sup>: Implementing Case Study I in basic subjects and extra-curricular activities, including Kethoprak, at the Dewi Fortuna CLC as a non-formal school and comparing the results with those of Case Study I (comparison between formal and non-formal education).

## II. TARGET COMMUNITIES

The Klaten Regency is an area of 65,556 ha (655.56 km<sup>2</sup>) with a population of 1,174,986 (576,513 men and 598,473 women [as of 2020]). The number of formal school students is 94,808, divided into the age group of 6–13 years in elementary school (SD–SMP) with 45,821 students in 118 schools, and the age group of 14–17 years in high school (SMA/SMK), with 44,661 students in 83 schools. The number of non-formal school students is 770 students in 17 PKBM (Community Learning Centres).

As targets for this case study, we selected institutions and personnel in formal and non-formal education systems located in the Klaten Regency to reflect the complex and heterogeneous cultural conditions of society. To limit this research, we first observed the schools using Kethoprak in their educational programme, and then the schools that do not. Three schools were selected for the research:

- 1. SD Krista Gracia Elementary School: This school consistently performs Kethoprak as an extracurricular activity.
- 2. SD Negeri 2 Trunuh Elementary School: This school does not perform Kethoprak as an extracurricular activity.
- 3. DFCLC: A non-formal school that implemented the results of Case Study I to compare the differences between formal and non-formal schools.

Sampling technique was used as a research technique because the sample population (i.e., number of respondents) is relatively small. See the table below:

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> This was briefly reported online on International Symposium (28 January 2021).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> Reports were prepared during the Regional Workshop and Symposium (21–22 December 2021).

# Table 1: The primary data

Object of Research	Case Stu	ıdy I	Case Study II		
	SD Krista Gracia	SD N 2 Trunuh	Dewi Fortuna CLC		
Address	Jl. Seruni No.8.	Trunuh Village,	Jl. Arimbi No. 02		
	Klaseman,	South Klaten,	Jombor Danguran		
	Tonggalan, Village,	Klaten Regency	South Klaten, Klaten		
	Klaten center,		Regency		
	Klaten Regency				
NPSN	20309228	20309953	P2970282		
Headmaster	Sri Purwanti Juli,	Aris Pratiwi,	Kristian Apriyanta,		
	S.Pd, MM	S.Pd, MM	S.Pd		
Respondents					
Students					
Grade	5–6	5–6	5–12		
Age (in years)	11–12	11–12	13–50		
Male	6	5	17		
Female	6	5	10		
Total	12	10	27		
Headmaster	1	1	1		
Teacher of art and culture	1	1	1		
Teacher of Javanese	1	1	1		
language					
Teacher of social &	1	1	1		
history					
Teacher of citizenship	1	1	1		
education					
Parents	5	5	5		
Public figure	1	1			

Secondary data can be seen in the table below:

Table 2: The secondary data	Table	2: The	e secon	dary	data
-----------------------------	-------	--------	---------	------	------

No	Type of Data	Note
1	School Profile	Adjust
2	Decision letter determining the curriculum	Adjust
3	Example of lesson plan and syllabus	3 lessons
4	Teaching schedule of 5 <sup>th</sup> grade	1 piece
5	Document of Kethoprak learning facility	List and photo
6	Learning schedule of Kethoprak	1 piece
7	Document of Kethoprak learning activity	Photo/Internet link
8	Example of student report	4 students
9	Achievement of sample learners related to the subjects	Adjust
10	Community partnership document	Decision letter/MoU
11	List of respondents	Adjust
12	Written works about Kethoprak art in Klaten	Bibliography
13	National educational objectives	Bibliography
14	Written work about character building	Bibliography

#### III. RESEARCH METHODOLOGY AND IMPLEMENTATION

#### A. METHODOLOGY

A case study is a research strategy to examine cases using systematic methods of observation, data collection, information analysis, and result reporting. This strategy was employed to answer research questions related to:

- 1. Improving the quality of education (SDG 4) through the capacity of schools in implementing the learning of Kethoprak.
- 2. Sustainable community development (SDG 11) through community participation.
- 3. Relationship with or impact on other SDGs.

This study compared evidence from survey results. Quantitative and qualitative analyses of primary data (Table 1) and secondary data (Table 2) were performed, referring to the opinion of Arief Furchan (1999: 22) on the qualitative methods<sup>3</sup> with the empirical study that investigates the real-life background to gain a substantive understanding of learning Kethoprak in formal and non-formal schools. In this study, there was no controlling variable,

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> '...the research process that produces descriptive, spoken or written data or observable behaviour from the people themselves, in our opinion this approach directly shows the setting and the individuals in that setting as a whole. The subject of investigation, either in the form of an organization or an individual, does not narrow it down to a separate variable or becomes a hypothesis, but is seen as part of a whole.'

nor manipulation or special treatment from the researcher. The research was conducted naturally, and researchers collected and analysed data to gather information on the studied variables, using assumptions based on quantitative numerical values to facilitate comparative studies and draw conclusions from this research.



#### 1. The research thinking framework is as follows:

Figure 1: Research thinking framework

#### 2. The research variables include:

Tangibles	Intangible reliability
Human resources: principals, students,	The schools' contribution to fostering the
parents, subject teachers, and community	improvement of character education in the
leaders who were tasked to provide teaching	community and participating in sustainable
services for Kethoprak in schools.	community development by supporting a
	communal work culture.
Infrastructure facilities and technology for	School attendance increased because of
learning Kethoprak.	encouragement of unity and solidarity in the
	art community formed in the school.
Influence on the development of academic	Indicators of growing appreciation and pride
skills of students in Kethoprak, regional	in knowledge of local wisdom in the
languages, historical social studies, and civic	community, which leads to character
education.	development in students
Impact of community involvement in creating	Students developed skills in the fields of
awareness and participating in the	traditional arts and crafts, which contributed
preservation, protection, and promotion of	to community welfare.
ICH for sustainable community development.	
	Other positive outcomes of learning
	Kethoprak.

Table 3: The research variables

- **3.** Data collection techniques are methods used to obtain the data needed for a study. Recorders and online communication, mobile phones, and notebooks from interviews were used.
  - **a. Questionnaires** were distributed to all respondents to obtain data on the research instruments. This data collection method includes a written list of questions in a logical, detailed, and complete manner, to which respondents can provide precise and clear answers.
  - **b. Interviews** were conducted online with respondents to clarify answers to the questionnaires that needed validation or confirmation.
  - c. Secondary Data Documentation.
  - d. Curriculum Development Practice at Dewi Fortuna CLC.
  - e. The practice of implementing Kethoprak art learning at Dewi Fortuna CLC.

#### **B. IMPLEMENTATION**

The framework of thinking and translation of research methods was implemented by conducting activities in stages.

No	Case Study I	No	Case study II
1	Preparation, including team building	1	Team building
2	Compiling licenses and activity implementation guidelines, preparation of questionnaires and interview lists, and other supporting tools for primary/secondary data documentation	2	Guidelines and legal basis for the implementation of activities
3	Letters and conducting research socialisation	3	Implementing standard procedures for developing Kethoprak art curriculum integrated with other subjects at the Dewi Fortuna CLC
4	Data collection via field research and desk surveys using interview methods and filling out questionnaires to obtain primary and secondary data from respondents (students, teachers, etc.)	4	Implementation of Kethoprak learning activities as an extra- curricular activity at the Dewi Fortuna CLC for specialisation sub-subjects: talent artist, makeup artist, Gamelan music dressing, stage management, sound system, lighting system, multimedia photographer, videographer, and performing arts management
5	Analysing the results of field study and desk surveys	5	Collecting field study data and desk study
6	Compiling case study reports	6	Kethoprak performance art: stage learning outcomes
		7	Analysing activity, result document data
		8	Compiling case study report
		9	Conducting regional workshops, providing reports on the results of activities, and seeking opinions from regional policymakers
	THE RESULT OF CA	SE ST	UDY FY 2020–2021

Table 4: Major activities

## IV. THE FOCUSED SOCIAL ISSUE

#### A. Case Study I (FY 2020)

Case study I focussed on answering basic questions/hypotheses regarding the contribution of ICH (the art of Kethoprak) in improving the quality of education (contribution to SDG 4), which can be analysed from:

- a. the capacity of schools that organise or do not organise Kethoprak lessons.
- b. the results of learning scores on the value of students' report cards for other subjects.
- c. the impact on character education of students.
- d. sustainable community development (contribution to SDG 11), which can be analysed by the participation of the people involved.

#### B. Case study II (FY 2021)

Case study II aimed at answering basic questions/hypotheses regarding the contribution of ICH (Kethoprak) that was implemented in the non-formal schools (Dewi Fortuna CLC), by applying the results of Case study I and developing lessons that combine Kethoprak with other subjects.

- 1. Comparing the results of Case Study I to analyse differences in implementation in formal and non-formal education is related to the contribution to SDGs 4 and 11.
- 2. Overview of the relationship with other SDGs.
- 3. Obtaining responses and recommendations from the Klaten Regency and local government on the results of Case Studies I and II.

## V. ACTIVITIES CONDUCTED (FIELD RESEARCH/DESK SURVEY)

#### A. Case Study I FY 2020

Case Study I compared and analysed contributions of the character values of local wisdom (Kethoprak) in the improvement of quality of education (SDG 4) and increase in community participation in sustainable development (SDG 11). The study was conducted with the cooperation of SD Krista Gracia and SD N 2 Trunuh elementary schools. Details are as follows:

No	ACTIVITY	TIME			OFFICER	TARGET
		D	Μ	Y		
1	PKBM coordinator meeting cooperation discussion	21	10	2020	Kristian Apri	Socialisation, team building
2	Cooperation programme decision letter	28	10	2020	Kristian Apri	Basic activity
3	Case Study I team meeting	30	10	2020	Kristian Apri	Questionnaire guidelines and case study files
4	Compilation of case study file questionnaire	31	10	2020	Heri Iswanto	Sending permits, recommendations, etc.
5	Sending research permission	1	11	2020	Heri Iswanto	
6	Permission letter for elementary schools for case study research	2	11	2020	Fembriyana	SD Krista Gracia Elementary School, SD N 2 Trunuh Elementary School
7	SD Krista Gracia elementary school – socialisation	7	11	2020	Team 1	Programme presentation
8	SD N 2 Trunuh elementary school – socialisation	7	11	2020	Team 2	Programme presentation
9	Primary data research SD Krista Gracia Elementary School	10	11	2020	Team 1	Documentation and questionnaire for students and teachers
10	Primary data research SD N 2 Trunuh Elementary School	13	11	2020	Team 2	Documentation and questionnaire for students and teachers
11	Interview – SD Krista Gracia	18	11	2020	Team 1	Headmaster, teachers, committee, students

Table 5: Major activities in FY 2020

	Elementary School					
12	Interview – SD N 2 Trunuh	20	11	2020	Team 2	Headmaster, teachers, committee, students
	Elementary School					
13	Secondary data SD Krista Gracia	25	11	2020	Team 1	Profile, infrastructure, support
	Elementary School					
14	Secondary data SD N 2 Trunuh	25	11	2020	Team 2	Profile, infrastructure, support
	Elementary School					
15	Analysis of data collection results	4	1	2021	Team A	Recap the result of Team 1
16	Data comparison analysis I	22	1	2021	Team A	Comparison, summary
17	Data comparison analysis II	25	1	2021	Team A	Comparison, summary
18	Research and analyst team case	27	1	2021	Team A	Conclusion case study from Team A and Team D
	study report					
19	Symposium I Zoom online meeting	28	1	2021	Alga Yudistira	Activity report Case Study I with IRCI
20	Case Study I report	8	2	2021	Kristian Apri	Compilation of the official Case Study I report
21	Research implementation letter	22	2	2021	Heri Iswanto	Head of education office and school principal for follow-up
						research
23	Funding	14	3	2021	Miske Regina	2020 budget allocation

## B. Case Study II FY 2021

## Table 6: Major activities in FY 2021

No	ACTIVITY		TIME		OFFICER	RESULT NOTE
		D	М	Y		
1	Meeting DFCLC coordinator	20	3	2021	Kristian Apri	Evaluation report Team 1, 2 RTL, form TIM
2	Teacher and committee meeting DFCLC	30	3	2021	Kristian Apri	Socialisation, programme, aspiration network
3	Kethoprak education programme decision letter	2	3	2021	Kristian Apri	Curriculum Kethoprak art intra & extra

4	Intra-curricular team meeting	4	4	2021	Team I	Curriculum preparation of the intra-subject integration
5	Intra-curricular team meeting	4	4	2021	Team E	Preparation of extra implementation guidelines
6	Extracurricular registration circular	5	4	2021	Heri Iswanto	Teacher and student recruitment 2020/2021
7	Preparation of syllabus and lesson plans for intra-curricular subjects	6	4	2021	Team E	RPP syllabus integration of Kethoprak in subjects
8	Extra-curricular partnership application letter	8	4	2021	Team E	Resource persons, Arts Council and Art Studio Omah Wayang Klaten
9	Technical meeting activity closing registration	12	4	2021	Team E	Resource persons, facilitators, teachers, parents, committee
10	First extra-curricular Kethoprak class	18	4	2021	Team E	Schedule socialisation, production process, and Kethoprak story interpretation
11	Extra-curricular training	19	4	2021	Team E	See schedule of activities* By Zoom, face to face etc.
12	Consolidation meeting	10	5	2021	Kristian Apri	Advisor, coach, and partner of DFCLC
13	Zoom meeting IRCI	18	6	2021	Alga Yudistira	Planning programme 2021
14	Extra-curricular team meeting	19	6	2021	Team E	Register II 2021/2022-Reschedule
15	Case Study II team meeting	28	6	2021	Team 2	Compilation of questionnaire Case Study II
16	Intra-curricular team meeting	1	7	2021	Team I	Preparation of curriculum documents
17	Primary data research DFCLC	12	7	2021	Team 2	Documentation and questionnaire
18	Dewi Fortuna PKBM secondary data	20	7	2021	Team 2	Documentation and questionnaire
19	Support data documentation	5	8	2021	Team 2	
20	Finalisation of the workshop draft	6	8	2021	Dwiyati, S.Pd	Draft workshop technical guidelines
21	Interview with PKBM Dewi Fortuna	3	9	2021	Team 2	Principal, teacher, committee, students
22	Data comparison analysis	15	9	2021	Team A	Conclusion comparison of Case Study I and Case Study II
23	Curriculum evaluation report	2	10	2021	Team I	Report on the results of improving students' knowledge of Kethoprak
24	DFCLC planning committee meeting I	10	10	2021	Dwiyati, S.Pd	Workshop team formation meeting
25	Finalisation of Case Study II: Data analysis results	15	10	2021	Team 2	Progress report

26	Research and analyst team: Case study	18	10	2021	ALL TEAMS	Research team, head of programme, and DFCLC
	report					management
27	Workshop team meeting	23	10	2021	Dwiyati, S.Pd	Workshop guidelines
28	Rehearsal of Kethoprak performance	27	10	2021	Team E	Extracurricular results appreciation
29	Extracurricular virtual performance	28	10	2021	Team E	Live streaming: YouTube channel
30	Location preparation and final check	3	11	2021	Team W	
31	DFCLC committee meeting III	4	12	2021	Team W	Short report—symposium papers
	(workshop report)					
32	Preparation of reports	15	12	2021	Team W	Concrete RTL stakeholder recommendations
33	Symposium I Zoom online meeting	21	12	2021	Dwiyati, S.Pd	IRCI Case Studies I and II activity reports
34	Preparation of FY Cooperation	15	1	2022	Krystiadi, MA	Print hardcopy books and e-books
	Programme Report 2020–2021					
35	Report delivery	30	2	2022	Heri Iswanto	IRCI

## VI. FINDINGS AND ANALYSIS

The type of comparative analysis used is the one-sample t-test where the analysis clarifies differences and similarities between the sample groups of data and other data. To test the hypothesis, it is expected to conduct an analysis that does not merely answer the question of 'what' is the object under study but is more thorough and comprehensive about 'how' and 'why' the object occurs and is formed, thereby forming the basis for further research.

## A. Schools' efforts to improve the quality of education through Kethoprak

Table 7: Contribution of	Case St	udv I	Case Study II
4 EDUCATION	SD Krista Gracia	SD N 2 Trunuh	Dewi Fortuna CLC
School capacity to improve the quality of education through Kethoprak	Law on national education goals According to the school's vision and mission	Financing that is too large compared to the available budget sources	Mandate of the national education objectives law School mission vision
Do you have the capacity to conduct Kethoprak learning?	Have adequate school infrastructure and facilities	Have minimal school infrastructure and facilities	Have adequate community infrastructure and facilities
How to manage cooperation with other parties/society	Competent potential data in the school environment Prepare a cooperation offer Cooperating in the school cooperation agreement letter	There has been no cooperation with the community	Competent potential data in the school environment Prepare a cooperation offer Cooperating in the school cooperation agreement letter
Results obtained by the school by holding the Kethoprak lessons	The school has positive educational results and achievements of institutions and students	None yet	The school receives community's appreciation
Results obtained indirectly by the school by conducting Kethoprak activities	The school receives community's appreciation It contributes to the	None yet	The school receives community's appreciation The school has rare

Table 7: Contribution of Kethoprak to SDG 4

	preservation, protection, and utilisation of local cultural values		and excellent extra- curricular activities
Source of funds	Government school operational assistance fund Donation from a private partnership MoU with a promotional achievement contract during an art performance	None yet	IRCI FY 2021 Programme Other businesses in the form of profit funds from the sale of performing arts merchandise (t- shirts, performance video CDs, etc.)
Is there an improvement in the school's capacity for safeguarding efforts and instilling the values of character education in students?	Highly influential in capacity building, because Kethoprak lessons not only influence direct participants, but also those who watch the performance	None yet	Highly influential in capacity building, because Kethoprak lessons not only influence direct participants, but also those who watch the performance
Do you want Kethoprak lessons implemented in your child's school?	Schools continue to encourage students to participate in traditional art activities to develop it as a regular school event	Will repeat next year too	Schools continue to encourage students to participate in traditional art activities

#### B. The effect of Kethoprak lessons on other subjects

Kethoprak lessons contributed to SDG 4 in SD N 2 Trunuh and SD Krista Gracia elementary schools, positively influencing the respondents (students, teachers, society, etc.). This is revealed by the increase in the motivation and participation of students and positive changes in their mental capacity and character. They began communicating, socialising and self-expressing more and showed an appreciation of the teachings of local wisdom. Academic improvement is witnessed in arts and culture classes, regional languages, social sciences, history, and citizenship education.

Four subjects related to Kethoprak, as seen in respondents' semester report cards, include:

No	Subjects	Relation to the subject
1	Art and culture	Aesthetics, appreciation, creativity, innovation, preservation,
		and development.
		Kethoprak is a branch of this subject.
2	Javanese language	Because the language used in Kethoprak is Javanese
3	Social science and	Kethoprak portrays stories related to history and social order
	history	
4	Citizenship education	Kethoprak teaches the values of nationhood and character

Table 8: The effects of Kethoprak lessons on the other subjects

The table 9 below compares the impact of the implementation of Kethoprak in basic subject classes such as Culture and Arts, Javanese language, Social Sciences, History, and Civics and extra-curricular classes in schools. The scores of students at SD N 2 Trunuh in Semesters 1 and 2 were similar. It is different from the other two schools, where students who participate in Kethoprak activities have better scores. This means that extra-curricular Kethoprak lessons not only train students in acting, but also make a positive impact on related subjects. Improvement in learning in related subjects, as seen from the respondents' scores, is shown in the following table:

Description		Respondents (students)																								
Description		Case Study I (formal education)											Case Study II (non-formal education)													
School				SD K	rista Gra	acia						SD N 2	Trunuh				Dewi Fortuna CLC									
Respondent	RP.1.	RP.1.5 RP.1.7 RP.1.8		.1.5 RP.1.7		RP.1.7 RP.1		3	RP.1.9	P.1.9		RP. 2.1 RP		RP.2.6		RP.2.7		RP.2.9		2.	RP.3.4.		RP.3.6.		RP.3.10	
Code																										
Semester	1	2	1	2	1	2	1	2	1	2	1	2	1	2	1	2	1	2	1	2	1	2	1	2		
Art and	7,1	8,0	7,5	8,0	7,0	7,5	7,7	8,5	7,0	7,0	8,0	8,0	7,5	7,0	7,0	7,0	77	80	79	85	79	84	80	85		
culture																										
Local	7,5	8,5	8,0	8,0	7,2	7,5	8,2	8,7	7,0	7,0	7,5	7,5	6,9	6,9	7,0	7,0	80	88	81	85	82	87	79	87		
language																										
IPS history	7,0	7,5	7,5	8,0	7,5	8,0	7,5	8,0	8,2	8,2	7,0	6,8	7,0	7,0	7,5	7,5	81	85	80	86	80	86	80	84		
Citizenship	7,6	7,9	8,0	8,5	8,0	8,5	7,5	8,5	8,0	8,0	7,0	7,0	7,0	7,2	8,1	8,1	81	85	80	88	80	85	80	84		
education																										





#### C. The Influence of Kethoprak on learners' character

No	Attitude	Students' attitude example
1	Honesty	In practice, students admit their mistakes
2	Tolerance	<ol> <li>If someone commits a mistake, fellow students give an opportunity to repeat that part</li> <li>Students give time to each other to pray according to their religious teachings</li> </ol>
3	Discipline	Everyone is punctual for practice
4	Cooperation	<ol> <li>Kethoprak dialogues were memorised together</li> <li>The training ground was cleaned together</li> <li>The show was set up together</li> </ol>
5	Creativity	<ol> <li>Proposed exercises in open spaces and crowds to train mentally</li> <li>Change the text that is difficult for students to pronounce</li> <li>Improvise stage preparation according to students' understanding</li> </ol>
6	Independence	Self-study using YouTube, seeking family's advice, etc.
7	Democracy	Appreciate differences of opinion regarding stage layout
8	Patriotism	<ol> <li>Care about local folklore</li> <li>Practice and performance begin with singing the national anthem, <i>Indonesia Raya</i></li> </ol>
9	Appreciation	<ol> <li>Appreciate deeds of historical figures via Kethoprak</li> <li>Applause for friends' performances</li> </ol>
10	Communication	<ol> <li>All students can speak in public confidently</li> <li>If unaware about something, they ask freely</li> </ol>
11	Environmental care	<ol> <li>Prevent damage to the surrounding natural environment</li> <li>Care for plants around the place where Kethoprak practice was conducted</li> <li>Do not litter</li> </ol>
12	Social care	<ol> <li>Help friends in need</li> <li>Provide social service at local folklore sites whose stories were used for performances</li> <li>Donate to the poor (Avara stage)</li> </ol>
13	Responsibility	<ol> <li>Perform their role in Kethoprak lesson at school</li> <li>Receive punishment for and rectify mistakes</li> <li>Ask for additional private study hours, if required</li> </ol>

Table 10: The influence of Kethoprak on learners' character

Character education, as described above, has an important role in the sphere of education. Each subject must contribute to character education, and Kethoprak does so. Based on the results of the questionnaire survey conducted among 11 students of SD Negeri 2 Trunuh, 11 students of SD Krista Gracia, and 12 students of Dewi Fortuna CLC, the following table presents the character values acquired by students after participating in Kethoprak activities.

No	Character Values	SD N 2	SD Krista	Dewi Fortuna
		Trunuh	Gracia	CLC
1.	Religious	11	11	11
2.	Honesty	1	8	10
3.	Tolerance	9	11	12
4.	Discipline	3	8	10
5.	Cooperativeness	7	11	12
6.	Creativity	1	8	7
7.	Independence	3	7	8
8.	Democratic	5	9	7
9.	Curiosity	5	11	10
10.	Nationalistic	10	11	11
11.	Patriotic	11	11	12
12.	Appreciative of	11	11	12
	Achievements			
13.	Communicative	11	11	12
14.	Loves homeland	10	11	12
15.	Likes to Read	5	9	7
16.	Caring for the Environment	11	11	12
17.	Caring for the Society	10	11	12
18.	Responsibility	11	11	12

Table 11: Character values acquired by students

The table 11 reveals the difference in the number of respondents from schools that applyor do not applyKethoprak as an extra-curricular activity. SD Negeri 2 Trunuh does not apply it as an extra-curricular activity, and records a lower understanding of character than other schools, except for Religious, Loves the Homeland, Appreciative of Achievements, Communicative, Caring for the Environment, and Responsibility—these six values have the maximum number of respondents. However, for other values, SD Negeri 2 Trunuh has fewer respondents compared to the other two schools, which implies that Kethoprak has a positive impact on students' understanding and character development. Based on the results of the questionnaire survey and interviews with principals and teachers, a few examples of attitudes/characteristics acquired after participating in the Kethoprak class are shown below.

#### D. The contribution of Kethoprak to SDG 11

The contribution of the art of Kethoprak to SDG 11 can be gauged from the participation and involvement of the community in the preservation and development of Kethoprak, support for the communal work culture (evident from partnerships), and community involvement for skill development, funding, and promotion.

11 SUSTAINABLE CITIES AND COMMUNITIES	Case Study I		Case Study II
	SD Krista Gracia	SD N 2 Trunuh	Dewi Fortuna CLC
	Traditional art is		The community is helped
An impact on the	exposed to a wider		to promote the values of
community	audience		social care
environment	Preservation of		
because of learning	community folklore is		
Kethoprak	packaged in interesting		
	performances		
	Learn about traditional		Learn about traditional
	art forms		art forms
	Speak and write in	None yet	Speak and write in proper
	proper Javanese		Javanese
	Appreciate historical		Appreciate historical
In general, the goals	figures		figures
given to students	Obey social rules as		Obey social rules as
	citizens		citizens
	Recognise, understand,		Recognise, understand,
	and execute character		and execute character
	education based on		education based on local
	local culture		culture

## Table 12: Contribution of Kethoprak to SDG 11

#### E. Contributions to other SDGs

Contributions to other SDGs are more evident in the Dewi Fortuna CLC as shown in the following table.

SectorSector controlSector control											
The role of women can only be obtained from the economics and entrepreneurs ats industryKethoprak has taught a harmonious system of respecting and appreciating naturent of the emergence of education and arts communities, and other partiesincreased knowledge about the role of women in traditional Javanese artsThe multiplayer effect shows in the sale of food, drinks, etc.Develop a respecting natureEncourage the emergence of education and arts communities, and other parties involved in performingJavanese artsThe respecting of women in traditional javanese artsDevelop a respecting in the sale of food, drinks, etc.Encourage the emergence of education and arts communities and other participating multimediaCreate opportunities and increase employment, especially for thos reliant on traditional arts and craftsInnovate for performance for performance equipment of the area into a culturalEncourage the development of the area into a culturalEncourage the equipment of the area into a cultural	5 GENDER EQUALITY	8 DECENT WORK AND ECONOMIC GROWTH	9 INDUSTRY, INNOVATION AND INFRASTRUCTURE	15 UFE ON LAND							
tourism village	the role of women can only be obtained from the teachings of the story about the empress and the Javanese heroine Increased knowledge about the role of women in traditional	knowledge about economics and entrepreneurs hip based on local wisdom of the community The multiplayer effect shows people participating in the sale of food, drinks, etc. Create opportunities and increase employment, especially for those reliant on traditional	opportunities in the performing arts industry (makeup artist, lighting designer, videographer etc.) Develop a creative industry for traditional art performances that are packaged virtually/using multimedia Innovate for the provision of accessories for performance equipment Encourage the development of the area into a cultural	Kethoprak has taught a harmonious system of respecting and appreciating nature Encourage the emergence of education and arts communities and other parties involved in performing	nt of the emergence of education and arts communities, and other parties involved in performing						

## Table 13: Contribution of Kethoprak to other SDGs

#### F. Klaten community's response to the result of the study

The results of Case Studies I and II were discussed in a workshop. We needed to convey information and data about the contribution of Kethoprak in improving the quality of education and sustainable community development. Accordingly, we organised a Focus Discussion Group to review and exchange opinions and thoughts, by inviting experts, Kethoprak practitioners, educators, and other stakeholders including IRCI. The workshop was conducted on 4 November 2021 to obtain views and recommendations about research results. We plan to publish these results as a book.

At the opening ceremony, Chairperson of Dewi Fortuna CLC, Mr. Kristian Apriyanta presented a report on the research collaboration programme, which was followed by a research report by the Head of the research team, Mr. Krystiady, S.Sn, MA. Director General of IRCI, Mr. Iwamoto Wataru gave his speech via Zoom meeting, which was attended by other IRCI members. The workshop was inaugurated by the Regent of Klaten, Mrs. Hj. Sri Mulyani, who left written remarks to be read by the Head of the Culture, Tourism, Youth and Sports Office, Mr. Sri Nugroho, SIP, MM.

In the discussion section, participants expressed their concerns about the loss of values of local traditional arts due to the global influence. They hoped that this research will make policymakers pay attention to the art of Kethoprak as a means of strengthening the character of the youth and support for establishing Klaten as the City of Kethoprak Art through regulations. A brief summary of the discussion is given below.

- 1. Principal of SD Krista Gracia, Mrs. Sri Purwanti Juli, S.Pd, MM, stated that, if possible, further research would be conducted the following year, increasing the number of school samples as research objects to obtain more data.
- 2. Principal of SD N 2 Trunah, Mrs. Aris Pratiwi, S.Pd, MM, voiced the necessity to disseminate information about Kethoprak that is integrated in the curriculum with other academic subjects, so that the school budget for Kethoprak extra-curricular activities can be planned, because the main constraint is funding.
- 3. Mrs. Yati Pesek, a Kethoprak practitioner, expressed artisits' willingness to learn teaching methods, and visitschools to teach about the values of Kethoprak.
- 4. A formal schoolteacher shared suggestions about mastery of literary language and the local Javanese script, as many teachers do not know it. It is a problem to be solved together, because Kethoprak is Javanese, and it must be an integral part of Kethoprak teaching.
- 5. A non-formal schoolteacher, Mrs. Erlyna Widyastuti, stated that Kethoprak helped achieve community's empowerment and was useful in that sense. Additionally, the adult learning approach through art is highly effective and provides supplementary values. She also said that it would be good to open a non-formal education Javanese Art Class in Klaten, because its values are familiar to the community.
- 6. Lecturer at Widyadharma University, Dr. DB Putut Setiadi, M. Hum, asked the research team to pay attention to the rules of the scientific writing framework for research results, so that they can be published in scientific journals, and if necessary, publish a book with the results of this research.

- 7. Cultural figure Ki. Suwito Radyo, S.Kar, encouraged the Dewi Fortuna CLC to continue implementing Kethoprak art education programmes and establish wider partnerships to preserve ICH values to support education and social empowerment of the community. Such an education provides resources, knowledge, and creative skills to the community, which can be beneficial for the economy.
- 8. Principal of the non-formal school, Drs. M. Sulaiman, M.Miss, expressed the opinion that the preservation of Javanese literature and characters in dressmaking is paramount, as it is the main component of the art of Kethoprak. Additionally, Kethoprak has a philosophical meaning of its own ICH values, which is interesting to study to influence the students' character.
- 9. The Head of Jetis Village, Mr. Mulyono, SH, welcomed the initiative of Klaten City of Kethoprak, and hoped to soon revive Kethoprak in the community to strengthen the values of *gotong royong* (mutual assistance).
- 10. Mr. Djoko Sarjono, a journalist from the newspaper 'Media Indonesia' and Mrs. Sri Warsiti from the newspaper 'Kedaulatan Rakyat' expressed hope that the Klaten legal basis for 'Kethoprak City' would soon be issued, and that it would provide many benefits for sustainable community development based on ICH values. It can be achieved by accelerating the Cultural Friendly Village Programme, which requires the village government to issue Village Regulations on Preservation, Management, and Utilization of ICH in the village.
- 11. Chairman of the Klaten Arts Council, Mr. FX Setyawan, DS, SH, MH, MM encouraged villages to protect and promote local art forms through the Village Regulation on Promoting Village Cultural Arts, especially Kethoprak, which is almost extinct, because it has educational, participatory, and creative economic effects.
- 12. Village Cultural, Mr. Anshori hoped for real results of the focus group discussion that will encourage the Regional Development Planning Agency together with Regional Apparatus Organizations and institutions to form a Klaten Declaration Study Team for the City of Kethoprak 2022.
- 13. Kethoprak art sponsor, entrepreneur, and founder of the Klaten Student Kethoprak Festival, Mr. Edy Sulsityanto (owner of Amogo Group) suggested that the Student Kethoprak Festival for Elementary Schools, Senior High Schools, and Middle Schools can be held again after the COVID-19 pandemic and opined that the government or the Arts Council can take over the implementation of activities next year.

#### **VII. SUGGESTION FOR FUTURE ACTIVITIES**

What can be done for the development of interest and better learning in the future research:

- 1. Increase objects of research for Case study II to obtain more data and strengthen the validity of research.
- 2. Conduct in-depth research about the contribution of Kethoprak to other SDGs to prove the positive impact of ICH.
#### **VIII. CONCLUSION**

ICH—an important cultural identity factor—plays a significant role in national and international development in this era of globalisation. Kethoprak and cultural values are threatened by global cultural standardisation. This threat can be immediately overcome through the integration of education with culture by all parties, and community development based on the *meyu hayuning*, which includes many positive values for leading a better life.

# Appendix 3. Case Study Report: Kyrgyzstan



Section cover photo: Sary-Mogol ethnographic museum, entrance, Kyrgyzstan ©Taalim-Forum THE EVOLVING ROLE OF COMMUNITY MUSEUMS IN SAFEGUARDING OF INTANGIBLE CULTURAL HERITAGE: CASE-STUDIES FROM KYRGYZSTAN



## **TABLE OF CONTENTS**

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS	3
INTRODUCTION	4
1. PURPOSE, CONCEPTUAL FRAMEWORK, AND METHODOLOGY OF THE RESEARCH	6
2. THE RESEARCH FOCUS AND TARGET ICH ELEMENTS	12
3. TARGET COMMUNITIES AND RESEARCH ACTIVITIES	14
a. Case study 1. Living museum "Salbuurun" in Bokonbaev village	
b. Case study 2. Ethnographical Community Museum in Sary Mogol village	
c. Case study 3. Community museum "Koshoi-Korgon Fortress"	
FINDINGS AND ANALYSIS	
SUGGESTIONS FOR FUTURE RESEARCH	31
LIST OF LITERATURE	35
Photo credits	36
Annex 1. The questionnaire	37
Annex 2. The international conference	38
	39

## ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

"Taalim-Forum" Public Foundation expresses deep gratitude to the International Research Centre for Intangible Cultural Heritage in the Asia-Pacific Region (IRCI) for the financial support, the opportunity to conduct research (case studies) within the framework of the project 'Research on ICH Contribution to SDGs – Education and Community Development', and the valuable feedback and opportunity to present the research on the International Symposium (online).

We express our gratitude to Dr. Nurgul Ukueva, vice president of the American University of Central Asia (AUCA), and Dr. Cholpon Turdalieva, Head of the Department of Anthropology, Technology, and International Development—for their partnership support in organizing and participating in the international conference on 'Safeguarding of the Intangible Cultural Heritage through Education', which was held within the framework of the research project at AUCA.

We are grateful to the experts and consultants from Kyrgyzstan and Kazakhstan, AUCA faculty members, leaders of public and community organizations, and cultural practitioners for their active participation in the conference.

We express our gratitude to Aidai Asangulova, director of the 'Kiyiz Duino' public foundation, Almaz Akunov, leader of the 'Salbuurun Federation', and Jyldyz Asanakunova, director of the ethno-complex of 'Almaluu' yurt village, for their valuable insights on the research issues and providing the necessary information and photographic materials.

We are thankful to our translator Aibek Samakov and our photographer Ilias Nurmambetov for their valuable contributions in the implementation of the research project.

#### **Research group:**

Aida Alymova, PhD, Museum Expert

Jyldyz Doolbekova, PhD, BCD Expert

Almagul Osmonova, Director of Taalim-Forum Public Foundation, MSc in Holistic Science

### INTRODUCTION

Safeguarding of the intangible cultural heritage in the UNESCO Convention (2003) includes not only measures such as "identification, documentation, research, preservation, protection, promotion, transmission, particularly through formal and non-formal education", but also "the revitalization of various aspects of such heritage"<sup>1</sup>.

In the first year of research in Kyrgyzstan in 2020, we focused on visionary communities in rural areas and the bearers of traditional knowledge, who put in a lot of effort to revive the nomadic yurt and related culture, including yurt-making, felt-making, and weaving. The study on the nomadic yurt is multi-layered and closely intertwined with traditional ecological knowledge, customs, and rituals that helped the Kyrgyz people sustain themselves. During the field trips, we recognised a strong leadership in the visionary communities concerning ICH safeguarding, which found the cultural expression to establish their own community museums. The initiatives to open community museums did indeed inspire the next step of the study. Therefore, the second phase of the research, conducted in 2021, focused on studying three small local community museums and their role in preserving ICH.

Evidently, the current ways to safeguard cultural heritage require revision and rethinking. Local museums can play an important role in the process of transferring cultural heritage to subsequent generations. In the modern world, museums, as socio-cultural institutions, are undergoing profound changes<sup>2</sup> due to complex economic, political, and cultural transformations. Further, museums' challenges include searching for a new identity and ensuring survival under the threat of pandemic. Museums, whose contemporary role is expanding, fulfil a variety of new roles in areas such as the well-being of local communities, access to education, sustainable development of regions, achievement of gender equality, and preservation of bio-cultural diversity. UNESCO and the International Council of Museums (ICOM) are concerned about the status of museums worldwide. According to the ICOM, more than 90% of museums worldwide were forced to close during the pandemic in 2020<sup>3</sup>. According to UNESCO forecasts, 13% of museums worldwide may never reopen.

Museums have become important in the process of transferring and updating cultural heritage as they contribute to the preservation of the cultural identity of the Kyrgyz people. In Kyrgyzstan, despite the challenges associated with the COVID-19 pandemic and the socio-economic difficulties in recent years, there has been an increase in the number of museums. According to the data of the Ministry of Culture of the Kyrgyz Republic, over the years following the independence of the country (since 1991), the number of museums has increased by 30. In total, 62 state museums and about 100 museums of various profiles have been registered in the country<sup>4</sup>, including public, departmental, university, school, private, and community museums.

The present report is a continuation of the previous research on the ICH element—the Kyrgyz yurt and related knowledge, skills, and traditions: making of the original nomad house, felt carpets, and patterned weavings and transferring the ICH to younger generations. The research group studied four 'visionary' local communities, which play an active role in the revival and safeguarding of the cultural heritage and values intrinsically linked to the nomadic lifestyle. The research

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup><u>https://www.un.org/ru/documents/decl\_conv/conventions/cultural\_heritage\_conv.shtml</u>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> Imennova L.S. Museum in the socio-cultural system of society: Mission, trends, prospects. Dissertation abstract. Moscow, 2012.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> https://ru.unesco.org/news/covid-19-yunesko-i-ikom-obespokoeny-polozheniem-muzeev-v-mire

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup> <u>http://mkit.gov.kg/museum-business/</u>

demonstrated the significant impact of the visionary communities in integrating ICH into modern everyday life, thus maintaining ICH as a 'living culture' for engaging and educating the youth.

During the first phase of the research in the selected communities, the inspiring initiatives to establish community museums were observed. Community museums have a potential to engage local communities and collaborate with traditional knowledge bearers and local people for whom traditional knowledge is still relevant and holds spiritual and cultural significance. The primary research hypothesis is that communities, harnessing innovations, and co-creating knowledge with traditional knowledge bearers, local craftsmen, women, and youth leaders.

## 1. PURPOSE, CONCEPTUAL FRAMEWORK, AND METHODOLOGY OF THE RESEARCH

This **research is focused** on studying the initiatives of community museums, which are a result of the efforts of local communities. The **purpose** of the study is to explore and comprehend the experiences and roles of three community museums in the safeguarding of the ICH and development of the respective regions.

The creators of these museums represent the active members of the local community, who are sensitive to issues such as finding and maintaining their unique identity and protecting and expressing their ancestral cultural heritage. In a traditional society, leaders or elders, whose opinions are typically recognized and respected by a majority of the inhabitants, act as local experts in their community, clan, area, or region.

This study attempted to find answers to the following questions: 'How can public museums help preserve cultural heritage? 'To this end, what strategies can be adopted?', 'How must the venues—for displaying traditional knowledge, skills, and customs—be organised in museums?', and 'What skills and competencies are museum workers required to acquire and develop to preserve the living heritage?'

Based on the study of the experience of museums initiated and founded by the representatives of local communities, considering their role in the safeguarding of the cultural heritage and development of the region, three public museums, located in the Issyk-Kul, Naryn, and Osh regions of Kyrgyzstan, were selected for a detailed study.

In the selected museums, community residents collected materials representing the local cultural heritage, which reflects the identity specific to the region, place, and community. Notably, all the museums studied in the research were established relatively recently—that is, in the post-independence period, when the process of active formation and revival of the national identity of the Kyrgyz people commenced.

The research **methodology** is based on a participatory approach, which implies that the local communities should be active participants in the ICH safeguarding process. Involvement of the local communities in research and ICH safeguarding contributes to the following processes:

(1) Raising awareness of the local community about the values and significance of local cultural heritage; (2) meeting the need for the safeguarding of the local cultural heritage; (3) raising a sense of pride in safeguarding ICH and its transmission to subsequent generations; (4) strengthening the emotional attachment of communities to the places of residence; (5) participating in the management of heritage with the acquisition of new knowledge—including the rules and procedures of museum work—and in the monitoring and identification of risks, problems, and opportunities; (6) using cultural heritage for the sustainable development of their region and cultural development of local communities.

The research group participated in a Forum on Museums: 'Sustainable Museum as a Driver of Regional Development'. The Forum was held at a regional museum called 'Center of Nomadic Civilization', which is named after Kurmanzhan Datka and is located in the Chon Sary Oy village, Issyk-Kul region. The purpose of the Forum was to strengthen the role of museums as independent social and cultural institutions. The Forum discussions addressed the creation of sustainable models of museums, consolidation of networks of museums in the country, and supporting initiatives that involve local communities and improve the quality of life. Through

participation in the forum, the research group received an opportunity to closely communicate with the participants, administer a questionnaire survey, and conduct focus group discussions.



#### The field research included the following actions:

- 1) Study and exploration of the following three community museums:
  - Museum 'Salbuurun' located in Bokonbaev village, Issyk-Kul region.
  - Ethnographic Museum located in Sary-Mogol village, Osh region (virtually); and
  - Museum 'Fortress Koshoy-Korgon' located in the Kara Suu village, Naryn region.
- 2) Eight in-depth interviews with initiators, founders and employees of the museums, representatives of local authorities, and teachers at local schools.
- 3) Three focus-group discussions with museum experts and employees of national, regional, and community museums.
- 4) Questionnaire survey of the employees of regional and community museums.
- 5) An international conference on 'Safeguarding of the Intangible Cultural Heritage through Education'.



#### In-depth interviews

In-depth interviews were conducted with the initiators and founders of the local community museums, a museum employee, a representative of the local authority, and the teachers of local schools. These interviewees provided us the opportunity to listen to their stories and learn about how the idea of creating a museum was born, how the members of the local community helped to collect exhibits, which NGOs supported their organisation and management efforts, what difficulties they faced in their work, and what efforts have been exerted to preserve ICH and relay its importance to the youth, women, and society in general. The interview responses formed the foundation of the findings and analysis of this report.

#### Focus group discussions

Discussions were held with three focus groups, comprising 10–12 people each with the participation of museum professionals from different regions, as well as experts in the field of culture and cultural heritage. The following questions were asked in the focus group discussions:

- 1) What are the most effective ways to preserve and promote ICH through the work of museums?
- 2) How do the local museums involve the communities in ICH safeguarding? How can this work be enhanced?
- 3) What educational initiatives and implementation strategies—for children, youth, and local residents—do local museums use, and what else can be developed in this direction for the transmission of ICH?



The panellists noted that the protection of ICH can contribute towards the sustainable socioeconomic development of the region by enhancing the region's conduciveness for tourism. Sustainable development of the region, in turn, can contribute towards the vitality of ICH and the communities that preserve them. Developing crafts, encouraging craftsmanship in yurt-making, making felt carpets, organising festivals, celebrating traditional holidays, and performing traditional rituals engage the local population and enhance the value of ICH for the social and cultural well-being of communities.



The participants provided examples wherein the involvement of community members in the museums' cultural and educational programs enhanced community relations among its members and improved interactions with the local authorities.

Regarding the difficulties faced, museum employees noted a lack of conceptual vision and knowledge, which is required to develop their museums and highlight the originality and uniqueness of the landscapes and localities, traditions, and rituals associated with the historical and cultural sites. This situation is influenced by museum employees' low salaries (average salaries range from \$ 40 to \$ 60 per month), low motivation to learn new things, and inadequate qualifications.



#### The questionnaire surveys

A total of 28 museum employees participated in the survey. The questionnaire survey (Appendix 1) showed that museum workers are aware of the difference between ICH and the elements of cultural and natural heritage. However, simultaneously, they do not comprehend which elements from Kyrgyzstan were included in the UNESCO Intangible Cultural Heritage List. Thus, of the respondents, approximately 40% mistakenly attributed the Sulaiman-To Mountain in the city of Osh to the ICH, while 50% indicated being ill-equipped with the traditional knowledge and methods for making Kyrgyz and Kazakh yurts. Such examples indicate the need to strengthen the efforts of museum employees, who should raise their awareness of the following: UNESCO's world heritages; the cultural, natural, and intangible cultural heritages of Kyrgyzstan; and the methods and implementation strategies needed for ICH preservation.



As for the assistance needed for a better promotion of ICH by museums, an overwhelming majority (95%) indicated that they needed financial support. While 82% indicated that they

needed help in developing the vision, concepts, and understanding of ICH, and the role of museums in the safeguarding of the ICH, 79% indicated that they needed methodological and information assistance in educational programs.

# The international conference on 'Safeguarding of the Intangible Cultural Heritage through Education'

The International Conference was devoted to discussing the protection of the ICH in Kyrgyzstan through formal and non-formal education and research, was organized in partnership with the American University of Central Asia (AUCA). IRCI representatives participated online. During the conference, the participants, including researchers and ICH experts from Kyrgyzstan and Kazakhstan, AUCA students, representatives of local and public museums, UNESCO's national secretariat in the Kyrgyz Republic, and the practitioners of traditional culture exchanged their views and thoughts. During the presentations, the speakers highlighted the COVID-19 pandemic's negative impact: on the protection of the ICH and the exacerbation of intersected social, political, and environmental problems. They also emphasized the importance of cooperation between the experts of traditional knowledge noted that it is important to support local communities, which play a primary role in safeguarding ICH. Three thematic studies on community museums demonstrated that they could contribute towards the protection of ICH and play the role of drivers in regional development *(more details about the Conference are provided in Appendix 2).* 



# 2. THE RESEARCH FOCUS AND TARGET ICH ELEMENTS

The research focused on the social issues related to ensuring quality and access to education (SDG 4) and the sustainable development of the regions (SDG 11). According to National Statistics data, 66% of the country's population lives in rural areas<sup>5</sup>—wherein the primary occupation is animal husbandry—with limited opportunities for other economic activities. In 2019, 73.8% of the poor population of Kyrgyzstan lived in rural areas<sup>6</sup>.

The global crisis caused by the COVID-19 pandemic continues to affect all the areas of life, worsening the socio-economic situation of the local communities. According to the UNDP-ADB report<sup>7</sup> 'COVID-19 in the Kyrgyz Republic: Socioeconomic and Vulnerability Impact Assessment and Policy Response', the lockdowns affected the markets, which affected farm sales, in particular the sales of livestock. The closure of borders, suspension of international flights, and decrease in the income of the population have led to a significant drop in the demand for tourism services in Kyrgyzstan. The pandemic has far-reaching implications—limited access to quality education, a negative impact on the socio-economic development of local communities, and reduced opportunities to escape poverty.

The research group supports the idea that cultural heritage, as a powerful economic and social resource, has the potential to accelerate local development via employment, income generation, resilience, and environmental protection in the local communities. Another important factor in poverty reduction is the access to education. In the long term, in the absence of quality education and the acquisition of the necessary skills and knowledge, children from poor families will not be in a position to reach their full potential, get a job, and escape the trap of poverty.

The target ICH elements for the research are a nomadic yurt and the associated system of accumulated knowledge, skills and practices, and rituals and traditions. These elements were developed during the process of adapting to natural and climatic conditions, which helped in maintaining the ecological balance throughout the entire historical development and served as a fundamental factor in ensuring the well-being and cohesion of the Kyrgyz people. Kyrgyz cultural values and heritage are inextricably linked with the nomadic way of life. However, the forced transition to a sedentary lifestyle in the Soviet era—and the subsequent transition to a market economy after independence (1991) led to a decrease in the role and loss of the deepest cultural values, the values of the nomadic yurt, and the entire range of associated knowledge, practices, and skills. In everyday life, the yurt is only used during special occasions—such as holidays or funerals—and to showcase the traditional culture in exhibitions and museums.

During the Soviet period of the history of Kyrgyzstan, the cultural and spiritual heritages started to lose their symbolism and use in everyday life. They became an element of the fragmentary demonstration of the nomadic culture. With Kyrgyzstan gaining independence and the revival of the traditional culture, the lost values are gradually returning and their paramount importance for the well-being and sustainable development of local communities is being actualized.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>5</sup> Annual demographic report of the Kyrgyz Republic. 2015-2019: <u>http://www.stat.kg/ru/publications/demograficheskij-</u>ezhegodnik-kyrgyzskoj-respubliki/

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>6</sup> The level of poverty of the population of Kyrgyz Republic in 2019: <u>http://www.stat.kg/ru/publications/uroven-bednosti-v-kyrgyzskoj-respublike/</u>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>7</sup> <u>https://www.adb.org/sites/default/files/institutional-document/626021/covid-19-kgz-socioeconomic-vulnerability-impact.pdf</u>

These issues were addressed during the discussions organised at the international conference held in Bishkek with the participation of ICH researchers and experts from Kyrgyzstan and Kazakhstan, university professors and students, representatives of local and public museums, the National Commission for UNESCO in the Kyrgyz Republic, and practitioners of traditional culture. The participants exchanged their views and thoughts on protecting ICH in Kyrgyzstan, with a focus on the yurt and related knowledge and skills. The speakers highlighted the importance of the collaboration between traditional knowledge holders and academic researchers to enhance ICH research, and to enhance the ability of individuals and communities to update, preserve, and transmit traditional knowledge and culture to subsequent generations. The case studies of public museums were presented to and discussed with the conference participants.

These case studies emphasised on the importance of collaborations between traditional knowledge holders and academic researchers to strengthen the research on ICH and the ability of people and the community to actualize, safeguard, and transmit traditional knowledge and culture. The case studies on community museums have demonstrated that they can contribute to ICH safeguarding and to become drivers for community development. The participants have highlighted the internal and external threats to ICH safeguarding with respect to the intersected social, political, and environmental issues aggravated by the COVID-19 pandemic.

# 3. TARGET COMMUNITIES AND RESEARCH ACTIVITIES

#### CASE-STUDY 1. Living Museum "SALBUURUN" in Bokonbaev village, Issyk-Kul region

#### Background information

The Bokonbaev village is located in a valley at an altitude of 1800 m above sea level. As per the information received from the local self-government, the total population of the village is 10 450 people. Grazing livestock, growing fruits, and tourism are the backbone of the village's local economy and livelihood.

In this village, located on the shore of the sacred picturesque Issyk-Kul Lake in the north of Kyrgyzstan, one can still encounter fairy tales, legends, stories, practiced traditions, rituals and ceremonies, skills, and techniques to observe nature, and methods to communicate with birds of prey based on a knowledge of ancestors.



Almaz Akunov, the charismatic local leader, practitioner, and bearer of traditional knowledge, has enormous energy and passion for traditional culture. He united the falconers from all over Kyrgyzstan and created the Federation called "Sabuurun" with the aim of reviving the culture associated with traditional Kyrgyz hunting.

The interview with Almaz Akunov, president of the 'Salbuurun' Federation, revealed that, currently, more than 30 families (about 50–60 people) in the village keep and raise hunting birds and *taigans* (Kyrgyz aboriginal breed of dogs). Of these people, 85% of them are adolescents and young people (12–26 years) and 15% are older adults (40–60 years).

The federation has worked hard to revive the art of training golden eagles, archery, and traditional hunting with birds of prey, dogs, and horses: This complex of knowledge and skills is known as 'Salbuurun' among the local communities. In recent years, Salbuurun's performance and progress towards its long-term vision of development have included organising festivals throughout the country and establishing 'Salbuurunchi Mektebi' (Falconry School), which provides foundational learning to inspire and create conditions conducive to learn about nature, the worldview and philosophy of the ancestors, and cultural values and practices.

#### Stories from Sary Ata



Sary Ata was a keeper of traditional hunting knowledge. For numerous years, he was the oldest member of the Federation and a master trainer of the Salbuurun community. He passed away at the age of 87, and even until his last days, he continued being a master-trainer for young falconers. Here is what he used to say to the younger hunters.

"In the ancient time, murdering a berkut (the golden eagle) would be akin to depriving the life of a jigit (a brave young man who has mastered the art of riding horses and arms). The bird was never held in captivity for more than 10 years, following which it was released into freedom with gratitude. Berkutchi (falconer) first watched the bird's parents in the wild in order to choose his own bird. The father, having given the son an eaglet, hoped he would acquire the qualities of his future companion — strength, dexterity, and a sharp eye. Raising and training a bird of prey for hunting requires incredible patience, perseverance, kindness, and sensitivity. The secrets of bird hunting training are carefully guarded; love and respect for the bird was passed from father to son."



#### The idea of starting a museum

Throughout his life, Almaz Akunov has been actively collecting artefacts. His personal interest and love for the nomadic culture and spiritual and cultural values—along with the support of likeminded people, partners, and members of the local community—led to the inception of the idea to create and open the *Salbuurun Community Museum*.

The first museum exhibits included artefacts of ancient hunters' ammunition, including the hood of the golden eagle of the outstanding *Manaschi* (narrator), Sagymbai Orozbakov, of the *Manas* epic, which was included in the UNESCO list of masterpieces of the Intangible Cultural Heritage of Humanity in 2013. On the day when the research group visited and interviewed Almaz Akunov, a truck carrying an old yurt arrived (about 100 years old), which the descendants of the family donated to the museum. This was a clear example of how local residents trust things of familial value to Almaz.

#### Search for a solution

The Salbuurun Community Museum is a living museum, wherein significant efforts are being exerted to revive the Salbuurun culture in the context of the modern society. Thus, the created museum is not only a place for storing objects of material culture, but also a place for presenting tangible and intangible cultural heritages in their natural-historical-cultural environment by preserving and renewing their functions. Another important objective of the Salbuurun Museum is to ensure continuity between generations, knowledge transfer, and the cultivation of new holders of traditional knowledge in falconry.



#### Exposition of the museum

The Salbuurun Community Museum was founded and opened in 2018. The museum contains not only an exposition of the items related to falconry and the life of nomads, but also an educational centre for the young generation interested in the traditions of falconry and breeding and training of indigenous hunting dogs, the taigans.



The museum exposition is housed in a traditional yurt that has a diameter of 7.5 meters. The collection contains numerous interesting materials and unique antiques. While the figure for the volume of the collection is not exact, the number of exhibits is about 500 items. Here, we see difficulties in understanding the issue of a correct museum inventory. In this regard, there is an agreement on the provision of the necessary assistance from the Centre for Nomadic Civilization, which will conduct training on the registration and inventory of museum collection and the creation of stock documentation with the participation of museum specialists. The equipment of the museum is presented only partially. While there are several display cases, most items are kept in open storage. A large number of items in the museum can be touched and held, such as ancient hunting rifles.

#### The audience

The audience of the museum mainly comprises young people and adolescents, including women, all of whom are passionate about traditional hunting or strive to master the skills of taming hunting birds and dogs, or archery. Among the regular visitors of the museum are local and foreign tourists, researchers, and museum workers. The visitors are often greeted by the founder Almaz Akunov himself, who speaks to the visitors about the museum and its collection. Additionally, a master class on preparing the birds of prey for hunting and archery can be organized for the visitors. The entrance to the museum is free.



"Our museum is presented in the form of an ethno-complex, it serves both as an information centre and as a school. We can show and tell visitors about the real hunting dog "taigan," how to tame and keep a golden eagle, and how to shoot a bow. In the modern world, with the spread of the globalization process, young people are losing their identity. We must not allow this to happen. It has already become a custom among the nomads that our traditional knowledge has always been passed orally. First, I opened such a school here in Bokonbaev village. And now, in other regions, they are adopting my experience and creating educational centres where they talk about and clearly show what Salbuurun is."

Almaz Akunov, President of the 'Salbuurun' Federation



A great contribution of Almaz Akunov is that *'Salbuurun'*, which includes falconry, archery (sometimes horseback archery), and hunting with *taigan* (an aboriginal breed of hunting dog), is one of the disciplines of the World Nomad Games. He also initiated the establishment of a network of educational centres for *Salbuurun* supporters and followers.

"I had an idea of various international rules and assessment methodologies. Based on these concepts, I managed to come up with a systematic approach for the 'Salbuurun' games, in order to develop competitions where golden eagles and taigans compete in speed and horse riders compete in archery to shoot accurately at targets. It turned out to be a spectacular event, and our young people are proud of it."

Almaz Akunov, President of the 'Salbuurun' Federation



The Kyrgyz society was excited by the news that UNESCO included the nomination 'Nomad Games: rediscovering heritage, celebrating diversity' in the list of Resister of Good Safeguarding Intergovernmental Committee for the Safeguarding of the Intangible Cultural Heritage<sup>8</sup>. 'Nomad Games: rediscovering heritage, celebrating diversity' is the Kyrgyzstan's first nomination in this list.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>8</sup> <u>https://mfa.gov.kg/en/Main-menu/Press-service/novosti/Kyrgyzstan-elected-to-the-Assessment-body-of-the-UNESCO-Intergovernmental-Committee-for-the-Safeguarding-of-the-Intangible-Cultural-Heritage</u>

#### CASE-STUDY 2. Ethnographical Community museum in Sary Mogol village

#### **Background information**

Sary-Mogol village is located in a high-altitude mountainous area in the south of Kyrgyzstan, in Chon-Alai district, Osh region. As per the local government information, the village is home to 5257 people and 1035 households. Women comprise approximately 40% of the village population, of which approximately 20% are engaged in traditional handicrafts. The village has 22707 hectares of pastures. Approximately 80% of the households in the village keep livestock. The income from the sale of livestock accounts for approximately 60% of the family budget. During harsh climatic conditions, local people only grow a few crops. One of the sources of income is the trade in traditional handicraft products for the tourists and climbers visiting these attractive natural sites. The infrastructure in the region is not well developed.

Sary-Mogol village is surrounded by mountains and located in harsh climatic conditions. At the same time, it has preserved the culture of its ancestors, which attracts ethnographers and historians to study about such a place. During the 'Great Game', held at the beginning of the twentieth century, numerous travellers and researchers, as a part of military reconnaissance expeditions, penetrated the bordering areas of East and West Turkestan. They ended up documenting the strategic objects and natural landscapes of the Pamirs. In the travel notes, we find materials suggesting that the vast Alay Valley and Sary-Mogol pass (height 4303 m) were important routes<sup>9</sup>. The river bearing the same name, Sary-Mogol, flows in the valley. This river, together with the other rivers of the Trans-Alai ridge, creates the beginning of the largest river in Central Asia—the Amu Darya. The local residents believe that the name of the village is associated with the abundance of large stones called 'molo' in the area. According to another version, this name began to be used following the conquest of the lands by the Mongols and the rule in the Alai Valley of the 'Sary Mongol' ('sary' means 'yellow, red'). In this area, there are short cool summers and early severe winters with frosts down to -30°C. The route for conquering Lenin Peak passes through Sary-Mogol village; hence, a number of tourists visit this place during the respective season. The year 2020 became an exception due to the COVID-19 pandemic.

#### The idea of starting a museum

The promotion of the ideas of preserving the historical and cultural values of the local population and their national identity contributed to a more conscious manifestation of the original culture, which found expression in the creation of the local Ethnographic Museum through the efforts and resources of the inhabitants of the village of Sary-Mogol.



<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>9</sup> https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Alay\_Valley

The founder of the community museum, Termechikova Buunisa, is the bearer of traditional handicraft knowledge and the founder of a local public organization called 'Uuz Datkalar' ('Craftswomen'). Craftswoman Buunisa not only creates unique products and engages in traditional crafts, such as weaving, embroidery and felting, but also enjoys collecting antiques, including household items, traditional utensils, and clothing. The difficulty in collecting exhibits for the museum was that local beliefs required almost all things to be burned following the death of an elder relative. Initially, the villagers were suspicious of the idea of collecting things and creating a museum; gradually this idea became interesting and was supported by an increasing number of people. Following the announcement of the opening of a museum in their village, local residents started to bring varied things to Buunisa from their homes, many of which have been restored and put on display. In total, about 500 items were collected this way.



The museum building has been renovated and equipped with the help of Buunisa's children. It was an old house built by their grandfather in 1962. It is located on one of the first streets of the village, called 'Tunguch' (first). Efforts have been put to draw attention towards the architecture of the building—buildings of the Pamir type with a flat roof and small rooms. Traditionally, in such houses, in order to keep warm, utility rooms were attached to the living rooms. Since there are almost no trees in this area, large stones (i.e., boulders) were laid at the base of the foundation and walls were erected from homemade clay bricks. Thus, the building of the museum itself is also of interest for the research on the study of adobe buildings in the highlands.

The history of the building, which houses the museum exposition, is interesting. The parental house of Tashkulovs' family at an altitude of 3200 meters was built in the middle of the 20th century, when the head of the Tashkul family moved from Murghab (Tajikistan) to Alai Valley along with his wife. These small three rooms (*'kurzhun uy'*) hold the stories of all the Tashkulovs who grew up in this house. The daughter of Buunisa, Tashkulova Sharipa, is a researcher and handicraft designer. Sharipa grew up on the stories and legends about the ancestors of this area, and absorbed the skills of traditional craft. Right from her childhood, she knew how to embroider ornaments, create patterns, and work with wool. A woollen thread for her is like a link between generations, and a pattern represents the wisdom of her ancestors. Ethnographers emphasise that, for the residents of highland areas, handicraft is not just a craft, but a multifaceted complex of socio-cultural relations. It is a way of life and a way of self-expression conveyed through the creation of patterns, ornaments, and products.

"This is an old house built by my father-in-law. We did not want to destroy it because in this house, he was not only born and but also raised six of my husband's brothers and their children and grandchildren. Therefore, we had this idea of creating a museum in this house as a memory of our parents. I really wanted to show old items, things that are not used now and have lost their purpose. Many types of craft are also forgotten, so I want to pass on my skills to the young generations through the master classes that we provide here. I hope the museum will be of interest to both our villagers and tourists."

Buunisa Termechikova, founder of the museum

#### Search for a solution

The opening of the museum was possible with the assistance of the Institute for Sustainable Development Strategy Public Foundation (more about ISDS: <a href="http://www.isds.kg">http://www.isds.kg</a>) and the International Donor Organisation for the Support of Biocultural Diversity, the Christensen Fund (USA). With the support of ISDS, Baktygul Midinova, an experienced museum expert, was invited to help in the development of the design and the concept of the museum exposition; she also developed a program for working with the visitors. The museum opened in 2019 and became an important event in the life of the local community. The building itself is a typical traditional house. A small rural museum provided a new impetus to the family home and joined the surrounding space with a renewed quality. In this context, the museum acts as a tool for preserving the ethnographic heritage of the Kyrgyz people, as a 'keeper of collective memory', and also reflects historical periods, bringing out the continuity of cultural values. This museum not only presents the past history, but also creates an opportunity to get acquainted with the objects of arts and crafts and fine arts.



"For the first time in the history of our village, a museum has opened. Our goal is to understand the value of our traditions, to preserve and strengthen the great heritage that is now preserved in this home. I think that by creating a museum, we turn our attention to our history and contribute to the revival of cultural heritage. This is a tribute to my parents, brothers, and sisters who helped me a lot! May the spirit of my grandparents bless us and support our initiatives that will bring benefit to the community as a whole!"

#### Sharipa Tashkulova, handicraft designer

#### Exposition of the Museum

The exhibition of the museum presents several familial valuables--old carpets, elaborately embroidered wall hangings (*tush kiyiz*), felt carpets (*shyrdaks*), clothes, and other household items. Notably, the local community played an important role in the gathering of the museum collection and providing antiques for the museum's exposition. At the museum site, a trading platform has been created for the sale of souvenirs and handicrafts made by local residents.



Among the main exhibits of the museum are household items (dishes, carpets, and tools), horse harness, photographs of different years, familial valuables, reconstructed national clothes of southern Kyrgyzstan, and headdresses. The volume of the museum collection is 250 items. The main audiences of the museum are local residents, tourists, keepers of traditional crafts, and students. The museum forms the basis of the educational programs, which include master classes in spinning and weaving, and lectures on biocultural diversity for the local inhabitants. While an entrance fee is charged to visit the museum (there is an approved price list), it is a nominal amount. The opening hours of the museum vary depending on the season.



One of the rooms of the museum is equipped for conducting workshops and training in traditional crafts. The children, mostly girls, find this room interesting. This format of work instigated the idea of organizing a 'living museum', wherein a museum becomes a place of dialogue and joint events, engages people, and is enriched with new ideas. The museum started its education programme in partnership with local organizations. Since the start of the museum, as a part of the educational programme, five experts held master classes on local history, museology, place-based writing, tailoring of national clothes and learning to combine traditional and modern design, and taking photographs and publishing information about their village on social networks. With regard to this, there were reports by national and local TV channels, and articles written in national and regional newspapers.

#### Case-study 3. Community museum "Koshoi-Korgon Fortress"

#### **Background information**

'Koshoi-Korgon Fortress', the community museum, is located near Kara-Suu village in the At-Bashy district. It has a population of 6617 people<sup>10</sup>. Beautiful mountainous areas in the north of Kyrgyzstan are a part of the mountain system of the Inner Tien Shan. For several centuries, the main trade route, the Great Silk Road, passed through this place. In the village of Kara-Suu of the At-Bashy region, the ruins of the Koshoi-Korgon fortress, the ancient settlement of the 7th–12th centuries, have still been preserved<sup>11</sup>. The ancient city was mentioned in historical records as the largest trade centre, the inhabitants of which, in addition to trade, were engaged in handicrafts and animal husbandry. On the territory of the fortress, the remains of dwellings, deep pits of ovens for baking bricks have been preserved. The fortress was built in the form of a sharp rectangular shape, having an area of 245x250 metres. As per other sources, the length of the fortress was more than one kilometre. As per archaeological research, this fortress served as the control centre for all of Turkestan during the reign of the Turkic Khaganate. In the 10th–12th centuries, it served an army fortress, which held not only soldiers, but also all the weapons of the army. Later, the fortress served as the Caravanserai of the Great Silk Road. At one time, the height of the walls scaled up to 10 metres; however, today, you can only see the crumbling remains of the fortress<sup>12</sup>.



#### The idea of starting a museum

Koshoi-Korgon fortress is a unique historical monument of the archaeological heritage of the inner Tien Shan. On the territory of the fortress, courtesy the support of Askar Salymbekov, a well-known businessman, public figure, and philanthropist in Kyrgyzstan, archaeological expeditions are constantly being conducted to study the area and the monument with the participation of leading researchers of the Academy of Sciences of the Kyrgyz Republic and the Kyrgyz National

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>10</sup> Annual demographic report of the Kyrgyz Republic. 2015-2019: <u>http://www.stat.kg/ru/publications/demograficheskij-</u> <u>ezhegodnik-kyrgyzskoj-respubliki/</u>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>11</sup> Koshoi-Korgon – ancient town At-Bash./Moskalev M.I., Soltobaev O.A., Omurbekov T.N. – Biyiktik. 2005.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>12</sup> Bernshtam A.N. Historical and archaeological articles of the Central Tien Shan and Pamir-Alai. 1952, стр. 112.

University named after J. Balasagyn<sup>13</sup>. To preserve the unique historical monument of the Middle Ages and draw attention to the historical site, Askar Salymbekov, who was born in Kara-Suu village, decided to establish the Historical and Archaeological Museum near the Koshoi-Korgon Fortress. The design of the museum's building was developed and approved in 2004. It took three years for the invited museum specialists to complete the collection of exhibits. In 2007, the museum opened with the participation of numerous guests—representatives of the local community, scientists, government officials, and public figures. Most items—found during the archaeological surveys—as well as diagrams, drawings, photographs, and cultural objects formed the basis of the museum's exposition. It has become an important attraction among the other famous monuments located on the main tourist routes of the Naryn region. The Koshoi-Korgon fortress and the museum attract many tourists and visitors, making a great contribution to the sustainable development of the region.

The founder of the museum, Askar Salymbekov, together with the local activists, requested to take the museum officially to the balance of the local government. Despite being established and supported by a private entity, obtaining an official registration would strengthen the status of the museum and enable it to receive funding from the local state government and arrange public activities with the visitors on a legal basis. As the head of local government (*ayil okmotu*), namely Baktybek Mamytov, informed, the status of the museum is not resolved yet. However, the process pertaining to the registration of the documents for the museum's building and its territory is underway. Currently, the museum remains to be a private museum, receiving funding from Askar Salymbekov and other local residents.



<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>13</sup> Moskalev M.I. Excavations of the settlement of Koshoi-Korgon. // Archaeological discoveries 1981. - M. 1983.

#### Search for a solution

In the course of studying the activities of this Museum, the group of researchers carefully studied and discussed the issue of transferring the museum to the balance of local government via the registration of the documents of title for the maintenance of the museum fund, the building, and the adjacent territory. If the issue is resolved positively, this experience will become one of the first examples of successful partnerships based on the interaction of business, community, and local authorities.

During a meeting with an employee of the fortress museum, the Director of the Centre of Nomadic Civilization offered methodological assistance to put in order the documentation and inventorying of the museum collection in accordance with scientific principles, as well as offered support for the designing of the museum exposition, which was replenished with new exhibits. At the Museum Forum, which took place in September 2021 at the Centre of Nomadic Civilization, the issues pertaining to the further operation of the museum were discussed with the Minister of Culture. During the discussion, solutions were proposed for the preservation of the historical site and the unique collections kept in the museum. However, at present, these issues remain unresolved due to the arrival of a new person to the post of Minister of Culture.



#### Exposition of the museum

The exposition consists of two sections: archaeological and ethnographic. The exposition is a modern display of artefacts in a space specially created and equipped for this museum. Various authentic archaeological items are presented in the museum. Along with the original exhibits, there are high-quality reconstructions of military equipment and rock paintings, recreated in accordance with the drawings of the famous researchers of the middle ages. According to experts, the numerous archaeological findings, ethnographic objects, the recreated schemes of the fortress and the plan of the settlement, and the full-fledged exposition of the museum present the results of the archaeological expeditions in the Naryn region and clearly show that, 100

thousand years ago, the territory of the Inner Tien Shan was inhabited by people, as evidenced by the materials found in the museum.



On the second floor, the second part of the exposition presents unique ethnographic objects of the nomadic life and material culture. In 2010, at the Koshoy-Korgon Fortress Museum, a gallery of fine arts was created. It is a collection of art works of various artists who took part in the international plein-air organised in this area in 2007. The picture gallery also includes some art works from the personal collection of the Salymbekovs collected during different times.



The composition of the museum's visitors is varied. The study identified the main categories of visitors as follows:

- tourists (local and international)
- students and teachers from educational institutions
- researchers/scientists (archaeologists, ethnographers, anthropologists)
- local residents in connection with family celebrations

During the summer and autumn seasons, there is an increased flow of visitors belonging to all the listed categories. In particular, there is an increase in the category of visitors from the local community. They are visiting the museum complex in connection with family celebrations such as weddings, meeting relatives, and others. For this category of visitors, additional services are provided to serve the guests in a small, adapted room on the territory of the museum complex.

The initiative of Askar Salymbekov and the museum created by him makes it possible to not only preserve the historical and cultural heritage and the archaeological site of antiquity, but also create additional conditions to attract tourists to the Naryn region and open up opportunities that contribute to the development of the region and this area.



"Today, in the light of the events taking place in the world, including all kinds of crises, natural cataclysms, and war conflicts, I am more and more concerned with the fact that humanity, which has entered the era of scientific and technological progress, is losing its spiritual and cultural development."

Askar Salymbekov, founder of the 'Koshoy-Korgon Fortress' Museum

The Historical and Archaeological Museum, 'Koshoi-Korgon Fortress', holds great perspectives as a significant historical and cultural object, for it is located in close proximity to a unique ancient site and its location is on a busy tourist route. Further, the well-established infrastructure of the museum allows it to be in demand and contribute to the sustainable development of the area.



## **FINDINGS AND ANALYSIS**

#### ICH & education (SDG 4), and community development (SDG 11)

The research demonstrated the connection between the safeguarding of the ICH and SDG 4—to ensure inclusive and equitable quality of education and promote lifelong learning opportunities for all. There is a strong connection with Target 4.7, which focuses on 'acquiring the knowledge and skills needed to promote sustainable development, including, among others, through education for sustainable development and sustainable lifestyles, human rights, gender equality, promotion of a culture of peace and nonviolence, global citizenship and appreciation of cultural diversity and of culture's contribution to sustainable development'.<sup>14</sup>

The entire traditional culture of the Kyrgyz is based on the principles of harmonious coexistence with nature, rational use of natural resources, and adaptation to the local landscapes. Throughout its existence, ICN has helped the people survive and maintain the balance. This is the basis of culture; therefore, the connection with the principles of sustainable development is evident and relevant today.

The efforts that have a strong connection with the safeguarding of the ICH and promotion of SDGs have been observed in the studied communities. These included the spreading of values of sustainable living in harmony with nature among the younger generation ('Salbuurun' School), engaging women in learning about the traditional craftsmanship (Sary Mogol community), and establishing connections between the local schools and museums to study history, ethnography, crafts, and art (e.g., Koshoi Korgon Fortress). In all the three case-studies, a significant amount of attention was paid towards the development of the educational programmes to involve local communities, women, and children. The teaching and learning methods included hands-on education, game-based research projects, and a number of interactive activities.

Safeguarding of the ICH contributes towards the achievement of SDG 11—to make cities and human settlements inclusive, safe, resilient, and sustainable. It especially contributes towards the achievement of Target 11.4—strengthen the efforts to protect and safeguard the world's cultural and natural heritage<sup>15</sup>. The resilience of the communities requires a high level of community consolidation, for which ICH safeguarding is one of the strong uniting forces. The study demonstrated the presence of a high level of activity on the part of local residents in creating public organizations to promote ICH, support local museums, mobilize entire families to make yurts, make felt carpets and weaving, participate in various festivals and fairs, and manufacture and sell handicrafts. The safeguarding of the ICH helps in promoting community tourism, which can generate income for communities, reducing labour migration and poverty, and at the same time increasing the interest in culture among the population of the remote villages.

# Similarities and differences of ICH roles among the case studies on the three museums & challenges

All the three museums are similar in their histories of the creation and formation of the museum collections. It was observed that the establishment of the museums was based on the donation of personal collections and items having cultural, memorial, decorative, or historical value.

**The similarity** of all the three cases also lies in the fact that they are supported by the local communities, and they continue collecting artefacts and rare possessions coming to the them from local families, especially during traditional celebrations or holidays. All the three museums

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>14</sup> https://sdg4education2030.org/the-goal

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>15</sup> http://uis.unesco.org/en/topic/sustainable-development-goal-11-4

are located in the attractive tourist places of Kyrgyzstan, allowing them to reflect on and present the distinct culture and its peculiarities.

It is interesting that, at the heart of each museum, there is a certain heritage element or object: Salbuurun Museum is focused on the complex of ICH elements; 'Koshoi-Korgon Fortress' Museum is located near the ancient historical and archaeological site; and the museum in Sary-Mogol is based in an old building—a traditional home of a local family. There is a strong personal attitude among the founders of the museums to preserve the local heritage and dedicate themselves to revive and spread the knowledge of their ancestors to the people.

Some problems and challenges that are common and similar to all the three case studies are as follows: there is no proper documentation at each of the museums, there are no accurate records of the museum items/collections, and all the museums lack trained specialists within their staff in order to be able to carry out the work accordingly.

**The differences** between them are related to the status of the founders of the museums. Consequently, this impacts the volume and quality of the collections, the size and quality of the building and facilities, the attendance level of the visitors in the museum, and the representation of the museums on the maps and tourist routes of travel companies. 'Koshoi-Korgon Fortress' Museum provides additional services to its visitors, which can be seen as a marketing tool, although not yet systematised. In order to draw attention and visitors, the museums also provide additional services such as master classes and collective watching of films, although these services are not yet monetized and the staff has little understanding about the use of profitable approaches. This can be explained by the common attitude, according to which the knowledge and its transfer through demonstration should be free of charge; it is considered as a shame to take money from people for this.

'Koshoi-Korgon Fortress' Museum differs from the other two in the following regard: while its building is specially designed for museum purposes, the other two adapted an old building and a traditional yurt, wherein the conditions and safety issues are not adequate for the preservation of all the collections and execution of public activities for a big number of people.

**The impact of COVID-19** and the 2020 pandemic has forced the reviewing of priorities in many spheres, including public life, economy, and the sphere of culture. In particular, the sharp decline in population mobility caused by the quarantine led to a crisis in the tourism industry of all the countries of the world, and this immediately affected the work of museums. An analysis of the activities of museum visitors showed that there was a partial offset in the number of foreign tourists owing to the influx and interest of the local community in museum activities. Even in 2021, we observed a quantitative predominance of local residents and domestic tourists in relation to foreign tourists.

The important task for museums is to revise and develop a new strategy, which in the changed conditions should focus not only on the visitors and tourists, but also on the local communities as well. In order to develop a revised strategy, it is worth examining the following questions: on the one hand, 'Which local residents come to the museum?', 'What kind of people are not interested in visiting and why?', and 'How well does the museum know its potential visitors and understands their interests and motives?'; on the other hand, 'What does the museum mean for the local population?', 'How to make the museum relevant and attractive to the local community?', and 'Where to start this work?'. It could be useful to answer these questions through training activities among the museum specialists and hiring new managers<sup>16</sup>. The training should include the building of effective communication between the museum and the local community.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>16</sup> Nazipov R. Museum Management: History and Contemporary Practices. /R. Nazipov - Yekaterinburg /IntMedia, 2018.
### Findings

All the museums are focused on the work in which the **local communities** actively participate. This is a strategy that all the museum workers must learn and adhere to in their work<sup>17</sup>. As a result of this strategy, museums can work closely with the local schools, teachers, youth, local authorities, businesses, and ordinary people. The strategy strengthens the position of the museums in their communities, increasing the relevance and sustainability of their activities.



As a result of the study, it can be concluded that a museum of a local community is capable of clearly realizing its mission of preserving and actively promoting cultural values, and has the potential to become a popular cultural and educational centre and contribute towards the improvement of the quality of life and well-being of the local population.

There are organisations in Kyrgyzstan that promote museum work and implement programs to develop and strengthen the capacity of museum professionals, such as the National Committee of Museums (ICOM Kyrgyzstan), the Centre for Museum Initiatives Public Foundation, the Consortium of Museums, and other public organisations. Establishing of interactions and cooperation with such specialised organisations and engaging with the local museum workers in their programs will enable the diversification of the practises of working with heritages and audiences. Such a collaboration can also solve one of the main tasks of community museums—to ensure their sustainability and strengthen their positions as the centres for the development of the local communities and to engage in the cultural sphere of the region. The functioning of community museums during a pandemic requires special attention and research.

Community-based museums, which are harmoniously integrated into the social life of their communities, are important factors in the sustainable development of the area. Community engagement events and educational programs can inspire creativity, improve the quality of life, and help build and develop a prosperous local community. The studied community museums

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>17</sup> Zinovieva Y.V., Matskevich Y.Y. Museum and its Partners: Collaboration with Local Communities.

and their activities not only introduce ICH to numerous visitors, but also actualize the intangible cultural heritage in everyday life and bring back the respect to the bearers of traditional culture.



The peculiarity of the community museums is that they preserve the interest in cultural heritage sites, visually demonstrate the intangible cultural values, bring out the spiritual meaning of cultural traditions, knowledges, and skills, and pass these to the younger generation. This work undoubtedly contributes towards the implementation of the principles of the UNESCO Convention, promotion of the diversity of cultural expressions, and raising of a sense of pride and involvement in the safeguarding and transmission of ICH to new generations<sup>18</sup>. The studied community museums provide their local communities with a place to meet, practice, learn, share, and promote ICH.

The museums actively promote the presence of ICH in everyday life, attract visitors, and function as a popular socio-cultural centre playing an important role in the safeguarding of ICH, interpretation of the cultural heritage, and its adaptation in modern social life. By engaging in work with the local communities, they contribute towards the raising of a sense of pride in the participation of ICH safeguarding, emotional attachment to the places of residence, involvement in heritage management, and obtaining of new knowledges for the monitoring and identifying of risks, challenges, and opportunities.

Developing partnerships and collaborations with local public organisations, academic community, and international organisations complement the mechanisms of the implementation of SDGs. By carrying out various educational and cultural events supported by the local authorities, the local communities become important players in the development of regions.

Along with the museums' positive aspects, some of their weaknesses have also been observed, including the insufficient professional training of staff at the management level, which affects the execution of the documentation and inventory work, methods of updating, and arranging of expositions and storage systems. All the newly established museums need to develop a reliable system of security and monitoring for the buildings and all the exhibits.

During discussions and interviews at the Museum Forum and the Conference, the museum workers themselves expressed the idea that it is necessary to rethink their work, considering the changed situation and challenges in preserving ICH today. The study includes the rethinking of

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>18</sup> Hudson K. Museums in Influence// Translated from English by Motylev L. – Novosibirsk: Sibirski Khronograph. 2001.

the community-level vision of ICH protection by developing holistic programs of engagement with a wider community around them. Obviously, this is a common problem to many large and small museums in Kyrgyzstan, especially those based on the exposition of only the material objects of historical and cultural value. It is important to understand and find ways to build museum collections that contain ICH, organizing exhibitions and educational programs aimed at the transferring of knowledges and skills to young people. Priority should be given to the ways of co-creating knowledge on ICH, and its understanding, interpretation, and communication with the audience<sup>19</sup>.

In order to develop and improve the professional development of community museum workers and expand educational activities, it is necessary to conduct special trainings with involvement of museum staff and local teachers. Another recommendation includes the completion of the process of the legal registration of museums and their inclusion in the official list of museums through the Department of the Ministry of Culture of the Kyrgyz Republic, which will result in them receiving governmental support.

## SUGGESTIONS FOR FUTURE RESEARCH

The traditional culture of nomads is determined by the close ties held between the old and young generations through transferring the knowledge, worldviews, experiences, and practices. This culture is manifested in practices such as Master (*Ustat*) and Apprentice (*Shakirt*). In this regard, it is interesting to analyse the experience of involving young students in learning traditional music through playing *komuz* (a traditional musical instrument) and acquaintance with the skills of poet-improvisers (*akyns*) and storytellers of the epic *Manas*. For future research, we would like to propose a study of the experience of non-formal education inherent in the Kyrgyz traditional culture of *Ustat-Shakirt*, as well as the experience of integrating the elements of ICH in formal education. Such successful examples of activating ICH and actively involving young people in the learning of ICH elements deserve to be studied and disseminated in order to scale up the research conducted by the research we research community.



<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>19</sup> Nazipov R. Museum Management: History and Contemporary Practices. /R. Nazipov - Yekaterinburg /IntMedia, 2018.

## LIST OF LITERATURE

#### In Russian language:

Bernshtam A.N. Historical and archaeological articles of the Central Tien Shan and Pamir -Alai. 1952, ctp. 112.

Imennova L.S. Museum in the socio-cultural system of society: mission, trends, prospects. Dissertation abstract. Moscow, 2012.

Kenneth Hudson. Museums in Influence// Translated from English by Motylev L. – Novosibirsk: Sibirski Khronograph. 2001.

Koshoi-Korgon – ancient town At-Bash. / Moskalev M.I., Soltobaev O.A., Omurbekov T.N. – Biyiktik. 2005.

Moskalev M.I. Excavations of the settlement of Koshoi-Korgon. // Archaeological discoveries 1981. - M. 1983.

Nazipov R. Museum Management: History and Contemporary Practices. /R. Nazipov - Yekaterinburg /IntMedia, 2018.

Zinovieva Y.V., Matskevich Y.Y. Museum and its Partners: Collaboration with Local Communities.

#### **On-line resources:**

Convention for the Safeguarding of the Intangible Cultural Heritage: <u>https://www.un.org/ru/documents/decl\_conv/conventions/cultural\_heritage\_conv.shtml</u>

COVID-19: UNESCO and ICOM Concerned About the Situation of World Museums: <u>https://ru.unesco.org/news/covid-19-yunesko-i-ikom-obespokoeny-polozheniem-muzeev-v-mire</u>

Annual demographic report of the Kyrgyz Republic. 2015-2019: <u>http://www.stat.kg/ru/publications/demograficheskij-ezhegodnik-kyrgyzskoj-respubliki/</u>

The level of poverty of the population of Kyrgyz Republic in 2019: <u>http://www.stat.kg/ru/publications/uroven-bednosti-v-kyrgyzskoj-respublike/</u>

COVID-19 in the Kyrgyz Republic: Socioeconomic and Vulnerability Impact Assessment and Policy Response: <u>https://www.adb.org/sites/default/files/institutional-document/626021/covid-19-kgz-socioeconomic-vulnerability-impact.pdf</u>

Museums and Intangible cultural heritage: <u>http://memoriamedia.net/Bibliography-</u> ICH/382\_DERIC\_2020\_museums.pdf s

Salbuurun, Kyrgyz traditional game, World Nomad games: <u>https://en.unesco.org/silkroad/photo-bank/salbuurun-kyrgyz-traditional-game-world-nomad-games</u>

Opening of the museum in Sary Mogol: <u>https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=w4X-VUWCAXI&t=166s</u>

Ethnographic Community Museum "Living Museum": <u>https://www.youtube.com/wa</u> <u>Ethnographic</u> <u>Community Museum tch?v=CFbthSh6ono</u>

Longread about Koshoi-Korgon Fortress: https://govori.tv/longreads/koshoikorgon/koshoikorgon.html

Video about Koshoi-Korgon Museum: https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=NXq5Tg4wFzE

Museum of nomadic peoples at the foot of Lenin Peak: <u>https://rus.azattyk.org/a/museum-nomadic-kyrgyz/31008696.html</u>

Nomad games, rediscovering heritage, celebrating diversity: <u>https://ich.unesco.org/en/BSP/nomad-games-rediscovering-heritage-celebrating-diversity-01738</u>

## **PHOTO CREDITS**

Cover: Installing a Kyrgyz yurt on the summer pasture. © Kiyiz Duino p. 6: On the Forum of Museums. © Taalim-Forum p. 7: Participants of the Forum of Museums. © Taalim-Forum p.8: Focus-group discussion #1. © Taalim-Forum p.9: Focus-group discussion #2. © Taalim-Forum p. 9: Focus-group discussion #3. © Taalim-Forum p.9: Filling the questionnaires. © Taalim-Forum p.10-11: Participants at the international conference "Safeguarding of the intangible cultural heritage through education". © Taalim-Forum p.15: In the living museum of Salbuurun. © Taalim-Forum p.16: Almaz Akunov and the youngest members of the Salbuurun Federation. © Taalim-Forum p. 17: In the Salbuurun museum. © Taalim-Forum p. 18: Education activities at the Salbuurun Museum. © Taalim-Forum p. 18: Learning archery at the school of young falconers © Taalim-Forum p.19: Learning about falconry. © Taalim-Forum p. 20: The signboard of the local museum in Sary Mogol village. © ISDS p.21: The opening of the Ethnographic Museum in Sary Mogol village. © ISDS p.22: Waiting for the guests at the entrance of the Ethnographic Museum in Sary Mogol village. © ISDS p.23: Expositions in the museum. © ISDS p.23: Collection of Kyrgyz household antiques. © ISDS p.25: Remains of the ancient Koshoi-Forgon Fortress. © Koshoi-Forgon Fortress Museum p.26: At the Koshoi-Korgon Fortress Museum. © Taalim-Forum p.27: Interviewing the museum worker at the ethnographic section of the museum. © Taalim-Forum p.28: The model of the reconstruction of the fortress. © Taalim-Forum p.28: Archaeological findings at the museum. © Taalim-Forum p.28: Archaeological findings at the museum. © Taalim-Forum p.29: The gallery with the artworks of local artists. © Taalim-Forum p.30: The research group near the remains of the ancient fortress. © Taalim-Forum p.33: Village children at the Felt Festival. © Kiyiz Duino p.34: Educational programme for girls at the community museum. © Taalim-Forum p.35: Almaz Akunov with his students: Master (Ustat) and Apprentice (Shakirt). © Taalim-Forum



#### The questionnaire

"Taalim-Forum" Public Foundation is studying the issues of safeguarding of intangible cultural heritage (ICH) in Kyrgyzstan. In this regard, we are conducting a public awareness survey on ICH issues. We will be grateful for your complete and sincere answers.

Researchers Doolbekova J.B., Osmonova A.A.

- 1 What do you think in the proposed list refers to the intangible cultural heritage? Please tick from the list.
  - 1) Natural objects of ecological significance
  - 2) Customs, representations and expressions, knowledge, and skills transmitted by the communities from generation to generation
  - 3) Man-made objects of cultural and/or historical significance
- 2. Which of the ICH elements from Kyrgyzstan were included in the UNESCO list? Select from the list provided and mark using a circle.
  - Kyrgyz *shyrdak* and *ala-kiyiz*
  - Trilogy 'Manas', 'Semetey', 'Seytek'
  - Traditional knowledge and methods of making Kyrgyz and Kazakh yurts
  - Tower 'Burana'
  - The art of 'Aytysh'
  - Petroglyphs 'Saimaluu Tash'

- Celebration of 'Nooruz'
- Horse game 'Kok-boru'
- The method of making and wearing 'Ak kalpak'
- Traditional intellectual game 'Toguz korgool'
- 'Sulaiman-too', Osh city
- Traditional Kyrgyz hunting with falcons
- 3 How do you think museums can contribute towards the safeguarding and popularization of the ICH? Please write how.
- 4. Does your museum have an educational program aimed at involving schoolchildren, youth, and local residents? If yes, please briefly describe the main activities and forms of work.
  - 1) Tours and lectures with the involvement of the bearers of traditional knowledge
  - 2) Master classes with the participation of artisans and other local experts
  - 3) Festivals involving the local community
  - 4) Thematic exhibitions on traditional culture
  - 5) Others \_\_\_\_

#### 5 Please indicate the kind of assistance required by you to more effectively promote the values of ICH.

- Financial 1)
- Developing a vision, concept, and understanding of the ICH and the role of museums in the 2) preservation of the ICH
- Methodological and informational assistance on educational programs 3)
- 4) Other \_\_\_\_
- Write a few words about your museum: 6.
  - Where is it located? \_
  - What is the type of ownership? \_\_\_\_\_
  - When was it founded? \_
  - Who is the permanent staff of the museum? \_\_\_\_
  - The ICH promotion in our museum is ongoing (check one of the items)

Very good I I Wish it were better, rather weak Almost not conducted

### Annex 2.



#### **Conference organizers**

**Taalim-Forum** public foundation was registered in 2006. It promotes interdisciplinary approaches and innovations in the field of education, implements projects related to the preservation of biological and cultural diversity, and develops methodological manuals, educational books for children, and open educational resources. The organization conducts research in the field of culture and cultural heritage, education and challenges of the changing world, and holds seminars and trainings for various groups.

**The American University of Central Asia (AUCA),** founded in 1993, is an international, multidisciplinary learning community in the American liberal arts tradition. AUCA is the first university in Central Asia to offer US accredited degrees in liberal arts programs through a partnership with the Bard College in the United States. In addition to Bard, AUCA maintains partnerships with a number of universities and organizations worldwide. For more information, visit <u>https://www.auca.kg/</u>

#### About the conference

The international conference is dedicated to the discussion of the topic of safeguarding the intangible cultural heritage (ICH) in Kyrgyzstan through formal and non-formal education and research in the respective area. The conference is held within the framework of the project 'Research on the ICH's Contribution to Sustainable Development: Education and Community Development", initiated and supported by the International Research Center for Intangible Cultural Heritage in the Asia-Pacific Region (IRCI, Japan ).

#### About the research of the 'Taalim-Forum' PF

The research conducted by 'Taalim-Forum' consists of two phases. The first phase is focused on the study of the knowledge and craftsmanship of making Kyrgyz yurt and related knowledge and skills, including making of felt carpets (*shyrdaks*), patterned weaving (*terme*), and transferring of the skill of traditional hunting culture to new generations. The study examined four local communities that were called 'visionary'<sup>20</sup> in the research. The objectives of the research included studying the mechanism of knowledge transfer through learning, considering the connection between the safeguarding of the ICH and the principles of sustainable development of communities. Despite the multitasking of the research, the target element was the culture associated with the yurt, which from ancient times accompanied the nomadic Kyrgyz and Kazakh people from birth to death, reflecting the unity and balance of spiritual and material values. The results of the research entitled 'Visionary Local Communities in Promoting ICH Education in Kyrgyzstan' were presented at the International Symposium (online) in 2020 in Tokyo<sup>21</sup>.

The continuation of the project includes the research of local/community museums via the writing of three case studies. The focus of the research is to consider the role of museums in ICH safeguarding and their contribution towards the education and sustainable development of communities. The research will run until December 2021, and its results will be presented at the IRCI-sponsored International Symposium on ICH, which will be held in Japan (online).

#### **Participants**

ICH researchers and experts, AUCA faculties and students, representatives of local and community museums, custodians and practitioners of traditional culture from Kyrgyzstan, researchers from Kazakhstan, representatives from IRCI (Japan), and the UNESCO National Secretariat in Kyrgyzstan.

<sup>20</sup> The term "visionary community" refers to communities capable of acting as true leaders, with a vision for safeguarding local intangible cultural heritage, and strong human and leadership potential.

<sup>21</sup> The materials of the Symposium can be found at the link: <u>https://www.irci.jp/wp\_files/wp\_content/uploads/2021/02/019f9c70652e08635f0c8e5a87b928fb-1.pdf</u>

#### PROGRAMME

08:50 am – 09.00 am	Technical check
09:00 am – 09:15 am	Opening
	Blessing from the founder of the "Salbuurun" community museum Almazbek Akunov
	Almagul Osmonova, Director of Taalim-Forum PF
	Prof. Nurgul Ukueva, Vice President for Academic Affairs, AUCA
09:15 am – 09:25 am	Welcoming remarks
	Dr. Iwamoto Wataru, Director-General, IRCI, Japan
	Sabira Soltongeldieva, UNESCO National Secretariat in Kyrgyzstan
09:25 am – 10:30 am	Session 1. Living heritage that connects generations
	Facilitator: Almagul Osmonova
	Jyldyz Doolbekova, Reflection on the research on ICH safeguarding in Kyrgyzstan
	<b>Prof. Almira Nauryzbaeva</b> (Kazakhstan), Semiosphere of the Kazakh (kiiz üy) and Kyrgyz (boz üy) yurt in the aspect of traditional knowledge
	<b>Prof. Cholpon Turdalieva</b> , Safeguarding ICH through education and partnership development
	Prof. Ruslan Rakhimov, ICH research methodology
	Q & A
10:30 am – 10:45 am	Break
10:45 am – 11:50 am	Session 2. Contribution of ICH to sustainable development of regions
	Facilitator: Jyldyz Doolbekova
	Aida Alymova, Community museums as drivers of regional development
	<b>Aidai Asangulova</b> , Actualization of the traditional heritage through combination of traditions and innovations
	<b>Jyldyz Asanakunova</b> , Safeguarding of traditional values for sustainable development of communities in the Issyk-Kul region
	Q & A
11:50 am – 12:20 pm	Session 3. Discussion on targeted issues
	<ol> <li>What is the role of leaders of public organizations/local communities, custodians/practitioners of traditional knowledge, researchers, educational and cultural institutions in safeguarding of ICH?</li> <li>How does the safeguarding of ICH contribute to achievement of sustainable development goals of the regions?</li> <li>What are the top priorities and main directions for safeguarding ICH in the country?</li> </ol>
12:20 pm – 12:30 pm	Closing remarks
	Gulnara Aipaeva, Aigine Cultural Research Center, Director, PhD, UNESCO expert
12:30 pm – 2:00 pm	Lunch

#### SPEAKERS AND FACILITATORS



**Akunov Almaz**, charismatic leader, bearer and practitioner of traditional ecological knowledge, President of the "Salbuurun Federation," which promotes the culture and philosophy of traditional hunting. Akunov is the creator of the "living museum" in a yurt in the village of Bokonbaevo, Issyk-Kul region, the initiator of the "Salbuurun" festivals. Master of young people in the established center of informal education (master - apprentice) – "Salbuurunchu mektebi" (The School of Salbuurunchi).





**Aida Alymova,** Ph.D., museum expert, Director of the Centre for Nomadic Civilization named after Kurmanjan Datka, Issyk-Kul region. As a President of the National Committee of ICOM-Kyrgyzstan, she represents the museum community of the country abroad. More than 20 years of experience in the museum field, implementation of more than 10 major projects on museums development, preservation and restoration of monuments of historical and cultural heritage. She did her internship in the largest museums of Kazakhstan, Russia, China, Finland and the USA. Thanks to her initiative, the museum community of Kyrgyzstan participates in training seminars and implements projects on development of local museums.

**Asanakunova Jyldyz,** founder of the yurt village Almaluu (since 2014) of 25 yurts. For 30 years, together with her family and like-minded people, she has been developing ethno-tourism and popularizing traditional knowledge and values through an original educational program of trainings and workshops on hand-made felt making, installation of yurts and related traditions, rituals and traditional cuisine. Jyldyz shares her experience with young people and interested people from the regions of the country and foreign countries. Jyldyz is the Chairwoman of the Southern Shore of Issyk-Kul Ethno-Cultural Destination (USAID) and the initiator of the project to obtain UNESCO Geopark status for this area.



Asangulova Aidai, bearer and practitioner of traditional knowledge, Director and inspirational leader of "Kiyiz Duino" (Felt World) public foundation; participant of international craft exhibitions as a designer. The "Kiyiz Duino" Foundation promotes traditions and practices related to felt craft; supports and mobilizes the local community of Kyzyl-Tuu village in Issyk-Kul oblast through the revival of yurt-making skills, creation of a community museum, holding Felt Festivals, through popularization and promotion of nomadic ways of life and values in the settings of summer pasture ("Kyrgyz Ayily"). The Foundation conducts research on the historical and cultural significance of traditional Kyrgyz headdresses and costumes, revives traditional craft knowledge and technologies, and connects keepers and cultural practitioners with researchers and scientists and actively engages the youth.







**Doolbekova Jyldyz,** PhD, an anthropologist, researcher and consultant in traditional ecological knowledge, place-based education, community development to support, maintain biocultural diversity and well-being of mountain local communities in Kyrgyzstan and the Central Asia region. She has served as Special Advisor and Program Coordinator for Central Asia at the Christensen Fund (USA, California), directed the Aga Khan Humanities Project University Program (AKHP), and taught at Kyrgyz universities. Her research interests include Kyrgyz traditional ecological knowledge, nomads worldview, and philosophy.

Naurzbayeva Almira, Doctor of Philosophy, Professor of the Department of Social and Humanitarian Disciplines of the Kazakh National Conservatory named after Kurmangazy (Almaty). From 2011 to 2018, a member of the National Committee and Expert Council on the Intangible Cultural Heritage of the Republic of Kazakhstan. Research interests include philosophical issues of the language of culture and art, methodology of modern anthropology of culture, theoretical and practical issues of cultural policy.

**Osmonova Almagul,** director of Taalim-Forum Public Foundation, BA in history, MSc in holistic science. She holds teaching experience at the Kyrgyz National University and the American University of Central Asia. During her leadership of Taalim-Forum, the organization achieved significant results in promoting the paradigm of biocultural diversity through cultural, educational, and environmental projects.



**Rakhimov Ruslan,** has a doctorate in social sciences and a PhD in history. Associate Professor in the Department of Anthropology at the American University of Central Asia. Research interests: pastoral communities of Kazakhstan and Kyrgyzstan; anthropological theory and research methodology, cultural heritage policy, and others. Participant of international research projects, author of many publications on nomadic culture.



**Cholpon Turdalieva,** Ph.D. in History, Professor and Head of the Anthropology, Technology and International Development Program at the American University of Central Asia (AUCA). The research interests include: nomadic culture of Kyrgyz people in the writings of travelers of the 19th and early 20th centuries, museum management and marketing, preservation of the cultural heritage of Kyrgyzstan and Central Asia. Author of three monographs and more than 100 articles on these topics. Alumni of international programs: Fulbright, CARTI OSI and others. Director of international projects on the preservation of biocultural diversity supported by various international foundations.

#### **PRESENTATION ABSTRACTS**

#### Jyldyz Doolbekova, 'Reflection on the research on ICH safeguarding in Kyrgyzstan'

The researcher reflects on the issues of the safeguarding of the intangible cultural heritage in Kyrgyzstan in the light of the rapidly changing world and modern challenges, when the problems is not just the sheer loss of traditional knowledge, but may be something deeper, namely the loss of the sources of knowledge and people's ability to learn from Mother Earth. The researcher attempts to answer the following questions: 'How to actualize the traditions, skills, customs, and ways of thinking that have been so carefully preserved and transmitted to this day?', 'How to activate the local communities in order to bring together custodians, practitioners, researchers, and all supporters?', 'How to expand the supporters of cultural heritage preservation?', and 'What is the role of the participants in this process?'

# Almira Naurzbaeva, 'The Semiosphere of the Kazakh (kiz üi) and Kyrgyz (boz üi) Yurts in the Aspect of Traditional Knowledge'

The subject of discussion is the traditional dwellings of the Kazakhs, namely '*kiyiz-üy*', and the Kyrgyz, namely '*boz üy*', representing a semiotic system, storing the codes and signs, that contains 'hidden' knowledge of these peoples about the world and human being, space and time, the harmony of heaven and earth, and life and death. *Kiyiz üy* and *boz üy* are a kind of models of the world picture and a text, the reading of each of which bring out all of the new hidden meanings. An emphasis is placed on the ethnic names of the dwellings, for they contain a deep meaning, and thus, act as cultural concepts. The sacral meaning of the dwelling (yurt) or, more precisely, of the house for Turkic nomads lies not only in the forms of construction, ornaments, and decoration, but also in the material itself--*kiyiz* (felt), reflecting 'the dynamic rhythm of the ethnos existence and the specificity of its life philosophy'.

#### Cholpon Turdalieva, 'Preservation of ICH through Education and Partnership Development'

The presentation focuses on the role of anthropology in the study, preservation, and promotion of intangible heritage in the local, national, regional, and international contexts. The Anthropology Program at the American University in Central Asia has since its inception (1993) been involved in the preservation of intangible heritages through the study of the oral history, knowledge, and skills of the material culture of the Kyrgyz and Central Asian peoples through action-learning and place-based research. The program supports the development of research topics for undergraduate and graduate students through ethnographic internships in foreign countries, thereby increasing the field data resources and expanding the geography of the cultural study and preservation of culture. The safeguarding of ICH is reflected in the research of the faculty members and their direct participation in various research projects. Despite some successes, there are still some gaps and challenges pertaining to implementing the directions of the Anthropology Program.

#### Ruslan Rakhimov, Ph.D., 'Methodology of Research on ICH'

In the presentation, the author reflects on the role of research in ICH safeguarding, with focus being on the methodology of the research in the training of young researchers. On research as an important component of the preservation of intangible cultural heritage to obtain, document empirical material and further update little or/and unexplored issues and themes in the field of ICH. The author emphasizes on the peculiarity of ICH as a socio-cultural phenomenon, the importance of establishing links with the informal networks of keepers and practices of traditional knowledge, and the involvement of the local community in research. The questions of 'How can qualitative methods such as participant observation and other approaches be useful in interpreting the research?' and 'What other methodological approaches should be considered?' have been adequately dealt by the author in this presentation.

#### Aida Alymova, 'Community Museums as the Drivers of Regional Development'

The presentation reveals the role of museums as the drivers of regional development. In this modern society, the museums are undergoing profound changes caused by the complex of economic, political, and cultural transformations. In Kyrgyzstan, despite the difficulties and current challenges, there is a growth in the number of museums created by communities, which have subsequently become important socio-cultural institutions in the process of heritage transmission and in contributing towards the preservation of cultural identity. Based on the preliminary results of the Taalim-Forum research, we can conclude that a museum that clearly understands its mission and actively promotes its presence becomes an essential cultural and educational centre, which is helpful in improving the quality of life and well-being of the local population. Through the museum educational programs, community museums have come to make a certain contribution towards ICH safeguarding in Kyrgyzstan.

#### Aidai Asangulova, 'Connecting Tradition and Innovation for the Actualization of Cultural Heritage'

The presentation brings out the experience of preserving the intangible cultural heritage over the past 10 years: from the idea of building a team and mobilizing a local community to establishing a public organization, attracting partners from local and international organizations, and initiating and expanding a network of volunteers, custodians, and practitioners of traditional culture. Over the years, the team under the leadership of A.Asangulova has become more confident in its own strength, namely the uniqueness of its activities. These include a range of training topics and cultural programs with the potential to make a significant contribution to ICH safeguarding and consolidation of society and its cultural revival. The presentation raises the questions of 'What are the challenges faced by the custodians of traditional knowledge today?' and 'What are the effective strategies to safeguard ICH?'.

# Jyldyz Asanakunova, 'Preservation of Traditional Values for the Sustainable Development of the Communities in the Issyk-Kul Region'

This presentation explores the question of how the preservation of traditional values, knowledge, and practices impacts the sustainability and development of local communities in the Issyk-Kul region. The author shares her own experiences in creating and developing ethno-tourism and carrying out training programs, and her reflections on how to expand the geography of the supporters of the revival and preservation of cultural heritages for the economic well-being of families, empowerment and leadership of women, and improvement of the well-being of local communities in the Issyk-Kul region.

United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization

International Research Centre for Intangible Cultural Heritage in the Asia-Pacific Region (IRCI)

2 Mozusekiun-cho, Sakai-ku, Sakai city, Osaka, 590-0802, Japan

Website: https://www.irci.jp E-mail: irci@nich.go.jp